Fiscal Sustainability of Health Systems

BRIDGING HEALTH AND FINANCE PERSPECTIVES

OECD
BETTER POLICIES FOR BETTER LIVES
# Table of contents

Acronyms and abbreviations ................................................. 15
Preface ............................................................................... 17
Executive summary ............................................................... 19

Chapter 1. Fiscal sustainability of health systems – Why is it an issue, what can be done? .................................................. 23
1.1. Introduction and main messages .................................. 24
1.2. How can fiscal sustainability be defined in relation to health systems? .................................................. 25
1.3. Health care spending: Past, present and future .......... 26
1.4. Why is spending on health increasing in OECD countries? .................................................. 31
1.5. Ensuring the fiscal sustainability of health systems: what are the main policy options? .................. 33
1.6. Conclusion ................................................................. 41
Notes ............................................................................... 42
References .................................................................. 42

Chapter 2. The challenge of budgeting for health care programmes .......................................................... 45
2.1. Introduction ................................................................. 46
2.2. Health care spending and fiscal sustainability ........ 47
2.3. What is the effect of health care spending on a national economy? .................................................. 50
2.4. Demand for public spending on health care .............. 54
2.5. The challenge of efficiency ......................................... 61
2.6. Effects of programme structure: Beyond “Bismarck” vs. “Beveridge” .................................................. 64
2.7. Conclusion ................................................................. 68
Notes ............................................................................... 68
References .................................................................. 74

Chapter 3. Budgeting practices for health in OECD countries .......................................................... 79
3.1. Introduction ................................................................. 80
3.2. Approaches in budgeting for health care ................. 83
3.3. Expenditure control tools .......................................... 87
3.4. Decision making and assessment ............................ 93
3.5. Decentralisation of health financing and expenditure .. 97
3.6. Conclusion ................................................................. 101
Notes ............................................................................... 101
References .................................................................. 101
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4. Decentralisation of health financing and expenditure</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Introduction</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Role of sub-national governments in health care provision and financing</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Overview of sub-national revenues for funding health care expenditures</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4. Policy setting and control over sub-national health care expenditures</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5. Specific challenges in controlling health expenditure in decentralised settings</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6. Conclusion</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The impact of cost-containment policies on health expenditure</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1. Introduction</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2. Background and chapter objectives</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3. A stylised economic framework for cost-containment reforms</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4. Cost-containment policy reforms in OECD countries: Reviewing the evidence</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5. Conclusion</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Country experiences in dealing with fiscal constraint following the 2008 crisis</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1. Introduction</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2. Results</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3. Discussion</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4. Conclusion</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The effects of ageing on the financing of social health provision</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1. Introduction</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2. The choice between different types of tax</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3. The political economy of support for social health care</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4. The sustainability of social security revenues</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5. Sin taxes</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6. The experience of OECD countries</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Health care budgeting in France</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1. Introduction</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2. Health and the public budget</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3. Institutional framework and budgeting practices</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4. Controlling key elements of health expenditures</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5. Financing health care</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6. Deficit management in France</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.7. Conclusion</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Note ........................................................................................................................ 223
References ............................................................................................................... 223

Chapter 9. Health care budgeting in the United Kingdom ........................................ 225
9.1. Overview of health in government expenditure ................................................. 226
9.2. Institutional framework and budgeting practices .............................................. 228
9.3. Controlling key elements of health expenditures ............................................ 231
9.4. The impact of health on the government's structural budget position .............. 234
9.5. Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 240
Notes ....................................................................................................................... 241
References ............................................................................................................... 241

Chapter 10. Health care budgeting in the Netherlands ............................................. 245
10.1. Introduction ...................................................................................................... 246
10.2. Reforming towards regulated competition ..................................................... 246
10.3. Evolution of health spending under regulated competition ......................... 248
10.4. Fiscal challenges for regulated competition .................................................... 251
10.5. Role of government in cost containment underregulated competition .......... 254
10.6. Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 258
Notes ....................................................................................................................... 259
Bibliography ........................................................................................................... 259

