

Philip Lawn

# Resolving the Climate Change Crisis

The Ecological Economics  
of Climate Change

 Springer

# Contents

## Part I Ecological Economics, Climate Change, and Sustainable Development

<b>1 Ecological Economics and Climate Change</b> . . . . .	3
1.1 Introduction . . . . .	3
1.2 Some Background Information on Climate Change Science. . . . .	5
1.2.1 The Natural Greenhouse Effect . . . . .	5
1.2.2 Climate Change Over the Course of Time . . . . .	6
1.2.3 Anthropogenic Global Warming—The Enhanced Greenhouse Effect . . . . .	14
1.2.4 Climate Change Projections . . . . .	21
1.2.5 The Potential Implications of Climate Change . . . . .	26
1.2.6 The Scientific and Institutional Response to Climate Change . . . . .	35
1.3 What Is Ecological Economics? . . . . .	42
1.4 Putting the Climate Change Crisis into an Appropriate Context . . . . .	45
Annex 1A: Is the Earth Still Warming?—Yes It Is! . . . . .	47
Notes . . . . .	50
<b>2 Sustainable Development and Climate Change</b> . . . . .	57
2.1 Defining Sustainable Development . . . . .	57
2.1.1 The Coevolutionary World-View . . . . .	58
2.1.2 The Linear Throughput Representation of the Economic Process . . . . .	59
2.1.3 Ecological Constraints, Human Needs, and Intragenerational Equity . . . . .	62
2.1.4 A Broad Definition of Sustainable Development. . . . .	68
2.2 Sustainable Development and the Ecological and Economic Limits to Growth . . . . .	69
2.2.1 Economic and Uneconomic Growth . . . . .	69
2.2.2 Efficiency-Increasing Technological Progress . . . . .	70

2.3	Empirical Evidence of the Ecological and Economic Limits to Growth . . . . .	75
2.3.1	Ecological Limits to Growth: Ecological Footprint Versus Biocapacity . . . . .	75
2.3.2	Economic Limits to Growth: The Genuine Progress Indicator. . . . .	79
	Notes . . . . .	82
<b>3</b>	<b>Policies to Achieve Sustainable Development . . . . .</b>	<b>85</b>
3.1	Achieving Sustainable Development: Policy Goals and Instruments. . . . .	85
3.2	Ecological Tax Reform. . . . .	89
3.3	Achieving Ecological Sustainability . . . . .	90
3.3.1	Cap-Auction-Trade Systems . . . . .	90
3.3.2	Dealing with Non-renewable Resources . . . . .	93
3.3.3	The Sustainable Use of Agricultural Land . . . . .	96
3.3.4	Native Vegetation Clearance Controls . . . . .	97
3.3.5	Population Stabilisation . . . . .	99
3.4	Achieving Distributional Equity. . . . .	103
3.4.1	Minimum Income . . . . .	103
3.4.2	Maximum Income/Limiting the Range of Income Inequality . . . . .	108
3.4.3	Foreign Aid. . . . .	110
3.5	Achieving Allocative Efficiency. . . . .	111
3.5.1	Appropriately Defined Property Rights . . . . .	111
3.5.2	Externalities . . . . .	113
3.5.3	Public Goods . . . . .	117
3.5.4	Sunk Costs and the Contestability of Markets . . . . .	118
3.5.5	Market Deregulation and the Privatisation of Public Assets . . . . .	120
3.5.6	Flexible Labour Markets and Adequate Skills Formation. . . . .	121
3.6	Monetary Reform . . . . .	123
3.7	National Accounting Reforms . . . . .	126
3.7.1	National Accounting Reform # 1—National Income. . . . .	126
3.7.2	National Accounting Reform # 2—Sustainable Economic Welfare . . . . .	127
3.7.3	National Accounting Reform # 3—Ecological Economic Efficiency . . . . .	128
3.7.4	National Accounting Reform # 4—Biophysical Indicators . . . . .	129
3.7.5	National Accounting Reform # 5—Social Capital Indicators . . . . .	131
3.8	International Reforms. . . . .	131
3.8.1	The WTO and Compensating Tariffs . . . . .	136

