Hybrid Financial Instruments in International Tax Law

Jakob Bundgaard

dreyersfond

© Wolters Kluwer
# Table of Contents

Preface xv

List of Abbreviations xvii

**PART I Setting the Scene**

**CHAPTER 1**

Introduction 3

1. **Defining Hybrid Financial Instruments** 3

2. **The Topic: Relevance and Background** 4

   2.1. **Financial Innovation** 4

   2.2. **Tax Law Issues Raised by Hybrid Financial Instruments** 8

3. **Objective of the Study** 11

4. **Delimitation and Omissions** 14

5. **Methodology** 17

6. **Previous Studies** 18

7. **Outline of the Study** 20

**CHAPTER 2**

**Non-tax Framework and Drivers** 21

1. **Overview** 21

2. **Basic Characteristics of Debt, Equity and Hybrid Financial Instruments** 22

3. **Legal Framework** 25

4. **Drivers Behind the Use and Design of Hybrid Financial Instruments** 26

   4.1. **Lower Financing Costs and Tax Benefits** 27

   4.2. **Financial Accounting Treatment** 28

   4.3. **Ensuring Creditworthiness: Credit Ratings** 31

   4.4. **Financial Sector Considerations: Innovative Tier 1 Capital** 33
Table of Contents

4.5. Other Benefits and Areas of Use ........................................... 37
5. Interim Conclusions .............................................................. 39

CHAPTER 3
Basic Principles Determining the Taxation of Debt, Equity and Hybrid
Financial Instruments ............................................................... 41
1. Relevance of the Debt/Equity Distinction in International Tax Law ... 41
2. Comparative Overview of Classification Consequences .................. 44
   2.1. Global Overview ........................................................... 44
   2.2. Tax Treatment of an Equity Issuer .................................... 44
   2.3. Tax Treatment of an Equity Investor ................................. 45
   2.4. Tax Treatment of a Debt Issuer ........................................ 49
   2.5. Tax Treatment of a Debt Investor ..................................... 54
3. Interim Conclusions .............................................................. 57

PART II
General Tax Framework Applicable to the Classification of Hybrid Financial
Instruments ................................................................................. 59

CHAPTER 4
Domestic Criteria Applied to the Classification of Hybrid Financial
Instruments .................................................................................. 61
1. Global Overview ...................................................................... 61
2. Principles Applied for the Classification of Hybrid Financial
   Instruments in United States Federal Tax Law ......................... 66
   2.1. In General ......................................................................... 66
   2.2. Specific Statutory Authority in IRC § 385 ........................... 67
   2.3. Administrative Guidance: “The Modern Period” ................. 70
   2.4. The Debt/Equity Multifactor Distinction as Determined by
        Case Law .......................................................................... 72
       2.4.1. In General ................................................................. 72
       2.4.2. Maturity Date ............................................................ 76
       2.4.3. Remedies for Default ............................................... 79
       2.4.4. Subordination ........................................................... 80
       2.4.5. Certainty of Return .................................................... 81
       2.4.6. Participation in Corporate Gains ................................. 82
       2.4.7. Participation in Both Corporate Gains and Corporate
               Losses ....................................................................... 83
       2.4.8. Participation in Control .............................................. 83
       2.4.9. Label Applied by Parties ........................................... 84
       2.4.10. Pro Rata Holding of Stock and Debt: Identity between
               Shareholder(s) and Creditor(s) .................................... 85
       2.4.11. Thin Capitalization or Capacity to Repay .................... 86
       2.4.12. Intent to Create Creditor-Debtor Relationship ............. 87
2.4.13. Hypothetical Third Party Loans 87
2.4.14. History of Relationship 88
2.4.15. Use of Funds 88
2.4.16. Foreign Classification 88

2.5. Historic and Current Trends in the Development of Hybrid Financial Instruments in the United States 89

2.6. The Debt-Equity Distinction in the Light of Financial Innovation 93

2.7. Tax Reform Proposals Regarding Debt-Equity Treatment and Other Legislative Actions Affecting the Use of Hybrid Financial Instruments 94

