



**19 EDITION**

# Export Promotion or Development Policy?

A Comparative Analysis of Soft Loan Policies  
in Austria, Denmark, Germany and the Netherlands

Livia Fritz, Werner Raza,  
Manuel Schuler, Eva Schweiger

March 2014

**OFSE**<sup>™</sup>  
Austrian Foundation  
for Development Research



# Contents

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| List of Figures, Boxes and Tables .....  | XI        |
| Abbreviations .....  | XV        |
| Acknowledgements.....  | 1         |
| <b>PART I: Introduction and Definitions.....</b>   | <b>3</b>  |
| <b>1. Introduction.....</b>  | <b>5</b>  |
| 1.1. Context .....   | 5         |
| 1.2. Research Questions and Aim .....  | 7         |
| 1.3. Methodology.....  | 9         |
| 1.3.1. Desk Research and Literature Review.....  | 9         |
| 1.3.2. Field Research.....   | 12        |
| 1.4. Structure of the Publication.....   | 16        |
| <b>2. Preparing the Grounds: Definition of Key Terminology .....</b>                           | <b>19</b> |
| 2.1. The Concept of Official Development Assistance .....                                      | 19        |
| 2.1.1. Economic Welfare and Development as the Main Objective .....                            | 22        |
| 2.1.2. Concessional in Character and a Minimum Grant Element of 25 %.....                      | 22        |
| 2.2. Measures to Express Concessional of a Loan:<br>Grant Element vs. Concessional Level ..... | 24        |
| 2.3. Soft Loans, Tied Aid Credits, Associated Financing: Almost the Same but not Quite? .....  | 27        |
| <b>PART II: Historical Evolution and Institutional Structure of Tied Aid .....</b>             | <b>33</b> |
| <b>3. The DAC's Development Agenda .....</b>   | <b>35</b> |
| 3.1. The Aid and Development Effectiveness Debate .....  | 36        |
| 3.1.1. Evolution and Principles: From Rome to Busan via Paris and Accra.....                   | 38        |
| 3.1.1.1. Excursus: The Idea of Partnership in Development Co-operation.....                    | 40        |
| 3.1.2. Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness as a Benchmark .....                             | 42        |

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| 3.1.3. Untying Aid: A Long-lasting Matter of Concern.....   | 46        |
| 3.1.4. Policy Coherence for Development (PCD).....  | 52        |
| 3.2. Critical Remarks .....   | 57        |
| <b>4. An Introduction to the International Regulatory Framework.....</b>  | <b>63</b> |
| 4.1. The Participants Group and “their” Arrangement.....  | 65        |
| 4.1.1. Purpose and General Provisions of the Arrangement.....   | 65        |
| 4.1.2. The Masters of the Arrangement.....  | 66        |
| 4.1.3. Legal Status of the Arrangement.....   | 68        |
| 4.2. WTO Legislation .....  | 70        |
| 4.3. Development Assistance Committee (DAC) .....   | 72        |
| <b>5. Historical Genesis of the Arrangement on Officially Supported Export<br/>Credits: Evolution and Status Quo of the Tied Aid Disciplines.....</b> | <b>73</b> |
| 5.1. Contextualization: an Export Credit Race on the Rise.....  | 75        |
| 5.2. The Early “Consensus”: Establishing a Level Playing Field .....  | 77        |
| 5.3. Packages Adopted and Alternatives Discussed up to Helsinki.....  | 78        |
| 5.3.1. The Wallén Package (1987) .....  | 83        |
| 5.3.1.1. An Inquiry into the Logic of Concessionality.....  | 84        |
| 5.3.2. Failure of the Wallén and Negotiation of the Helsinki Package .....  | 85        |
| 5.4. Agreement on the Helsinki Tied Aid Disciplines.....  | 90        |
| 5.4.1. The Helsinki Package (1991/1992) .....   | 90        |
| 5.4.1.1. Country Eligibility.....   | 91        |
| 5.4.1.2. Project Eligibility .....  | 91        |
| 5.4.1.3. Minimum Concessionality Level .....  | 93        |