3.8.2	A New System of Foreign Exchange Management . . . . .	137
3.8.3	Redirecting the Goals and Functions of Bretton Woods Institutions . . . . .	140
Notes	. . . . .	141
<b>4</b>	<b>A Sustainable Versus a Growth-as-Usual Scenario . . . . .</b>	<b>149</b>
4.1	Introduction . . . . .	149
4.2	A Sustainable Emissions Scenario . . . . .	150
4.2.1	Setting the Guiding Parameters for a Sustainable Emissions Scenario . . . . .	150
4.2.2	Ecological Sustainability: Avoiding Catastrophic Climate Change . . . . .	150
4.2.3	Ecological Sustainability: A Sustainable Population and a Sustainable Rate of Resource Use . . . . .	153
4.2.4	Increasing Economic Welfare: Moving to the Optimal Macroeconomic Scale . . . . .	153
4.2.5	Assumptions . . . . .	155
4.2.6	Results . . . . .	158
4.3	An Assessment of the Sustainable Emissions Scenario . . . . .	161
4.3.1	Evolution of the Global Economy . . . . .	161
4.3.2	The Plausibility of the Sustainable Emissions Scenario . . . . .	163
4.4	A Growth-as-Usual Scenario . . . . .	167
4.4.1	Assumptions . . . . .	167
4.4.2	Results . . . . .	168
4.4.3	Plausibility of the Growth-as-Usual Scenario . . . . .	171
Annex 4A:	Energy Requirements and Energy Potentials of the Sustainable Emissions Scenario . . . . .	172
Notes	. . . . .	177

## **Part II Alternative Perspectives of the Climate Change Crisis**

<b>5</b>	<b>A Mainstream Economic Perspective of the Climate Change Crisis . . .</b>	<b>183</b>
5.1	Introduction . . . . .	183
5.2	The Stern Review: An Example of a Mainstream Economic Approach to the Climate Change Crisis . . . . .	184
5.2.1	Stern's General Conclusions . . . . .	184
5.2.2	Stern's General Methodology . . . . .	185
5.2.3	Stern's Choice of Discount Rate . . . . .	186
5.3	Mainstream Criticisms of the Stern Review . . . . .	187
5.3.1	Stern Underestimates the Cost of Climate Change Mitigation . . . . .	187
5.3.2	Stern Overestimates the Cost of Climate Change Damages . . . . .	188
5.3.3	The Discount Rate Used by Stern Is Too Low . . . . .	189
5.3.4	The Stern Review Does not Constitute a Proper Benefit-Cost Analysis . . . . .	191

