Investment Protection in Brazil

Edited by

Daniel de Andrade Levy
Ana Gerdau de Borja
Adriana Noemi Pucci
Summary of Contents

List of Editors and Contributors v

Forewords xix

Preface xxix

Acknowledgements xxxiii

PART I
Political Perceptions and Procedural Standards of Investment Protection in Brazil 1

CHAPTER 1
Investment Arbitration in Brazil: The Landscape of Investment Arbitration in Brazil and Why Brazil Should Become a More Important Player in the Investment Arbitration Arena
Paulo Macedo Garcia Neto 3

CHAPTER 2
ICSID in Latin America: Where Does Brazil Stand?
Daniel de Andrade Levy & Rodrigo Moreira 17

CHAPTER 3
Two Sides of the Same Coin: To What Extent Is Arbitration with the Brazilian Administration Similar to Investment-Treaty Arbitration?
Daniel M.C. Barbosa & Pedro Martini 37

CHAPTER 4
International Standards of Protection of Foreign Investment under Customary International Law
Adriana Noemi Pucci 61
Summary of Contents

PART II
Substantive Standards of Investment Protection in Brazil 69

CHAPTER 5
Investment Treaties, Foreign Investment and Brazilian Law: The Magic of Reality
Gustavo Fernandes de Andrade & Gustavo Henrique Justino de Oliveira 71

CHAPTER 6
Expropriation in Brazilian Law: An International Standard?
Daniel Tavela Luís & Luís Antonio Gonçalves de Andrade 107

CHAPTER 7
The Brazilian Legal Approach to Foreign Investment in Light of the Principle of National Treatment under Investment Treaties
Ana Gerdau de Borja, Maria da Graça de Almeida Prado & Priscila Knoll Aymone 127

CHAPTER 8
Investment Arbitration and Public-Private Partnership Agreements in Brazil
Elisana Baraldi & Jorge Vargas Neto 159

PART III
Certain Aspects of the Investment Protection in Brazil 177

CHAPTER 9
Arbitration and Energy Law
Rafael Villar Gagliardi, Camila Biral Vieira da Cunha & Daniel Hossni Ribeiro do Valle 179

CHAPTER 10
Investment Protection in the Brazilian Banking Sector
Bruno Balduccini & Amina Akram 193

CHAPTER 11
The Brazilian Option in International Investment Law: Democratic Institutions, Human Rights and the Protection of Foreign Investment
Henrique Rabello de Carvalho 215

CHAPTER 12
Intellectual Property Rights in the Context of Investment Arbitration: A Brazilian Perspective
Karina Haidar Müller & Nathalia Mazzonetto 227

APPENDIX
Rules and Legislation 259
Bibliography 271
Index 279
# Table of Contents

List of Editors and Contributors .......................................................... v
Forewords ............................................................................................. xix
Preface ................................................................................................. xxix
Acknowledgements ............................................................................ xxxiii

**PART I**

**Political Perceptions and Procedural Standards of Investment Protection in Brazil** .......................................................... 1

**CHAPTER 1**

**Investment Arbitration in Brazil: The Landscape of Investment Arbitration in Brazil and Why Brazil Should Become a More Important Player in the Investment Arbitration Arena**

*Paulo Macedo Garcia Neto*  ............................................................... 3

§1.01 Introduction .................................................................................. 3

§1.02 The Landscape of Investment Arbitration in Brazil .................. 4

[A] International Arbitration in Brazil .............................................. 5

[B] The Signed but Not Ratified BITs ............................................. 6

[C] The Single BIT Ratified by Brazil Remains Inoperative .......... 7

[D] Investment-Related Treaties under Negotiation .................... 7

§1.03 Brazil as an Outward Direct Investor ...................................... 8

[A] Brazilian Multinationals Uncovered and the New South-South Relationship ................................................................. 9

[B] Lessons from the Past: Risks Arising Out of the Brazilian Current Position ................................................................. 10

§1.04 The Steps that Could Be Taken by Brazil and Its National Investors to Break into the Investment Arbitration Arena 12
Table of Contents

[A] The ICSID Convention 12
[B] ICSID Additional Facilities 14
[C] Rules Other than ICSID 14

§1.05 Conclusion 15

CHAPTER 2
ICSID in Latin America: Where Does Brazil Stand?
Daniel de Andrade Levy & Rodrigo Moreira 17

§2.01 Introduction 17
§2.02 The 'Calvo Reborn' 19
§2.03 The Path to Withdrawal 22
§2.04 Filtering the Political Discourse 26
§2.05 Echoes of the Latin-American Discourse in the International Community
  [A] From the Latin-American Countries to the International Community 27
  [B] From the International Community to Brazil 30
§2.06 Conclusion 34

CHAPTER 3
Two Sides of the Same Coin: To What Extent Is Arbitration with the Brazilian Administration Similar to Investment-Treaty Arbitration?
Daniel M.C. Barbosa & Pedro Martini 37

