

RIGHT TO WORK?
Assessing India's Employment Guarantee
Scheme in Bihar

Puja Dutta

Rinku Murgai

Martin Ravallion

Dominique van de Walle

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>About the Authors</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>xxi</i>
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>xxiii</i>
Overview	1
The Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme	7
This Study	12
Main Lessons from the Study	15
Notes	17
References	19
1 Does India's Employment Guarantee Scheme Guarantee Employment?	23
Why an Employment Guarantee Need Not Be Attainable	24
Performance in Meeting the Demand for Work across States	30
Targeting	40
Wages and Rationing on MGNREGS	48
Participation by Women	53
Conclusion	56
Notes	59
References	61
2 Unmet Demand for Work on the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme	63
The BREGS Survey	63
Performance in Meeting Demand for Work	66
Annex 2A	71
Notes	77
References	77

3	Who Gets Work? Who Is Left Out?	79
	Targeting	82
	Determinants of Participation and Rationing	86
	Annex 3A	103
	Notes	113
	References	114
4	Wages	115
	Payment of Wages	116
	Wages Received by Households	118
	Impact of BREGS on Wages	128
	Determinants of Wages	133
	Comparing Survey Aggregates with Administrative Data	135
	Annex 4A	138
	Notes	144
	References	144
5	Forgone Employment and Income	147
	Forgone Opportunities	148
	Forgone Income	149
	Forgone Employment and Income as a Result of BREGS	150
	Impacts on Migration	153
	Notes	154
	References	154
6	Impacts on Poverty	157
	Impacts on Poverty of the Extra Earnings from BREGS	157
	Comparisons with Other Simulated Impacts	161
	Perceptions of BREGS	168
	Annex 6A	171
	Notes	173
	Reference	174
7	Reforming the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee	
	Scheme: Citizen Awareness	175
	Registration and Expressing Demand for Work	175
	What Do Rural Households Know about BREGS?	179
	A Pilot Information Campaign	194
	Annex 7A	214
	Notes	216
	References	217

8	Reforming the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme: Administrative Processes	219
	A Closer Look at the Scheme's Administration	220
	Understanding the Supply-Side Constraints on Delivery	234
	Learning from Experiences Elsewhere	245
	Notes	247
	References	250
	Glossary	253
	Index	255
	Boxes	
O.1	Key Features of MGNREGS	3
1.1	Effect of Local-Level Costs on Meeting Demand under MGNREGS	27
1.2	Corruption and the Unmet Demand for Work	29
7.1	Are the Transparency Safeguards Adhered To in Practice?	177
8.1	Informed, Participatory Planning for the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (BREGS)	224
8.2	The Role of the Mukhiya	236
	Figures	
O.1	Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Flowchart	9
1.1	There Is No Correlation between Participation Rates in MGNREGS and the Incidence of Poverty across Indian States	35
1.2	Demand for MGNREGS Work Is Greater in Poorer States	37
1.3	Poorer States Have Greater Unmet Demand for Work on MGNREGS	37
1.4	There Is Less Rationing at the Margin Than on Average across States	38
1.5	Participation and Rationing by Consumption per Person, Rural India	43
1.6	Targeting Performance Rises with the Overall Participation Rate across States	47
1.7	Participation Rates for Scheduled Tribes, Scheduled Castes, and Other Backward Classes Rise Faster Than That for "Other" Castes as the Overall Participation Rate Increases across States	51

1.8	Women Get a Larger Share of MGNREGS Work Than of Casual Wage Labor across States	54
1.9	The Share of Work Going to Women Tends to Be Lower in Poorer States	55
1.10	The Share of Work Going to Women Tends to Be Lower in States with Higher Rationing	56
3.1	Participation and Rationing as a Function of Wealth	88
4.1	Delays in Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Wage Payments	118
4.2	Wages over Time	121
4.3	Evolution of Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Wages and Days Worked over the Entire Survey Period	124
4.4	Density of Daily Casual Wages, by Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Participation Status	126
4.5	Wages Relative to the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Stipulated Wage Rate	131
4.6	Actual BREGS Wages Relative to the BREGS Stipulated Wage Rate, by Gender	133
5.1	Distribution of the Ratio of Self-Assessed Forgone Days to Public Works Days and Ratio of Forgone Wages to Public Works Wages	152
6.1	Impacts on Participants' Poverty in Round 1	159
6.2	Poverty Impact Graph for Public Works Participants and the Whole Population	160
6.3	Poverty Impact Graph with 50 Percent Lower Forgone Income	162
6.4	Poverty Impact Graph without Forgone Income	163
6.5	Impacts on Poverty under Idealized Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme	165
8.1	Selection of Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Works	221
8.2	Worksite Facilities in Round 2	230
8.3	Utilization of Available Resources across Districts	241