5.3.5	Stern's Conclusions Are Incommensurate with His Economic Analysis . . . . .	196
5.4	Stern's Response to the Mainstream Criticisms of the Stern Review . . . . .	196
5.4.1	Stern Underestimates the Cost of Climate Change Mitigation—Stern's Response . . . . .	198
5.4.2	Stern Overestimates the Cost of Climate Change Damages—Stern's Response . . . . .	199
5.4.3	The Discount Rate Used by Stern Is Too Low—Stern's Response . . . . .	201
5.4.4	The Stern Review Does not Constitute a Proper Benefit-Cost Analysis—Stern's Response . . . . .	206
5.4.5	Stern's Conclusions Are Incommensurate with His Economic Analysis—Stern's Response . . . . .	207
5.5	Support and Further Criticisms of the Stern Review . . . . .	208
5.5.1	Mainstream Support for the Stern Review . . . . .	208
5.5.2	Further Criticisms of the Stern Review . . . . .	212
5.5.3	An Ecological Economics Perspective of the Stern Review . . . . .	219
	Notes . . . . .	222
<b>6</b>	<b>An Ecological Economic Perspective of the Climate Change Crisis . . . . .</b>	<b>225</b>
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	225
6.2	Measuring Climate Change Damage Costs and Mitigation Costs . . . . .	226
6.2.1	The Total Cost of Climate Change Damages . . . . .	226
6.2.2	The Total Cost of Climate Change Mitigation . . . . .	231
6.2.3	How Are Total Damage Costs and Mitigation Costs Estimated? . . . . .	234
6.3	Overlooked Factors Affecting Climate Change Damage Costs and Mitigation Costs . . . . .	242
6.3.1	Climate Change Damage Costs—Overlooked Factors . . . . .	242
6.3.2	Mitigation Costs—Overlooked Factors . . . . .	256
6.4	Future Changes in Marginal Damage Costs and Marginal Mitigation Costs and Its Implications for the Social Cost of Carbon . . . . .	266
6.4.1	Likely Changes in a GWP Growth-as-Usual Context . . . . .	266
6.4.2	Likely Changes in a Steady-State Economic Context . . . . .	273
6.5	The Shortcomings of Benefit-Cost Analysis . . . . .	277
	Notes . . . . .	281
 <b>Part III A Way Forward and the Road to Sustainable Development</b>		
<b>7</b>	<b>The Case for an Emissions-Trading System to Help Resolve the Climate Change Crisis . . . . .</b>	<b>291</b>
7.1	Introduction . . . . .	291
7.2	Key Features of an Effective Emissions-Trading System . . . . .	292

7.3	Key Features of a Tax-Based System . . . . .	297
7.4	A Theoretical Backdrop to Examine the Pros and Cons of Different Policy Mechanisms. . . . .	298
7.4.1	The Social Welfare Impact of Introducing a Non-tradeable Emissions Quota . . . . .	301
7.4.2	The Social Welfare Impact of Introducing an Emissions Tax . . . . .	305
7.4.3	The Social Welfare Impact of Introducing an Emissions-Trading System . . . . .	307
7.5	Refuting the Main Criticisms of Emissions-Trading Systems . . . . .	309
7.5.1	Criticism # 1—An Emission-Trading System Leads to Undesirable Market Uncertainty . . . . .	309
7.5.2	Criticism # 2—Taxes Are Simpler to Implement Than an Emissions-Trading System. . . . .	319
7.5.3	Criticism # 3—Emissions-Trading Systems Often Include Allowances for Carbon Offsets/Credits that Are Vulnerable to Abuse . . . . .	321
7.5.4	Criticism # 4—Emissions-Trading Systems Are Highly Corruptible and Subject to Negative Influences by Political Lobby Groups . . . . .	321
7.5.5	Criticism # 5—Emissions-Trading Systems Impose an Emissions ‘Floor’ as Well as an Emissions Cap . . . . .	323
7.5.6	Criticism # 6—Emissions-Trading Systems Promote Speculative Trading Behaviour . . . . .	326
7.5.7	Criticism # 7—Emissions-Trading Systems Allow Big Firms to Buy a Large Quantity of Permits to Control Markets . . . . .	327
7.5.8	Criticism # 8—Countries Requiring More Growth Are Less Likely to Agree to an Emissions Cap Than an Emissions Tax . . . . .	327
7.5.9	Criticism # 9—Emissions-Trading Systems so Far Instituted Have Failed to Significantly Reduce Emissions . . . . .	329
7.6	Further Ecological Economic Reasons for Preferring an Emissions-Trading Systems Over an Emissions Tax. . . . .	330
7.6.1	Ecological Sustainability . . . . .	330
7.6.2	Distributional Equity . . . . .	333
7.6.3	Allocative Efficiency . . . . .	334
7.7	The Need for Additional Government Intervention . . . . .	335
	Notes . . . . .	339
<b>8</b>	<b>International Climate Change Institutions and the Greenhouse-Gas Emitting Performance of Nations. . . . .</b>	<b>345</b>
8.1	Introduction . . . . .	345
8.2	Climate Change Institutions and Related Mechanisms . . . . .	346

