Private-Sector Standards as Technical Barriers in International Trade in Goods: In Search of WTO Disciplines

Arkady Kudryavtsev
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ......................................................................................... 1
List of Abbreviations ...................................................................................... x
List of Figures ................................................................................................. xiv

CHAPTER I: Introduction ............................................................................... 1
1.1 Problem Statement .................................................................................. 2
1.2 Research Questions ................................................................................. 5
1.3 Structure of the Study ............................................................................. 6
1.4 Scope of the Study .................................................................................. 7
1.5 Relevance of the Study .......................................................................... 8
1.6 Methodology and Approach .................................................................. 10

CHAPTER II: The “World” of Private-Sector Standards .......................... 13
2.1 Defining the Concept of a Private-Sector Standard .............................. 14
  2.1.1 Main Characteristics of Private-Sector Standards
      and Their Conformity Assessment Procedures .................................... 16
      2.1.1.1 Defining the Concept of a Standard ........................................... 16
      2.1.1.2 Mandatory or Voluntary? ......................................................... 17
      2.1.1.3 Excluding Services and Consensus Rule ................................. 19
      2.1.1.4 Main Characteristics of Private-Sector Standards ................. 20
      2.1.1.5 Some Examples of Private Sector Standards .......................... 22
      2.1.1.6 Reasons for Using the Term “Private-Sector Standard” ........ 24
      2.1.1.7 Brief Definition of a Private-Sector Standard
          and its Conformity Assessment Procedure ..................................... 25
  2.1.2 Operational Stages of Private-Sector Standards ............................. 26
      2.1.2.1 Preparation of a Standard ....................................................... 26
      2.1.2.2 Adoption of a Standard ......................................................... 27
      2.1.2.3 Application of a Standard ..................................................... 27
      2.1.2.4 Implementation of a Standard ................................................ 28
      2.1.2.5 Conformity Assessment and Enforcement of a Standard ...... 29
  2.2 Typology of Private-Sector Standards ................................................. 29
    2.2.1 Choice of Relevant Criteria for
        Typology of Private-Sector Standards ........................................... 30
    2.2.2 Forms of Private-Sector Standards .............................................. 32
    2.2.3 Types of Organizations Adopting Private-Sector Standards ...... 34
      2.2.3.1 How a Document Becomes a Private-Sector Standard:
          De Facto and De Jure Private-Sector Standards .......................... 35
      2.2.3.2 Private-Sector Standards Developed
          by Different Types of Organizations ............................................. 38
2.2.3.2.1 Individual Company Private-Sector Standards
2.2.3.2.2 Collective Private-Sector Standards
2.2.3.2.2.1 Advantages of Collective Private-Sector Standards
2.2.3.2.2.2 Forms of Incorporation of Private Standard-Setting Entities
2.2.3.2.2.3 National, Regional and International Private-Sector Standards

2.2.4 Level of Governmental Involvement or Incentives for the Adoption and Application of Private-Sector Standards
2.2.4.1 Private-Sector Standards vs. Public-Sector Standards
2.2.4.2 Public and Private-Sector Standards vs. Technical Regulations
2.2.4.3 Resolving Private vs. Public Dilemma: Which Standards Are Relevant?
2.2.4.3.1 International Standard-Setting Organizations
2.2.4.3.2 Regional Standards-Setting Organizations
2.2.4.3.3 National Standards Bodies
2.2.4.3.4 The Private-Public Regulatory Continuum

