The Liberalisation of the Telecommunications Sector in Sub-Saharan Africa and Fostering Competition in Telecommunications Services Markets

An Analysis of the Regulatory Framework in Uganda
## Contents

1 Introduction ................................................................. 1  
  1.1 Background of Research ............................................. 1  
  1.2 Statement of the Problem ............................................ 7  
  1.3 Main Objective and Research Questions ........................... 9  
  1.4 Justification of Research ........................................... 10  
  1.5 Research Methodology ............................................... 11  
  1.6 Limitations of Research ........................................... 13  
  1.7 Structure of the Study ............................................... 14  

2 Competition and Regulation of the Telecommunications Sector .... 17  
  2.1 Rationale for Regulating the Telecommunications Sector ........ 18  
  2.2 Justifying Continued Regulation in the Fully Liberalised  
      Telecommunications Sector .......................................... 18  
  2.3 Economic Characteristics of the Telecommunications Sector  
      and Regulation ...................................................... 19  
    2.3.1 Significant Economies of Scale ............................... 20  
    2.3.2 Network Externalities .......................................... 21  
    2.3.3 Switching Costs ................................................ 22  
  2.4 The Market Characteristics in the Telecommunications Sector  
      in Sub-Saharan Africa and the Implications for Regulation .... 25  
    2.4.1 Substitution of Fixed Line Networks with Mobile  
      Networks ............................................................ 25  
    2.4.2 The Fading Dominance of Former State Monopoly  
      Operator and Rise of Multinational Telecommunications  
      Operators ............................................................ 27  
    2.4.3 Network Infrastructure: Vertically Integrated  
      Telecommunications Operators ..................................... 30  
    2.4.4 Outsourcing Tower Sites: Rise of Third Party Tower  
      Companies ........................................................... 31  
  2.5 Conclusion .......................................................... 31  

vii
3 Liberalisation of the Telecommunications Sector: From Public Monopoly to Competitive Telecommunications Markets

3.1 Rationale for Opening Up the Telecommunications Sector to Competition

3.1.1 The Phasing-Out of the Natural Monopoly Theory Rationale

3.1.1.1 Technology Change and the Natural Monopoly Theory

3.1.1.2 Inefficient Monopoly Operator

3.2 The Specific Factors Leading to the Liberalisation of the Telecommunications Sector in Uganda

3.2.1 The Influence of Multilateral Development Institutions and Donor Agencies

3.2.2 The Role of WTO

3.2.3 The Growth of Mobile Market

3.3 Evolution of the Telecommunications Policy from Monopoly to Competition

3.3.1 Liberalisation and Privatisation

3.3.2 Evolution of the Telecommunications Policy in Uganda from Monopoly to Competition

3.3.2.1 Monopoly Era (1900–1993)

3.3.2.2 The Beginning of Competition (1993–1996)

3.3.2.2.1 Adoption of the Telecommunications Sector Policy Statement of 1996 and the Enactment of the Communications Act of 1998

3.3.2.3 Privatisation of UPTC and the Duopoly Period (1998–2006)

3.3.2.4 Full Liberalisation and Telecommunications Policy of 2006

3.3.2.5 Competition Concerns in the Fully Liberalised Telecommunications Sector

3.4 Conclusion

4 Regulating Anti-Competitive Conduct in the Telecommunications Market in Uganda

4.1 Anti-Competitive Conduct in the Telecommunications Sector: Why Uganda Should Focus on the Mobile Market

4.2 Regulating Anti-Competitive Behaviour: Economy-Wide Versus Sector-Specific Competition Rules

4.3 Overview of Competition in the Telecommunications Sector in Uganda

4.4 Main Telecommunications Markets in Uganda

4.4.1 The Telephony Market

4.4.2 Fixed Line Market (Voice)
4.4.3 Mobile Market (Voice) ........................................ 64
4.4.4 Internet Market ............................................... 67

4.5 Specific Market Characteristics of Uganda’s Telecommunications Sector Impacting on the Regulation of Anti-Competitive Behaviour ......................................................... 70

4.5.1 Strong Presence of Local Subsidiaries of Multinational Corporations (MNCs) ......................................................... 71
4.5.2 Vertical Integration in the Telecommunications Markets .......... 74

4.6 Legal and Regulatory Framework for Anti-Competitive Behaviour in the Telecommunications Markets in Uganda ........................................ 79

4.6.1 Market Definition in the Telecommunications Sector ............... 80
4.6.2 Market Definition Under the Fair Competition Regulations: Is It Modern Enough? ......................................................... 82

4.6.2.1 Definition of the Relevant Product Market ..................... 84
4.6.2.2 Defining the Relevant Geographical Market .................... 88

4.6.3 Anti-Competitive Practices ....................................... 89

4.6.3.1 Anti-Competitive Agreements and Concerted Practices .......... 89

4.6.3.1.1 Interconnection and Anti-Competitive Behaviour: Emphasis on Call Termination Rates ......................................................... 95

