Shortcomings in the EU Merger Directive

Frederik Boulogne
Table of Contents

Acknowledgement xv

Introduction 1
I Background and Overview of the Merger Directive 1
II Main Question and Sub-questions 5
III Justification of Topic and Research 6
IV Approach 7
V Relationship between Primary EU Law, Secondary EU Law and Domestic Law 10
VI Delimitations 11

CHAPTER 1
The Scope Ratione Personae 13
§1.01 Introduction 13
§1.02 'Company' 13
[A] Introduction 13
[B] Literal Interpretation 14
[C] Schematic Interpretation 16
[1] Introduction 16
[2] Other EU Directives 16
[3] Article 54 of the TFEU 17
[D] Teleological Interpretation 20
[E] Recommendation 20
[1] Introduction 20
[2] Option 1: Use the Definition of the Term 'Company' in Article 3(1)(b) of the OECD Model Convention 21
[3] Option 2: Replace the Term 'Company' by the Term 'Entity' 22
§1.03 'Listed Form Requirement' 23
[A] Introduction 23
Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Validity of the ‘Listed Form Requirement’</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Access to the Freedom of Capital Movement</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Capital Movement</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Concurrence with the Freedom of Establishment</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[d]</td>
<td>Restriction</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[e]</td>
<td>Company Level versus Shareholder Level</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[f]</td>
<td>Justification</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[5]</td>
<td>Article 18 of the TFEU</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Article 24(1) of the OECD Model Convention</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[E]</td>
<td>Recommendation: Abolition of the ‘Listed Form Requirement’</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[F]</td>
<td>Proposed CCCTB Directive</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[G]</td>
<td>SE and SCE</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§1.04</td>
<td>‘Residence Requirement’</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Dual Residence within the EU</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Dual Residence outside the EU</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Deviations from the ‘Place of Effective Management Tie-Breaker’</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Place of Incorporation</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§1.05</td>
<td>‘Subject-to-Tax Requirement’</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Taxes Covered by Article 3(c) of the Merger Directive</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>‘Subject to Tax’</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>‘Without the Possibility of an Option or of Being Exempt’</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[E]</td>
<td>Recommendation: Abolition of the ‘Subject-to-Tax Requirement’</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§1.06</td>
<td>‘Involving Companies from Two or More Member States’</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>‘Involving’</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Company from Which Member State(s)?</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Company from One or from Multiple Member States?</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

[3] Company from One Member State: Decisive Criterion? 65
   [a] Introduction 65
   [b] ‘Listed form Requirement’ 65
   [c] ‘Residence Requirement’ 66
   [d] ‘Subject-to-Tax Requirement’ 68

[4] Company from Multiple Member States? 68
   [D] Partial Application of the Facilities of the Merger Directive 69
   [E] Recommendation: Relaxation of the ‘Involvement Requirement’ 70

§1.07 UCITS 73
§1.08 Conclusions and Recommendations 76

CHAPTER 2
The Scope Ratione Materiae 81
§2.01 Introduction 81
§2.02 ‘Merger’ 84
   [A] Introduction 84
   [B] The ‘Non-Liquidation Requirement’ 85
   [C] The Nature of the Consideration 86
      [1] Introduction 86
      [2] The Restriction to Securities 86
      [3] The ‘10% Cash Payment Limitation’ 88
         [a] Introduction 88
         [b] The Terms ‘Nominal Value’ and ‘Accounting Par Value’ 90
         [c] Critique 90
         [d] Buy-Out of Minority Shareholders 91
      [4] ‘Securities Representing the Capital’ 92
      [5] The ‘Issuance Requirement’ 95
   [D] The Value of the Consideration 98
§2.03 ‘Division’ and ‘Partial Division’ 102
   [A] Introduction 102
   [B] ‘Branch of Activity’ 103
      [1] Introduction 103
         [a] Capital Duty Directive 108
         [b] VAT Directive 111
      [4] Critique on the ‘Branch of Activity Requirement’ 113
   [C] ‘Dispute Divisions’ 117
§2.04 ‘Transfer of Assets’ 118
§2.05 ‘Exchange of Shares’ 118
Table of Contents

[A] Introduction 118
[B] The 'Voting Rights Requirement' 119
[C] Critique on the 'Voting Rights Requirement' 121

§2.06 Transfer of the Registered Office of an SE or an SCE 123
§2.07 Interplay between Tax Law and Corporate Law 125

[A] Introduction 125
[B] Three Categories of Operations 125
[C] Differences in Interpretation 129
[D] Unnecessarily Restrictive Elements 131
[F] Bridging the Gap between Tax Law and Corporate Law 133

§2.08 Conclusion 135

CHAPTER 3
Carry-Over of Balance-Sheet Values, Provisions, Reserves and Losses 143
§3.01 Introduction 143
§3.02 Carry-Over of Balance-Sheet Values at Company Level 145

