Capacity Mechanisms in the EU Energy Market

Law, Policy, and Economics

Edited by
LEIGH HANCHER
ADRIEN DE HAUTELOCQUE
and
MAŁGORZATA SADOWSKA

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
# Table of Contents

Table of Cases xv
Table of Legislation xix
Table of Relevant Non-Legislative Documents xxvii
List of Contributors xxxi
List of Abbreviations xxxix

## PART I. POLICY

1. EU Policy on Capacity Mechanisms 3
   1.1 Why capacity mechanisms? The missing money problem and RES capacity 3
   1.2 Core features of capacity mechanisms 7
   1.3 The EU approach to capacity mechanisms before the 20/20/20 Package 16
   1.4 The EU approach to capacity mechanisms after the 20/20/20 Package (and before the November 2013 Communication) 18
   1.5 The November 2013 Communication 22
   1.6 Conclusion—where next with capacity mechanisms in the EU? 30

2. The Regulators’ View: ACER’s Report on Capacity Mechanisms and the EU Internal Electricity Market 32
   2.1 Introduction 32
   2.2 The contribution of energy-only markets to generation adequacy 33
   2.3 Impact of capacity mechanisms: design and distortions 35
   2.4 Cross-border participation in capacity mechanisms 37
   2.5 Conclusions and recommendations 38

   3.1 Introduction 40
   3.2 The pervasive impact of capacity mechanisms on the remuneration of flexibility 41
   3.3 The costs of self-sufficient capacity mechanisms 44
   3.4 A framework for coordination of national capacity mechanisms at EU level 48
   3.5 Conclusion 54

## PART II. ECONOMICS

4. Energy Market Design with Capacity Mechanisms 59
   4.1 Introduction 59
   4.2 Energy-only market—can it be sustainable? 60
   4.3 What are the policy options—and how would they perform? 67
   4.4 How do renewable energies fit into the market design? 72
   4.5 What are the challenges in the EU context? 75
   4.6 Summary—when to use which capacity mechanisms? 76

5. Different Approaches for Capacity Mechanisms in Europe: Rationale and Potential for Coordination? 79
   5.1 Introduction 79
   5.2 A patchwork of capacity mechanisms in Europe: different designs fit different needs 80
Table of Contents

5.3 Toward coordination of capacity mechanisms in Europe 81
5.4 Capacity mechanisms and the new EEAG 2014–2020: Key issues 86
5.5 Coordinating capacity mechanisms in Europe 89
5.6 Conclusions 93

   6.1 Elements of the EU debate on cross-border participation 95
   6.2 Explicit cross-border participation with congested capacity of interconnections 102
   6.3 Social efficiency of cross-border participation from the national perspective 106
   6.4 Social efficiency of cross-border participation from the EU perspective 110
   6.5 Conclusion 117

7. The System Adequacy Problem: Lessons Learned from the American Continent 119
   7.1 Introduction 119
   7.2 Design elements 121
   7.3 Target market 121
   7.4 Lag period (or lead time) 127
   7.5 Contract duration 128
   7.6 Defining the requirements associated with the 'reliability product' 130
   7.7 Indexation and warranties 136
   7.8 Summary and high-level recommendations 138

8. The Generation Mix, Price Caps, and Capacity Payments 140
   8.1 Introduction 140
   8.2 Optimal generation mix 141
   8.3 A competitive market leads to an optimal generation mix 145
   8.4 A price cap distorts investment levels 147
   8.5 Capacity payments restore efficiency 149
   8.6 Renewable energy and demand participation 150
   8.7 Conclusion 153

PART III. LAW

9. Capacity Mechanisms and State Aid Control: A European Solution to the 'Missing Money' Problem? 157
   9.1 Introduction 157
   9.2 Policy evolution 158
   9.3 Funding capacity mechanisms: When do the state aid rules apply? 162
   9.4 Compatible support—the new EEAG 2014–2020 171
   9.5 Assessment 175
   9.6 Conclusion 181

    10.1 Introduction 182
    10.2 EU antitrust enforcement in the energy sector—a primer 183
    10.3 A typology of antitrust issues related to capacity mechanisms 185
    10.4 The problem with the market definition 187
    10.5 Selected anticompetitive practices under Articles 101 and 102 TFEU 189
    10.6 Conclusions 200
### Table of Contents


11.1 Introduction 201  
11.2 Energy as goods 202  
11.3 Free movement of goods and state aid 203  
11.4 Free movement of goods: Restrictions 203  
11.5 Free movement of goods: Justification 210  
11.6 Conclusion 223

#### PART IV. CASE STUDIES

12. Austria

12.1 Introduction 227  
12.2 Setting the scene 227  
12.3 Energy-only market 235  
12.4 European dimension 237  
12.5 Conclusion 240

13. Belgium

13.1 Introduction 241  
13.2 Setting the scene 241  
13.3 Capacity mechanism 245  
13.4 European dimension 253  
13.5 Conclusion 255

14. France

14.1 Introduction 256  
14.2 Setting the scene 256  
14.3 Capacity mechanism 258  
14.4 European dimension 264  
14.5 Conclusion 270

15. Germany

15.1 Introduction 271  
15.2 Setting the scene 271  
15.3 Energy-only market and network reserve 276  
15.4 European dimension 285  
15.5 Conclusion 287

16. Greece

16.1 Introduction 288  
16.2 Setting the scene 288  
16.3 Capacity mechanism 293  
16.4 European dimension 297  
16.5 Conclusion 301

17. Italy

17.1 Introduction 302  
17.2 Setting the scene 302  
17.3 Capacity mechanism 306  
17.4 European dimension 310  
17.5 Conclusion 313
## Table of Contents

### 18. Netherlands
- 18.1 Introduction 314
- 18.2 Setting the scene 314
- 18.3 Energy-only market and the European dimension 318
- 18.4 Conclusion 320

### 19. Norway
- 19.1 Introduction 321
- 19.2 Setting the scene 321
- 19.3 Energy-only market 325
- 19.4 European dimension 331
- 19.5 Conclusion 334

### 20. Poland
- 20.1 Introduction 335
- 20.2 Setting the scene 335
- 20.3 Energy-only market, capacity measures, and a 'capacity debate' 342
- 20.4 European dimension 347
- 20.5 Conclusions 349

### 21. Spain
- 21.1 Introduction 351
- 21.2 Setting the scene 351
- 21.3 Capacity mechanism 356
- 21.4 European dimension 363
- 21.5 Conclusion 364

### 22. United Kingdom
- 22.1 Introduction 365
- 22.2 Setting the scene 365
- 22.3 Capacity mechanism 370
- 22.4 European dimension 380
- 22.5 Conclusion 382

Index 383