Tables
1.1. Fiscal sustainability definitions from the European Commission and the International Monetary Fund ................................................................. 25
1.2. Health spending projections by national fiscal authorities and the OECD ...... 30
3.1. Is health care expenditure part of central government budget? ...................... 83
3.A1.2. Success of the central budget authority (CBA) in keeping health care spending within desired parameters in the last four years ........ 103
3.A1.3. Types of budget allocation ........................................................................ 103
3.A1.4. Categories included in projections .............................................................. 104
3.A1.5. Existence of specific ceilings for health expenditures ............................. 104
3.A1.6. Entity primarily responsible for setting the health expenditure ceiling(s) ........................................................................................................ 105
3.A1.7. Most important factors when establishing ceilings or targets for health ................................................................. 105
3.A1.8. Existence of an early warning system to alert that health expenditures may exceed targets or legally binding levels ...................... 106
3.A1.9. Use of automatic reductions in health expenditure .................................... 106
3.A1.10. Functions undertaken by the CBA ............................................................. 107
3.A1.11. Extent to which the CBA can influence health care policies .................... 108
3.A1.12. Areas which have been key priorities for expenditure control in health in recent years ................................................................. 108
3.A1.14. Countries in which the CBA receives economic evaluations of expected health benefits from new policy proposals suggested by the Health Ministry ........................................................................................................ 110
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.A1.15</td>
<td>Assessment of health policy proposals (on the basis of economic assessments of their expected benefits) by the CBA</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.A1.16</td>
<td>Assessment of the impact of health policies on equity by the CBA</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.A1.17</td>
<td>Major challenges encountered in the co-operation between the CBA and the Ministry of Health</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.A1.18</td>
<td>Existence of a formal co-ordination body between the CBA and Ministry of Health, and other institutions for co-ordination</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.A1.19</td>
<td>Ability of the central government (or social security) to vary total resources transferred to sub-national governments for health from one year to the next</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.A1.20</td>
<td>Procedure for central government (or social security) to vary total resources transferred to sub-national governments from one year to the next</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.A1.21</td>
<td>Influence of the central government (CG) on overall health spending by sub-national governments</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.A1.22</td>
<td>Institution primarily responsible for controlling health spending by sub-national governments</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.</td>
<td>Central governments set targets for health spending by SNGs</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.</td>
<td>Summary of the reviewed empirical evidence on cost-containment policies in OECD countries</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.</td>
<td>Pay for performance programme in several OECD countries</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.A1.1</td>
<td>Menu of policy options</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.</td>
<td>Total expenditure on health</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.</td>
<td>Public expenditure on health</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.</td>
<td>Revenue shares of the main tax categories in the OECD area</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.</td>
<td>Trends in the tax wedge</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.</td>
<td>Use of social security contributions to finance health care</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.</td>
<td>ONDAM sub-categories actuals, predictions and targets for the years</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.</td>
<td>Evolution of CSG rates since its creation</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.</td>
<td>Presentation of all earmarked taxes related to health in 2012</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1.</td>
<td>Changes in public spending as a share of GDP and tax receipts</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.</td>
<td>Government spending on health in the United Kingdom</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.</td>
<td>The 2002 Wanless Review projections of English NHS funding pressures</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.</td>
<td>NHS England funding pressures facing the NHS by the end of the decade</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5.</td>
<td>Health Foundation projected funding gap for English NHS in 2030-31 under three assumptions for productivity</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1.</td>
<td>Nominal hospital price developments</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.</td>
<td>Time lags between realisation of spending and implementation of measures</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figures**

1. Average annual growth rate of real health spending and GDP per capita, 1990-2012 (or closest years)            | 27   |
2. Average annual growth rates in real health spending per capita, from 2000 to the latest year | 27   |
3. Growth in health spending as compared with GDP                                                          | 28   |
4. Health spending as a share of GDP, 2012 or latest year                                                   | 28   |
## 1. Projected public health and long-term care expenditure as a percentage of GDP in 2060

