Christian Bergqvist

Between Regulation og Deregulation

Studies on the limitations of competition law and its ambiguous application to the supply of electricity and telecommunications in the EU

1. edition

Jurist- og Økonomforbundets Forlag
2016
# Table of Content

**Foreword** .................................................. 13  
**Chapter I. Market power and competition** .......................... 15  
1. The use of exclusive rights in response to the market power problem ........................................... 15  
2. Market power and competition .................................................. 16  
   2.1. Market power creates welfare loss and foreclosure .................. 16  
   2.2. The manifestation of market power is well known ............... 17  
3. Market power and the supply of electricity and telecom .......... 21  
   3.1. An enhanced level of market power ....................................... 21  
   3.2. Limited ability to contain market power ............................... 25  
   3.3. Strong barriers for competition ......................................... 26  
      3.3.1. Barriers and the supply of telecommunications .............. 26  
      3.3.2. Barriers and the supply of electricity ....................... 29  
      3.3.3. The barriers might not be that unknown ................... 32  
4. Competition law contributing to the market opening ............. 32  

**Chapter II. The concept of dominance** ............................. 37  
1. Outline of the chapter .......................................................... 37  
2. The single dominance doctrine .............................................. 37  
   2.1. A clear foundation of our perception is lacking ................ 40  
   2.2. An applicable doctrine dislodged from market shares ........ 42  
      2.2.1. Competition barriers .............................................. 44  
   2.3. Super dominance – when size does matter ....................... 46  
   2.4. Summary of single dominance and market power .............. 48  
3. Oligopolistic dominance ..................................................... 49  
   3.1. Oligopolistic competition – partly uncharted waters .......... 50  
      3.1.1. Coordinated effects ................................................. 50  
      3.1.2. Non-coordinated effects .......................................... 51  
      3.1.3. Summary of coordinated and non-coordinated effects .... 52  
   3.2. From single to joint dominance in oligopolistic markets ..... 53
Chapter III. The concept of Abuse

1. Outline of the chapter ........................................... 67
2. Market opening and the obligation to liberalise .............. 68
   2.1. Article 106(1) ........................................ 69
      2.1.1. Special and exclusive rights ...................... 69
      2.1.2. Article 106(1) and exclusive rights ............ 70
   2.2. Article 106(2) and its consequences .................. 71
   2.3. Article 106(1) or (2) and the shifting between them .. 72
3. The concept of abuse .......................................... 73
   3.1. Exploitative abuse .................................... 74
   3.2. Exclusionary abuse ................................... 75
   3.3. Objective justifications ................................ 81
      3.3.1. Meeting competition .............................. 82
      3.3.2. Efficiency defence ............................... 82
   3.4. A aggravated standard of abuse ....................... 84
4. Abusive behaviour targeting the direct market ............. 86
   4.1. Excessive & unfair pricing ............................. 87
      4.1.1. Excessive pricing in practice .................... 87
      4.1.2. Costs and the unfair profit ...................... 88
      4.1.3. Price comparison .................................. 91
      4.1.4. Excessive pricing and electricity and telecom .. 92
      4.1.5. Summary of excessive pricing .................... 95
   4.2. Artificially low prices and predation .................. 95
      4.2.1. Predatory pricing in practice .................... 97
Table of Content

4.2.2. Calculating costs ........................................ 100
4.2.3. Other cases contributing to the concept ........... 102
4.2.4. Predatory pricing and electricity and telecom .... 104
4.3. Single branding arrangements ............................. 105
4.3.1. Single branding and economies of scale .......... 106
4.3.2. Single branding and electricity and telecom ..... 106
4.3.3. Summary of single branding ......................... 108
4.4. Cross-subsidising ........................................... 109
4.4.1. Cross-subsidising and the delivery of
electricity and telecommunication ................. 110
5. Abuse capitalising on the vertical integration .......... 111
5.1. Margin squeeze .............................................. 113
5.1.1. Margin squeeze and early practice .............. 115
5.1.2. Mature practice – Deutsche Telekom
and Telefónica ............................................. 116
5.1.3. Other cases contributing to the margin
squeeze concept ........................................... 122
5.1.4. Summarizing on margin squeeze ................. 125
5.2. Tying & bundling .............................................. 129
5.2.1. Tying/bundling and the delivery of electricity
and telecommunication ................................. 131
5.2.2. An unclear practice on bundling and tying ...... 132
5.3. Discrimination ................................................. 132
5.3.1. Theory and practice and their many ambiguities 134
5.3.2. Discrimination and the delivery of electricity
and telecommunication ................................. 138
5.3.3. The problem of condemning discrimination ... 139
6. Refusal to supply and shared access to the infrastructure .... 140
6.1. The foundation for a legal obligation for shared access .. 142
6.1.1. Shared access and potential sub-doctrines ....... 143
6.1.2. The non-legal arguments against shared access .. 144
6.2. The Commission’s attempt to summarise a doctrine .... 144
6.2.1. The Access Notice and its relationship to practice .... 145
6.2.2. Other notable Commission cases .................. 149
6.3. The Courts’ contribution and the
Commission’s follow-on ......................................... 151
6.3.1. From Tiercé Ladbrooke to IMS ..................... 151
6.3.2. Microsoft I, II, Sot Lélos and later cases ........ 156
6.4. Practice and the requested standard for shared access .. 159
Table of Content

