EXPORT RESTRICTIONS ON CRITICAL MINERALS AND METALS

Testing the Adequacy of WTO Disciplines

ILARIA ESPA

World Trade Institute, University of Berne

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
CONTENTS

Foreword by Giorgio Sacerdoti xiii
Acknowledgements xv
List of abbreviations xvii
WTO reports xix
GATT panel reports xxiii

Introduction 1
I.1 Historical trends in the use of export restrictions 1
I.2 The panoply of export restrictions on primary commodities in recent times 8
  I.2.1 Agricultural export restrictions and food security concerns 11
  I.2.2 Export restrictions on energy commodities between new and old concerns 22
  I.2.3 Export restrictions on raw materials of mineral origin and the revival of industrial policies 28
I.3 ‘Critical’ minerals and metals and the debate over the use of export restrictions 31
I.4 Goals, method and structure of this study 34

PART I Minerals and metals critical to the world economy and the recent proliferation of export restrictions 39

1 Evolving world trade patterns in critical minerals and metals 41
  1.1 Introduction 41
  1.2 Defining mineral raw materials 41
    1.2.1 A definition of raw materials 41
CONTENTS

1.2.2 Raw materials of mineral origin 44
1.2.3 A classification of minerals and metals 46

1.3 Identifying ‘critical’ minerals and metals 48
  1.3.1 Demand and supply determinants for mineral raw materials 48
  1.3.2 Specific factors of mineral criticality 51
  1.3.3 A list of critical minerals and metals 54

1.4 Distinctive features of critical minerals and metals 56

1.5 Main patterns of international trade in critical minerals and metals 63

1.6 Conclusions 65

2 The landscape of export restrictions on critical minerals and metals 67
  2.1 Introduction 67
  2.2 A definition of export restrictions 67
  2.3 The explosion of attention towards export restrictions 69

2.4 Recent trends in the use of export taxes 72
  2.4.1 A definition of export taxes or duties 72
  2.4.2 The proliferation of export duties or taxes 74
  2.4.3 Export duties or taxes applied to critical mineral and metals 77
  2.4.4 Other price or tax measures imposed on exportation 84

2.5 Recent trends in the use of QRs on exports 86
  2.5.1 Export prohibitions or bans 86
  2.5.2 Export quotas 89
  2.5.3 Export licensing schemes or requirements 93
  2.5.4 Minimum export prices and other types of export restrictions 96

2.6 Conclusions 98
3 Economic effects and policy goals of mineral export restraints 101

3.1 Introduction 101

3.2 The economic effects of export restrictions 102
   3.2.1 Effects predicted by theoretical economic models 103
   3.2.2 Changes in welfare and redistributional effects linked to export restrictions 105
   3.2.3 Sector-specific factors influencing the effects of export restrictions on minerals and metals 108

3.3 Main policy goals of export restrictions in the minerals and metals sector 111
   3.3.1 Export restrictions as developmental tools 111
   3.3.2 Export restrictions as environmental tools 116
   3.3.3 Other policy objectives associated with export restrictions 118

3.4 Empirical evidence on the effects of export restrictions on critical minerals and metals 119

3.5 Conclusions 122

PART II Existing WTO disciplines on export restrictions 125

4 WTO disciplines on export duties 127

4.1 Introduction 127

4.2 Asymmetry in the WTO treatment of import and export tariffs: origins and rationale 128

4.3 Export duties or taxes in the GATT 131
   4.3.1 Enforceability of export duty concessions included in GATT schedules 131
   4.3.2 Differences in the treatment of import and export duty concessions in the GATT 135
   4.3.3 Admissibility of export duties under Article XI:1 GATT 140
   4.3.4 Other GATT provisions applicable to export duties 143
4.4 Export duty commitments in post-1994 accession protocols: the emergence of WTO-plus obligations