- 29

## 1.6. Health spending as a share of total government spending, 2012

- 34

## 1.7. Revenue sources for funding government health expenditures, 2010 or latest year

- 35

## 1.8. Health expenditure by function of health care

- 36

## 1.9. Hospital medical admission rates across and within selected OECD countries, 2011 or latest year

- 37

## 1.10. Relative share of public and private spending, 2012 (or nearest year)

- 39

## 1.11. Number of countries using HTA to make coverage decisions or set reimbursements

- 41

## 3.1. Fiscal sustainability framework

- 81

## 3.2. Coverage of long-term health expenditure projections

- 86

## 3.3. Years of estimates for health spending in the budget

- 88

## 3.4. Factors influencing ceilings for health

- 89

## 3.5. Size of budget overruns and underspending in percentage of budgeted spending, 2006-12

- 90

## 3.6. Early-warning systems (EWS)

- 90

## 3.7. Voted ONDAM vs. achieved health expenditures

- 91

## 3.8. Delay in reporting health expenditure to central budget authority (CBA)

- 92

## 3.9. Share of discretionary vs. mandatory health spending, average 2006-12

- 94

## 3.10. Main healthcare-related functions undertaken by the central budget authority

- 95

## 3.11. Influence of the central budget authority (CBA) over healthcare-related policies

- 95

## 3.12. Top priority areas for health expenditure control for budget officials

- 96

## 3.13. Perceived co-ordination challenges between the Ministry of Health and the central budget authority

- 96

## 3.14. Sources of revenues financing SNG health expenditure

- 98

## 3.15. Composition of transfers from central authorities as a share of total SNG health care spending

- 98

## 3.16. What is the procedure for central government (CG) or social security (SS) to vary total resources transferred?

- 99

## 4.1. Division of public health care spending between levels of government, 2012

- 117

## 4.2. SNG health care expenditure as a share of total SNG expenditure, 2000-12

- 118

## 4.3. Sources of revenues financing SNG health expenditure

- 119

## 4.4. Composition of transfers from central authorities as a share of total SNG health care spending

- 120

## 4.5. To what extent can the central government or social security authority vary total resources transferred to SNGs for health from one year to the next?

- 121

## 4.6. What is the procedure for the central government or social security authority to vary total resources transferred?

