Taxation of Corporate Groups

Miguel Correia
## Table of Contents

About the Author vii  
Preface xv  
List of Abbreviations xvii  
List of Figures xix  
Introduction: Problem, Approach and Structure 1  

I The Problem 1  
II The Nature of CIT Law 2  
III The Approach 5  
IV The Structure of the Study 7  

### CHAPTER 1  
The Policy Approach 9  

§1.01 The Core Structure of the CIT System 9  
[A] The Concept of Realization 9  
[1] The Advantages of Realization 10  
[B] The Alternatives to a Realization-Based CIT System 15  
[1] Accretion-Based Taxation 15  
[2] Consumption-Based Taxation 18  
[C] Taxing the Corporate Sector through a Corporate-Level Tax 23  
[1] Corporate-Level Taxation and the Firm’s Agency Problems 23  
[a] The Reliability Effect 23  
[b] The Deterrent Effect 24  
[c] The Reversal of Clientele Effect 26  
[d] The Control Effect 26  
[D] Taxing the Corporate Sector in an Imperfect World 29  

§1.02 The Corporation Income Tax and Corporate Behavioral Control 33
Table of Contents

[A] The Structural Distortions 33
[B] The CIT and Corporate Behavioral Control 35
[C] The Behavioral Control Instruments under a CIT System 36
[D] The Types of Possible Behavioral Control 38
[E] The Interaction Problems of CIT Behavioral Intervention 39
[F] The Firm’s Reaction to the Behavioral Control Instruments 41
   [2] The Degree of Substitution to the Specific Tax Provision 42
[G] The Complexity of the CIT System When Used For Behavioral Control 49
[H] Other Negative Consequences of Behavioral Control 51
[I] CIT’s Behavioral Control Instruments versus Direct Subsidies 52
[J] CIT and Corporate Behavioral Control 54

§1.03 A New Policy Approach 58
[A] A New Policy Approach to CIT 58
[B] Issues Raised by the New Policy Approach 61

CHAPTER 2
The Taxation of Corporate Groups under the Standard CIT System 65

§2.01 The Nature of Corporate Groups 65
[A] The Economic Nature of Corporate Groups 65
   [1] Beyond the Classic Distinction of Firm and Market 65
   [2] Unitary Economic Direction and Organized Internal Markets 68
[B] The Legal Nature of Corporate Groups 71
   [1] The Distortions to the Legal Structure of a Corporation Introduced by Intercorporate Control 71
   [2] The Corporate Group as a Legal Person 72
   [3] The Corporate Group as a Polycorporative Network 74
[C] The Functional Nature of Corporate Groups 75
   [1] The Evolution of Functional Structures 75
      [a] From the Single-Unit and Single-Corporate Enterprise to the Multi-Unit and Polycorporate Enterprise 76
      [b] Centralized and Decentralized Governance Structures 77
      [a] The Modern Multinational Corporate Groups: Beyond the M-Form 78
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[i] Transnationality</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[ii] Heterarchy</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D] Reconsidering the Nature of Corporate Groups</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[E] Tax Policy and the Nature of Corporate Groups</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2.02 The Mechanics of the Standard CIT System</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] The Basic Operational Structure of the Standard CIT System</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] The Three Core Structural Pillars of the Standard CIT System</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a] Corporate-Level Tax</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b] Realization-Based Taxation</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c] Yearly Tax Assessment Rule</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a] Capital/Ordinary Income Divide</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b] Limitations on the Use of Losses</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c] Continuity of Interest Principle</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[d] Dual Set of Tax Attributes</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[e] Rules to Define and Treat Distributions</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[f] Capitalization, Depreciation and Amortization Rules</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Nature of Good Transferred</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Ownership Thresholds</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4] Legal Instrument Adopted</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] Structure, Form and Substance under the Standard CIT System</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] The Basic CIT Principles and the Operational Structure of the CIT System</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] The Significance of Form on Tax Treatment</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Economic Integration and Tax Treatment</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a] Economic Integration, Substitution and Discontinuity</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b] Economic Integration and Anti-abuse</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2.03 The Nature of Corporate Groups and the Standard CIT System</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2.04 The Dynamic Effects of Taxing Corporate Groups under the Standard CIT System</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A] The Manipulation of Legal Characterization</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Discontinuity, Substitution and Transaction Costs</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Perfect and Imperfect Substitution</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B] The Manipulation of Timing</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] The Consequences of Manipulating the CIT System</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Complexity and Transaction Costs</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Reduction of Ability to Shift Capital to Its Most Efficient Use</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents


## Chapter 3

The Tax Integration of Corporate Groups 131

### §3.01 The Mechanics of Tax Integration 131

[A] The Tax Integration Solutions 131

[B] The Tax Integration of Corporate Groups through the Relaxation of the Standard CIT System's Anti-abuse Arsenal 132

[C] The Interaction of Tax Integration Solutions with the Outside Environment 133

[D] The Mechanic Structure of Tax Integration Solutions 136

### §3.02 Closed Setting Framework: Common Issues 138

[A] The Common Issues of Tax Integration Solutions 138

[B] Eligible Entities 138

[1] Residency 139

[2] Control 139

[a] The Definition of Corporate Group for General Regulatory Purposes 139

[b] The Definition of Corporate Group for Tax Integration Purposes 141

[i] The Criteria to Determine Control 141

[ii] Power and Ownership 142

[iii] Power and Economic Integration 147

[iv] The Definition of the Boundaries of the Tax Group 149

[C] Business Characteristics 149

[D] Applicability Regime 152

[1] Mandatory versus Elective Applicability 152

[2] Procedural Aspects 155

[D] Proportional versus Full Consolidation 158

### §3.03 Closed Setting Framework: Mechanic Analysis 159

[A] General Conceptual Framework 159

[B] The Common Tax Base 167

[1] Entry Issues 168

[a] Entry Issues: Tax Losses 168

[b] Entry Issues: Assets 174


[a] The US Group Taxation Regime 178

[i] The Floating Outside Basis 178

[ii] The Determination of the Tax Liability of the Corporate Group 181
Table of Contents

[iii] The Problem of Transfers of Tax Group Members' Stock 182
[b] The Participation Exemption 185
c] Integration Approaches under a Common Tax Base with a Participation Exemption Regime 186

[a] Option 1: Recognition Mechanics with Deferment of Tax Liability 190
[b] Option 2: Disregard of Transaction 192
c] Option 3: Carryover Mechanics 193
d] Other Considerations 193


[C] The Separate Tax Base 200
[1] Entry Issues 202
[2] Transfer of Tax Losses 204

[D] The Single Tax Base 209
[1] Entry Issues 210
[3] Other Considerations 217

[E] The Flow-Through Model with Multiple Owners 218

[F] Hybrid Models 222
[1] The Molecular Model 222
[2] Other Hybrid Models 225

§3.04 The Tax Rate 226
§3.05 The Tax Amount Payable 227
§3.06 Conclusion: The Mechanics of Tax Integration under a Closed Setting Framework 235
§3.07 The Dynamics of Tax Integration under a Closed Setting Framework 241

[A] Considerations on Efficiency 242
[3] Flexibility for Restructurings of Corporate Structures 244
[4] Simplified Combination of Tax Attributes 244

[B] Analysis of Distortions and their Interactions 245
[1] The Structural Distortions 245
[a] The CIT System and Corporate Risk-Taking 245
[b] No Relief for Losses 247
[c] Relief with Full Refund 247
d] Relief without Refund but with Carryover Allowed 249
Table of Contents

| [i] | Inter-Entity Loss Carryovers and Tax Integration | 250 |
| [ii] | Year Carryovers and Tax Integration | 253 |
| [iii] | Source Carryovers and Tax Integration | 257 |
| [4] | Tax and Regulation | 258 |

§3.08 Conclusion: The Dynamics of Tax Integration under a Closed Setting Framework 260

§3.09 Taxing Corporate Groups under an Open Setting Framework 261

[A] Efficiency under an Open Setting Framework 262

[1] The Internal Efficiency of the MNG 262

[2] Efficiency from the Perspective of the States 263

[B] Fundamental International Tax Reform 265

[C] Current Country Experience 268

[1] Issue 1 268

[2] Issue 2 270

[3] Issue 3 271

[4] Issue 4 271

[a] Foreign Subsidiary 271

[b] Foreign PE 274

[c] Other Considerations 275

CHAPTER 4
Policy Guidelines 277

§4.01 General Guidelines 277
§4.02 Specific Guidelines on Tax Integration 282

Appendix 289

Glossary 305

Bibliography 307

Table of Statutes 325

Index 331