2.8. Policy Proposals in Legal Commentary 97

3. Principles Applied for the Classification of Hybrid Financial Instruments in German Tax Law 97

4. Principles Applied for the Classification of Hybrid Financial Instruments in Danish Tax Law 103
4.1. In General 103
4.2. Debt Classification 105
4.2.1. The Concept of Debt and Claims 105
4.2.2. The Notion of "Interest" 107
4.3. Equity Classification 109
4.3.1. The Notion of "Equity" 109
4.3.2. What is a "Shareholder"? 110
4.4. Case Law Regarding the Debt-Equity Distinction 112
4.4.1. In General 112
4.4.2. The Debt-Equity Distinction in Case Law Regarding Partnerships 112
4.4.3. The Debt-Equity Distinction in Case Law Regarding Corporations 118
4.5. Principles Applicable to the Classification of Hybrid Financial Instruments 120
4.6. Reclassification of Hybrid Financial Instruments: Legal Authority and Requirements 124
4.6.1. General Observations on Recharacterization 124
4.6.2. Reclassification of Debt to Equity 129
4.6.3. Reclassification of Repayment of Debt as Dividends 132
4.6.4. Reclassification of Equity to Debt 133

5. Interim Conclusions 136

CHAPTER 5
Classification of Hybrid Financial Instruments According to Tax Treaties 137
1. Introduction 137
2. The Concept of Dividends: Article 10(3) OECD 138
3. The Concept of Interest: Article 11(3) OECD 143
Table of Contents

4. Distinguishing Dividend and Interest Income: The Relevant Tie Breaking Factor? 146
   4.1. General Remarks 146
   4.2. The Corporate Rights Test 147
   4.3. The Debt Claim Test 150
5. Capital Gains: Article 13(4) OECD 153
6. Other Income: Article 21(1) OECD 154
7. Classification Conflicts 154
8. Tax Arbitrage and Tax Treaties 155
9. Interim Conclusions 156

CHAPTER 6
General Principles for the Classification and Taxation of Hybrid Financial Instruments Derived from European Union Law 159
1. Hybrid Financial Instruments and Primary European Union Law 159
   1.1. Introduction 159
   1.2. Issues Arising from Primary European Union Law in the Context of Hybrid Financial Instruments 160
   1.3. Scope: Identifying the Applicable Freedom 161
   1.4. The Existence of a Discriminatory or Restrictive Domestic Measure 163
   1.5. Justifications: The Existence of Legitimate Grounds 164
      1.5.1. In General 164
      1.5.2. Loss of Revenue 165
      1.5.3. Level of Taxation and Prevention of Harmful Tax Competition 165
      1.5.4. Ensure the Effectiveness of Fiscal Supervision 166
      1.5.5. Coherence of the Tax System 166
      1.5.6. Balanced Allocation of the Power to Impose Taxes 166
      1.5.7. The Objective to Prevent Double Use of Losses 167
      1.5.8. Prevention of Tax Abuse 167
   1.6. Proportionality 170
   1.7. Influence of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union on Member States’ Approaches to Classification and Taxation of Hybrid Financial Instruments 170
      1.7.1. General Considerations on Classification Methods 171
      1.7.2. Double Taxation and European Union Law 171
      1.7.3. Per se Classification of Financial Instruments 175
      1.7.4. Reclassification on the Basis of Substance over Form Approaches 178
      1.7.5. Interim Conclusions 180
2. Secondary European Union Law: Classification of the Yield on Hybrid Financial Instruments According to Corporate Tax Law Directives 180
   2.1. Background, Aim and Structure 180
# Table of Contents

2.2. Hybrid Debt Instruments (Equity-Like Debt Instruments) 182  
2.2.1. The Notion of Interest and Debt According to the Interest-Royalty Directive: Positive Demarcation 182  
2.2.2. Exclusion of Certain Hybrid Financial Instruments: Negative Demarcation 183  