4.6.3.1.2 Call Termination Rates and Anti-Competitive Behaviour: Uganda’s Interconnection Regulations ......................................................... 97

4.6.3.2 Abuse of Dominant Position by Telecommunications Operator: Defining Dominance in Uganda’s Telecommunications Sector ......................................................... 100

4.6.3.2.1 Dominance in the Voice Market ............................. 101
4.6.3.2.2 Dominance in the Internet Market .......................... 104
4.6.3.2.3 Collective Dominance ........................................... 106

4.6.3.3 Forms of Abuse of Dominant Position .......................... 108

4.6.3.3.1 Predatory Pricing .................................................. 109
4.6.3.3.2 Price Discrimination ............................................ 119
4.6.3.3.3 Price Squeeze ..................................................... 128
4.6.3.3.4 Refusal to Deal ................................................... 137

4.6.3.3.5 Refusal to Deal in the Telecommunications Regulatory Framework in Uganda ......................................................... 141

4.6.3.3.6 Refusal to Interconnect or Act in Good Faith During Interconnection Negotiations ......................................................... 142

4.6.3.3.6.1 Refusal to Grant Access to Essential Facilities .......... 144
4.6.3.3.6.2 The Essential Facilities Doctrine ........................................ 146
4.6.3.3.6.3 Elements of the Essential Facilities Doctrine .......................... 149
4.6.3.3.6.4 Implementation of the Essential Facilities Doctrine in the Telecommunications Sector ..................................................... 153

4.7 Conclusion ......................................................................................... 160

5 Foreign Direct Investment in Telecommunications Sector
and Regulation of Anti-Competitive Behaviour: The Specific Case of Cross-Border Mergers .............................................................. 163

5.1 Overview of Significant Mergers Affecting the Telecommunications Sector in Sub-Saharan Africa ................................................. 169

5.1.1 Celtel International BV/Mobile Telecommunications Company KSC (MTC) ................................................................. 169

5.1.2 Investcom LLC/MTN International (Mauritius) Limited .......... 170

5.1.3 Atlantique Telecom/Etisalat ............................................................ 170

5.1.4 Vodacom Group/Vodafone Group .................................................. 170

5.1.5 Zain International BV/Bharti Airtel ................................................ 171

5.2 Similarities Among the Cross-Border Mergers and Acquisitions in Sub-Saharan Africa’s Telecommunications Sector ...................... 172

5.3 Rationale for the Increase in Cross-Border Mergers in Sub-Saharan Africa ......................................................................................... 174

5.4 Cross-Border Mergers and Acquisitions and Competition ............ 175

5.5 Regulating Cross-Border Mergers in the Telecommunications Sector in Uganda ................................................................. 177

5.5.1 Regulatory Framework for Cross-Border Merger Control in the Telecommunications Sector ............................................................ 181

5.5.1.1 Scope of Application ...................................................................... 181

5.5.1.1.1 Who Is Subject to Merger Control? ........................................... 181

5.5.1.2 Which Mergers Are Subject to Merger Review? ......................... 183

5.5.1.2.1 Merger Thresholds ................................................................. 183

5.5.1.2.2 Defining Business Transactions: The Concept of Combinations/ Concentrations ................................................................. 187

5.5.1.3 Notification ................................................................................... 188

5.5.1.4 Defining an Anti-Competitive Merger .......................................... 191

5.5.1.5 Public Interest Considerations ...................................................... 192

5.5.1.6 Merger Review Timeframe .......................................................... 195

5.5.2 Overview of the Assessment of the Merger Control Provisions for Uganda’s Telecommunications Sector ................................. 196
5.6 Co-operation Agreements and Cross-Border Enforcement of Competition Law ........................................ 198
5.7 Regional Integration and Trade Agreements and Competition Law Enforcement ........................................ 203
5.8 Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 208

6 Regulation of Network Interconnection and Network Access ........ 211
6.1 Importance of Access to Telecommunications Facilities ............ 211
6.2 Two-Way Access: Interconnection ................................................................. 214
   6.2.1 Rationale for the Regulation of Interconnection ..................... 214
   6.2.2 Types of Interconnection ............................................................... 216
   6.2.3 Mobile Interconnection ................................................................. 218
   6.2.4 Fair and Efficient Interconnection ............................................. 219
6.3 Analysis of the Regulatory Regime for Interconnection in Uganda with Emphasis on Mobile Interconnection ......... 221
   6.3.1 Competition-Related Interconnection Concerns .......... 222
     6.3.1.1 Duty to Interconnect ............................................................ 222
     6.3.1.2 Asymmetric or Symmetric Approach to Interconnection Obligations ........................................ 223
     6.3.1.3 Mobile Call Termination Rates ...................................... 225
     6.3.1.4 Asymmetric or Symmetric Regulation of Interconnection Rates ........................................ 229
     6.3.1.5 Non-discriminatory Interconnection ......................... 234
     6.3.1.6 Delayed Interconnection Negotiations ..................... 235
     6.3.1.7 Incorporation of Unfair Terms and Conditions in the Interconnection Agreement .................. 238
6.4 One-Way Access .......................................................... 239
   6.4.1 One-Way Access Regulation in Sub-Saharan Africa .......... 241
6.4.2 Essential Facilities Doctrine: Enhancing Competition in Uganda’s Telecommunications Sector ............. 243
6.4.3 Essential Facilities Doctrine: Access to the Fixed Network and Competition in the Internet Market .......... 245
6.4.4 Local Loop Unbundling ..................................................... 247
6.5 Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 254