Tables

0.1	Summary Statistics on the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme from Administrative Data	10
1.1	Summary MGNREGS Statistics, 2009/10	33
1.2	Program Expenditure per Capita across States	36

1.3	Coverage of MGNREGS across Consumption Quintiles, 2009/10	42
1.4	Targeting Performance of MGNREGS across States	46
1.5	Participation Rates and Targeting by Social Group	49
1.6	Average Wages on MGNREGS and in Casual Labor, 2009/10	52
1.7	Regression Results for Female Share of Employment in MGNREGS	57
2.1	Sample Sizes in Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Survey	65
2.2	Summary of Participation, Demand, and Rationing	67
2.3	Joint Distribution of Program Participation across the Two Survey Rounds	68
2.4	Days of Employment Provided and Demanded in the Past Year	70
2.5	Household Perceptions about Why They Were Rationed	70
2A.1	Distribution of Households and Individuals across Strata (Round 1)	74
2A.2	Sample Size (Rounds 1 and 2)	75
2A.3	Variable Definitions	76
3.1	Characteristics of Participants, Excess Demanders, and the Rest, Round 1	80
3.2	Coverage of Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme across Consumption Quintiles of Rural Bihar	83
3.3	Coverage of the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme across Social Groups of Rural Bihar	85
3.4	Targeting Differentials by Poverty Status and Social Group	86
3.5	Regressions for Household Participation, Demand, and Assignment of Work	90
3.6	Individual-Level Determinants of Days Worked on the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme in Round 1	99
3A.1	Participation and Demand for Work by Household Asset Group	103
3A.2	Effects of Gram Panchayat Attributes on Participation by Asset Group	107
3A.3	Individual-Level Participation, Demand, and Assignment of Work	108
4.1	Daily Wage Rate for the Week before Interview	120

4.2	Average Wage Rates before and after Increases in the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Stipulated Wage	123
4.3	Daily Wages for Farm and Nonfarm Casual Labor in Bihar from the 2009/10 National Sample Survey, by Subround	125
4.4	Sample Total Person Days of Non-Public Works Work by Operation and Subround, 2009/10	130
4.5	Wages and Employment Comparison between Survey Data and Administrative Data	137
4A.1	The Determinants of BREGS and Non-BREGS Casual Wages at the Individual Level	138
5.1	Forgone Work Opportunities Identified by Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Participants	149
5.2	Forgone Wages for Casual Work Compared with Actual Wages for Those Working in the Same Month	151
5.3	Migration Impact of Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme	153
6.1	Summary of Estimated Poverty Impacts Holding Total Public Spending Constant	167
6.2	Summary Statistics on Perception Variables	169
6A.1	Perceptions among Nonparticipants	171
7.1	Not All Households That Want a Job Card Have One	176
7.2	Notion of “Demanding” Work Is Weak but Improving	178
7.3	Summary Statistics of Knowledge of Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Rules	180
7.4	Regression for Knowledge of Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Rules in Round 1	185
7.5	Estimates of the Effect of the Movie on Knowledge about the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme by Gender	197
7.6	Estimates of the Effect of the Movie on Perceptions and Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Participation by Gender	200
7.7	Effects of the Movie on Learning about the Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme	205
7.8	Tests for Heterogeneity in the Impacts of the Movie	208
7A.1	Knowledge among Participants, Excess Demanders, and the Rest	214
8.1	Percentage of Bihar Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme Expenditure by Type of Project, 2008/09	222

8.2	Participant Reports about the Worksite	228
8.3	Time Taken for Payment of Wages after Work Completion	231
8.4	Percentage of Rural Households with Accounts at Financial Institutions	233
8.5	Percentage of Participants Reporting Wage Payments through Various Sources at the Last Worksite	233
8.6	Flow of Funds	238