2.3. Hybrid Equity Instruments (Debt-Like Equity Instruments) 187  
2.3.2. Community Law Expression with an (Almost) Autonomous Meaning 188  
2.3.3. Content of the Notion of "Distribution of Profits" 190  
a) General Interpretation in Commentary 190  
b) Interpretation of the Parent-Subsidiary Directive by the European Court of Justice 192  
c) Different Meaning in Articles 4 and 5 of the Parent-Subsidiary Directive? 193  
2.3.4. Scope of the Parent-Subsidiary Directive with Respect to Hybrid Financial Instruments 194  
a) General Observations 194  
b) Legal Basis to Include Yield from Hybrid Financial Instruments under the Parent-Subsidiary Directive 195  
c) Application of the Parent-Subsidiary Directive on Reclassified Interest Payments 196  
d) Yield on Instruments Excluded from the Scope of the Interest-Royalty Directive 201  
2.3.5. Are Classification Inconsistencies Allowed? 202  
2.3.6. Does the Parent-Subsidiary Directive Allow Reclassification of Dividends? 204  

2.4. Fulfillment of the Holding Requirement by Hybrid Financial Instruments 206  

2.5. Applicability of the European Union Arbitration Convention 211  

2.6. Interim Conclusions 212  

## CHAPTER 7  
Cross-Border Tax Arbitrage and Hybrid Financial Instruments 215  
1. Definition and Stating the Problem 215  
2. OECD Recommendations for the Design of Domestic Rules: BEPS Action No. 2 221  
3. Domestic Responses Towards Cross-Border Tax Arbitrage by Use of Hybrid Financial Instruments 224  

ix
Table of Contents

4.1. Do the European Union Corporate Tax Directives Minder Member States from Curbing Cross-Border Tax Arbitrage? 233
4.2. Does Tax Arbitrage Constitute Fraud or Abuse under the Directives? 234
4.3. Rejection of Directive Benefits due to Different Classification and/or Deductibility in the Source State 236
4.5. The European Union Anti Tax Avoidance Directive 241
5. European Union Law Conformity of Coordination Rules 242
  5.1. In General 242
  5.2. Scope of Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union 243
  5.3. The Existence of a Discriminatory or Restrictive Domestic Measure 244
    5.3.1. In General 244
    5.3.2. Restrictions Caused by Linking Rules Disallowing Participation Exemption: State of Origin Rules 245
    5.3.3. Restrictions Caused by Linking Rules Disallowing Interest Deduction: Host State Rules 251
  5.4. Justifications: The Existence of Legitimate Grounds 255
    5.4.1. In General 255
    5.4.2. Loss of Revenue 255
    5.4.3. Level of Taxation and Prevention of Harmful Tax Competition 256
    5.4.4. Ensure the Effectiveness of Fiscal Supervision 257
    5.4.5. Coherence of the Tax System 258
    5.4.6. Balanced Allocation of the Power to Impose Taxes 259
    5.4.7. The Objective to Prevent Double Use of Losses 260
    5.4.8. Prevention of Tax Abuse 262
  5.5. Proportionality 268
6. Interim Conclusions 268

PART III
Classification and Treatment of Specific Hybrid Financial Instruments 271

CHAPTER 8
General Considerations 273

CHAPTER 9
Equity-Flavored Debt Instruments 279
  1. Perpetual Debt and Super Maturity Debt 279
    1.1. Introduction 279
    1.2. Economic and Legal Framework 280
      1.2.1. In General 280
1.2.2. Regulatory Framework 281
1.2.3. Financial Accounting Framework 284

1.3. Classification and Treatment According to Domestic Tax Law 284
  1.3.1. Comparative Overview 284
  1.3.2. United States Federal Tax Law 285
  1.3.3. German Tax Law 289
  1.3.4. Danish Tax Law 290

1.4. Treatment According to European Union Corporate Tax Directives 297

1.5. Treatment According to Tax Treaties 300

1.6. Interim Conclusions 302

2. Convertible Debt Instruments 303
  2.1. Introduction 303
  2.2. Financial and Contractual Construction 303
    2.2.1. Optional Convertible Bonds: Financial and Contractual Construction 303
    2.2.2. Mandatory Convertibles and Reverse Convertibles 306
    2.2.3. Contingent Convertible Instruments 309
    2.2.4. Warrant Loans and Option Loans (Bond cum Warrant) 310
  2.3. The Financial Decision on Investing in and Issuing Convertible Bonds 311

