The Assessment and Regulation of Market Power in Australia

An institutional approach
# Table of contents

List of figures and tables ........................................................................................................ 11
Glossary .................................................................................................................................. 12

I. Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 14

II. Questions posed by the regulation of market power in Australia ................................. 18
   A. General issues concerning market power ................................................................. 18
      1. What is the purpose of regulating market power according to Australian law? ...... 18
      2. Is there recognition that strategic market power exists? ...................................... 20
   B. Issues prompted by essential services ......................................................................... 22
      1. Constraining monopoly pricing ............................................................................ 23
      2. The role of regulation in assessing and constraining market power ..................... 24
   C. Issues specific to Australia’s regime ............................................................................. 25
      1. The relationship between the structural and behavioural regulation of market power in Australia ................................................................. 26
         (a) The relationship between sections 46 and 50 ................................................. 26
         (b) The relationship between Parts IV and IIIA ................................................. 28
      2. The appropriate roles of the respective institutions .............................................. 29
   D. Method of enquiry ......................................................................................................... 31

III. The Courts ....................................................................................................................... 33
   A. Overview of the Courts’ dealings with market power ................................................. 33
   B. What is the object of regulating market power according to Australian law? ........... 37
      1. General comments as to object ............................................................................. 37
      2. The impact of Queensland Wire ........................................................................... 39
         (a) The High Court decision .............................................................................. 40
         (b) The application of Queensland Wire ........................................................... 41
      3. The role of section 2 ............................................................................................. 43
      4. The High Court post-Queensland Wire .............................................................. 44
         (a) Kirby’s dissents ............................................................................................. 44
C. Is there recognition in Australia of the existence and relevance of strategic market power? 51

1. Conclusions from earlier research .................................................. 51
   (a) Conclusions 53

2. Competition-tested decisions: pre-2003 ........................................ 55

3. Decisions since late 2003 ................................................................ 56
   (a) Safeway 57
   (b) Rural Press 59
   (c) AGL 61

4. Conclusions .................................................................................. 61

D. How should monopoly pricing be treated in the regulation of market power? 63

1. Queensland Wire ........................................................................... 63
   (a) Constructive refusal 63
   (b) Structuring relief 65

2. Pont Data ....................................................................................... 65

3. NT Power ...................................................................................... 67

4. Conclusions .................................................................................. 68

E. What is the role of regulation in assessing market power and constraining its use? 70

1. Market power vs regulatory power ................................................ 70

2. Regulation as a constraint on market power ................................. 72
   (a) An existing regulatory framework: the Ansett / Avis merger 73
   (b) A proposed regulatory framework: NT Power 74
   (c) The impact of regulatory intervention 76

3. Conclusions .................................................................................. 77

F. What is the relationship between the structural and behavioural regulation of market power in Australia? 79

1. Structural vs behavioural regulation within Part IV .......................... 79
   (a) The relationship between sections 46 and 50 79

2. Part IV vs Part IIIA ......................................................................... 88

3. Conclusions .................................................................................. 89
G. What is the appropriate role of the respective institutions, and to what extent do they have regard to each other?  
1. The Courts on the Courts .................................................................................................................. 90  
   (a) General comments .............................................................................................................................. 90  
   (b) Judicial review ................................................................................................................................... 92  
   (c) As the appropriate forum .................................................................................................................... 92  
2. The Tribunal ........................................................................................................................................ 93  
3. The Commission .................................................................................................................................... 94  
   (a) The Commission's role and functions ............................................................................................... 95  
   (b) As a litigant ......................................................................................................................................... 96  
   (c) As an expert/authority .......................................................................................................................... 98  
4. Conclusions .......................................................................................................................................... 100  

IV. The Tribunal ...................................................................................................................................... 101  
A. Overview of the Tribunal's determinations .......................................................................................... 101  
   1. The nature of the Tribunal's role .......................................................................................................... 101  
   2. 'Precedent' and the Tribunal's composition ......................................................................................... 104  
B. What is the object of regulating market power according to Australian law? 106  
   1. General comments as to object .......................................................................................................... 106  
   2. Authorisation and notification ............................................................................................................ 108  
      (a) The applicable test(s) ...................................................................................................................... 108  
      (b) The presumption for or against authorisation ................................................................................. 109  
      (c) Public benefit .................................................................................................................................. 112  
      (d) Detriment ...................................................................................................................................... 118  
      (e) The meaning of public vs private .................................................................................................. 119  
   3. Access under Part IIIA ......................................................................................................................... 123  
      (a) General observations ...................................................................................................................... 123  
      (b) The promotion of competition ....................................................................................................... 124  
      (c) The meaning of public interest ...................................................................................................... 125  
   4. Access under Part XIC ......................................................................................................................... 125  
   5. Conclusions ...................................................................................................................................... 126  
C. Is there recognition in Australia of the existence and relevance of strategic market power? 127  
   1. Re QCMA ......................................................................................................................................... 127
2. The post-QCMA legacy
   (a) Use of the SCP model
   (b) Beyond SCP — recognizing strategic factors
3. Access regimes
4. Approaches to authorisations following the advent of access regimes
   (a) Strategic sources of market power: Chicken Growers
   (b) Strategic checks on market power: Qantas
5. Conclusions