2.2.5 Objectives of Private-Sector Standards

2.2.6 Targeted Organizations for the Implementation of Private-Sector Standards

2.2.7 Targeted Clients of Private-Sector Standards

2.2.8 Scope of Private-Sector Standards: Product and Process Requirements

2.2.9 Conformity Assessment Systems of Private-Sector Standards

2.3 Role of Private-Sector Standards in International Trade
2.3.1 The Proliferation of Private-Sector Standards
2.3.2 Reasons for the Proliferation of Private-Sector Standards
2.3.2.1 The Globalization of International Trade
2.3.2.2 Evolving Consumer Demands and Business Reputation
2.3.2.3 Corporate Social Responsibility
2.3.2.4 Increased Business Concentration
2.3.2.5 Changes in the Regulatory Environment
2.3.2.5.1 Shifts in the Regulatory Approach to Process-Based Criteria
2.3.2.5.2 Insufficient Flexibility, Effectiveness and the Mobility of Public Regulation
2.3.2.5.3 Product Liability Rules and Risk Management
2.3.3 Effects of Private-Sector Standards on International Trade
2.3.3.1 Positive Effects of Private-Sector Standards
2.3.3.2 Challenges Posed by Private-Sector Standards
2.3.4 Meeting the Challenges Posed by Private-Sector Standards
2.3.4.1 Private-Sector Standards and WTO Rules
2.3.4.2 Private-Sector Standards, IP Rights and Competition Law
CHAPTER III: Private-Sector Standards under the GATT 1994 and the International Law Rules on the Attribution of Conduct to WTO Members

3.1 Scope of Application of the GATT 1994

3.1.1 Material Scope of Application of the GATT 1994: Mandatory or Voluntary Measures?

3.1.2 Personal Scope of Application of the GATT 1994

3.1.2.1 Responsibility of WTO Members under the GATT 1994 for Their Measures Affecting Private Behaviour

3.1.2.2 Are There Implicit or Explicit Positive Obligations to Discipline Private Conduct Under the GATT 1994?

3.1.3 Temporal Scope of Application of the GATT 1994

3.2 Attribution of Private Conduct to WTO Members

3.2.1 Attribution of Private Conduct to States Under the General Rules of Customary International Law

3.2.1.1 Conduct of State Organs and Entities Exercising Elements of Governmental Authority

3.2.1.2 Conduct Directed or Controlled by a State, or Accepted by a State as Its Own

3.2.2 Attribution of Private Conduct to WTO Members Under the GATT 1994 and Certain Other WTO Agreements

3.2.2.1 Practice on the Attribution of Private Conduct Under the GATT 1994

3.2.2.1.1 General Approach to the Attribution of Private Conduct Under the GATT 1994

3.2.2.1.2 Attribution of Conduct of State Trading Enterprises Under the GATT 1994

3.2.2.2 Practice on the Attribution of Private Conduct Under Certain Other WTO Agreements

3.2.2.2.1 Attribution of Private Conduct Under the SCM Agreement

3.2.2.2.2 Attribution of Private Conduct Under the Agreement on Agriculture

3.3 Relevant Rules of the GATT 1994

3.3.1 Non-Discrimination Obligations: Most-Favoured-Nation and National Treatment

3.3.1.1 Essence of MFN Treatment Obligation

3.3.1.2 Essence of National Treatment Obligation

3.3.1.3 “Like Products” in Articles I:1 and III:4

3.3.1.4 Any Advantage “Accorded Immediately and Unconditionally” in Article I:1

3.3.1.5 “Treatment No Less Favourable” in Article III:4

3.3.2 Rules on the Publication and Administration of Trade Laws and
| Regulations                                                                                       | 193 |
| 3.3.2.1 Publication of Trade Laws and Regulations                                              | 195 |
| 3.3.2.2 Administration of Trade Laws and Regulations                                           | 198 |
| 3.3.3 Elimination of Quantitative Restrictions on the Importation or Exportation of Products    | 201 |
| 3.3.4 General Exceptions From the GATT Obligations                                              | 207 |
| 3.3.4.1 Measures Necessary to Protect Public Morals                                            | 211 |
| 3.3.4.2 Measures Necessary to Protect Life or Health                                            | 214 |
| 3.3.4.3 Measures Necessary to Secure Compliance With Laws or Regulations                       | 217 |
| 3.3.4.4 Measures Relating to the Conservation of Exhaustible Natural Resources                  | 219 |
| 3.3.4.5 Chapeau of Article XX                                                                   | 224 |
| 3.3.5 Non-Violation and Situation Complaints                                                    | 230 |
| 3.3.6 Processes and Production Methods Under the GATT 1994                                      | 233 |
| 3.4 Summary and Conclusions                                                                     | 237 |

