Labour Law and Social Progress
Holding the Line or Shifting the Boundaries?

Editors
Roger Blanpain
Frank Hendrickx

Guest Editor
D’Arcy du Toit

Contributors
Stefano Bellomo
Graciela Bensusán
Adelle Blackett
Gaye Burcu Yildiz
Graeme Colgan
Simon Deakin
Alexander de Becker
Emma Fergus
Judy Fudge
Thierry Galani Tiemeni

Dirk Gillis
Yves Jorens
Monica McBritton
Keith Puttick
Paul Smit
Carla Spinelli
Alain Supiot
D’Arcy du Toit
Isabelle Vacarie
Lien Valcke
Table of Contents

Notes on Contributors v

Preface xvii

CHAPTER 1
What International Social Justice in the Twenty-First Century?

Alain Supiot 1

§1.01 The New Dimensions of Social Justice 5
[A] Justice in International Trade 6
[B] Justice in Relationships of Economic Allegiance 8
[C] Justice in the Division of Labour 10

§1.02 The Ways Forward for International Social Justice 12

CHAPTER 2
The Contribution of Labour Law to Economic Development and Growth

Simon Deakin 19

§2.01 Introduction 19
§2.02 New Institutional Economics and the Employment Relationship 20
§2.03 Labour Law and Capitalist Dynamics: The Evolution of the Contract of Employment 24
§2.04 Labour Law and the Growth Path of Low- and Middle-Income Countries 27
§2.05 Labour Law’s Contentious Data Revolution 31
§2.06 Conclusion 33
References 34
Table of Contents

CHAPTER 3  
Collective Bargaining ... and Beyond: Debates, Problems and Alternatives for Worker Protection  
*Graciela Bensusán*  
§3.01 Introduction 39  
§3.02 The Future of Collective Action 41  
[A] Structural Factors: The Crisis of Capitalism 41  
[B] Glimmers of Optimism: Recuperating Actors 42  
[C] Towards a New Washington Consensus? 43  
§3.03 In Defense of Collective Bargaining 44  
§3.04 Collective Bargaining Trends: Different Issues 46  
[A] The Current Situation 46  
[C] Adaptation or Erosion of Bargaining Structures? 51  
[D] Changes in Collective Bargaining Content: Between Concessions and Innovations 52  
§3.05 Interactions between Contexts and Institutions: Obstacles in the Renovation of Trade Unions and Collective Bargaining 53  
[A] Argentina, Brazil, Mexico and Chile 53  
[B] The United States and Canada 57  
§3.06 The Alternatives 58  
[A] Revitalizing the Minimum Wage: Ideas, Collective Action and Public Policy 58  
[B] Private and Voluntary Regulations: Accomplishments and Limitations 60  
§3.07 Conclusions 61  
References 63  
Annexes 68  

CHAPTER 4  
Challenging the Borders of Labour Rights  
*Judy Fudge*  
§4.01 Introduction 73  
§4.02 Conceptual: Labour as a ‘Fictive Commodity’ 74  
§4.03 Historical and Sociological Approaches to Labour Law 75  
[A] Trade Unions as Vehicles for the Rights of Labour and Labour Law 77  
§4.04 Reimagining the Scope and Goals of Labour Law 82  
[A] Broadening the Compass of Labour Law to Include Personal Work Relations 82  
[B] Who Counts as a Subject of Justice? 84  
[1] Informal Workers: Rooted Capital and Casual Workers 86  