| 5.4.2. Exemptions from the Helsinki Disciplines.....  | 93        |
| 5.4.2.1. De Minimis Projects: Small Transactions as Circumvention Strategy? .....   | 94        |
| 5.4.3. The Consultations Group and the Development of the Ex Ante Guidance<br>for Tied Aid (1996, 2003, 2005) .....                                   | 98        |
| 5.4.4. Financial Terms and Conditions for Export Credits According to<br>the Arrangement.....   | 100       |
| 5.4.4.1. Repayment Terms .....  | 101       |
| 5.4.4.2. Interest Rates .....   | 101       |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 5.4.4.3. Credit Risk Premiums .....  | 102        |
| 5.5. Recap and Concluding Remarks .....  | 102        |
| <b>6. Aid Considerations and the Role of the Development Assistance Committee .....</b>  | <b>105</b> |
| 6.1. Pushing Development Interests –in and through the DAC/FA .....  | 106        |
| 6.1.1. Concerns over Limited and/or Negative Development Impact of<br>Tied Aid Credits .....   | 107        |
| 6.1.1.1. Approaching the Issue: ODA Stretching and Debt Servicing Capacity.....  | 108        |
| 6.1.1.2. Distorting Aid Distribution Patterns.....   | 111        |
| 6.1.2. “Development Safeguards” in Historical Perspective.....   | 112        |
| 6.1.2.1. Strengthened Role of Aid Agencies.....  | 114        |
| 6.1.2.2. Development of a Consensus on Objective Development<br>Criteria for Pre-Mixed Financing.....                                  | 116        |
| 6.1.2.3. Aid Quality: Improved and Mandatory Aid Quality Assessment .....  | 117        |
| 6.1.2.4. Greater Importance of Development Content in Consultation<br>Procedures .....   | 120        |
| 6.1.3. Communicating Aid Considerations: the DAC/FA’s Relation to the Participants.....  | 121        |
| 6.1.3.1. Monitoring the Participants Group .....   | 121        |
| 6.1.3.2. Forms of Interaction between the Two Groups .....   | 124        |
| 6.1.4. “(Re-)Claiming its Territory”: Adoption of Complementary<br>Guidelines by the DAC .....   | 125        |
| 6.1.4.1. Guiding Principles for the Use of Aid in Association with<br>Export Credits and Other Market Funds (1983) .....               | 126        |
| 6.1.4.2. DAC Guiding Principles for Associated Financing and Tied<br>and Partially Untied Official Development Assistance (1987) ..... | 127        |
| 6.1.4.3. New Measures in the Field of Tied Aid (1992) .....  | 129        |
| 6.1.4.4. Global Untying and Good Procurement Practices:<br>Mutual Concern and Ongoing Struggle? .....                                  | 131        |
| 6.2. Tracing Development Policy Aspects in Today’s Arrangement.....  | 136        |
| 6.2.1. The Key Tests – Capable of Assessing Aid Quality? .....   | 136        |
| 6.2.2. Explicit and Implicit References to DAC Principles.....   | 138        |
| 6.2.3. Grasping the Participants’ Notion of Development.....   | 140        |
| 6.3. Assessment of the DAC/FA’s Influence on the Participants Group.....   | 142        |
| 6.4. Recap and Concluding Remarks .....  | 147        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>7. Statistics on Tied Aid Credits</b> .....   | <b>149</b> |
| 7.1. Introduction to the DAC Statistical Concept.....  | 151        |
| 7.2. Evolution of Quantitative Importance of Tied Aid .....  | 152        |
| 7.3. Donors.....   | 157        |
| 7.4. Recipient Countries and Regions.....  | 160        |
| 7.5. Sectors.....  | 165        |
| 7.6. Summary of the Findings of the Statistical Data.....  | 171        |
| 7.7. Reading and Interpreting the DAC Statistics .....   | 172        |
| 7.8. Problems of Statistical Recording of Development Assistance .....   | 175        |
| 7.8.1. The Tying Status of ODA and "De Facto" Tying .....  | 175        |
| 7.8.2. Reporting of Credits According to their Motivation.....   | 176        |
