

GRZEGORZ LISSOWSKI

Principles  
of Distributive  
Justice

Translated by Tomasz Bigaj

Barbara Budrich Publishers • Scholar Publishing House

Opladen • Berlin • Toronto • Warsaw 2013

# LIST OF CHAPTERS

Preface.....	13
Part I. Basic concepts	
1. Introduction.....	17
1*. Relations and their properties .....	27
2. The division of goods and their individual evaluations.....	34
2*. Preferences and utilities.....	55
Part II. Types of social evaluations	
3. Social evaluations of goods divisions.....	69
3*. The bases for establishing social evaluations of divisions.....	81
4. Three types of distributive justice principles.....	89
4*. Base criteria of social evaluations.....	115
Part III. Equality	
5. Equal shares or equal utilities? .....	135
5*. Properties of egalitarian principles .....	165
6. Klemens Szaniawski's probabilistic equality rules.....	181
6*. Fair lotteries .....	206
Part IV. Impartiality	
7. The construction and justification of the classical principles of justice .....	219
7*. Axiomatic comparisons of the classical principles of justice .....	248
8. New versus classical principles of justice and individuals' choices in experimental situations.....	259
8*. The generalised Rawlsian and conservative principles of justice.....	303
Part V. Unanimity	
9. Games of fair division.....	317
9*. Solutions of goods division games .....	330
10. Fair procedures.....	335
10*. Properties of allocation procedures.....	345
Part VI. Summary	
11. Conclusion .....	351
Bibliography .....	359
Name Index.....	373
Subject Index .....	377

# CONTENTS

PREFACE .....	13
---------------	----

## Part I. BASIC CONCEPTS

1. INTRODUCTION .....	17
1.1. Distributive justice.....	17
1.2. Global and local distributive justice .....	19
1.3. Distributive justice problems in the social sciences .....	20
1.4. The book's goals and overview .....	22
1*. RELATIONS AND THEIR PROPERTIES .....	27
1*1. Notation .....	27
1*2. Binary relations.....	28
1*3. Properties of binary relations.....	28
1*4. Basic types of binary relations.....	29
1*5. Extensions of binary relations and the compatibility of two relations .....	30
1*6. Maximal and optimal set, choice function.....	31
2. THE DIVISION OF GOODS AND THEIR INDIVIDUAL EVALUATIONS .....	34
2.1. Kinds of goods.....	34
2.2. Division of goods.....	35
2.3. Division of homogenous and divisible goods.....	36
2.4. Division of a set of indivisible goods .....	38
2.5. Random methods of allocation .....	39
2.6. Individual preferences.....	41
2.7. Subjective preferences .....	42
2.8. Cardinal utilities.....	44
2.9. The utility of one homogeneous and divisible good.....	47
2.10. The utilities of two homogeneous and divisible goods.....	48
2.11. Divisions and their utilities .....	49
2.12. Extended preferences and utilities.....	50
2.13. Global preferences and utilities .....	51
2.14. Preferences for indivisible goods and their divisions .....	53

2*. PREFERENCES AND UTILITIES .....	55
2*1. General characterisation of the division of goods .....	55
2*2. Deterministic and random methods of the allocation of goods .....	56
2*3. Subjective and extended preferences .....	57
2*4. Ordinal and cardinal utilities .....	58
2*5. Global evaluations of the division of goods .....	62
2*6. Types of goods and the differences among individual evaluations of goods .....	63

## Part II. TYPES OF SOCIAL EVALUATIONS

3. SOCIAL EVALUATIONS OF GOODS DIVISIONS .....	69
3.1. Social evaluations of divisions .....	69
3.2. Principles of distributive justice .....	70
3.3. Individual principles of distributive justice .....	71
3.4. The problem of the mutual consistency of extended individual preferences .....	73
3.5. Invariance axioms: the measurability and comparability of individual utility functions .....	73
3.6. Differences among social distributive evaluations .....	78
3*. THE BASES FOR ESTABLISHING SOCIAL EVALUATIONS OF DIVISIONS .....	81
3*1. Relations of social distributive evaluation .....	81
3*2. Social welfare and social choice functionals .....	83
3*3. Sen's axioms of individual preference consistency .....	85
3*4. Invariance axioms .....	86
4. THREE TYPES OF DISTRIBUTIVE JUSTICE PRINCIPLES .....	89
4.1. Types of justification of distributive justice principles .....	89
4.2. Equality .....	91
4.3. Impartiality .....	96
4.4. Unanimity .....	104
4.5. Connections among the three types of justice principles .....	112
4*. BASE CRITERIA OF SOCIAL EVALUATIONS .....	115
4*1. The Pareto optimality relation .....	115
4*2. The equalisation relation and selected egalitarian principles of justice .....	116
4*3. Suppes's justice relation and selected impartial principles of justice .....	121
4*4. The acceptance relation and selected unanimous principles of justice .....	126
4*5. Connections among the three base relations of justice .....	131