D. How should monopoly pricing be treated in the regulation of market power?
1. Constraining monopoly pricing
   (a) Monopoly pricing generally
   (b) Underpricing
2. Cross-subsidisation
3. Appropriate pricing structures
   (a) Non-access scenarios
   (b) Access pricing principles
4. Conclusions

E. What is the role of regulation in assessing market power and constraining its use?
1. Regulation as a source of market power
   (a) Self-regulation
   (b) Transitioning to de-regulation
2. Regulation as a constraint on market power
   (a) General industry regulation
   (b) Pricing constraints
   (c) Access
3. Conclusions

F. What is the relationship between the structural and behavioural regulation of market power in Australia?
1. Methodology
2. Authorised conduct and Part IV
3. Access and Part IV
   (a) Section 46
   (b) General anti-competitive agreements: Foxtel
4. Conclusions ........................................................................................................................................ 173

G. What is the appropriate role of the respective institutions, and to what extent do they have regard to each other? 175

1. The Commission ................................................................................................................................ 175
   (a) The Commission before the Tribunal .............................................................................................. 175
   (b) Guidance as to general role .............................................................................................................. 178
   (c) The Commission as authority ........................................................................................................... 179

2. The Tribunal ........................................................................................................................................... 180
   (a) General role ....................................................................................................................................... 180
   (b) Procedure .......................................................................................................................................... 181
   (c) Precedent ............................................................................................................................................ 182

3. The Courts ............................................................................................................................................ 183

V. The Commission .................................................................................................................................... 185

A. Identifying the Commission’s views ...................................................................................................... 185

1. The nature of the Commission’s role ..................................................................................................... 185

2. Distinctive features of the Commission’s role ...................................................................................... 188

3. Activities relevant to issues of market power: identifying appropriate material ................................ 192

B. What is the object of regulating market power according to Australian law? 195

1. General statements as to object ............................................................................................................ 195
   (a) The TPA ............................................................................................................................................. 195
   (b) Articulating the Commission’s priorities .......................................................................................... 197

2. The authorisation context: public benefit and detriment .................................................................... 198
   (a) Benefits recognised by the Commission ......................................................................................... 198
   (b) Detriments ......................................................................................................................................... 203
   (c) The meaning of private vs public .................................................................................................. 204

3. Other contexts ......................................................................................................................................... 207
   (a) Telecommunications regulation ...................................................................................................... 207
   (b) The SLC test ..................................................................................................................................... 208

4. Conclusions ............................................................................................................................................ 209

C. Is there recognition in Australia of the existence and relevance of strategic market power? 210

1. Formal use of the SCP framework ......................................................................................................... 210

2. Moving to a more strategic assessment ............................................................................................... 211
3. The Commission's approach recently .......................................................... 216
   (a) Short-hand assessments of market power ............................................. 216
   (b) More detailed analysis: case studies .................................................. 219

4. Conclusions ............................................................................................. 226

D. How should monopoly pricing be treated in the regulation of market power? 228
1. Part IV context ....................................................................................... 228
2. Micro-economic reform and the move to access regulation ..................... 231
   (a) Telecommunications ........................................................................... 231
   (b) The intersection between section 46 and access regulation ................. 233
3. Conclusions ............................................................................................. 235

E. What is the role of regulation in assessing market power and constraining its use? 237
1. When regulation was the norm ............................................................... 237
2. Recognising early moves to deregulation ................................................. 238
3. Post-NCP: regulating market power in a largely de-regulated environment .... 239
   (a) General regulation ............................................................................. 239
   (b) Competition law as a regulatory constraint ........................................ 241
4. Conclusions ............................................................................................. 244