| 7.8.3. The Term "Concessional in Character" in the ODA Definition .....  | 177        |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>8. Critical Assessment of the Institutional Framework for Tied Aid</b> .....                                    | <b>181</b> |
| 8.1. Assessment of the Arrangement Terms.....  | 181        |
| 8.1.1. Assessment of Eligibility Criteria .....  | 182        |
| 8.1.2. Assessment of Minimum Concessional Levels.....  | 183        |
| 8.2. Assessment of Tied Aid Credit Policies against the Principles of the OECD's<br>Development Agenda .....       | 184        |
| 8.2.1. The OECD – Living up to Policy Coherence (for Development)? .....   | 185        |
| 8.2.2. In Line With the Paris Principles on Aid Effectiveness? .....   | 187        |
| 8.2.2.1. Harmonization.....  | 188        |
| 8.2.2.2. Ownership.....  | 190        |
| 8.2.2.3. Alignment.....  | 191        |
| 8.2.2.4. Aid Quality Matters: Assessing the "Demonstrated" Development<br>Quality of Tied Aid Credit Projects..... | 194        |
| 8.2.3. In the Spirit of Partnership? Global Partnership and the Role of Recipient aka<br>Partner Countries.....    | 196        |
| 8.2.4. Untying : Is the OECD Coherent in Its Quest for an Untying Regime? .....                                    | 197        |
| 8.2.4.1. Provisions for Least Developed Countries .....  | 198        |
| 8.3. Concluding Remarks: Of Conflicting Policy Goals and Magic Bullets.....  | 199        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>PART III: Soft Loan Policies of Four European Donor Countries.....</b> | <b>201</b> |
| <b>9. Introduction.....</b>   | <b>203</b> |
| <b>10. Austria.....</b>   | <b>205</b> |
| 10.1. Country Facts and Figures.....                                      | 205        |
| 10.1.1. Economy and Foreign Trade.....                                    | 205        |
| 10.1.2. Austria's Donor Profile.....                                      | 205        |
| 10.1.2.1. ODA Performance.....  | 205        |
| 10.1.2.2. Institutional Setting of Austria's Development Cooperation..... | 206        |
| 10.2. Profile of the Program.....   | 207        |
| 10.2.1. Objectives of the Soft Loan Program.....                          | 208        |
| 10.2.2. Legal Basis of the Soft Loan Program.....                         | 208        |
| 10.2.3. Financing of the Soft Loan Program.....                           | 209        |
| 10.2.4. Institutional Environment.....                                    | 209        |
| 10.2.5. Complementary Programs.....                                       | 213        |
| 10.2.6. Guidelines for the Austrian Soft Loan Program.....                | 213        |
| 10.2.6.1. Soft Loan Eligibility Criteria.....                             | 213        |
| 10.2.6.1.1. Soft Loan Eligibility of the Recipient Country.....           | 213        |
| 10.2.6.1.2. Soft Loan Eligibility of Products and Projects.....           | 215        |
| 10.2.6.1.3. Eligible Sectors.....   | 216        |
| 10.2.6.2. Terms and Conditions for Soft Loan Eligible Countries.....      | 217        |
| 10.3. Program Performance.....  | 218        |
| 10.3.1. Development of Austrian Soft Loan Financing.....                  | 218        |
| 10.3.2. Recipient Countries.....  | 219        |
| 10.3.3. Sectors.....  | 222        |
| 10.4. Program Implementation.....   | 223        |
| 10.4.1. Procurement in Soft Loan-Financed Projects.....                   | 223        |
| 10.4.2. Application Procedure for Soft Loan Financing.....                | 224        |
| 10.4.3. Questionnaire.....  | 224        |
| 10.4.4. Project Appraisal.....  | 226        |
| 10.4.5. Engagement of other Actors During the Application Process.....    | 226        |
