BUILDING RESPONSIVE AND RESPONSIBLE FINANCIAL REGULATORS IN THE AFTERMATH OF THE GLOBAL FINANCIAL CRISIS

Editor:
Pablo Iglesias-Rodríguez
# CONTENTS

*Preface and acknowledgements* ........................................... v
*Foreword* ................................................................... vii
*List of contributors* ............................................................ xv

Responsive-and-responsible financial regulation in the aftermath of the
global financial crisis

Pablo Iglesias-Rodríguez .................................................. 1

1. Introduction ................................................................. 1
2. Responsive-and-responsible financial regulators ................. 4
   2.1. The dimensions of responsive-and-responsible financial
       regulation and the pre-crisis failures of financial regulators .... 7
       2.1.1. The pursuing of the statutory mandates of financial
              regulation and supervision ........................................ 7
       2.1.2. The unbiased pursuing of the interests of stakeholders
              within the financial realm ........................................... 10
       2.1.3. The pursuing of social returns ................................. 13
3. The role of accountability in responsive-and-responsible financial
   regulation ....................................................................... 17
4. Contents and structure of the book .................................... 20

**PART I. THE CONTRIBUTION OF ACCOUNTABILITY,
INDEPENDENCE AND ECONOMIC THEORY TO
RESPONSIVE-AND-RESPONSIBLE FINANCIAL
REGULATION**

Financial institutions and accountability mechanisms

Rosa María Lastra ............................................................... 31

1. Introduction ................................................................... 31
2. Accountability, legitimacy and transparency ....................... 35
3. Political and technical accountability ................................. 37
4. Monetary and supervisory independence and accountability .... 39
5. Concluding observations ................................................ 41
### Contents

Central bank governance, society and politicians: the tale of independence  
Donato MASIANDARO ........................................... 43

1. Introduction .................................................. 43
2. Designing the central bank governance and the role of independence:  
   insights from the economic literature .......................... 46
3. Citizens, politicians and the design of the central bank  
   independence: the theoretical framework ......................... 55
4. The central bank independence before and after the crisis:  
   ups and downs .............................................. 59
5. Conclusion .................................................. 64

The ultrarational illusion of finance. Economics and policymaking  
Xose Carlos ARLAS and Antón COSTAS .......................... 67

1. Introduction .................................................. 67
2. When a theory is more than an argument: the efficient market  
   hypothesis ................................................. 68
3. From theory to an entire belief system .......................... 74
4. The EMH in the wake of the storm: a shift in paradigm? .......... 81
5. Conclusions .................................................. 85

PART II. POST-CRISIS ARCHITECTURES OF FINANCIAL  
REGULATION IN THE EUROPEAN UNION,  
THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA AND CANADA:  
ACCOUNTABILITY AND RESPONSIVENESS-  
AND-RESPONSIBILITY

Part II.1. THE EUROPEAN UNION

Governing financial market regulation: a cascade from  
intergovernmental bank resolution, to prudential regulation, to conduct  
regulation  
Nicholas DORN ..................................................... 91

1. Scope and introduction ....................................... 91
2. Comparative perspectives: market conduct regulation ............... 92
3. Heads of prudential agencies: appointment the norm ............... 96
4. Intergovernmentality: new lynchpin for banking regulation ........ 98
5. National parliaments: democracy or dispersal ....................... 103
6. Conundrums of the new political architecture ....................... 107
7. Acknowledgements ........................................... 113
The European Securities and Markets Authority: accountability towards EU institutions and stakeholders

Carmine Di Noia and Matteo Gargantini ........................................... 115

