Left out of the Bargain
Settlements in Foreign Bribery Cases and Implications for Asset Recovery

Jacinta Anyango Oduor
Francisca M. U. Fernando
Agustin Flah
Dorothee Gottwald
Jeanne M. Hauch
Marianne Mathias
Ji Won Park
Oliver Stolpe

Stolen Asset Recovery Initiative
The World Bank • UNODC
## Contents

*Contributors*  ix  
*Acknowledgments*  xi  
*Abbreviations*  xiii  

### Executive Summary 1
1. Key Findings 2
2. Additional Observations 3
3. StAR's Proposals 4

### Introduction 7
1. Background 7
2. United Nations Convention against Corruption: Setting the Stage 11
3. Methodology and Overview of the Study 13

1. **Settlements in Foreign Bribery Cases** 17
   1. Defining the Term Settlement 17
   2. Legal Frameworks for Settlements 20
   3. Shortened Criminal Procedures and Other Forms in Certain Civil Law Countries 21
      3.1 Switzerland 21
      3.2 Norway 23
      3.3 Italy 23
      3.4 Germany 25
   4. Guilty Pleas, Civil Liability, and Other Forms in Certain Common Law Countries 26
      4.1 United Kingdom 26
      4.2 Canada 30
      4.3 Nigeria 30
      4.4 United States 32

2. **Common Threads and General Observations about Settlements** 39
   1. Criteria for Understanding Settlements 39
      1.1 Forms of Legal Liability: Criminal, Civil, and Administrative 39
      1.2 Judicial Oversight 40
      1.3 Transparency 41
   2. Terms Typically Included in Settlements 41
13. Statoil (Norway and United States) 134
14. TSKJ Consortium (Nigeria, United Kingdom, and United States) 136

**Appendix I** Forms of Legal Remedies Relevant to Foreign Bribery Cases 141

1. Confiscation: Criminal, Civil, and Administrative 141
2. Compensation: Criminal and Civil 142
3. Disgorgement: Civil Remedy Variation on Confiscation 142
4. Restitution: Criminal and Civil 143
5. Fines: Criminal and Civil 143
6. Reparations: Gratuitous and/or Voluntary Payments 144

**Appendix II** U.K. Remedies 145

1. Criminal Remedies 145
2. Civil Remedies 145

**Appendix III** Settlements Cases Database: Methodology 147

1. Details of the Settlements Cases Database 148
   1.1 Time Period Covered 148
   1.2 "Case" Defined 148
   1.3 Sources Used 149
2. Explanation of Fields and a Sample Entry 150

**Appendix IV** Glossary 159

**Boxes**

1.1 A Time for Action, 2010 ICHA Meeting Report 10
1.1 Elements of a Deferred Prosecution Agreement: Alcatel-Lucent SA and the Department of Justice, in the United States District Court, Southern District of Florida 35
3.1 Practices to Promote International Cooperation in Cases of Prior or Pending Settlement 65
4.1 Components of Monetary Sanctions 68
4.2 NGOs as Parties Civiles 90

**Figures**

1.1 U.K. Settled Enforcement Actions by Legal Form of Settlement (as of July 3, 2012) 29
1.2 U.S. DOJ FCPA Enforcement Actions (June 1979–January 2012) 34
1.3 Principles of Federal Prosecution of Business Organizations and Prosecutors’ Decisions to Decline Prosecution, Enter into a DPA or NPA, or Prosecute 37
2.1 Timeline of Settlements in Various Cases against Siemens 51
3.1 Settlements in Multiple Jurisdictions by a Multinational Corporation Involved in a Bribery Scheme Related to the Bonny Island Liquefied Natural Gas Project (Nigeria) 60
3.2 Settlements in Foreign Bribery Cases Settled across Multiple Jurisdictions

B4.1.1 Methods for Recovering the Proceeds of Corruption

4.1 Alstom: Swiss Settlement
4.2 BAE Systems: U.K. Settlement
4.3 Alcatel Lucent: U.S. Settlement
4.4 Monetary Sanctions in Settlements of Criminal Foreign Bribery and Related Cases
4.5 Monetary Sanctions in Civil and Administrative Settlements of Foreign Bribery and Related Cases
4.6 Total Monetary Sanctions and Assets Returned or Ordered Returned Where Jurisdiction of Settlement Differed from Jurisdiction of Foreign Public Officials
4.7 Sector Involvement in Foreign Bribery and Related Cases

Map
4.1 Assets Returned by 30 OECD Countries (2006–09)

Tables
1.1 Settlements of Foreign Bribery and Related Offenses Cases, 1999 through July 3, 2012
1.2 Settlements by Type of Legal System: Civil and Common Law Jurisdictions
2.1 Forms of Liability in Public Legal Actions: Criminal, Civil, and Administrative
2.2a Settlements: Criminal Forms and Sanctions
2.2b Settlements: Civil Forms and Sanctions
4.1 Assets Returned/Ordered Returned Where the Jurisdiction of Enforcement and the Jurisdiction of Allegedly Bribed Foreign Public Officials Were the Same
4.2 Assets Returned/Ordered Returned Where the Jurisdiction of Enforcement and Jurisdiction of Foreign Public Officials Were Different
4.3 Other Asset Returns
A3.1 Fields and Their Breakdowns in the Settlements Database
A3.2 Sample Entry in Settlements Database