

Economic Policy Coordination in the Eurozone

Dr. iur. Armin Steinbach

Dissertation zur Erlangung des Grads eines Doktors der Wirtschaftswissenschaft (Dr. rer. pol.) der Universität Erfurt, Staatswissenschaftliche Fakultät

2013

Table of Contents

1	INTRODUCTION	8
1.1	Basic criticisms of economic policy coordination	10
1.2	State of the research.....	14
1.3	This study's approach.....	18
2	ASYMMETRIC SHOCKS AND HETEROGENEITY FOLLOWING THE CREATION OF THE EMU	27
2.1	Theoretical studies on business cycle convergence in the EMU	29
2.2	Empirical studies of economic convergence in the EMU	32
2.2.1	Heterogeneity with regard to capacity utilization	33
2.2.2	Heterogeneous inflation levels	37
2.2.3	Heterogeneous account balances	45
2.2.4	Monetary policy transmissison differences can amplify heterogeneity.....	51
2.2.5	Interim findings	54
2.3	Possible mechanisms to adjust for heterogeneous development within the eurozone.....	55
2.3.1	Labor mobility	57
2.3.2	Price and wage flexibility	59
2.3.3	Fiscal transfer	62
2.3.4	Fiscal policy stabilization	64
2.3.5	Interim findings	67

3 Prerequisites for Coordination and Options for its Design 68

3.1 Definition and forms of coordination: Vertical and horizontal coordination.. 69

3.2 Requirements for the need for coordination..... 73

- 3.2.1 Requirements for the need for cross-border coordination 73
- 3.2.2 Requirements for the need for cross-policy coordination..... 79
 - 3.2.2.1 The Keynesian view on the need for policy coordination 80
 - 3.2.2.2 Monetary neoclassical assignment: The irrelevance of coordination83
- 3.2.3 Interim findings 88

3.3 The existence of externalities as a basis for the need for coordination..... 89

- 3.3.1 Cross-border externalities as a by-product of economic policy 89
 - 3.3.1.1 Cross-border fiscal policy spillovers..... 89
 - 3.3.1.2 Cross-border wage policy spillovers..... 94
- 3.3.2 Cross-policy externalities as a basis for the need for coordination..... 99
 - 3.3.2.1 Interdependencies between monetary and fiscal policy 100
 - 3.3.2.2 Interdependencies between wage and monetary policy 107
- 3.3.3 Interim findings 114

3.4 Fiscal-monetary-wage interactions and the potential and conditions for fiscal policy coordination 115

- 3.4.1 This study’s approach 116
- 3.4.2 The model..... 120
- 3.4.3 The three-stages game: First unions, then fiscal authorities, then central bank 123
 - 3.4.3.1 Scenario 1: Fiscal non-coordination..... 125
 - 3.4.3.2 Scenario 2: Fiscal coordination 131
 - 3.4.3.3 The effects of central bank’s conservativeness 135
 - 3.4.3.4 Conclusions..... 141

3.5 Vertical forms of coordination 144

- 3.5.1 Soft coordination 145
- 3.5.2 Hard coordination..... 150
- 3.5.3 Centralized coordination..... 155

3.6 Interim findings..... 157

4	COORDINATION IN THE EU BEFORE THE GOVERNMENT-DEBT CRISIS	160
4.1	Soft coordination in the EU	161
4.1.1	Broad economic policy guidelines, integrated guidelines, and national reforms	163
4.1.2	The Macroeconomic Dialogue	166
4.1.3	The Luxembourg Process	171
4.2	Forms of hard coordination within the EU	173
4.2.1	The SGP: A hard, cross-border form of coordination.....	174
4.2.2	Weaknesses of fiscal coordination in the eurozone	178
4.2.2.1	The SGP and the internalization of external effects.....	179
4.2.2.2	The SGP and the time inconsistency problem.....	183
4.3	Monetary policy: centralized coordination	187
4.4	The failure of coordination during the financial crisis	189
4.4.1	Economic developments in the EMU before the crisis.....	190
4.4.2	Deficits in existing systems of eurozone governance	193
4.5	Interim findings.....	197
5	THE EXPANSION OF COORDINATION IN THE EU.....	201
5.1	Reform of cross-border fiscal policy coordination	202
5.1.1	Reform of fiscal policy coordination since the outbreak of the sovereign debt crisis	203
5.1.1.1	Reform of the preventive components of the SGP	204
5.1.1.2	Assessment of the reformed preventive components	206
5.1.1.3	Reform of the corrective components	210
5.1.1.4	Assessment of the reformed reactive components	212
5.1.2	Farther-reaching forms of fiscal policy coordination	216
5.1.2.1	Fiscal policy coordination incentive structures in different constitutional settings.....	217
5.1.2.1.1	Incentives for debt accumulation in federal states.....	218
5.1.2.1.2	Incentives for debt accumulation in union states.....	223
5.1.2.2	Incentives for debt consolidation in federal and union states.....	228
5.1.2.2.1	National debt brakes.....	231
5.1.2.2.1.1	The development and spread of national debt brakes.....	232

