Protecting Labour Rights in a Multi-polar Supply Chain and Mobile Global Economy

General Editor
Roger Blanpain

Guest Editors
Jan Wouters
Glenn Rayp
Laura Beke
Axel Marx

Contributors
Laura Beke
João Paulo Cândia Veiga
Kyle Cote
Klaas Hendrik Eller
Katiuscia Moreno Galhera
Pieter Leenknecht
Lauren Marsh
Axel Marx

Myriam Oehri
Juan Carlos Ochoa S.
Rafael Peels
Peng Qinxuan
Glenn Rayp
Anselm Schneider
Lara White
Jan Wouters

Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business
# Table of Contents

Notes on Contributors v  

Protecting Labour Rights in a Multi-polar Supply Chain and Mobile Global Economy: An Introduction  
Axel Marx, Jan Wouters & Laura Beke 1  
References 5  

**CHAPTER 1**  
Monitoring Precarious and Forced Labour in Brazil: Sweatshops in São Paulo from a Gender Perspective  
João Paulo Cândia Veiga & Katiuscia Moreno Galhera 7  
§1.01 Introduction 7  
§1.02 'Models' for Labour Governance 10  
§1.03 Why Private Governance Does Not Work for Labour Standards? 14  
§1.04 Public and Private Incentives to Comply with Labour Standards in Brazil 17  
§1.05 The Migratory Flows of Bolivian Sewing Workers in the City of São Paulo 21  
§1.06 The Gender Issue 23  
§1.07 Conclusion 25  
References 28  

**CHAPTER 2**  
Multi-layered Gaps between ILO Conventions and the Chinese Legal Protection for Migrant Women Workers as Domestic Helpers in China  
Peng Qinxuan 31  
§2.01 Introduction 31  
§2.02 Presentation of the Problem 32  
[A] Triple-Dilemma: Women Workers, Rural Migrants, and Domestic Helpers in China 32  

ix
Table of Contents

[2] Rural Migrants as “Second Class Citizens” in the Urban Areas 34
[B] Intersectionality Analysis 36
[1] Overlapping Identities 37
[2] Interconnected Identities 38
§2.03 Gap Identification 39
[A] Normative Gap: Space for Improvement within ILO Standards 39
[1] On the “Protection” of Women Workers 40
[2] On Migrant Workers 41
[B] Ratification Gap: Unratified ILO Conventions and the Chinese Legislation Gap 43
[C] Implementation Gap: Ratified ILO Conventions and the Chinese Legislation Gap 45
[3] Indirect Discrimination and Multiple Discrimination 47
§2.04 Conclusion 48

CHAPTER 3
Approaches in Promoting Fair and Ethical International Labour Recruitment
Lara White & Lauren Marsh

§3.01 Introduction 49
§3.02 Types of Recruitment Intermediaries 51
§3.03 What Is Meant by Ethical or Fair Recruitment? 51
§3.04 Negative Outcomes of Unethical Labour Recruitment 52
[A] Migrants 53
[B] Employers 53
[C] Recruitment Industry 54
[D] Governments of Countries of Origin and Destination 54
§3.05 Current Government-Led Approaches in Regulating Recruitment 55
[A] International Conventions 55
[1] International Labour Organization 55
[2] UN Counter-Trafficking Instruments 56
[3] Europe 57
[4] The Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) 57
[B] National Laws 58
[1] The Philippines 58
[2] The United States of America 58
[3] The United Kingdom of Northern Ireland and Great Britain 60
[4] Canada 60
Table of Contents

§3.06 Private Sector and Civil Society Efforts to Promote Fair Recruitment 61
[A] Recruitment Industry Standards 61
[B] Codes of Conduct 62
[C] Principles and Guidelines 63
§3.07 Gaps or Limitations of Current Approaches 64
§3.08 Values-Based Approaches to Self-Regulation in Other Sectors 65
[A] Fair Trade 66
[B] Palm Oil Certification 66
[C] International Organization for Standardization 67
§3.09 Innovative Approaches to Ethical Recruitment: Filling Regulatory Gaps 67
Bibliography 68

CHAPTER 4
EU Trade Policy and International Labour Standards: The View from the ILO
Pieter Leenknegt 73
§4.01 Introduction 73
§4.02 The ILO and the Trade/Labour Debate 74
§4.03 The ILO-EU Relationship and Trade Policy 76
§4.04 How Does EU Policy Look from the ILO Perspective? 78
[A] GSP + 78
[B] FTAs (and Bilateral Investment Treaties) 79
[C] EPAs 82
[D] Social Sustainability Criteria for Biofuels 83
§4.05 A Shift Away from a Social Clause towards a Cooperation Centred Approach: Real or Imagined, Desirable or Uninvited? 83
§4.06 The EU as Compliance Seeker: Is the Observance of Labour Standards between the EU Internal and External Trade Regimes Consistent? 85
§4.07 Reference Solely to Fundamental Labour Standards in EU Trade Instruments 86
§4.08 The ILO: a ‘European Organization’? 87
§4.09 Concluding Remarks 88