7. Summary on market power and abuse .................................................. 163

Chapter IV. The limitations of competition law .................................. 165
1. Outline of the chapter ............................................................................. 165
2. The limits of competition law ................................................................. 167
   2.1. Ideological limitations ..................................................................... 168
   2.2. Limits dictated by competition law ................................................... 170
      2.2.1. Reviewing excessive pricing ....................................................... 170
      2.2.2. Reviewing vertical foreclosure .................................................... 171
      2.2.3. Reviewing the sanctions ............................................................. 172
      2.2.4. The many ambiguities in the concept of abuse ............................ 173
   2.3. Limits dictated by the markets ........................................................... 175
   2.4. Underdeveloped legal doctrines and standards .................................. 178
   2.5. A risk of pollution ........................................................................... 179
3. The contribution from competition law .................................................. 181

Chapter V. The sector regulation ............................................................. 183
1. Outline of the chapter ............................................................................. 183
2. The purpose of sector regulation and its characteristics ....................... 184
   2.1. Restructuring for competition .......................................................... 185
   2.2. Non-discriminatory access ............................................................... 186
   2.3. Implementing vertical and horizontal splits (unbundling) ................. 189
   2.4. Securing universal service .............................................................. 191
   2.5. Protecting competition ................................................................... 191
3. Legal characteristics of sector regulation .............................................. 192
4. Sector regulation and competition law .................................................. 193
   4.1. The limitations of competition law and the need for sector regulation .................................................................................................................. 194
   4.2. The contribution from competition law .............................................. 196
5. Why competition and the limitations of sector regulation? ................... 196
   5.1. Sector regulation addressing the risk of market failure ....................... 196

Chapter VI. EU models for regulating telecom ....................................... 199
1. Outline of the chapter ............................................................................. 199
2. PTT Model - a system of exclusive and special rights ............................ 199
   2.1. The PTT-model and competition law ................................................ 201
   2.2. The system errors of the PTT model and the Commission's dilemma .................................................................................................................. 203
3. The 1987 Green Paper Model ............................................................... 204
   3.1. Implementing the Green Paper ......................................................... 204
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.2.</td>
<td>Competition law and the 1987 Green Paper Model</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.</td>
<td>Competition law limits cooperation agreements</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.</td>
<td>Unfolding the 1987 Green Paper Models</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.</td>
<td>National sector regulator (NRA) – Independent</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>sector authorities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2.</td>
<td>Privileged undertakings and reserved services</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3.</td>
<td>Regulating market access</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4.</td>
<td>Shared access to the infrastructure</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.5.</td>
<td>Accounting unbundling and a few non-discrimination obligations</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Full Liberalization Model</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.</td>
<td>Implementing full liberalisation</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1.</td>
<td>Later adjustments to the Full</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Liberalization Model</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.</td>
<td>Competition law and the Full Liberalization Model</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.</td>
<td>Access Notice and the (few) cases</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.</td>
<td>Sector Inquiries</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3.</td>
<td>The concentrations and implied problems</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.</td>
<td>Competition law as a sledgehammer</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.</td>
<td>The use of Article 106(1) post liberalisation</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.</td>
<td>Unfolding the Full Liberalization Model</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1.</td>
<td>Developing national regulatory authorities</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.</td>
<td>Market access – Licensing Directive</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.</td>
<td>Adjusting the ONP Frame – Significant</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Market Power</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4.</td>
<td>Shared access to the infrastructure</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5.</td>
<td>Accounting unbundling and non-discrimination</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.6.</td>
<td>Universal service</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>99 Review Model</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.</td>
<td>Drawing up a new legal framework</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1.</td>
<td>Gradual translation and a new role for</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the Commission</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.2.</td>
<td>Later adjustments to the 99 Review Model</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.</td>
<td>Competition law and the 99 Review Model</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1.</td>
<td>The risk of a foreclosure in case law</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2.</td>
<td>Few problems with the concentrations</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3.</td>
<td>Competition law and sector regulation</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and its limits</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.4.</td>
<td>New sector inquiries</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Table of Content

5.2.5.  Competition law in a quasi-regulatory role .......................................................... 247

5.3.  Unfolding the 99 Review Model .................................................................................. 249
  5.3.1.  Market access ........................................................................................................ 249
  5.3.2.  The NRAs and their tasks ....................................................................................... 250
  5.3.3.  Market analysis and ex ante regulation .................................................................. 252
  5.3.4.  SMP and effective competition ............................................................................... 253
  5.3.5.  SMP toolbox and shared access to the infrastructure ............................................. 255
  5.3.6.  Other forms of shared use ....................................................................................... 257
  5.3.7.  Accounting unbundling and non-discrimination ...................................................... 258
  5.3.8.  Universal service .................................................................................................... 259