8.2.1	The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change . . . . .	346
8.2.2	The Kyoto Protocol—Obligations During the First Commitment Period of 2008–2012 . . . . .	348
8.2.3	The Kyoto Protocol—Obligations During the Second Commitment Period of 2013–2020 . . . . .	350
8.2.4	Mitigation—The Kyoto Protocol’s Flexibility Mechanisms . . . . .	352
8.2.5	Mitigation—The Kyoto Protocol’s Treatment of Land Use, Land-Use Change, and Forestry (LULUCF) . . . . .	359
8.2.6	Mitigation—The Kyoto Protocol’s Treatment of Aviation and Shipping . . . . .	361
8.2.7	Mitigation—The Kyoto Protocol’s Enforcement Mechanisms . . . . .	362
8.2.8	Climate Change Financing Mechanisms and Institutions . . . . .	364
8.2.9	The Kyoto Architecture—A Summary. . . . .	386
8.3	The Greenhouse Gas-Emitting Performance of Nations . . . . .	386
8.3.1	The Greenhouse Gas-Emitting Performance of Annex I Nations . . . . .	386
8.3.2	The Performance of Non-annex I Nations . . . . .	394
8.3.3	Comparing the Greenhouse Gas-Emitting Performances of the UNFCCC-Defined Groups of Nations . . . . .	394
	Notes . . . . .	398
<b>9</b>	<b>Laying the Foundations to Support a New Global Climate Change Protocol . . . . .</b>	<b>411</b>
9.1	Introduction . . . . .	411
9.2	Views on the Kyoto Institutions and Related Mechanisms . . . . .	413
9.2.1	Mitigation—The Kyoto Protocol’s Flexibility Mechanisms . . . . .	413
9.2.2	Mitigation—The Kyoto Protocol’s Treatment of Land Use, Land-Use Change, and Forestry (LULUCF) . . . . .	432
9.2.3	Mitigation—Incorporating Funding Commitments in a New Global Protocol to Boost Mitigation Efforts. . . . .	441
9.2.4	Mitigation—The Kyoto Protocol’s Enforcement Mechanisms . . . . .	445
9.2.5	Mitigation—Border-Tax Adjustments/Green Tariffs to Limit Carbon Leakage and Promote Genuine Efficiency . . . . .	454
9.2.6	Adaptation—Incorporating Commitments in a New Global Protocol to Boost Adaptation Efforts . . . . .	465
9.2.7	Finance—Streamlining and Consolidating Climate Change Funding Arrangements . . . . .	469
9.3	The Distribution of Emissions Rights . . . . .	475

9.4 A Modified Architecture for a New (Post-2020) Climate Change Protocol . . . . .	481
Notes . . . . .	483
<b>10 A Post-2020 Protocol and Emissions-Trading Framework to Resolve the Climate Change Crisis . . . . .</b>	<b>491</b>
10.1 Introduction . . . . .	491
10.2 Fundamental Elements of a New Climate Change Protocol . . . . .	492
10.2.1 Ecological Sustainability Requirements—Global Greenhouse Gas Emissions Targets . . . . .	493
10.2.2 Distributional Equity Requirements . . . . .	504
10.2.3 Allocative Efficiency Requirements . . . . .	530
10.3 Governance of a National Emissions-Trading System . . . . .	544
10.4 The Separation, Linking, and Gradual Merging of National Emissions-Trading Systems . . . . .	547
10.5 How Challenging Would It Be to Achieve the Greenhouse Gas Emissions Targets Recommended for the Post-2020 Protocol? . . . . .	550
10.6 Concluding Remarks . . . . .	553
Notes . . . . .	554
<b>Postscript—The UNFCCC Climate Change Conference in Lima, 2014 . . .</b>	<b>561</b>
<b>References . . . . .</b>	<b>563</b>