  2.4. Domestic Tax Treatment of Optional Convertible Debt Instruments 313
    2.4.1. Comparative Overview 313
    2.4.2. United States Federal Tax Law 315
    2.4.3. German Tax Law 316
    2.4.4. Danish Tax Law 317
      a) Introduction 317
      b) Interaction with Company Law 319
      c) On the Substance Requirement 321
      d) Integration or Bifurcation? 321
      e) Tax Treatment of the Investor 322
      f) Tax Treatment of the Issuer 323

  2.5. Domestic Tax Treatment of Mandatory Convertible Bonds and Reverse Convertibles 325
    2.5.1. Comparative Overview 325
    2.5.2. Federal United States Tax Law 326
    2.5.3. German Tax Law 326
    2.5.4. Danish Tax Law 327

  2.6. Contingent Convertibles 329
    2.6.1. Comparative Overview 329
    2.6.2. Federal United States Tax Law 330
    2.6.3. German Tax Law 331
    2.6.4. Danish Tax Law 331

  2.7. Warrant Loans 332
    2.7.1. Comparative Overview 332
Table of Contents

2.7.2. Federal United States Tax Law 332
2.7.3. German Tax Law 333
2.7.4. Danish Tax Law 333
2.8. Treatment According to European Union Corporate Tax Directives 335
2.8.1. Optional Convertibles 335
2.8.2. Mandatory Convertibles 337
2.8.3. Contingent Convertibles 337
2.8.4. Warrant Loans 337
2.9. Treatment According to Tax Treaties 338
2.9.1. Optional Convertibles 338
2.9.2. Mandatory Convertibles 339
2.9.3. Contingent Convertibles 340
2.9.4. Warrant Loans 340
2.10. Interim Conclusions 341
3. Profit Participating Loans: Contingent Interest and/or Principal 342
3.1. Introduction 342
3.2. Structure and Economic Characteristics of Profit Participating Loans 344
3.3. Financial Rationales 345
3.4. Domestic Tax Law Classification of Profit Participating Loans 346
3.4.1. Comparative Overview 346
3.4.2. Federal United States Tax Law 346
3.4.3. German Tax Law 347
3.4.4. Danish Tax Law 348
   a) Introduction 348
   b) Classification of the Instrument 349
   c) One or More Instruments 351
   d) Classification of Yield on Profit Participating Loans: Interest, Capital Losses or? 351
   e) On the Computation of the Debtor’s Losses 354
   f) Optional Use of the Mark-to-Market Principle 357
   g) Tax Treatment of the Creditor 358
   h) Danish Withholding Tax on Cross-Border Profit Participating Loan-Yield? 360
   i) Convertible Profit Participating Loans 361
3.5. Treatment According to European Union Corporate Tax Directives 362
3.6. Treatment According to Tax Treaties 364
3.7. Interim Conclusions 367

Chapter 10
Debt-Flavored Equity Instruments 369
1. In General 369
2. Financial Construction 370
# Table of Contents

3. The Financial Decision to Issue and Invest in Preference Shares 371
4. Tax Treatment of Preference Shares in Domestic Tax Law 372
   4.1. Comparative Overview 372
   4.2. United States Federal Tax Law 375
   4.3. German Tax Law 376
   4.4. Danish Tax Law 377
5. Treatment According to European Union Corporate Tax Directives 381
6. Treatment According to Tax Treaties 383
7. Interim Conclusions 385

## PART IV
Conclusions and Tax Policy Recommendations 387

### CHAPTER 11
Conclusions 389
1. General Findings 389
2. Comparative Findings 391
3. Findings Regarding Tax Treaties 392
4. Findings Regarding European Union Law 392
5. Findings Regarding Specific Hybrid Financial Instruments 395

### CHAPTER 12
Tax Policy Considerations 399
1. Neutrality between Debt and Equity 399
2. Bifurcation versus Integration 404
3. Drawing the Line between Debt and Equity 406
4. Proposals Improving the "Line Drawing" 407
5. Proposals Eliminating the Effects of the Current Debt-Equity Distinction 409
6. Proposals Eliminating the Debt-Equity Distinction 410
   6.1. Allowance for Corporate Equity: ACE Regimes 411
   6.2. Overview of Country Practices: Domestic Equity and Dividends Deduction Regimes 413
7. Evaluation 416

**Bibliography** 417

**Index** 465