### Part III. EQUALITY

5. EQUAL SHARES OR EQUAL UTILITIES? .....	135
5.1. Equality .....	135
5.2. Equality of shares and the criteria of dominance.....	135
5.3. Egalitarian equivalent allocations .....	142
5.4. Non-envy and the principles of distributive justice.....	147
5.5. Envy and the exchange of goods .....	157
5.6. Attempts to combine equality and efficiency .....	162
5*. PROPERTIES OF EGALITARIAN PRINCIPLES .....	165
5*1. Lorenz dominance and other criteria of dominance .....	165
5*2. The Pazner-Schmeidler principle.....	168
5*3. Non-envy principles of goods allocation.....	171
5*4. The Walras principle of competitive equilibrium .....	177
5*5. The Goldman-Sussangkarn principle and its modifications .....	178
6. KLEMENS SZANIAWSKI'S PROBABILISTIC EQUALITY RULES ....	181
6.1. Random methods of social decision-making.....	181
6.2. The assumptions of Szaniawski's two probabilistic principles .....	182
6.3. The equal satisfaction principle .....	184
6.4. Equality of satisfaction vs. optimality .....	186
6.5. The principle of equal chances of choice.....	188
6.6. A comparison of the two probabilistic equality principles .....	190
6.7. Szaniawski's principles and the postulates of proportionality and non-envy .....	193
6.8. An experimental study of Szaniawski's equality principles .....	197
6.9. Probabilistic equality rules when the subjective utilities are known...	204
6*. FAIR LOTTERIES .....	206
6*1. The properties of the random division of a set of indivisible goods ..	206
6*2. Klemens Szaniawski's two probabilistic equality principles.....	212
6*3. The probabilistic serial rule .....	214

### Part IV. IMPARTIALITY

7. THE CONSTRUCTION AND JUSTIFICATION OF THE CLASSICAL PRINCIPLES OF JUSTICE.....	219
7.1. Impartiality .....	219
7.2. Three models of the original position.....	221
7.3. Decision theory in the justification of choices in the original position .....	226
7.4. Justification of the utilitarian principle: the model of the impartial observer .....	228

7.5. Justification of the utilitarian principle: Harsanyi's axiomatic model .....	233
7.6. Justification of Rawls's principle: Strasnick's theorems .....	237
7.7. Justification of Rawls's principle: Hammond's theorems .....	243
7.8. The utilitarian social welfare function vs. Arrow's theorem .....	246
<b>7*. AXIOMATIC COMPARISONS OF THE CLASSICAL PRINCIPLES OF JUSTICE.....</b>	<b>248</b>
7*1. Early comparisons of the classical principles of justice .....	248
7*2. The utilitarians' principle vs. Rawls's leximin: the theorems of d'Aspremont and Gevers .....	252
7*3. The utilitarians' principle vs. Rawls's leximin: Maskin's theorem .....	254
7*4. Restrictions on the set of justice principles: the theorems of Deschamps and Gevers .....	255
<b>8. NEW VERSUS CLASSICAL PRINCIPLES OF JUSTICE AND INDIVIDUALS' CHOICES IN EXPERIMENTAL SITUATIONS.....</b>	<b>259</b>
8.1. Principles of justice and individuals' choices and evaluations .....	259
8.2. Sayeki and Tomiyama's study: the consistency of choices with utilitarian and egalitarian principles .....	260
8.3. The experiment "Evaluations and Choices": social welfare functions vs. empirical strategies.....	264
8.4. The distributive justice representation of the social choice problem....	268
8.5. Classical principles of justice vs. empirical choices.....	272
8.6. Generalised principles of fair choice and their validity.....	277
8.7. Generalised principles of the evaluation of fairness.....	286
8.8. The empirical adequacy of the generalised principles of fairness .....	288
8.9. Evaluations from the point of view of an impartial observer and of a participant in the division .....	295
8.10. Ordering distributive justice principles.....	301
<b>8*. THE GENERALISED RAWLSIAN AND CONSERVATIVE PRINCIPLES OF JUSTICE .....</b>	<b>303</b>
8*1. The Kemeny-Snell distance measure between preferential rankings .....	303
8*2. The normative foundations of the Kemeny-Snell distance measure.....	304
8*3. Generalised principles of fair choice and their properties .....	307
8*4. Generalised principles of justice evaluation and their properties.....	312
8*5. A comparison of the generalised Rawlsian and conservative principles of fair evaluation and choice.....	313

## Part V. UNANIMITY

9. GAMES OF FAIR DIVISION .....	317
9.1. Games of goods division .....	317
9.2. The Nash bargaining solution .....	319
9.3. Principles of justice connected with the Nash solution .....	323
9.4. The Kalai-Smorodinsky solution, its modifications and the principle of fairness .....	326
9.5. Other solutions of goods division games.....	328
9*. SOLUTIONS OF GOODS DIVISION GAMES.....	330
9*1. Generalisations and modifications of Nash's solution.....	330
9*2. The Kalai-Smorodinsky solution and the lexicographic maximin .....	332
10. FAIR PROCEDURES.....	335
10.1. Procedures of goods allocation.....	335
10.2. Negotiations .....	335
10.3. Desirable properties of the procedures .....	336
10.4. Classical procedures of fair allocation.....	338
10.5. Selected procedures of division choice.....	341
10*. PROPERTIES OF ALLOCATION PROCEDURES .....	345
10*1. Theorems on negotiations.....	345
10*2. Theorems on the properties of selected procedures.....	347

## Part VI. SUMMARY

11. CONCLUSION.....	351
11.1. The functions of distributive justice principles.....	351
11.2. The bases of distributive judgements.....	352
11.3. Methods of constructing and justifying distributive justice principles .....	353
11.4. The importance of empirical studies.....	355
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	359
NAME INDEX .....	373
SUBJECT INDEX .....	377