6.  The EU telecom models and competition law ................................................................ 260
  6.1.  Competition law and sector regulation ..................................................................... 262
  6.2.  Competition law and its ambivalent relationship with itself ..................................... 268

Chapter VII. EU models for regulating electricity ............................................................... 271
1.  Outline of the chapter ..................................................................................................... 271
2.  Utility Company Model .................................................................................................. 271
  2.1.  The Utility Model and competition law ................................................................... 272
  2.2.  The missing system failure of the Utility Model ...................................................... 273
3.  First Electricity Model .................................................................................................... 274
  3.1.  The slow implementation of the Energy Working Paper ........................................... 276
  3.2.  Competition law and the First Electricity Model ...................................................... 278
    3.2.1.  Supporting the First Electricity Directive ............................................................. 279
    3.2.2.  A more normal application? ................................................................................ 284
  3.3.  Unfolding the First Electricity Model ...................................................................... 286
    3.3.1.  National Regulatory Agency .............................................................................. 286
    3.3.2.  Market access ...................................................................................................... 287
    3.3.2.1.  Eligible customers .......................................................................................... 288
    3.3.2.2.  Production of electricity ................................................................................. 289
    3.3.2.3.  Dispatching ..................................................................................................... 290
    3.3.3.  Shared access to the infrastructure ..................................................................... 290
    3.3.3.1.  New infrastructure ........................................................................................ 292
    3.3.4.  Unbundling the sector ......................................................................................... 293
    3.3.5.  Public Service Obligations .................................................................................. 294
4.  Second Electricity Model ................................................................................................. 295
  4.1.  Implementing the Commission proposal .................................................................... 295
  4.2.  Competition law and the Second Electricity Model .................................................. 296
    4.2.1.  Competition law in quasi regulatory role .......................................................... 297
# Table of Content

4.2.1.1. EDF and the French “problem” .................. 297 
4.2.1.2. EDF’s acquisition sets the standards .............. 299 
4.2.2. One horizontal and three vertical mergers .............. 300 
4.3. Second Electricity Model ................................ 303 
   4.3.1. National Regulatory Agency ...................... 303 
   4.3.2. Market access ................................... 304 
   4.3.2.1. Production of electricity ...................... 304 
   4.3.2.2. Dispatching .................................. 305 
   4.3.3. Shared access to the infrastructure .............. 305 
   4.3.3.1. Derogations .................................. 307 
   4.3.4. Unbundling ..................................... 307 
   4.3.5. Public Service Obligations ...................... 308 
5. Third Electricity Model .................................. 309 
   5.1. Implementing the Commission proposal .............. 310 
   5.2. Competition law and the Third Electricity Model .... 312 
      5.2.1. The sector Inquiry ............................ 312 
      5.2.2. Competition law in quasi regulatory role ...... 314 
      5.2.2.1. Ownership unbundling through the backdoor . 315 
      5.2.3. A somewhat lose concept of dominance ......... 317 
      5.2.4. A more normal application? ................... 318 
   5.3. The Third Electricity Model ......................... 320 
      5.3.1. National Regulatory Agency .................... 320 
      5.3.2. Market access ................................ 322 
      5.3.2.1. Production of electricity ................. 323 
      5.3.2.2. Dispatching ................................ 323 
      5.3.3. Shared access to the infrastructure ............ 324 
      5.3.3.1. Derogations ................................ 325 
      5.3.4. Unbundling the sector ........................ 326 
      5.3.5. Public Service Obligations .................... 330 
6. The EU electricity models and competition law ............ 331 
   6.1. Competition law and sector regulation ............. 332 
   6.2. Competition law and its ambivalent relationship with itself ........... 338 
      6.2.1. From unusual to unexplainable and perhaps undefendable ........... 339 

## Chapter VIII. Competition law and sector regulation ....... 341 
1. Outline of the chapter ................................... 341 
2. A sector framed competition law ........................ 341 
   2.1. The real content of sector regulation .............. 342
Table of Content

2.2. The ambiguous role of competition law ............... 344
   2.2.1. The roles allow overlapping competences .... 344
   2.2.2. The overlaps create areas of conflicts .......... 345
   2.2.3. The conflict might lead to uncoordinated decisions ............ 348

2.3. A practical priority rule formulated by the Commission . 350
2.4. Formulating a priority rule requires a prudent balancing . 352
2.5. Does the Commission respect the priority rule? .......... 354

3. A pollution of competition law .................................. 354
   3.1. Doctrines are influenced by the sector and the Commission's approach .............................. 355
      3.1.1. The direct influence ................................. 356
      3.1.2. The indirect influence ............................... 358

3.2. An influence embracing the core of competition law ...... 358
3.3. Would the influence have been stronger without sector regulation? ..................................... 359

3.4. Sector regulation protects competition law against itself 363

4. Reframing the relation of competition law and sector regulation ........................................... 363

Table of Cases .............................................................. 367