| 10.4.6. Project Approval Process.....                                     | 227        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 10.5. Monitoring and Evaluation .....  | 228        |
| 10.5.1. Monitoring .....   | 228        |
| 10.5.2. Evaluation .....   | 229        |
| 10.6. Accountability and Transparency .....  | 230        |
| 10.7. Conclusion and Outlook .....   | 231        |
| <b>11. Denmark .....</b>   | <b>235</b> |
| 11.1. Country Facts and Figures .....  | 235        |
| 11.1.1. Economy and Foreign Trade .....  | 235        |
| 11.1.2. Denmark's Donor Profile .....  | 236        |
| 11.1.2.1. ODA Performance .....  | 236        |
| 11.1.2.2. Institutional Setting of Denmark's Development Cooperation .....                                   | 238        |
| 11.2. Profile of the Program .....   | 241        |
| 11.2.1. Background and Objectives .....  | 241        |
| 11.2.1.1. Program Objectives .....   | 243        |
| 11.2.2. Policy Framework and Legal Foundation .....  | 243        |
| 11.2.2.1. Danida Business Finance in the Overall Development Strategy 2012: The Right to a Better Life ..... | 243        |
| 11.2.2.2. Strategic Framework for Priority Area: Growth and Employment 2011-2015 .....                       | 244        |
| 11.2.2.3. Strategic Framework for Priority Areas: Natural Resources, Energy, and Climate Change (2013) ..... | 244        |
| 11.2.2.4. Act No. 64 of 7 February 2013 .....  | 245        |
| 11.2.2.5. The Finance Act: § 06.32.05.18 .....   | 245        |
| 11.2.3. Institutional Environment .....  | 247        |
| 11.2.4. Guidelines for Danish Mixed Credits .....  | 250        |
| 11.2.4.1. Requirements and Eligibility Criteria .....  | 250        |
| 11.2.4.1.1. Country Eligibility .....  | 251        |
| 11.2.4.1.2. Project Eligibility .....  | 251        |
| 11.2.4.1.3. Concessionality Requirements .....   | 252        |
| 11.2.4.1.4. Procurement Guidelines .....   | 252        |
| 11.2.4.1.5. Miscellaneous .....  | 253        |
| 11.2.4.1.6. Specific Requirements for Small Projects (SDR < 2 million) .....                                 | 254        |
| 11.2.4.2. Terms and Conditions .....   | 254        |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 11.2.4.2.1. Composition of Danida Subsidy in a Mixed Credit .....                             | 254 |
| 11.2.4.2.2. Loan Conditions .....   | 256 |
| 11.2.5. Complementary Programs .....  | 257 |
| 11.2.5.1. Danida Business Partnerships .....  | 257 |
| 11.2.5.2. Investment Fund for Developing Countries (IFU) .....                                | 258 |
| 11.2.5.3. The Fast-Track Scheme: an EKF – DBF Cooperation.....                                | 258 |
| 11.3. Program Performance .....   | 259 |
| 11.3.1. Statistical Issues .....  | 259 |
| 11.3.2. Development of Mixed Credit Financing.....  | 260 |
| 11.3.3. Recipient Countries .....   | 262 |
| 11.3.4. Sectors .....   | 265 |
| 11.3.5. Danish Untied Mixed Credits .....   | 266 |
| 11.4. Program Implementation.....   | 267 |
| 11.4.1. Application and Project Approval Process.....   | 267 |
| 11.4.1.1. Application and Screening Procedure.....  | 269 |
| 11.4.1.1.1. The Appraisal Report: Testing against Development Criteria ...                    | 271 |
| 11.4.1.2. Approval Process .....  | 274 |
| 11.4.1.2.1. Composition of the Internal and External Grant Committee .....                    | 275 |
| 11.4.1.2.2. Working Procedures .....  | 275 |
| 11.4.2. Tender Process .....  | 276 |
| 11.5. Monitoring and Evaluation .....   | 277 |
| 11.5.1. Monitoring and Evaluation at Project Level .....                                      | 277 |
| 11.5.2. Evaluation at Program Level.....  | 278 |
| 11.5.2.1. Evaluations of the Danish Mixed Credit Program 1998 and 2002 .....                  | 278 |