7 Efficient Radio Spectrum Regulation: Facilitating Competition in the Wireless Communications Markets in the Telecommunications Sector .................................................. 257
7.1 Importance of Spectrum in the Telecommunications Sector in Sub-Saharan Africa ........................................ 258
7.2 Significance in the Voice and Internet Services Markets .......... 259
7.3 Spectrum Scarcity and Efficient Spectrum Management ............. 263
7.4 The Debate on Efficient Radio Spectrum Management ............. 265
7.5 Spectrum Management in Uganda’s Telecommunications Sector ................................................................. 268
7.5.1 The Regulatory Framework for Spectrum Management in the Telecommunications Sector ............ 269
  7.5.1.1 Legislative Framework on Spectrum Management ............................................. 270
7.5.2 Spectrum Allocation ................................................................. 272
7.5.3 Spectrum Assignment .............................................................. 278
  7.5.3.1 Spectrum Assignment in Uganda’s Telecommunications Sector: Bottleneck to Competition in the Mobile Communications Market? ....................... 280
  7.5.3.2 Liberalisation of the Telecommunications Sector and the Change in Spectrum Use in Uganda’s Mobile Communications Market ...................... 280
7.5.4 Analysis of the Regulatory Framework for Spectrum Assignment in Uganda’s Telecommunications Sector .................. 284
  7.5.4.1 Spectrum Assignment Methods in Uganda .................................................. 284
7.5.5 Alternative Methods of Spectrum Assignment ....................................................... 287
  7.5.5.1 Spectrum Auctions ....................................................................................... 288
  7.5.5.2 Lotteries ........................................................................................................ 294
  7.5.5.3 Comparative Hearing (Beauty Contests) ....................................................... 296
7.5.6 Liberalisation of the Spectrum Assignment Process .................. 300
  7.5.6.1 Spectrum Trading ................................................................................. 301
  7.5.6.2 Spectrum Commons .................................................................................. 304
7.5.7 Asymmetric Spectrum Holdings in the Mobile Communications Market and Spectrum Management: A Case for Refarming? ......................... 307
7.5.8 Spectrum Under-Utilisation .............................................................. 313
  7.5.8.1 Inefficient Spectrum Utilisation by Telecommunications Operators .......... 314
  7.5.8.1.1 Anti-Competitive Behaviour and Spectrum Under-Utilisation: Spectrum Hoarding ....................................................... 316
  7.5.8.2 Enhancing Spectrum Utilisation: The Case for Frequency Sharing ........ 318
7.6 Conclusion ......................................................................................... 321

8 Competition Regulation in the Telecommunications Sector in Uganda: The Potential Role of a National Competition Law ............ 325
  8.1 Main Rules for the Regulation of Competition in the Telecommunications Sector .......................................................... 326
  8.2 Exclusive Reliance on Sector-Specific Rules in Uganda’s Telecommunications Sector: Perceived Weaknesses in Competition Regulation ........................................ 328
  8.3 National Competition Law to Facilitate Competition in the Telecommunications Sector .................................................. 334
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.4 Clarifying the Role of a National Competition Authority</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regarding Competition Regulation in the Telecommunications Sector</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.1 Mechanisms to Facilitate Efficient Regulation Where</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There’s Concurrent Jurisdiction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.1.1 South Africa’s Experience</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Final Conclusions</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Need for More Vigilant Enforcement of Legislative Framework</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1.1 Regulation of Interconnection</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1.2 Spectrum Management</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1.3 Regulation of Anti-Competitive Behaviour</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 Need to Bolster the Competition Regulation Framework with Economy-Wide Competition Rules</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.1 Role for a National Competition Authority: Relationship Between Sector-Specific Rules and National Competition Law</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.2 Co-operation and Regional Competition Authorities as Means of Enhancing Competition Law Enforcement Capacity</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 Economic Characteristics of the Telecommunications Sector</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and Uganda’s Market Composition Play an Important Role in the Regulation of Competition in the Sector</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1 Economic Characteristics of the Telecommunications Sector</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.2 Market Composition and the Approach to Regulation</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 Policy Suggestions and Recommendations</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix A: List of Interviewees                                      | 365  |

Appendix B                                                            | 367  |

Bibliography                                                          | 371  |