F. What is the relationship between the structural and behavioural regulation of market power in Australia? 245
1. Structural vs behavioural regulation within Part IV .................................. 245
   (a) Section 50 vs section 46 .................................................................... 246
   (b) Section 50 vs other aspects of Part IV ............................................... 248
   (c) Structural vs behavioural remedies - undertakings ............................ 250
2. Part IV (and Part XIB) vs access regulation .......................................... 256
   (a) SLC assessments vs access ............................................................... 256
   (b) General regulation: section 46 vs Part IIIA ...................................... 257
   (c) Telecommunications regulation: Part XIB vs Part XIC ...................... 257
3. Conclusions ............................................................................................. 259
G. What is the appropriate role of the respective institutions, and to what extent do they have regard to each other? 261

1. The Commission
   (a) Guidance as to its general role 261
   (b) Approaches to evidence 263
   (c) The significance of Commission decisions and publications 264

2. The Courts
   (a) Appropriate role and procedures 267
   (b) Use of precedent 269

3. Tribunal 271

4. Conclusions 274

VI. Analysis ................................................................. 275

A. What is the object of regulating market power according to Australian law? 275

B. Is there recognition in Australia of the existence and relevance of strategic market power? 277

C. How should monopoly pricing be treated in the regulation of market power? 281

D. What is the role of regulation in assessing market power and constraining its use? 285

E. What is the relationship between the structural and behavioural regulation of market power in Australia? 288

F. What is the appropriate role of the respective institutions, and to what extent do they have regard to each other? 294

VII. Concluding observations ............................................ 299

References ................................................................. 303

Articles, books and reports 303

Cases and determinations 329

Cases .......................................................... 329

Australia 329

Overseas 340

Tribunal determinations .................................................. 341

Commission determinations and statutory notices .............. 345

TPC determinations 345

ACCC determinations and statutory notices 345
# Legislation and government documents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statutes</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overseas</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bills</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explanatory memoranda</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parliamentary debates</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Appendix A: Excerpts from key legislative provisions

## Appendix B: The regulation of market power in Australia – instruments and institutions

### A. The regulatory instruments

#### 1. The TPA

- **(a) General legislative history**
- **(b) Structure and purpose of TPA**
- **(c) Part IV**
- **(d) Part IIIA**
- **(e) Telecommunications**
- **(f) Prices surveillance**

#### 2. National Competition Policy

- **(a) The Hilmer Report**
- **(b) CoAG agreements**
- **(c) Review of National Competition Policy**

### B. The institutions

#### 1. The Commission

- **(a) Administrative powers**
- **(b) Enforcement powers**
- **(c) Ability to intervene**

#### 2. The Tribunal

#### 3. The Courts

## Appendix C: Understanding market power

### A. Defining market power

#### 1. Classical approaches to market power: power over price
(a) Underlying assumptions 412
(b) Exercising classical market power 413
(c) Identifying classical market power 414
(d) Measuring classical market power 416

2. Strategic market power: raising rivals' costs .................................................. 419
   (a) Contextualising market power: a focus upon incentives and effects 420
   (b) Exercising strategic market power 421
   (c) Identifying strategic market power 425

3. Conclusions: comparing classical and strategic approaches ......................... 430

B. Why is market power a problem? 431
1. Efficiencies ........................................................................................................ 433
2. Transfers ........................................................................................................... 433
3. Other concerns .................................................................................................. 435
4. Determining the priority of concerns ................................................................. 435

Appendix D: Market power and essential services .............................................. 437

A. Defining essential services 437
1. Characteristics of essential services ................................................................. 438
   (a) Defining characteristics 439
   (b) Common characteristics 439
   (c) Electricity 440
   (d) Telecommunications 441

B. Bases for treating market power in essential services differently 442
1. Elasticity ............................................................................................................ 442
   (a) Transfers 443
   (b) The broader impact upon the economy: market depth as a multiplier 444
2. The significance of fixed costs ........................................................................ 446
   (a) Effects on marginal cost pricing 448
   (b) Additional consequences of high fixed costs 449
3. The impact of regulation .................................................................................... 450
   (a) Is regulation a relevant constraint when assessing market power? 452
   (b) Conclusions 455
4. Conclusions: do the standard assumptions hold for essential services? ....... 455
Appendix E: Comparison of sections 46(1) and 50(1) ........................................ 458
Appendix F: Brief précis of key Court decisions .................................................... 462
Appendix G: Final substantive Court decisions under sections 45-47 and 50 .......... 470
Appendix H: Final Court decisions under sections 45-47 & 50 where no substantive consideration of market power issues ........................................ 475
Appendix I: Brief précis of key Tribunal decisions ............................................... 478
Appendix J: Substantive Tribunal decisions .......................................................... 482