x
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 5
Decolonizing Labour Law: A Few Comments
*Adelle Blackett*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§5.01 Introduction</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§5.02 On Seeing</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§5.03 Labour and Land</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§5.04 On Sensing</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§5.05 Boundaries and Frontiers</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§5.06 Re-presentation</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§5.07 Relationships</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§5.08 Conclusion</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 6
Labour in a Borderless Market
*Isabelle Vacarie*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§6.01 The Universalisation of Social Rights</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§6.02 Extending Corporate Responsibility to the Value Chain</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] Findings</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B] Analysis</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a] The Notion of Vigilance</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b] The Scope of Vigilance</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c] Judicial Remedy</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] Lessons</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 7
Asymmetries, Adversity and Labour Rights: Thoughts from a Developing Region
*Emma Fergus & Thierry Galani Tiemeni*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§7.01 Introduction</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§7.02 Chapter Overview</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§7.03 Social Regionalism</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§7.04 Adopting a Human Rights Based Approach</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] Introduction</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B] Critiquing the Human Rights Based Approach</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Introduction</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Substantive Concerns with the HRBA</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Procedural and Practical Concerns with the HRBA</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§7.05 Conclusion</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

CHAPTER 8
The Future of Labour Law in a Globalized or Regionalized World
*Paul Smit*

§8.01 Introduction 145
§8.02 Transnational Law 146
  [A] Compliance with International Law 147
  [B] Non-compliance with International Law 148
§8.03 Transnational Labour Relations and Regional Labour Standards 149
§8.04 Regional Integration versus Regional Globalization 152
§8.05 Role of Trade Union Movement and Labour Law in the Era of Globalization 154
§8.06 Conclusion 156

CHAPTER 9
The Challenges for Labour Law and Social Security Systems at the Labour-Social Security Interface
*Keith Puttick*

§9.01 Introduction 159
§9.02 Deregulation, the Changing Nature of ‘Work’ & the Transfer of Costs 163
§9.03 What Is ‘Social Security’? 165
  [A] Social Security as an Economic Tool 167
§9.04 How Is ‘Social Security’ to Be Achieved? 167
  [A] The ILO’s Input 168
§9.05 Is a Job Still the Best Form of ‘Security’? 169
§9.06 The Labour Side of the Interface 170
  [A] Weakened Collective Bargaining 171
  [B] Is Improved Social Security Enough? 172
  [C] Employers’ Responsibilities: Low Pay 174
  [D] The Problem of In-Work Support for Employment: Employer Disincentives 175
§9.07 Decent Work Standards: Better Redistributive and Support Mechanisms 176
  [A] Is There Scope for Better Redistributive Mechanisms? 177
§9.08 Some Retrenchment and New(er) Directions of Travel? 178
§9.09 Are There ‘Lessons’ Europe Can Learn from Other Systems? 179
§9.10 Conclusions 182
References 182

CHAPTER 10
Transformation and Functional Evolution of Collective Bargaining
*Stefano Bellomo*

§10.01 Scope of the Paper and General Questions 191
§10.02 General Features of the Collective Agreements and the ‘Crisis’ of Some National Models of Collective Bargaining 193
Table of Contents

[A] The Hierarchical Dualism between Legal Rules and Collective Agreements 194
[B] Inderogability and the Binding Effectiveness of Collective Agreements 194
[C] The Structural Layout of Collective Bargaining as a Centralized System 194

§10.03 Collective Bargaining Facing Globalization 196
§10.04 Decentralization of Collective Bargaining within the European Union 197
§10.05 Decentralization as an Adaptive Response to the Growing Diversification of Labour Markets 202
§10.06 Bilateral Derogability and Regulatory Interchangeability after the Recent Reforms in Some European Countries 205
§10.07 Conclusion 1 and Conclusion 2: Collective Bargaining and Equality – Can Collective Agreement Still Be Considered a Source of Standards? 207
§10.08 Conclusions 2. The Changing Relationship between Collective Agreements and Statutory Rules: Adaptive Functions Outclassing Standard Arrangements 209
References 211

CHAPTER 11
Litigation as an Alternative to Collective Bargaining
Graeme Colgan 217
§11.01 Public Statements of Dissatisfaction with Collective Bargaining 217
§11.02 The New Zealand Governmental/Legal System and the Place of Employment Law in Particular 218
§11.03 Features of Collective Bargaining in New Zealand in General 219
§11.04 The Current State of Union Membership, Collective Bargaining and Collective Agreements 219
§11.05 What Is Collective Bargaining (in New Zealand)? 220
§11.06 Background to Social/Political Litigation Generally 222
§11.07 Union Dissatisfaction with Collective Bargaining 223
§11.08 Three Employment Case Studies 223
[A] ‘Sleepovers’: The Idea Services and Woodford House Cases 223
[B] Respite Carers – Lowe v. Director-General of Health, Ministry of Health 225
[C] The Equal Pay (Pay Equity) Cases 225
§11.09 Some Future Predictions 226

