Creative Labour Regulation
Indeterminacy and Protection in an Uncertain World

Edited by
Deirdre McCann
Sangheon Lee
Patrick Belser
Colin Fenwick
John Howe
and
Malte Luebker
# Contents

*List of Figures and Tables* xi

*Preface and Acknowledgements* xiii

*Notes on Contributors* xv

## PART I INTRODUCTION

1 Regulatory Indeterminacy and Protection in Contemporary Labour Markets: Innovation in Research and Policy 3
   *Sangheon Lee and Deirdre McCann*

   Introduction 3
   Regulating the fragmented labour market: theory, doctrine and enforcement 8
   Institutional interactions: the case of the minimum wage 12
   Effective implementation: new theoretical and empirical approaches to enforcement indeterminacy 18
   Conclusions 25
   Notes 28
   References 28

## PART II REGULATING THE FRAGMENTED LABOUR MARKET: EMPIRICAL AND DOCTRINAL INSIGHTS

2 Fissured Employment: Implications for Achieving Decent Work 35
   *David Weil*

   Who's in charge? Vignettes from the modern workplace 35
   Fissured employment and its consequences 37
   Building blocks of the fissured workplace 39
   Fissured employment as a driver of indeterminacy 43
   Franchising as a distinctive form of fissured employment 45
   Franchising in fast food 47
   Effects of fast food franchising on workplace labour standards 47
   Rebalancing the fissured workplace 49
   Rethinking responsibility in a fissured workplace 50
   Rethinking enforcement 54
Contents

Conclusions 57
Notes 58
References 59

3 Regulating for Decent Work and the Legal Construction of Personal Work Relations 63
Mark Freedland

Introduction 63
'Regulating for decent work' and the 'legal construction of personal work relations': definitions and interactions 64
'Legal construction of personal work relations': doctrinal and regulatory perspectives 67
The broad domain of personal work relations 68
The ideas of the personal work nexus and the personal work profile 70
The idea of differential integration of layers of regulation 73
Conclusions: 'regulating for decent work' and the 'legal construction of personal work relations' – normative purposes and empirical methodology 75
Normative purposes 76
Empirical methodologies 78
Notes 83
References 83

PART III INSTITUTIONAL INTERACTIONS: THE CASE OF MINIMUM WAGE REGULATION

4 Employment, Inequality and Minimum Wages in Argentina 87
Fernando Groisman

Introduction 87
The minimum wage controversy 88
The international debates 89
Minimum wages in Latin America 91
The minimum wage in Argentina: history and recent evolution 92
Evaluating minimum wages and their impacts 93
Data 93
Who is affected by minimum wages? 97
Minimum wages versus average wages: too high or too low? 97
Minimum wages and informal workers 100
Minimum wage dynamics: the wage and employment trajectories of sub-minimum wage earners | 103
Conclusions | 112
Appendix | 115
Notes | 122
References | 122

5 The Pay Equity Effects of Minimum Wages: A Comparative Industrial Relations Approach | 126
Damian Grimshaw, Jill Rubery and Gerhard Bosch

Introduction | 126
Minimum wages and pay equity | 128
Interaction effects | 133
  Do more inclusive industrial relations models support higher value minimum wages? | 134
  What are the combined effects of minimum wages and collective bargaining on pay equity? | 136
Pay equity outcomes and the role of institutions and actors | 140
Conclusions | 148
Appendix 1 | 150
Appendix 2 | 151
Notes | 152
References | 153

PART IV NEW APPROACHES TO ENFORCEMENT INDETERMINACY: THEORETICAL AND EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATIONS

6 Models of Labour Enforcement: Necessary Indeterminacy | 161
Steven L. Willborn

Introduction | 161
The standard economic model of labour enforcement | 162
Applying the standard economic model: the example of public versus private enforcement across the economic cycle | 165
Discovering violations | 166
Prosecuting violations | 166
Damages for successful prosecutions | 167
The incidence of violations | 168
Discovering violations | 168
Prosecuting violations | 170
Damages for successful prosecutions | 172
Rethinking the standard economic model of labour enforcement
   The uncertain effects of increased enforcement
   Problems with probabilities
   Problems with D
   The value of weak enforcement
Conclusions

Notes
References

7 Regulations, Monitoring and Working Conditions: Evidence from Better Factories Cambodia and Better Work Vietnam
   Drusilla Brown, Rajeev Dehejia and Raymond Robertson

Introduction
Compliance: a review of evidence from Better Factories Cambodia
Worker well-being: new evidence from Vietnam
   Summary statistics
   Results
Conclusions
Notes
References

PART V NEW APPROACHES TO ENFORCEMENT
INDETERMINACY: INVESTIGATING HYBRID MODELS

8 Linkages and Labour Inspectors: Enforcement in the Garment Workshops of Buenos Aires
   Matthew Amengual

Introduction
The garment industry during the post-crisis growth
Dormant regulators
Intensified enforcement
Explaining enforcement: linkages and administrative resources
Putting the brakes on enforcement
Conclusions
Notes
References
9 Exploring Civil Society Partnerships in Enforcing Decent Work in South Africa 231
Ada Ordor

- Introduction 231
- Background 232
- Civil society governance of the world of work 233
- Civil society engagement with labour issues in South Africa 234
- Methodology 236
- The case studies 236
- Farming communities 238
  - Women on Farms Project 238
  - The Aurora Cooperative and the Rawsonville Women’s Agricultural Cooperative 240
- Informal work 241
  - StreetNet 241
  - South African Self Employed Women’s Association 244
- Domestic service 245
  - South African Domestic Service and Allied Workers Union 245
- Wholesale, retail and allied industries 246
  - Khanya College 246
  - South African Commercial Catering and Allied Workers Union 247
- Discussion 248
  - Invoking the right to work 249
  - Recourse to law and policy frameworks that regulate labour markets 249
  - Strategies to advance enforcement of legal provisions 250
  - Advocacy for legal reform and innovation 250
- Conclusions 251
- Notes 253
- References 256

10 Evaluating a Promising Model of Non-State Labour Regulation: The Case of Cambodia’s Apparel Sector 259
Chikako Oka

- Introduction 259
- Background on the Cambodian model 260
Contents

Assessment of the Cambodian model 262
Rigour 262
Legitimacy and accountability 263
Complementarity with state regulation 265
Buyer-driven enforcement 267
Pressure-driven enforcement 268
Buyer engagement 270
Supplier efforts and purchasing practices 271
Sustainability and the new business model 272
Conclusions 274
Notes 275
References 277

Index 281