| 11.5.2.2. Meta-Evaluation 2004: Private and Business Sector<br>Development Interventions..... | 279 |
| 11.6. Accountability and Transparency .....   | 280 |
| 11.6.1. Involvement of the Parliament.....  | 280 |
| 11.6.2. Transparency and Availability of Information.....                                     | 282 |
| 11.6.3. Stakeholder Consultation .....  | 282 |
| 11.7. Conclusion and Outlook.....   | 284 |



|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>12. Germany</b> .....   | <b>289</b> |
| 12.1. Country Facts and Figures.....                                       | 290        |
| 12.1.1. Economy and Foreign Trade.....                                     | 290        |
| 12.1.2. Development Cooperation.....                                       | 291        |
| 12.1.2.1. Financial and Technical Cooperation.....                         | 291        |
| 12.1.2.2. Programming of Bilateral Cooperation.....                        | 292        |
| 12.1.2.3. Country and Sector Concentration.....                            | 293        |
| 12.2. Profile of Financial Cooperation.....                                | 295        |
| 12.2.1. Legal Background/History.....                                      | 295        |
| 12.2.2. Institutional Environment.....                                     | 296        |
| 12.2.3. Terms and Conditions.....  | 300        |
| 12.2.4. Financial Instruments.....   | 301        |
| 12.2.4.1. Overview.....  | 301        |
| 12.2.4.2. Federal Budget Funds.....  | 303        |
| 12.2.4.3. FC Development Loans.....  | 304        |
| 12.2.4.4. FC Promotional Loan.....   | 306        |
| 12.3. Performance of Financial Cooperation.....                            | 308        |
| 12.3.1. Development of Financial Cooperation.....                          | 308        |
| 12.3.2. Recipient Countries.....   | 311        |
| 12.3.3. Sectors.....   | 312        |
| 12.3.4. Share of Financial Cooperation to Total ODA.....                   | 313        |
| 12.4. Planning and Implementation of FC Funds.....                         | 314        |
| 12.4.1. Intergovernmental Agreement and Project Pre-Selection.....         | 316        |
| 12.4.2. Decision-Making and Project Selection Process.....                 | 318        |
| 12.4.3. Implementation-Planning and International Competitive Bidding..... | 320        |
| 12.4.4. Payment Terms, Guarantees and Insurance.....                       | 322        |
| 12.5. Monitoring and Evaluation.....                                       | 324        |
| 12.5.1. Reviewing Project-Related Progress.....                            | 324        |
| 12.5.2. Independent Ex-Post Evaluation.....                                | 325        |
| 12.5.2.1. Approach and Methodology.....                                    | 325        |
| 12.5.2.2. Logframe and Field Missions.....                                 | 326        |
| 12.6. Transparency and Accountability.....                                 | 327        |
| 12.6.1. Involvement of the Parliament.....                                 | 328        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 12.6.2. Auditing of Financial Management .....                                | 328        |
| 12.6.3. German Institute for Development Evaluation .....                     | 330        |
| 12.6.4. Civil Society and Availability of Information .....                   | 330        |
| 12.7. Conclusion and Outlook .....  | 333        |
| 12.7.1. Developmental Orientation .....                                       | 334        |
| 12.7.2. Rationale of ODA Reporting .....                                      | 335        |
| 12.7.3. (Un)Tied German Financial Cooperation? .....                          | 336        |
| <b>13. The Netherlands .....</b>  | <b>339</b> |
