Is Marx's Theory of Profit Right?
The Simultaneist–Temporality Debate

Edited by Nick Potts and Andrew Kliman
# Contents

Editors’ Note                                    ix  
Acknowledgments                                xi   
Abbreviations                              xiii  

1 A Sad Story: An Introduction to and Commentary on the Debate  
   *Nick Potts*                      1  

**PART I: THE SIMULTANEIST–TEMPORALIST DEBATE**  

2 Simultaneous Valuation vs. the Exploitation Theory of Profit  
   *Andrew J. Kliman*          19  

3 On the TSSI and the Exploitation Theory of Profit  
   *Simon Mohun*                33  

4 Deriving a Negative PNP  
   *Andrew Kliman*              49  

5 Exploitation, Profits, and Time  
   *Roberto Veneziani*          51  

6 Replicating Marx: A Reply to Mohun  
   *Andrew Kliman and Alan Freeman*    55  

7 The Incoherence of the TSSI: A Reply to Kliman and Freeman  
   *Simon Mohun and Roberto Veneziani*  63  

8 Simultaneous Valuation vs. the Exploitation Theory of Profit:  
   A Summing Up  
   *Alan Freeman and Andrew Kliman*  69
Contents

9 The Truthiness of Veneziani’s Critique of Marx and the TSSI
   Andrew Kliman and Alan Freeman 79

10 The Temporal Single-System Interpretation:
   Underdetermination and Inconsistency
   Simon Mohun and Roberto Veneziani 99

11 No Longer a Question of Truth? The Knell of Scientific
   Bourgeois Marxian Economics and a Positive Alternative
   Alan Freeman and Andrew Kliman 115

PART II: EXCHANGE BETWEEN ROBERT PAUL WOLFF
   AND PROPONENTS OF THE TSSI 125

12 Once More unto the Breach, Dear Friends, Once More
   Robert Paul Wolff 127

13 Physicalism and the Exploitation Theory of Profit are
   Incompatible: A Response to Robert Paul Wolff
   Chris Byron, Alan Freeman, and Andrew Kliman 133

14 Response to Professors Freeman and Kliman and Mr. Byron
   Robert Paul Wolff 141

15 Subsequent Dialogue between Kliman and Wolff
   Andrew Kliman and Robert Paul Wolff 145

Bibliography 171

Index 175

About the Editors 179