[A] Introduction 145
[B] 'Shall Not Give Rise to Any Taxation of Capital Gains' (at Company Level) 147
[1] Which Member State Is Not Allowed to Tax? 147
[5] The Terms 'Real Value' and 'Value for Tax Purposes' 149

[C] The 'Permanent Establishment Requirement' and the 'Taxable Income Requirement' 150
[1] Pivotal Roles 150
[2] Literal Interpretation 151
[3] Historical Interpretation 151
[4] Schematic Interpretation 152
[a] Introduction 152
[b] Interplay with the 'Taxable Income Requirement' 152
[c] Interplay with the 'Branch of Activity Requirement' 154
[d] Interplay with the Term 'Permanent Establishment' in the Other Direct Tax Directives 154
[e] Interplay with the Terms 'Agencies' and 'Branches' in Article 49 of the TFEU 156
[5] Teleological Interpretation 157
[6] Deliberation 158

[D] Reconsidering the 'Permanent Establishment Requirement' 159
Table of Contents

1. Introduction 159
2. The Immediate Taxation of Hidden Reserves in the Light of the Freedom of Establishment 161
3. Unsatisfactory Elements in the National Grid Regime 162
4. Comparison between the Regime in the Merger Directive and the National Grid Regime 164
5. Options for Exit Tax Regimes in the Merger Directive 165
6. An Improved Exit Tax Regime À La National Grid 166
7. The 'Restrictive' Definition or Allocation of Taxing Rights 168
8. Allocation of Assets and Liabilities to the Permanent Establishment and the Subsequent Attribution of Profits 170

E. The Perspective of the Member State of the Receiving Company 172
F. The Transfer of a Permanent Establishment 173

1. Introduction 173
2. Reinstatement of Losses 174
3. Free Choice of Legal Form 179

3.03 Carry-Over of Balance-Sheet Values at Shareholder Level 181

A. Introduction 181
B. Description of Article 8 of the Merger Directive 181
C. Shareholder of Which Company? 182
D. Which Taxes May Not Be Levied Pursuant to Article 8 of the Merger Directive? 183

E. The Perspective of the Member State of the Shareholder 184
F. The Perspective of the Member State of the Shareholding 185

1. Introduction 185
2. Example 1: Cross-Border Merger 185
3. Example 2: Exchange of Shares 186
4. Analysis 186

G. Change of the Regime Applicable to the Shareholding 187

1. Introduction 187
2. Articles 8(6) and 14(2) of the Merger Directive 188
3. Interaction with the Parent-Subsidiary Directive 188
4. Apportionment of the Capital Gain 189
5. Tax Treaty Override 191

H. A 'Taxable Income Requirement' and Exit Tax Regime in Article 8 of the Merger Directive 192

3.04 Carry-Over of Provisions or Reserves 193

A. Introduction 193
B. The Term 'Provisions or Reserves' 194
C. 'Not Derived from Permanent Establishments Abroad' 195

3.05 Takeover of Losses 197

A. Introduction 197
B. Purpose of Article 6 of the Merger Directive 198
Table of Contents

[C] Article 6 of the Merger Directive Does Not Cover the Carry-Over of Other Deferred Tax Assets Than 'Losses' 198

[D] Article 6 of the Merger Directive Only Addresses the Losses of the Transferring Company 200

[E] Article 6 of the Merger Directive Provides for Losses to Be Carried Forward, but Not Carried Back 201

[F] Article 6 of the Merger Directive Only Requires a Takeover of Losses If This Would Be Allowed with a Domestic Restructuring Operation 202

[G] Article 6 of the Merger Directive Does Not Clarify Whether (or How) the Losses of the Transferring Company Should Be Apportioned to the Transferred Assets and Liabilities 203

[H] Article 6 of the Merger Directive Does Not Specify against Which Profits the Losses of the Transferring Company Can Be Set Off 207

[I] Article 6 of the Merger Directive Covers the Domestic, but Not the Cross-Border Takeover of Losses 208

[1] Introduction 208


[a] Facts and Preliminary Questions 210

[b] Restriction and Justification 210

[c] Is the Finnish Measure Proportional? 211

[3] When Are Losses 'Final'? 212

[a] Introduction 212

[b] Distinguishing Marks & Spencer Situations from A Oy Situations 212

[c] Which Amount of Losses of the Transferring Company Can Be Taken into Account in the Member State of the Receiving Company? 214

[d] Conclusion 217

[J] Primary EU Law Does Not Compel Expansion of Article 6 of the Merger Directive 217


[L] Proposal to Expand and Improve Article 6 of the Merger Directive 219

[M] The 'Comparable Circumstances Test' in Article 13(2) of the Merger Directive 221