- 121

## 4.7. Central government monitoring of sub-national government performance for health expenditure

- 123

## 4.8. Institutions in charge of controlling SNG health care spending

- 124

## 4.9. Health care resources for county councils, Sweden, 2011

- 125

## 4.10. Evolution of social and health care services in Finnish municipalities

- 126

## 5.1. Public expenditure on health as a share of total health expenditure, OECD countries 2012 or nearest year

- 135
5.2. Total expenditure on health as a share of GDP, OECD countries 2012 or nearest year .................................................. 136
5.3. A stylised economic framework for cost-containment reforms .......................................................... 139
5.4. Evolution of pharmaceutical expenditure as a share of total health expenditure ........................................... 144
6.1. Key policy responses in Europe .................................................. 161
6.2. Budget tools available if health spending exceeds targets, by option .................................................. 162
6.3. Contribution to the evolution of health care expenditure by function of care ........................................... 163
6.4. Estimated savings from hospital consolidation: Greece .................................................. 164
6.5. Gross pay in the Irish health sector .................................................. 165
6.6. Actual and projected UK NHS spending as a percentage of GDP .................................................. 166
6.7. Savings in the United Kingdom under the Quality, Innovation, Productivity and Prevention programme (QIPP) .................................................. 168
6.8. South Africa fiscal position: Consolidated revenue and expenditure as a percentage of GDP .................................................. 169
6.9. Variability in hospital beds by country in OECD .................................................. 172
6.10. Variation in hospital discharges by country in OECD .................................................. 172
7.1. Total expenditure on health .................................................. 182
7.2. Public expenditure on health .................................................. 187
7.3. Compensation of employees .................................................. 189
7.4. Reliance on social security contributions and the tax wedge .................................................. 194
7.5. Reliance on social security contributions and the increase in the government share of health care expenditure since 2000 .................................................. 194
8.1. Total health expenditure as share of GDP, 2011 (or nearest year) .................................................. 200
8.2. Expenditure on health by type of financing, 2011 (or nearest year) .................................................. 201
8.3. General government health spending compared to general government overall spending as a share of GDP, 2009 (or nearest year) .................................................. 201
8.4. Social security/health deficits (salaried workers regime/CNAMTS) since 1998 .................................................. 202
8.5. Health branch of total social security revenues and expenditures since 2005 .................................................. 203
8.6. Total social security deficits projections up to 2017 .................................................. 203
8.7. Evolution of gross public debt to GDP ratio (Maastricht definition) in France .................................................. 204
8.8. Total public and primary private health insurance .................................................. 205
8.9. Calendar of the Social Security Act .................................................. 208
8.10. Main savings included in the ONDAM between 2010 and 2013 .................................................. 210
8.11. Voted ONDAM vs. achieved health expenditures .................................................. 211
8.12. The year-long process of the Alert Committee .................................................. 213
8.13. Key factors behind actual health spending below the ONDAM, 2010 to 2012 .................................................. 215
8.14. Distribution of CNAMTS resources .................................................. 217
8.15. Origins and allocation of CSG revenues in 2012 .................................................. 218
8.16. Destinations of earmarked taxes for social security in 2012 .................................................. 219
8.17. Evolution of household income distribution between 1970 and 2011 .................................................. 220
8.18. Share of CNAMTS revenues by source in 2011 .................................................. 220
8.19. Evolution of the CADES net liability position .................................................. 222
8.20. Evolution of the CADES recourses .................................................. 222
9.1. NHS spending in the United Kingdom, as a proportion of total public spending ........................................ 226
9.2. Percentage of public spending in 1978-79 and 2010-11 .......................................................... 227
9.3. The variation in public health spending per person in the four countries of the United Kingdom .................................................. 228
9.4. English health budget to 2015-16 ......................................................................................... 229
9.5. Purchase of NHS-funded health care from non-NHS bodies from 2006-07 to 2013-14 .................... 230
9.6. NHS primary care trust expenditures 2009-10 – GBP 97.5 billion ........................................... 230
9.7. Percentage change from previous year in English NHS spending by service area .......................................................... 231
9.8. Health care output, inputs and productivity estimates (nominal terms), 1995-2010, United Kingdom ................................................................................................. 232
9.9. NHS Staff annual average earnings per person 2010-11 to 2013-14 ............................................ 233
9.10. DEL and AME components ................................................................................................... 235
9.11. The financial gap by 2021-22, assuming English NHS funding rises as set out in the 2010 Spending Review to 2014-15 and is frozen in real terms ........................................... 235
9.12. Funding pressures on acute services in England attributable to population change and to the rising probability of admission for chronic conditions ........................................... 236
9.13. Funding pressures on English NHS in 2030-31 ....................................................................... 238
9.14. Change in sectoral job share and level of productivity .............................................................. 239
10.1. Evolution of total health expenditure in percentage of GDP and per capita ...................... 249
10.2. Annual increase in expenditures by cost deciles funded by the Health Insurance Act, 2006-08 .......................................................... 250
10.3. Evolution of real hospital care expenditures ........................................................................... 251
10.4. Risk bearing by insurers went up over time .............................................................................. 253
10.5. Market shares and real monthly premium prices of the four largest health insurers .............. 254

Follow OECD Publications on:

http://twitter.com/OECD_Pubs
http://www.facebook.com/OECDPublications
http://www.linkedin.com/groups/OECD-Publications-4645871
http://www.youtube.com/oecdilibrary
http://www.oecd.org/oecddirect/

This book has... StatLinks

Look for the StatLinks at the bottom of the tables or graphs in this book. To download the matching Excel® spreadsheet, just type the link into your Internet browser, starting with the http://dx.doi.org prefix, or click on the link from the e-book edition.