The Relationship of WTO Law and Regional Trade Agreements in Dispute Settlement

From Fragmentation to Coherence

Malebakeng Agnes Forere

Wolters Kluwer
Table of Contents

About the Author vii

Foreword xv

Preface xvii

List of Abbreviations xix

PART I
Foundations 1

CHAPTER 1
Introduction 3

§1.01 Introduction 3

§1.02 Tension in the Global Trading System 6

§1.03 Objectives of the Book 7

§1.04 Hypothesis 7

§1.05 Theoretical Framework 8

[A] Multilevel Governance 8

[B] Principle of Subsidiarity 22

[1] Subsidiarity Principle in Politics 24

[a] United Nations (UN) 26

[b] Swiss Governance 27

[2] Subsidiarity as a Legal Norm 28

[a] German Federalism 28

[b] European Union Integration 29

§1.06 Methodology 31

§1.07 Organisation of the Book 33

ix
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 2

Multilateralism and Regionalism: Are the RTAs Building Blocks to the Global Trading System?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§2.01 Introduction</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2.02 Multilateralism: Overview</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2.03 WTO Adjudicative Body: DSB</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] Jurisdiction of the DSB</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B] Standing before the DSB</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] Standard of Review</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D] Remedies</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Compensation</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Suspension of Measures</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4] Surveillance</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2.04 Regionalism</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] Free Trade Agreements</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B] Customs Unions</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] Common Markets</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D] Economic Union</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2.05 Historical Background of RTA</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] First Wave</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] Third Wave: Post-Uruguay Round</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2.06 Political Economy of RTA DSM</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] Consequence of Creation of New Norms</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B] No Functional Dispute Settlement Prior to WTO</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] Deeper Integration</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D] WTO-Plus Standards</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[E] 'Monkey Do, Monkey See' Effect: Emulating the EU Model</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[F] Hegemon's Interests</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2.07 Are RTAs Building Blocks or Stumbling Blocks to the Global Trading System?</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] Reference to WTO Law</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B] Replication of the WTO Dispute Settlement Institutions and Processes</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] Attempt to Present RTA Matters in the WTO DSB</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2.08 Conclusion</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 3

Tension in the Global Trading System: Untangling the Web

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§3.01 Introduction</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§3.02 Description of Cases That Depict Tension between RTAs and WTO</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] Mexico: Soft Drinks</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table of Contents

[B] Argentina: Definitive Anti-dumping Duties on Poultry from Brazil 77
[C] Brazil: Measures Affecting Imports of Retreaded Tyres 79
[D] Turkey: Restrictions on Imports of Textile and Clothing Products 80

§3.03 Untangling the Web of Tension in the Global Trading System 81
[A] Absolute Disregard of RTA Dispute Settlement Mechanisms 81
[B] The Place of RTA Law in the WTO Remains Unsettled 82
[C] Contradictory Decisions between RTAs and WTO DSU on the Same Matter 83
[D] Purpose of Article XXIV of GATT Is Undermined by the WTO DSU: Partial Settlement of Disputes 84
[E] Forum Shopping 85
[F] WTO Is Unable to Correct WTO-Minus Standards That Exist in the RTAs 87

§3.04 Conclusion 88

### CHAPTER 4
Conclusion of Part I 89

### PART II
Relationship of WTO and Regional Trade Agreements 93

### CHAPTER 5
The Relationship between the Law of World Trade Organization and the Regional Trade Agreements 95

§5.01 Introduction 95

§5.02 Normative Relationship between the WTO and RTAs 96
[A] Vertical Relationship 96
[1] WTO as Constitutive of RTAs 97
[2] Article XXIV as Regulatory Rule to the RTAs 100
[B] Vertical Relationship between the WTO and RTAs in the Dispute Settlement 103
[1] Procedural Aspects 104
[a] Direct Applicability 106
[b] Direct Effect 109
[c] Supremacy of WTO Law over RTA Law 112
[d] Constitutionalisation of the Superior Norm 113
[e] Direct Enforceability of WTO Decisions in RTAs and Precedence 115