§3.06 Hybrid Entities 222

[A] Introduction 222


[C] Different Perspectives on Hybrid Entities 226

[D] Company Level 227

[1] The Transferring Company Is a Hybrid Entity 227
Table of Contents

[E] Shareholder Level 234
[1] The Shareholder is a Hybrid Entity 234
[2] The Shareholder is a Reverse Hybrid Entity 236
[1] The Transferring or Acquired Company Is a Hybrid Entity 237
[2] The Receiving or Acquiring Company Is a Hybrid Entity 240
[G] Reflections 244

§3.07 ‘Valuation Rules’ 246
[A] Introduction 246
[B] The Valuation of the Securities Received in the Case of a Transfer of Assets 246
[C] The Valuation of the Assets and Liabilities Received in the Member State of the Receiving Company 248
[D] Valuation of the Securities Received by the Acquiring Company 249

§3.08 Conclusion and Recommendations 251

CHAPTER 4

The Combat of Tax Avoidance under the Merger Directive 263
§4.01 Introduction 263
§4.02 The Combat of Tax Avoidance under Article 15(1)(a) of the Merger Directive 264
[A] Brief Description of the Provision 264
[B] ‘Principal Objective or as One of Its Principal Objectives’ 267
[C] ‘Valid Commercial Reasons’ 268
[D] ‘Refuse to Apply or Withdraw the Benefit of’ 270
§4.03 Framework for the Interpretation of Article 15(1)(a) of the Merger Directive 273
[A] Introduction 273
[C] The Purpose of the Merger Directive 274
[D] The Fundamental Freedoms 276
[E] The Principle of Proportionality 280
[F] The Principle of Legal Certainty 282
§4.04 Which Possible Types of Tax Avoidance Can Be Identified? 283
[A] Introduction 283
[B] The Deferral of Taxation by Converting, under the Merger Directive’s Carry-Over Facilities, an Immediately Taxable Gain to a Gain That Is Taxable in the Future 283
[C] The Loss of Taxing Rights 285
[D] The Compensation of Losses 286
Table of Contents

[E] The Obtainment of a Tax Benefit after the Restructuring Operation 288
[G] Conclusions 291

§4.05 (How) Should the Merger Directive Be Amended? 292
§4.06 Conclusion 295

CHAPTER 5

The Avoidance of Double Taxation under the Merger Directive 303
§5.01 Introduction 303
§5.02 *The 3D I Sri Decision* 304
§5.03 Conflicts of Interpretation concerning the Term ‘Permanent Establishment’ 306
[A] Background 306
[B] The Result: Double Taxation and Double Non-taxation 307
[1] Example 307

[C] Distinguishing Conflicts of Interpretation concerning the Term ‘Permanent Establishment’ from Other Conflicts of Interpretation 310
[1] Introduction 310
[2] Conflict of Interpretation concerning the Term ‘Securities Representing the Capital’ 310
[3] The Solution of Conflicts of Interpretation concerning the Term ‘Permanent Establishment’ 311
[a] Introduction 311
[b] The Meaning of the Term ‘Permanent Establishment’ in Article 5 of the OECD Model Convention 311
[c] Interpretation by the ECJ and the Risk of Diverging Interpretations 313
[d] Interpretation by the ECJ and Bilateral Situations in Which No Conflict of Interpretation Exists 313
[e] Interpretation by the ECJ and the Allocation of Taxing Powers by the Member States 314

[D] Solution for Conflicts of Interpretation concerning the Term ‘Permanent Establishment’ 314
[1] Solution: The Member State of the Receiving Company Follows the Interpretation by the Member State of the Transferring Company 314
[2] Old Roots of the Solution 314
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>§5.04 Specification of the Exemption Method</th>
<th>325</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[A] Different Methods of Avoiding Juridical Double Taxation</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B] The 1969 Proposal Obliged Member States to Apply Either the Exemption Method or the Credit Method</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] Arguments in Favour of the Specification of the Exemption Method</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D] Obstacles with the Specification of the Exemption Method</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§5.05 The Merger Directive and ‘Triangular Cases’</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] Introduction</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B] The Taxation of Dividends, Interests and Royalties Attributable to the Permanent Establishment of the Receiving Company</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] The Taxation of Dividends That Relate to Profits Realised with the Activities of the (Former) Transferring Company</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D] Solutions</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§5.06 Conclusion</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER 6
Proposal for the Amendment of the Merger Directive 337

CHAPTER 7
Overall Conclusion 347
§7.01 Introduction 347
§7.02 Summary of Conclusions 347
[A] Chapter 1: The Scope Ratione Personae 347
[B] Chapter 2: The Scope Ratione Materiae 351
[C] Chapter 3: Carry-Over of Balance-Sheet Values, Provisions, Reserves and Losses 356
[D] Chapter 4: The Combat of Tax Avoidance under the Merger Directive 366
§7.03 Main Shortcomings and Possible Solutions 375

Bibliography 381

Table of Cases 393

Table of Treaties, Regulation, Directives and Communication 403

Opinions of the European Economic and Social Committee 407