CHAPTER 5
US and EU Labor Governance in the Dominican Republic: Contrasting the DR-CAFTA and the CARIFORUM-EPA De Jure and De Facto
Myriam Oehri 93
§5.01 Introduction 93
§5.02 External Labor Governance 95
[A] De Jure and De Facto Labor Governance 95
[B] Case Selection and Data 97
§5.03 US Labor Governance in the DR – De Jure 98
§5.04 EU Labor Governance in the DR – De Jure 100
§5.05 US Labor Governance in the DR – De Facto 102
§5.06 EU Labor Governance in the DR – De Facto 105
§5.07 Contrasting EU and US Labor Governance in the DR 107
Table of Contents

§5.08 Conclusion 109
References 109
Interviews 112

Chapter 6
European Union Trade Sustainability Impact Assessments: Developing Coherence between Trade Agreements and Labour Standards
Kyle Cote 113
§6.01 Introduction 113
§6.02 Background: Social and Human Rights Impact Assessments 114
[A] Human Rights Impact Assessments 114
[B] US-Thailand Free Trade Agreement 115
[C] Ecumenical Advocacy Alliance 116
[D] Canada-Colombia Free Trade Agreement 117
[E] UN Guiding Principles on Human Rights Impact Assessments of Trade and Investment Agreements 117
§6.03 The European Union Trade Sustainability Impact Assessment 118
[A] EU Trade SIA Methodology 119
[B] Preliminary Assessment 120
[C] Detailed Assessment 122
§6.04 The Eu Sustainability Impact Assessment and Labour Standards 124
[A] Employment 125
[B] Wages and Income 126
[C] Inequality and Gender 126
[D] Worker Displacement 127
[E] Other Labour Standards 128
§6.05 EU Sustainability Impact Assessments: Opportunities and Challenges 129
References 135
EU Trade Sustainability Impact Assessment Final Reports 135

Chapter 7
The Potential Role of the ILO to Enhance Institutional Coherence on CSR in International Trade and Investment Agreements
Rafael Peels & Anselm Schneider 139
§7.01 Introduction 139
§7.02 CSR as a Regulatory Mode 141
[A] The Hard-Soft Law Continuum 141
[B] Bringing the State Back In 142
§7.03 CSR in Trade and Investment Agreements 143
[A] State-of-the-Art 144
[1] Normative Contents 147
[2] Implementation Mechanisms 150
§7.04 The Potential Role of the ILO 151
[A] Rethinking the Boundaries of CSR 152
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§7.05</td>
<td>The Way Forward</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>References</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 8

**An Empirical Examination of the Function of the OECD National Contact Points to Handle Complaints on an Alleged Breach of the OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises**

*Juan Carlos Ochoa S.*

| §8.01   | Introduction                                 | 159  |
| §8.02   | Overview of the Provisions of the Guidelines on Human Rights and Labor Rights | 159  |
| §8.03   | The Functions and Powers of NCPS regarding Individual Complaints according to Relevant OECD Instruments | 161  |
| §8.04   | The Functions and Powers of NCPS regarding Individual Complaints according to the Regulations and Practice of the Analyzed NCPS | 162  |
| [A]     | On the Power to Conduct a Thorough Examination of the Facts in Order to Issue a Final Statement | 164  |
| [B]     | On the Power to Make a Determination as to Whether or Not the OECD Guidelines Were Breached by the Concerned Company | 166  |
| §8.05   | Conclusion                                   | 167  |
|         | References                                   | 168  |

### CHAPTER 9

**Towards a Reflexive Juridification of Private Governance Instruments: The Case of Labor Standards**

*Klaas Hendrik Eller*

| §9.01   | Introduction                                 | 171  |
| §9.02   | Paradigms of Protection of Labor Rights in World Society | 171  |
| [A]     | "Formal" Labor Law Following the Industrial Revolution | 174  |
| [B]     | Internationalization of Labor Law through the ILO | 174  |
| [C]     | From International to Global Labor Law | 175  |
| §9.03   | Law’s Reflexivity: Translating Private Governance Tools into Legal Innovation | 176  |
| §9.04   | From a Statist to a Societal Concept of Law | 179  |
| §9.05   | “Learning Law”: Connecting Law and Social Movements | 179  |
| §9.06   | Interpretive Challenges of Private Governance | 181  |
| §9.07   | “Lost in Standardization?” | 184  |
| §9.08   | Conclusion                                   | 185  |
Table of Contents

Conclusion: Enforcement Gaps and Fragmentation in Global Labour Governance

Axel Marx, Jan Wouters & Glenn Rayp 189

I Introduction 189
II The Enforcement Gap 190
III Fragmentation and Coordination 191