4.4.1 An overview of export duty commitments assumed by newly acceded WTO Members

4.4.2 Limited flexibility of WTO-plus obligations on export duties

4.5 Transparency and notification requirements applicable to export duties

4.6 Conclusions

5 WTO disciplines on export quantitative restrictions

5.1 Introduction

5.2 GATT rules on export quantitative restrictions

5.2.1 The general elimination obligation under Article XI:1 GATT

5.2.2 Other GATT provisions relevant to quantitative restrictions on exports

5.3 GATT exceptions applicable to quantitative restrictions on exports

5.3.1 The critical shortage of supply clause under Article XI:2(a) GATT

5.3.2 Limited applicability of other Article XI-specific exceptions

5.3.3 Non-availability of other GATT exceptions applicable to quantitative restrictions

5.4 Transparency and notification requirements applicable to export quantitative restrictions

5.5 Conclusions

6 GATT general exceptions relevant and applicable to WTO-inconsistent export restrictions

6.1 Introduction

6.2 Availability of Article XX GATT to WTO-plus obligations on export duties assumed under post-1994 accession protocols
6.2.1 The existence of an 'objective link' as a precondition for the applicability of Article XX GATT to post-1994 accession protocol provisions 194
6.2.2 Implications for WTO Members assuming specific obligations on export duties under post-1994 accession protocols 202
6.2.3 Systemic imbalances produced by the Appellate Body's approach in light of the fragmentation of WTO disciplines on export duties 204

6.3 The relevance of Article XX GATT to justify export restrictions in light of recent WTO case law 208
   6.3.1 Article XX(b) GATT 209
   6.3.2 Article XX(g) GATT 214
   6.3.3 Industrial policy exceptions under Article XX GATT 221
   6.3.4 The chapeau of Article XX GATT 223

6.4 Conclusions 225

PART III Regulatory prospects 229

7 Understanding the multifaceted discourse on export restrictions in the WTO: a brief conceptual framework 231
   7.1 Introduction 231
   7.2 Access to supplies vs. development needs in the debate over export restrictions in the GATT era 232
   7.3 Arguments in favour of export restrictions as developmental tools 234
      7.3.1 The regained centrality of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources 235
      7.3.2 Export restrictions as safeguard tools 241
      7.3.3 Export restrictions as instruments to relieve commodity dependence and vulnerability to price volatility 243
   7.4 Arguments against export restrictions as beggar-thy-neighbour instruments 245
      7.4.1 Disruptions in global value chains caused by export restrictions 245
      7.4.2 Subsidy-equivalent effects of export restrictions 247
      7.4.3 Rent-seeking behaviours induced by export restrictions and absence of competition rules in the WTO 252
   7.5 Conclusions 254
8 Export restrictions in the Doha Round negotiations 257
  8.1 Introduction 257
  8.2 The Doha mandate on export restrictions 257
  8.3 The EU Proposals on export taxes 258
    8.3.1 The proposal for a WTO Agreement on Export Taxes 258
    8.3.2 The EU Revised Submission on Export Taxes 262
  8.4 The proposed Protocol on Transparency in Export Licensing to the GATT 266
  8.5 Conclusions 269
9 The way forward 273
  9.1 Introduction 273
  9.2 Building blocks 274
    9.2.1 Enhanced transparency in the use of export restrictions 274
    9.2.2 Negotiation of export duty concessions in WTO Members’ GATT schedules 277
    9.2.3 Expansion of GATT flexibilities 282
    9.2.4 Envisaging an export safeguard mechanism 284
  9.3 Implementing options 286
    9.3.1 A deal on transparency 286
    9.3.2 Launching negotiations on export duty concessions: options and modalities 287
    9.3.3 A new WTO Agreement on Export Taxes 289
  9.4 Conclusions 290

Appendix 1 Export taxes applied to critical minerals and metals (2008–2014) 293
Appendix 2 Export licensing schemes applied to critical minerals and metals (2008–2014) 329
Bibliography 335
Index 357