5.1.2.2.1.2	Economic consequences of debt brakes on incentives for debt accumulation.....	240
5.1.2.2.2	Insolvency procedures for states	246
5.1.2.2.3	Fiscal coordination through eurobonds	254
5.1.2.2.3.1	The eurobond model.....	255
5.1.2.2.3.2	The European Redemption Pact	260
5.1.2.2.3.3	Criticism of eurobonds	265
5.1.2.3	Fiscal policy coordination for economic stabilization.....	268
5.1.2.4	Interim findings.....	275

5.2 The expansion of cross-policy coordination through macroeconomic

monitoring	281	
5.2.1	The techniques of macroeconomic monitoring.....	283
5.2.1.1	Warning mechanism	283
5.2.1.2	Procedure for excessive imbalance	285
5.2.1.3	Indicator selection for macroeconomic scoreboards	286
5.2.1.3.1	Account imbalances	287
5.2.1.3.2	Net foreign position.....	298
5.2.1.3.3	Real effective exchange rate based on unit labor costs	302
5.2.1.3.4	Real rises in housing prices	307
5.2.1.3.5	Public sector debt	309
5.2.1.3.6	Private debt.....	311
5.2.1.4	Assessing the indicator approach for macroeconomic monitoring.	317
5.2.2	The Europe 2020 strategy	324
5.2.3	The European Semester	327
5.2.4	The Euro-Plus Pact	333
5.2.5	Cross-policy coordination for credit lines with attached conditionality ..	337

5.3 Expanding wage policy coordination..... 343

5.3.1	The problem of insufficient transparency on the part of wage and price policy actors in the eurozone	344
5.3.2	Controversy on the need to coordinate wage and monetary policy	349
5.3.2.1	Neoclassical and Keynesian views about the role of coordination and monetary policy practice	350
5.3.2.2	Productivity-oriented wage policy as a consensus-building principle	358
5.3.2.2.1	The welfare effects of coordinating monetary policy and a productivity-oriented wage policy	360
5.3.2.2.2	Configuring the wage and productivity formula	362
5.3.2.2.3	The relevance of wage policy as the cause and the solution of imbalances in the eurozone	367
5.3.3	Implementing productivity-oriented wage coordination.....	372

5.3.3.1	Previous approaches to wage policy coordination in the eurozone	374
5.3.3.2	The instability of wage policy coordination in terms of collective action theory.....	380
5.3.3.3	Empirical studies of previous efforts at wage policy coordination	393
5.3.3.4	Institutional frameworks for coordinated wage policy in EU member states	397
5.3.3.4.1	Classification by wage negotiation level.....	398
5.3.3.4.2	Classification by degree of centralization	401
5.3.3.4.3	Level of organization and the scope of wage scale coverage	404
5.3.3.4.4	Coordination mechanisms in national collective bargaining systems	406
5.3.4	Interim findings	408
5.4	Coordinating monetary and fiscal policy	414
5.4.1	The classical argument against coordinating monetary policy	416
5.4.2	The role of the ECB in a Keynesian-based coordinated economic policy	418
5.4.3	The ECB's quasi-fiscal monetary policy in the sovereign-debt crisis	422
5.4.4	Monetary and fiscal policy coordination between the ECB and the ESM (European Stability Mechanism)	426
6	SUMMARY	431
7	BIBLIOGRAPHY	446