1. Introduction .............................................................................. 116
2. The creation of ESMA .............................................................. 117
3. Independence and accountability of financial regulators: an overview. 119
4. ESMA accountability: governance and procedures .......................... 123
   4.1. The governance of ESMA ................................................... 124
   4.1.1. The governing bodies of the authority .............................. 124
   4.1.2. The Securities and Markets Stakeholder Group ............... 130
   4.2. The performance of regulatory and supervisory functions ......... 138
   4.2.1. The regulatory powers of ESMA .................................... 140
   4.2.1.1. The reformed regulatory architecture ......................... 140
   4.2.1.2. Strengthening regulatory harmonisation. The new quasi-rulemaking powers ..................... 144
   4.2.1.3. The role of the Securities and Markets Stakeholder Group .................................................. 151
   4.2.2. The supervisory powers of ESMA .................................... 154
   4.2.2.1. Cross-sectoral supervisory powers: addressing national competent authorities and market participants .................................................. 154
   4.2.2.2. ESMA as a single EU supervisor: the case of credit rating agencies ........................................... 163
5. Evaluating the regulatory and supervisory architecture: some reform proposals ......................................................... 165
   5.1. In the shadow – or in the light? – of Meroni and Romano. The institutional tensions framing the powers of ESMA .......... 165
   5.2. Evaluation of efficiency. Rulemaking .................................... 170
   5.2.1. Reform proposals for rulemaking functions: centralization vs. monopolization ........................................ 173
   5.2.2. Feasibility according to the Meroni doctrine and the EU Treaties ......................................................... 176
   5.3. Evaluation of efficiency. Supervision .................................... 178
   5.3.1. Reform proposals for supervisory functions: integration vs. uniformity ............................................. 181

The role of civil society in EU financial regulation

Guillaume Prache ................................................................. 185

1. Introduction: a crucial and outstanding issue for the European economy and democracy ........................................... 185
2. The current representation of financial services users and of the civil society at large .............................................................. 186
  2.1. The creation of Better Finance (the European Federation of Financial Services Users) in 2009 ........................................ 186
  2.2. The creation of Finance Watch in 2011 .................................... 188
3. Competencies are not the main issue for a balanced role between the financial sector and civil society ....................................... 189
  3.1. ‘Level one’ EU authorities ..................................................... 190
  3.2. ‘Level two’ EU authorities ..................................................... 191
4. Resources: one of the key unfulfilled requirements identified by the EC since 2009 .............................................................. 194
  4.1. Emerging support for European civil society organisations involved in financial services policy ................................. 194
  4.2. Improved support to individual user experts in ‘level one’ European authorities .......................................................... 198
  4.3. Inadequate support to user experts in ‘level two’ European authorities .............................................................. 199
5. No equal access to the European authorities .................................... 202
  5.1. No or unbalanced representation in EU consultative bodies ..... 202
  5.2. The governance of EU authorities ............................................. 205
  5.3. The events organised by the international public financial authorities .............................................................. 207
  5.4. The participation of EU politicians and executives to outside initiatives and events ............................................................. 208
  5.5. The meetings of EU officials with third parties ........................................ 209
6. Conclusion: time for change .......................................................... 210

Part II.2. THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Financial stability rearticulated: institutional reform, post-crisis governance and the new regulatory landscape in the United States
  David S. BIERI .......................................................... 215

1. Overview .................................................................................. 215
2. The quest for financial stability .................................................... 217
3. The institutional arrangements of U.S. financial regulation ............ 219
  3.1. Micro-prudential entities ....................................................... 219
  3.2. Macro-prudential framework ................................................ 221
4. The CFPB as a post-crisis response ............................................ 222
  4.1. Institutional focus and policy mandate ....................................... 223
  4.2. Financial stability as a public good .......................................... 225
  4.3. Regulatory governance and the accountability challenge ............. 226
    4.3.1. Global governance ......................................................... 227
Contents

4.3.2. National accountability ........................................ 228
5. Regulatory lessons from the recent financial crisis ............. 231

The Financial Industry Regulatory Authority: not self-regulation after all
Hester Peirce .......................................................... 233

1. The emergence of FINRA .......................................... 234
2. FINRA's functions ................................................. 240
3. FINRA's accountability structure .................................. 244
4. FINRA's comparative lack of accountability ..................... 246
5. FINRA's regulatory aspirations .................................... 249
6. Conclusion .......................................................... 252

Part II.3. CANADA

Why opacity is just not good enough: the effectiveness and accountability of Canada's Office of the Superintendent of Financial Institutions
Ian Roberge and Dona M. Dunea ..................................... 255

1. The effectiveness and accountability of financial services sector regulators .................. 257
   1.1. Effectiveness .................................................. 257
   1.2. Accountability ................................................ 261
2. Canada .............................................................. 264
   2.1. Effectiveness .................................................. 264
   2.2. Accountability ................................................ 267
3. Key lessons ........................................................ 271