CHAPTER 12
Atypical Employment in the European Aviation Sector
Yves Jorens, Dirk Gillis & Lien Valcke 229
§12.01 Evolution: Regulation to Liberalization 229
§12.02 Current State of Affairs 230
[A] Casualization of the Workforce in Aviation 230
[B] Atypical Employment and (Bogus) Outsourcing in Civil Aviation 233

xiii
# Table of Contents

1. Some Figures 233
2. Types of Employment 234
3. An Overview of the Employment Situations 236

[C] Labour Law Applicable to Crew Members 242
1. Which Law Applies? 242
2. Applicable Legislation: The Options 242

[D] Social Security Legislation Shopping? 246
1. The Home Base: A New Specific Rule for Air Crew Members 247

§12.03 Conclusion 251
[A] Social Security Law: Towards a New Rule or Connecting Factor for Air Crew? 251


CHAPTER 13
The Reunification of the World of Work: The Role of Collective Labour Relations for Immigrants and Disabled People

*Carla Spinelli & Monica McBritton* 257

§13.01 The Meaning of Work in a Time of Globalization 257
§13.02 The ‘Labour Principle’ in the Italian Constitution 258
§13.03 The Decline of the Welfare State in Italy 259
§13.05 The Response of Trade Unions to the Segmentation of the Labour Market 261

§13.06 Reunifying Workers’ Interests 262
[A] The Case of Migrant Workers 263
[B] The Case of Persons with Disability 264

§13.07 Concluding Remarks: Building a New Solidarity? 265

CHAPTER 14
The Right to Strike in the Public Sector: A Catch 22 between Fundamental Right and Fundamental Prohibition – The Cases of Denmark and Germany with Some Comparative Belgian and Dutch Elements

*Alexander de Becker* 267

§14.01 What Is the Exact Meaning of ‘the Right to Strike for Civil Servants’ in Historical Perspective? 267
[A] Introduction 267

§14.02 A Prohibition to Strike: The Original Administrative Law Approach 268
§14.03 The Growing Role of Collective Negotiations 269

§14.05 Evolution of the Jurisprudence of the ECtHR 274
| §14.06 | The Impact of the Case Law of the ECtHR on Germany and Denmark | 275 |
| §14.07 | The Right to Strike and Its Restrictions in the Public Sector in Belgium and the Netherlands | 279 |
| §14.08 | Conclusion | 280 |

**CHAPTER 15**

Recognition of the Right to Strike (Terms and Conditions Apply)

*D'Arcy du Toit*

| §15.01 | Overview | 283 |
| §15.02 | The Contested Status of the Right to Strike | 284 |
| §15.03 | The Right to Strike versus 'the Right Not to Strike' | 289 |
| §15.04 | The *Horton* Judgment and Its Sequel | 290 |
| §15.05 | The Right (Not) to Strike in South Africa | 293 |
| [A] | The Limitation of Basic Rights | 294 |
| [B] | The Purposes of the LRA | 295 |
| [C] | Freedom of Contract | 295 |
| [D] | Interest Arbitration | 297 |
| §15.06 | Concluding Observations | 298 |

**CHAPTER 16**

Determining the Scope of Freedom of Association with regard to Right to Strike

*Gaye Burcu Yildiz*

| §16.01 | Introduction | 301 |
| §16.02 | International Texts about Freedom of Association and Strike | 302 |
| §16.03 | Linkage between Strike and Unions (Workers Organizations) | 304 |
| §16.04 | A Vulnerable Social Right: Right to Strike in Turkey | 307 |
| §16.05 | Conclusion | 311 |

References | 312 |