§5.03 Horizontal Relationship: Equality of Treaties 116
§5.04 No Relationship at All 119
§5.05 Theoretical Underpinnings of the Relationship between RTAs and the WTO 122
# Table of Contents

[A] Multilevel Governance and Subsidiarity 122

§5.06 Conclusion 125

**CHAPTER 6**

RTA Claims in the WTO Dispute Settlement 127

§6.01 Introduction 127

§6.02 Jurisdiction of the WTO Panels 128

[A] Article 7.3 of DSU: Special Terms of Reference 130

[B] Article 25 of DSU: Arbitration 134


[2] Arbitration Award 139


[C] Non-violation and Situation Complaints: GATT Article XXIII, DSU Articles 26 and 27 141

§6.03 Applicable Law 142

[A] Current Debate on the Applicable Law in the WTO 143

[1] Pauwelyn: International Law Applies to the Extent the WTO Has Not Contracted Out of It 143

[a] Treaty Law Born from International Law System 143

[b] Article 3.2 of DSU 145

[c] Non-violation Complaints 145


[a] WTO Panels as Courts of Limited Jurisdiction 146

[b] Non-WTO Law as Interpretive Tools 146

[c] Article 3.2 of the DSU 147

[B] Applicable Law as Practiced by WTO Panels 147

[1] RTA Law as a Defence 147


§6.04 Should WTO Panels Apply RTA Law? 151

[A] RTA Law as Part of the Global Trading System Law 151

[B] RTA Law as Part of Public International Law 152

§6.05 Conclusion 155

**CHAPTER 7**

Conclusion of Part II 157
PART III
Proposed Reforms 161

CHAPTER 8
First Instance and Appellate Procedure for RTAs in the WTO DSB 163
§8.01 Introduction 163
§8.02 WTO Panels as Courts of First Instance 164
[A] Jurisdiction of WTO Panels over RTA Claims 166
[1] RTA Claims Raising WTO Law 166
[B] Modifications to the DSU 169
[1] Jurisdiction over Intra-RTA Claims 169
[2] Jurisdiction over RTAs Involving Non-WTO Members 172
[3] Jurisdiction over RTA and Third Party Claims 176
[C] Jurisdiction: Standing before WTO Panels 178
[D] Applicable Law 179
[E] Standard of Review over RTA Claims 181
§8.03 Appeals from RTAs to the WTO 183
[A] Panel or Appellate Body 184
[B] Jurisdiction of the Appellate Body over RTA Tribunal Decisions 185
[1] Scope of the Appellate Body Appeals 185
[2] Standing before the Appellate Body 186
[3] Functions of the Appellate Body 186
[C] Appellate Body Standard of Review in Determining Correctness of RTA/Panel Decision 189
§8.04 Implication of Using WTO Panels and Appellate Body for RTA Claims 190
[A] Remedies on RTA Claims 190
[1] Measure Complained of Violates RTA Obligations 190
[a] RTAs Having Same Remedies as WTO or WTO-Plus Remedies 191
[b] RTAs Whose Remedies Are Inadequate or Ambiguous 192
[c] RTAs Silent on Remedies 193
[B] Enforcement 194
[C] Direct Applicability and Enforceability of WTO Decisions in the RTAs 195
§8.05 Conclusion 197

CHAPTER 9
Preliminary Ruling & Advisory Opinion from WTO to RTAs 199
§9.01 Introduction 199
§9.02 Preliminary Ruling 201
Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Jurisdiction</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Subject Matter Jurisdiction or Questions for Referral</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Power to Refer</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Applicable Law</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Panels or Appellate Body?</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Legal Force of Preliminary Ruling</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§9.03</td>
<td>Advisory Opinion</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Jurisdiction</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Questions for Referral</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Power to Refer</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Applicable Law on Advisory Opinion</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Panel or Appellate Body?</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Legal Force of the Opinion</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§9.04</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER 10

Final Conclusions                                              223

Bibliography                                                   233

Table of Cases                                                  249

Table of Treaties                                               255

Index                                                           265