§3.01 Introduction 37
§3.02 Comparisons between Investment-Treaty Arbitration and Arbitration with the Brazilian Public Administration 38
  [A] Subjective Arbitrability 38
  [B] Objective Arbitrability 42
  [C] Sources of Consent 45
  [D] Applicable Law 47
  [E] Procedural Aspects 51
  [F] Enforcement and Annulment of Awards 53
§3.03 Conclusion 56

CHAPTER 4
International Standards of Protection of Foreign Investment under Customary International Law
Adriana Noemi Pucci 61

§4.01 Introduction 61
§4.02 The Minimum Standard of Protection under Customary International Law
  [A] The Emergence of a Minimum Standard 62
Table of Contents

[B] International Minimum Standard versus National Standard 64

§4.03 Standards of Protection under Customary International Law 65
  [A] Non-discrimination 65
  [B] Arbitrary Acts or Omissions 65
  [C] Unlawful Interference 65
  [D] Unjustified Enrichment 66
  [E] Abuse of Rights 66

§4.04 Brazilian Law and the Customary International Law 66

§4.05 Conclusion 67

PART II
Substantive Standards of Investment Protection in Brazil 69

CHAPTER 5
Investment Treaties, Foreign Investment and Brazilian Law:
The Magic of Reality
Gustavo Fernandes de Andrade & Gustavo Henrique Justino de Oliveira 71

§5.01 Introduction 71

§5.02 International Standards of Protection and Foreign Direct Investments:
  From Diplomacy to Arbitration Without Privity 73
  [A] Protecting Foreign Direct Investments 73
      [1] Diplomatic Protection 73
      [2] Investment Treaty Arbitration 77
  [B] Is There a Positive Correlation between BITs and FDI? 79
      [1] Overview of the Literature 79
      [2] The Brazilian Case 87

§5.03 The Substantive Protections Accorded to Foreign Investors 91
  [A] The Main Substantive Protections Afforded by International
      Treaties 92
      [1] Expropriation 92
      [2] Fair and Equitable Treatment 94
      [3] Most-Favoured-Nation (MFN) and National Treatment
          Clauses 96
      [4] Umbrella Clause 97
  [B] Regulatory Framework of Brazilian Administrative Law on
      Investment 99
      [1] Protection System Specific to Foreign Investment by
          Brazilian Administrative Law 99
          Specific to Foreign Investment 100
      [3] Legal Grounds for the Protection System Specific to
          Foreign Investment 101
      [4] The Concept of Good Administration under Brazilian
          Administrative Law 102

xiii
Table of Contents


[6] Exposure of the Challenges for the Effectiveness of the Protection System Specific to Foreign Investment 105

5.04 Conclusions 105

CHAPTER 6
Expropriation in Brazilian Law: An International Standard?
Daniel Tavela Luís & Luis Antonio Gonçalves de Andrade 107

§6.01 Introduction 107

§6.02 The International Way of Dealing with Expropriation 109
[B] The International Concept of Protected Property Right and of Expropriation 109

§6.03 Brazilian Way of Dealing with Expropriation 117
[A] Types of Expropriation in Brazilian Law 118
[B] Evaluation and Payment of the Amount Due 121

§6.04 Conclusion: Does Brazil Have an International Standard for 'Expropriation'? 124

CHAPTER 7
The Brazilian Legal Approach to Foreign Investment in Light of the Principle of National Treatment under Investment Treaties
Ana Gerdau de Borja, Maria da Graça de Almeida Prado & Priscila Knoll Aymone 127

§7.01 Introduction 127

§7.02 National Treatment under WTO Law 132

§7.03 National Treatment under EU Law 138

§7.04 National Treatment in Investment Arbitration 140
[A] The Basis for Comparison: Like Circumstances 141
[B] Fact of Differentiation and Justification: The Intent Test 144
[C] Less Favourable Treatment 145
[D] Exceptions Concerning the Application of 'Like Circumstances': The Example of NAFTA Investment Arbitration Cases 147
[E] Legitimate Exercises of Sovereignty as an Exception to the National Treatment Obligation 149

§7.05 The Case of Brazil: Regulatory Autonomy versus National Treatment in International Investment Law – Relevant Exceptions and Reservations 153

§7.06 Conclusion 157

xiv
## Table of Contents

### Chapter 8

Investment Arbitration and Public-Private Partnership Agreements in Brazil  
*Eliana Baraldi & Jorge Vargas Neto*

§8.01 Opening Reflections  
[A] The International Context of Foreign Direct Investment and the Brazilian State  
[B] The Role of Foreign Investors in Major Infrastructure Projects  

§8.02 Public-Private Partnerships: The Brazilian Experience  
[A] Public Service Concessions and Public-Private Partnerships Categories  
[B] Restrictions to Foreign Investment in Public Concessions Sector  

§8.03 Structuring of Finance and Guarantees in the Various Models of Public-Private Partnerships  
[A] Project Finance  
[B] Guarantees  
[C] The Participation of Foreign Capital  