CHAPTER IV: Private-Sector Standards and the TBT Agreement

4.1 Scope of Application of the TBT Agreement

4.1.1 Material Scope of Application of the TBT Agreement

4.1.1.1 Technical Regulation

4.1.1.2 Standard

4.1.1.3 Conformity Assessment Procedures

4.1.1.4 Processes and Production Methods Under the TBT Agreement

4.1.1.4.1 Negotiation History of the TBT Agreement and PPMs

4.1.1.4.2 Dispute Settlement Practice Under the TBT Agreement and PPMs

4.1.2 Relationship of the TBT Agreement

4.1.2.1 Relationship With the GATS

4.1.2.2 Relationship With the Agreement on Government Procurement

4.1.2.3 Relationship With the SPS Agreement

4.1.2.4 Relationship With the GATT 1994

4.1.3 Personal Scope of Application of the TBT Agreement

4.1.3.1 Central and Local Governmental Bodies

4.1.3.2 Non-Governmental Bodies

4.1.3.3 Regional Bodies

4.1.4 Temporal Scope of Application of the TBT Agreement

4.2 Obligations of WTO Members With Respect to Different Types of Bodies

4.2.1 Positive Obligations

4.2.1.1 Positive Obligations With Respect to Technical Regulations
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.2 Positive Obligations With Respect to Standards</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.3 Positive Obligations With Respect</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to Conformity Assessment Procedures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.4 Available “Reasonable” Measures</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Negative Obligations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Main Disciplines of the TBT Agreement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 MFN and National Treatment Obligations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Prohibition of Unnecessary Obstacles to Trade</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Harmonization Based on Relevant International Standards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4 Other Obligations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4.1 Equivalence and Mutual Recognition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4.2 Product Requirements in Terms of Performance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4.3 Transparency and Notification</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5 TBT Agreement and Developing Country Members</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5.1 Technical Assistance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5.2 Special and Differential Treatment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Summary and Conclusions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER V: Private-Sector Standards and the SPS Agreement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Scope of Application of the SPS Agreement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1 Material Scope of Application of the SPS Agreement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1.1 Definition of an SPS Measure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1.1.1 Purpose of an SPS Measure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1.1.2 Other Substantive Criteria for an SPS Measure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1.3 SPS Measures: Voluntary vs. Mandatory</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1.2 Measures Affecting International Trade</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.2 Relationship With the GATT 1994</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.3 Personal Scope of Application of the SPS Agreement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.4 Temporal Scope of Application of the SPS Agreement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Obligations of WTO Members With Respect to Different Types of Bodies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 Positive Obligations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2 Negative Obligations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3 Work of the SPS Committee With Respect to Article 13 of the SPS Agreement and Private-Sector Standards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Main Disciplines of the SPS Agreement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1 Right to Take SPS Measures and the Burden of Proof</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2 Basic Limitations on the Right to Take SPS Measures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2.1 Necessity Requirement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2.2 The Use of Scientific Principles and Evidence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.3.2.3 The Prohibition of Arbitrary or Unjustifiable Discrimination and Disguised Restrictions on Trade

5.3.3 Promotion of Harmonization Based on International Standards

5.3.3.1 Relationship Between the Provisions of Article 3

5.3.3.2 International Standard Under the SPS Agreement

5.3.3.3 Measures “Based on” and “Conforming to” International Standards

5.3.3.4 Higher Level of SPS Protection Than in an International Standard

5.3.4 Risk Analysis Disciplines and Provisional Measures

5.3.4.1 Risk Assessment Obligations

5.3.4.1.1 Nature of the Risk Assessment

5.3.4.1.2 SPS Measures Based on Risk Assessment

5.3.4.2 Risk Management

5.3.4.2.1 Choice of Appropriate Level of Protection

5.3.4.2.2 Choice of an SPS Measure

5.3.4.3 Provisional SPS Measures and the Role of the Precautionary Principle

5.3.4.3.1 Precautionary Approach and Article 5.7 of the SPS Agreement

5.3.4.3.2 Relationship of Article 5.7 With Other Relevant Provisions of the SPS Agreement

5.3.4.3.3 Test Under Article 5.7

5.3.5 Other Relevant Disciplines of the SPS Agreement

5.3.5.1 Equivalence and Adaptation to Regional Conditions

5.3.5.1.1 Equivalence

5.3.5.1.2 Adaptation to Regional Conditions

5.3.5.2 Control, Inspection and Approval Procedures

5.3.5.3 Transparency and Notification

5.3.5.4 Provisions With Respect to Developing Countries

5.4 Summary and Conclusions

CHAPTER VI: Conclusions

Summary

Appendix 1

Appendix 2

Appendix 3

Appendix 4

Valorization Addendum

Table of Cases

Bibliography

Curriculum Vitae