| 13.1. Country Facts and Figures .....   | 339        |
| 13.1.1. Key Objectives of Dutch Development Policy .....                      | 339        |
| 13.1.2. A New Agenda for Aid, Trade and Investment .....                      | 341        |
| 13.2. Profile of Programs .....   | 341        |
| 13.2.1. Historical Overview .....   | 342        |
| 13.2.2. Legal Background .....  | 348        |
| 13.2.3. Institutional Environment .....                                       | 349        |
| 13.2.4. Government Funds .....  | 354        |
| 13.2.4.1. Facility for Infrastructure Development (ORIO) .....                | 354        |
| 13.2.4.2. Infrastructure Development Fund (IDF) .....                         | 356        |
| 13.2.4.3. Dutch Good Growth Fund (DGGF) .....                                 | 357        |
| 13.3. Scheme Performance .....  | 359        |
| 13.3.1. ORET Budget and Expenditures .....                                    | 359        |
| 13.3.2. ORET Grant Scheme .....   | 360        |
| 13.3.3. LDC Infrastructure Fund .....   | 360        |
| 13.3.4. Share of ORET/MILIEV of Total ODA .....                               | 362        |
| 13.3.5. ORIO Grant Scheme .....   | 362        |
| 13.4. Implementation of Programs .....  | 363        |
| 13.4.1. Project Eligibility and Application .....                             | 364        |
| 13.4.1.1. Project Appraisal Process and Decision-Making .....                 | 365        |
| 13.4.1.2. Project Implementation, Tendering and Contract Management .....     | 369        |
| 13.4.1.3. Payment Terms, Guarantee and Operations and Maintenance Phase ..... | 371        |
| 13.5. Monitoring and Evaluation .....   | 372        |
| 13.5.1. Monitoring and Evaluation Plan .....                                  | 372        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 13.5.2. Impact Evaluations .....  | 373        |
| 13.6. Transparency and Accountability .....   | 374        |
| 13.6.1. Role of the Parliament .....  | 374        |
| 13.6.2. Civil Society .....   | 375        |
| 13.6.3. Transparency .....  | 376        |
| 13.7. Conclusion and Outlook .....  | 377        |
| <b>PART IV: Comparative Analysis of Case Studies and Conclusions .....</b>              | <b>381</b> |
| <b>14. Comparative Assessment of Case Study Countries .....</b>                         | <b>383</b> |
| 14.1. Comparative Analysis of the Case Study Results: a Tabular Presentation .....      | 383        |
| 14.2. Comparative Conclusions of the Case Studies .....                                 | 397        |
| 14.2.1. Program Characteristics.....  | 397        |
| 14.2.2. Importance of the Program in the Field of Development Cooperation .....         | 401        |
| 14.2.3. Institutional Setting .....   | 402        |
| 14.2.4. Objectives of the Programs.....   | 403        |
| 14.2.5. Country Eligibility Criteria.....   | 405        |
| 14.2.6. Sector and Project Eligibility Criteria .....                                   | 406        |
| 14.2.7. Ex-ante Assessment of Expected Development Impact .....                         | 409        |
| 14.2.8. Project Approval .....  | 411        |
| 14.2.9. Stakeholder Involvement .....   | 413        |
| 14.2.10. Role of Recipient Countries.....   | 414        |
| 14.2.11. Monitoring and Evaluation .....  | 416        |
| 14.2.12. Transparency and Accountability .....  | 417        |
| <b>15. General Conclusions and Outlook.....</b>   | <b>421</b> |
| 15.1. Conclusions – Between Institutional Heterogeneity, Hybridity and Development..... | 421        |
| 15.2. Outlook – What Future for Soft Loans? .....                                       | 427        |
| <b>ANNEX .....</b>  | <b>433</b> |
| Bibliography .....  | 435        |
| Interview List .....  | 456        |
| Authors .....   | 459        |