

Jurgita Bruneckienė • Irena Pekarskienė •  
Andrius Guzavičius • Oksana Palekienė •  
Jūratė Šovienė

# The Impact of Cartels on National Economy and Competitiveness

A Lithuanian Case Study

 Springer

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Conception of Cartels: Definition and Diversity</b> . . . . .	1
1.1	Conception of Cartels . . . . .	2
1.1.1	Concepts of Collusion . . . . .	2
1.1.2	Concept of Cartel . . . . .	3
1.1.3	Cartel: Is It a Combination of Independent Firms or a Single Corporation? . . . . .	7
1.1.4	Variety of Cartels . . . . .	8
1.2	Cartels in the Theories of Economic Thought: Two Different Approaches . . . . .	12
1.3	Key Characteristics of Cartels . . . . .	16
1.3.1	Cartel Duration . . . . .	18
1.3.2	Cartel Overcharge . . . . .	24
1.3.3	Cartel Profitability . . . . .	29
1.4	Cartel Statistics in the European Union and Lithuania . . . . .	32
1.4.1	Cartels in the European Union . . . . .	33
1.4.2	Lithuanian Cartels . . . . .	35
1.4.3	Fines for Cartels in Lithuania . . . . .	38
1.4.4	Basic Features of Cartels in Lithuania . . . . .	39
	References . . . . .	43
<b>2</b>	<b>Cartel Occurrence and Operation in Market</b> . . . . .	49
2.1	Cartels and Markets . . . . .	49
2.2	Cartel Formation Methods . . . . .	51
2.3	Principles of Cartel Formation . . . . .	54
2.4	Cartel Structure . . . . .	56
2.5	Cartel in the Market Economic System . . . . .	57
2.6	Cartels and Producer Associations . . . . .	60
2.7	Cartel Stability . . . . .	63
	References . . . . .	66

<b>3</b>	<b>Cartel Markets</b> . . . . .	69
3.1	Cartel During Different Business Cycle Stages . . . . .	69
3.1.1	Cartel During the Boom Phase of Business Cycle . . . . .	71
3.1.2	Cartel During the Decline Phase of Business Cycle . . . . .	72
3.1.3	Cartel During the Depression Phase of Business Cycle . . . . .	73
3.1.4	Cartel During the Recovery Phase of Business Cycle . . . . .	75
3.2	Characteristic Features of Industries with Increased Cartelisation Risks and Identification Thereof in Lithuania . . . . .	78
3.2.1	Key Indications of Cartel Markets . . . . .	79
3.2.2	Cartel Markets in Lithuania: Identification and Features . . . . .	83
3.2.3	Economic Methods in Cartel Detection . . . . .	91
	References . . . . .	93
<b>4</b>	<b>Legal Regulation of Cartels</b> . . . . .	97
4.1	Reasons and Objectives of Cartels Regulation . . . . .	97
4.2	Regulation of Cartels in the EU and in Lithuania . . . . .	101
4.3	Detection of Cartels: Authorities and Measures in the EU and in Lithuania: System of Fines . . . . .	106
4.3.1	EU Network of Competition Authorities . . . . .	106
4.3.2	EU Commission . . . . .	108
4.3.3	Lithuanian Competition Council . . . . .	108
4.3.4	Cartel Fining System . . . . .	110
4.4	Measures to Prevent Cartels: Peculiarities and Problems of Their Application in the EU and in Lithuania . . . . .	115
4.4.1	Leniency Programmes . . . . .	115
4.4.2	Private Actions for Damages Caused by Cartels . . . . .	119
4.4.3	Problems Concerning Imposition of Individual Liability for Cartel Activity . . . . .	122
4.4.4	Restrictions on Participation in Public Procurement Procedures . . . . .	123
4.4.5	Rewards to Natural Persons for the Provision of Information About a Cartel . . . . .	124
4.4.6	Competition Law Compliance Programme . . . . .	125
4.5	Main Problems of Implementing Competition Policy in Respect of Cartels in Lithuania and Solutions to them . . . . .	126
	References . . . . .	131
<b>5</b>	<b>Analysis of the Impact of Cartels on National Economy and Competitiveness</b> . . . . .	135
5.1	Cartel and Market Inefficiency (Deadweight Loss) . . . . .	135
5.2	Cartel Adverse Impact on Economy and Competitiveness . . . . .	138
5.2.1	Cartel Adverse Impact at National Level . . . . .	138
5.2.2	Cartel Adverse Impact at International Level . . . . .	143
5.3	Cartel Positive Impact on Economy and Competitiveness . . . . .	148
	References . . . . .	152