§8.04 Foreign Direct Investment in Public-Private Partnerships in Brazil  
[A] The Company as a Vehicle for Allocation of Interests in Public Service Concessions  
[B] Regulation of Foreign Investments in Public Service Concessions  

§8.05 Standards of Investment Protection and International Treaties Regarding Foreign Direct Investments  

§8.06 Dispute Resolution  
[A] The Role of Arbitration as an Appropriate Dispute Resolution Mean for Investment Disputes  
[C] Arbitration Involving Public Entities in Brazil  

§8.07 Conclusion  

### Part III:  
Certain Aspects of the Investment Protection in Brazil  

### Chapter 9  
Arbitration and Energy Law  
*Rafael Villar Gagliardi, Camila Biral Vieira da Cunha & Daniel Hossni Ribeiro do Valle*  

§9.01 Introduction  

§9.02 Arbitrability in the Energy Sector  
[A] Objective Arbitrability  
[B] Subjective Arbitrability  

§9.03 Types of Arbitration in Energy Law  
[A] Arbitration in Concession Agreements  

179
Table of Contents

[1] Subjective Arbitrability in Concession Agreements 182
[2] Objective Arbitrability in Concession Agreements 183
[B] Arbitration in Agreements between Players of the Sector 184
[C] Arbitration in the Brazilian Electricity Regulatory Agency: ANEEL 185
[D] Arbitration in the Electricity Trade Chamber: CCEE 186
[3] Spot Market 188
[E] Arbitration within the Field of Activity of the Brazilian Interconnected Power System Operator (Operador Nacional Do Sistemal: ONS) 190
[F] Arbitration in Contracts Executed by Captive Consumers and Energy Distributors 191
§9.04 Conclusion 192

CHAPTER 10
Investment Protection in the Brazilian Banking Sector
Bruno Balduccini & Amina Akram 193

§10.01 Introduction 193
§10.02 Foreign Banks in Brazil 195
[A] The Early Years 195
[B] The Real Plan (1994) 196
§10.03 The Brazilian Banking System 198
[A] An Overview 198
[B] Banking Laws and Regulations 200
[1] Articles 192 and 52 200
[2] Banking Law 201
[C] The Regulators: Rulemaking, Supervision and Regulation 202
§10.04 Substantive Investment Protection for Foreign Banks in Brazil 203
[A] Foreign Bank Entry: A De Jure Barrier 203
[B] National Treatment under Article 2 of Foreign Capital Law 204
[1] When Provided 206
[2] Exceptions to National Treatment 206
[3] Discriminatory Impact of the Restriction on Foreign Ownership of Rural Property on Foreign Banks 207
Table of Contents

[C] Guarantee of Transfer of Funds 207
   [1] Exception for Balance-of-Payment Crisis 209
   [2] Registration, Remittance, and Repatriation of Foreign Capital in Brazil 209

[D] Foreign Investment: Article 1 of the Foreign Capital Law 210

§10.05 Procedural Remedies 210
   [A] Regulatory Actions 211
   [B] Loan and Sovereign Debt Disputes 211

§10.06 Conclusion 212

Chapter 11
The Brazilian Option in International Investment Law: Democratic Institutions, Human Rights and the Protection of Foreign Investment
Henrique Rabello de Carvalho 215

§11.01 Introduction 215
§11.02 The Brazilian Position in the Context of the International Investment Law 216
§11.03 Alternative Elements for Attraction and Protection of Foreign Investment in Brazil 219
   [A] Democratic Institutions and the Protection of the Property Rights 219
   [B] Human Rights, Freedom of Expression and Foreign Direct Investment 221

§11.04 Conclusion 224

Chapter 12
Intellectual Property Rights in the Context of Investment Arbitration: A Brazilian Perspective
Karina Haidar Müller & Nathalia Mazzonetto 227

§12.01 Introduction 227
§12.02 IPRs as a Qualified Investment 233
§12.03 International Commitments on IPRs (Most Relevant Treaties) and the Possibility to Claim Expropriation of IPRs under Such Scenario 236
   [A] CUP 237
   [B] CUB 238
   [C] TRIPS 238
   [D] Brazilian Context in Such Treaties 239
   [E] TRIPS Commitments and Investment Arbitration 240

§12.04 Brazil Position in the Washington Convention and IIAs 241
   [A] Washington Convention 241
   [B] IIAs Signed by Brazil and IPR Perspective 242

§12.05 Potential (and Theoretical) Overlapping Issues between TRIPS Agreement and BITs Signed by Brazil 245
Table of Contents

§12.06 Benefits from Using Extrajudicial Dispute Mechanisms in Respect to IPRs 246
§12.07 Challenges when Taking IPRs Disputes to Arbitration: The Arbitrability Issue 248
§12.08 Relevant Cases Involving Brazil vis-à-vis the TRIPS Agreement 249
[A] Compulsory Licenses: Efavirenz Case (Merck versus Brazil) 249
[B] Industrial Design Registrations versus Competition Issues: ANFAPE Case 254
§12.09 Final Remarks 256

APPENDIX
Rules and Legislation 259

Bibliography 271

Index 279