EU Competition Law, Data Protection and Online Platforms

Data as Essential Facility

Inge Graef
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements xi

**Chapter 1**

Introduction 1

1.1 Background 1

1.2 Focus of the Book 2

1.3 Structure and Methodology 3

**Part I**

Competition and Innovation on Online Platforms 7

**Chapter 2**

Business Models and Economic Characteristics of Online Platforms 9

2.1 Introduction 9

2.2 Describing the Online Intermediary Environment 9

2.2.1 Search Engines 10

2.2.2 Social Networks 12

2.2.3 E-commerce Platforms 16

2.3 Multi-sided Businesses 18

2.3.1 Multi-sidedness in General 18

2.3.2 Establishing a Multi-sided Business 25

2.3.3 Multi-sided Nature of Online Platforms 27

2.4 Network Economy Characteristics of Online Platforms 32

2.4.1 Economies of Scale 32

2.4.2 Network Effects 33

2.4.3 Switching Costs and Lock-In 40

2.4.4 Barriers to Entry 47

2.5 Conclusion 53
Table of Contents

CHAPTER 3
Evaluating the Link Between Competition and Innovation 55
3.1 Introduction 55
3.2 Measuring Competition and Innovation 56
  3.2.1 Indicators of Competition 56
  3.2.2 Indicators of Innovation 57
  3.2.3 Reliability of the Indicators 59
3.3 Economic Theory and Empirical Evidence on the Relationship Between Competition and Innovation 59
  3.3.1 Schumpeter 60
  3.3.2 Arrow 61
  3.3.3 Aghion 63
  3.3.4 Appraisal 64
3.4 Different Types of Innovation 68
  3.4.1 Disruptive versus Sustaining Innovation 68
  3.4.2 Appraisal 71
3.5 Conclusion 74

CHAPTER 4
Market Definition and Dominance on Online Platforms 77
4.1 Introduction 77
4.2 Market Definition of Multi-sided Businesses 78
  4.2.1 An Approach for Market Definition of Multi-sided Platforms 79
  4.2.2 Relevant Product Market for the User Side 87
  4.2.3 Relevant Product Market for the Advertiser Side 93
  4.2.4 Relevant Geographic Market for Online Platforms 99
  4.2.5 Economic Tools for Market Definition on Multi-sided Platforms 100
4.3 Market Definition in New Economy Industries 103
  4.3.1 US Initiative Towards a Framework for Innovation in Competition Analysis 104
  4.3.2 EU Approach Towards Innovation in Competition Enforcement 106
4.4 Assessing Dominance on Online Platforms 111
  4.4.1 Room for Competition in Markets in Which Multi-sided Businesses Operate 111
  4.4.2 Establishing Dominance of Online Platform Providers 114
  4.4.3 From Market Shares to Potential Competition? 117
4.5 Conclusion 120

PART II
Data as Essential Facility 123

CHAPTER 5
Setting the Scene 125
5.1 Introduction 125
5.2 Role of Data in the Digital Economy 126
## Table of Contents

6.8.1 Market Definition and Dominance in Essential Facilities Cases 210  
6.8.2 Absolute Refusals to Supply 216  
6.8.2.1 Indispensability 216  
6.8.2.2 Exclusion of All Effective Competition on the Downstream Market 220  
6.8.2.3 Prevention of the Introduction of a New Product 223  
6.8.2.4 Absence of an Objective Justification 229  
6.8.3 Disruptions of Supply 235  
6.8.4 Discriminatory Refusals to Supply 242  
6.9 Conclusion 245  

### CHAPTER 7  
Application of the Essential Facilities Doctrine to Data 249  
7.1 Introduction 249  
7.2 Data as a Competitive Advantage 249  
7.3 Scenarios with Regard to Access to Data 256  
7.4 Market Definition in Essential Facilities Cases Relating to Data 259  
7.5 Market Power with Regard to Data 265  
7.6 Characteristics Which Set Data Apart from Other Assets Previously Being Considered under the Essential Facilities Doctrine 267  
7.7 Abusive Nature of Refusals to Give Access to Data on Online Platforms 269  
7.7.1 Indispensability of Data 270  
7.7.2 Exclusion of All Effective Competition on the Downstream Market 273  
7.7.3 Prevention of the Introduction of a New Product 274  
7.7.4 Absence of an Objective Justification 276  
7.8 Conditions under Which Access to Data Should Be Granted 277  
7.9 Conclusion 279  

### PART III  
Data Protection Interests in Competition Enforcement 281  

### CHAPTER 8  
How Data Protection Has Become Relevant to Competition Enforcement 283  
8.1 Introduction 283  
8.2 Disentangling Data Protection and Privacy 283  
8.3 Rise of Attention for Data Protection in Competition Enforcement 287  
8.4 Conclusion 292  

### CHAPTER 9  
Identifying the Interaction Between Competition and Data Protection Law 293  
9.1 Introduction 293  
9.2 Key Data Protection Principles and Their Enforcement in Relation to Competition Law 293  
9.2.1 From Consent and Purpose Limitation to Substitutability 294
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.2.2</td>
<td>Comparing the Enforcement Mechanisms of EU Data Protection and Competition Law</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Effect of Data Protection Regulation on Competition</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>Data Protection as a Non-price Parameter of Competition</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>Potential Conflicts Between Competition and Data Protection Law</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>Exploring the Objectives of EU Competition Law in Current Decision-Making Practice and Case Law</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.1</td>
<td>Article 101 TFEU</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.2</td>
<td>Merger Review</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.3</td>
<td>Article 102 TFEU</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.4</td>
<td>Consumer Welfare Standard</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>Examining the Scope for Data Protection Interests in EU Competition Policy</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.1</td>
<td>Comparing the Objectives of EU Competition and Data Protection Law</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.2</td>
<td>Weighing Pros and Cons of Integrating Data Protection Interests in EU Competition Policy</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.3</td>
<td>Three-Layer Approach Towards the Integration of Data Protection Interests in EU Competition Policy</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.3.1</td>
<td>Protection of Economic Efficiency Also Furthers Data Protection Interests</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.3.2</td>
<td>Going beyond Protecting Economic Efficiency?</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.3.3</td>
<td>Negative Duty to Respect the Right to Data Protection</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.3.4</td>
<td>Positive Duty to Promote the Application of the Right to Data Protection</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>Data Protection Interests in Merger Review</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.1</td>
<td>Assessing Data-Related Competition Concerns in Merger Cases</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.2</td>
<td>Scenario 1: The Merger Does Not Significantly Impede Effective Competition</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.3</td>
<td>Scenario 2: The Merger Significantly Impedes Effective Competition</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>Data Protection Interests and Abuse of Dominance</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Threefold Relevance of Data for Competition Policy</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>Two General Observations</td>
<td>366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>Summarising the Results from the Analysis in Part I</td>
<td>366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>Summarising the Results from the Analysis in Part II</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5 Summarising the Results from the Analysis in Part III</td>
<td>372</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.6 Outlook</td>
<td>375</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>377</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td>407</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Legislation</td>
<td>415</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>419</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>