<b>6</b>	<b>Critical Analysis of Economic Efficiency of Fines Imposed on Cartels</b> . . . . .	155
6.1	Cartels and Antitrust Policy . . . . .	156
6.2	Theoretical Concept of Optimal Fines . . . . .	158
6.3	Deterrent Effect of Fines . . . . .	161
6.4	Empirical Research on the Economic Efficiency of Fines . . . . .	165
	References . . . . .	168
<b>7</b>	<b>Methodological Principles of Assessing Cartel Harm (Effects)</b> . . . . .	173
7.1	Assessment of Harm in Social-Economic System: Role and Principles . . . . .	174
7.2	Parties Affected by Cartels . . . . .	177
7.3	Quantitative Assessment of Cartel Effects . . . . .	180
7.4	Phases of Effects Estimation . . . . .	188
7.5	Methods for Estimating Harm Caused by Cartels . . . . .	191
7.5.1	Overcharge Calculation . . . . .	193
7.5.2	Calculation of the Pass-On of Overcharges . . . . .	198
7.5.3	Evaluation of Lost Profit (Losses) . . . . .	199
7.5.4	Methodology for Cartel Effects Assessment Applied by Competition Supervisory Authorities . . . . .	200
7.6	Practical Difficulties in Harm Assessment . . . . .	203
7.7	Aspects of Increasing Harm Estimation Accuracy . . . . .	208
	References . . . . .	212
<b>8</b>	<b>Assessment of Cartel Impact on the National Economy: Integrated Model</b> . . . . .	217
	Reference . . . . .	229
<b>9</b>	<b>Empirical Application of a Model for an Integrated Assessment of Cartel Impact on the National Economy in the Case of Lithuania</b> . . . . .	231
9.1	Integrated Assessment of the Paper Cartel's Impact on the National Economy . . . . .	232
9.1.1	Description of Paper Cartel Products . . . . .	233
9.1.2	Paper Cartel Market Description . . . . .	233
9.1.3	Paper Cartel Performance Analysis . . . . .	233
9.1.4	Identification of Parties Affected by the Paper Cartel . . . . .	234
9.1.5	Objects Affected by the Paper Cartel . . . . .	235
9.1.6	Modelling of a Counterfactual Scenario for the Paper Cartel . . . . .	235
9.1.7	Evaluation of the Paper Cartel's Economic Impact . . . . .	238
9.1.8	Robustness and Sensitivity Analysis of Paper Cartel Assessment Results . . . . .	246
9.1.9	Interpretation of Paper Cartel Assessment Results: Assessment of the Economic Efficiency of Fines . . . . .	249

9.2	Integrated Assessment of the Orthopaedic Cartel's Impact on the National Economy . . . . .	250
9.2.1	Orthopaedic Cartel Product Description . . . . .	251
9.2.2	Orthopaedic Cartel Market Description . . . . .	251
9.2.3	Orthopaedic Cartel Performance Analysis . . . . .	251
9.2.4	Identification of Parties Affected by the Orthopaedic Cartel . . . . .	252
9.2.5	Objects Affected by the Orthopaedic Cartel . . . . .	252
9.2.6	Modelling of a Counterfactual Scenario for the Orthopaedic Cartel . . . . .	253
9.2.7	Assessment of the Orthopaedic Cartel's Economic Impact . . . . .	255
9.2.8	Robustness and Sensitivity Analysis of Orthopaedic Cartel Assessment Results . . . . .	259
9.2.9	Interpretation of Orthopaedic Cartel Assessment Results: Estimation of the Economic Efficiency of Fines . . . . .	261
9.3	Integrated Assessment of the Milk Cartel's Impact on the National Economy . . . . .	262
9.3.1	Milk Cartel Product Description . . . . .	263
9.3.2	Milk Cartel Market Description . . . . .	263
9.3.3	Milk Cartel Performance Analysis . . . . .	263
9.3.4	Identification of Parties Affected by the Milk Cartel . . . . .	263
9.3.5	Objects Affected by the Milk Cartel . . . . .	263
9.3.6	Modelling of a Counterfactual Scenario for the Milk Cartel . . . . .	264
9.3.7	Assessment of the Milk Cartel's Economic Impact . . . . .	267
9.3.8	Robustness and Sensitivity Analysis of Milk Cartel Assessment Results . . . . .	272
9.3.9	Interpretation of Milk Cartel Assessment Results: Evaluation of the Economic Efficiency of Fines . . . . .	273
9.4	Generalisation and the Main Problems of Empirical Cartel Impact Assessment . . . . .	275
	References . . . . .	277
<b>10</b>	<b>Recommendations to Minimise an Adverse Impact of Cartels on the National Economy . . . . .</b>	<b>279</b>
	<b>Conclusions . . . . .</b>	<b>287</b>
	<b>Annexes . . . . .</b>	<b>299</b>
	Annex 1. Detailed Analysis of Fines Levied on Lithuanian Cartels in 2011 and 2012 . . . . .	299
	Annex 2. Main Data About Unclosed Cartels in 2000–2012 . . . . .	306
	Annex 3. Consumer Price Index in Lithuania . . . . .	313
	Annex 4. Data Used in the Empirical Research . . . . .	313