THEORIZING FORMAL AND INFORMAL FEEDBACK PRACTICES IN MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTING THROUGH THREE DIMENSIONS

Hanna Pitkänen

Sarja/Series A-1:2013

Turun kauppakorkeakoulu
Turku School of Economics
TABLE OF CONTENTS

1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................... 13
  1.1 Motivation for studying formal and informal feedback ................................. 14
  1.2 Purpose of the study ......................................................................................... 17
  1.3 Methodological considerations and interpretive case study ......................... 19
  1.4 Abductive analysis ......................................................................................... 22
  1.5 Theoretical considerations ........................................................................... 23
  1.6 Outline of the thesis ....................................................................................... 28

2 CONTROLLING ORGANIZATIONS WITH MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTING SYSTEMS AND FEEDBACK ................................................................. 31
  2.1 Conceptualizing feedback from the system perspective ............................... 31
     2.1.1 Management accounting perspective ...................................................... 31
     2.1.2 Feedback and feed-forward ................................................................. 33
     2.1.3 Negative and positive feedback ............................................................. 35
     2.1.4 Vertical and horizontal feedback channels ........................................... 37
  2.2 Feedback in cybernetic control theory .......................................................... 38
     2.2.1 The model of control by Flamholtz ....................................................... 40
     2.2.2 Other management control frameworks .............................................. 44
     2.2.3 Feedback in relation to goals, rewards, and performance evaluation ...... 46
     2.2.4 Feedback in relation to open systems and system dynamics ............... 48
     2.2.5 Feedback in relation to learning and change ....................................... 51
  2.3 Enlarging the measurement view in management accounting doctrine ........... 53
     2.3.1 Non-financial and leading indicators: feed-forward measures .............. 53
     2.3.2 Diagnostic and interactive use of management control systems .......... 55
     2.3.3 Evaluations of the use of system-based communication and beyond ...... 56
     2.3.4 Beyond modern top-down management systems .................................. 59
  2.4 Shift from organization-level analyses to practice approaches ....................... 60
     2.4.1 The conceptual territory of feedback .................................................... 60
     2.4.2 Practices, actors, and feedback seeking .............................................. 63
     2.4.3 Theorizing feedback in interpretive research ....................................... 65

3 CASE STEELCO: FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS OF THE INTERPLAY BETWEEN FORMAL AND INFORMAL FEEDBACK IN CONTROL ......................................................... 71
  3.1 Introduction to the case setting ...................................................................... 71
  3.2 Performance measurement and reward systems in Group and Steelco .......... 73
# 3.3 Formal and informal feedback practices in the core control system

- 3.3.1 Matrix organization
- 3.3.2 Relations between Division Steelco and the headquarters
- 3.3.3 Relations between senior and middle managers
- 3.3.4 Managerial skills

# 3.4 Organizational structure and feedback practices

- 3.4.1 Matrix organization
- 3.4.2 Relations between Division Steelco and the headquarters
- 3.4.3 Relations between senior and middle managers
- 3.4.4 Managerial skills

# 3.5 Organizational feedback culture and elaboration of rules, symbols, and values

- 3.5.1 Profit making and customer orientation
- 3.5.2 One global company
- 3.5.3 Towards more communicative feedback culture
- 3.5.4 Towards more qualitative discussion in technology-dominant culture

# 3.6 Feedback and external environment

- 3.6.1 Dominant values on feedback in Finnish culture
- 3.6.2 Level of professionalism and high standards
- 3.6.3 Demands from the external environment

# 4 PROBLEMATIZING THE DICHOTOMY OF FORMAL AND INFORMAL FEEDBACK WITH THREE ANALYTICAL DIMENSIONS

- 4.1 From cybernetic to interpretive view on feedback
- 4.2 Construction of the 3D-framework
- 4.3 Coupling of formal and informal elements of feedback
- 4.3.1 Source dimension: systems and interaction
- 4.3.2 Time dimension: feedback periods and horizons
- 4.3.3 Rule dimension: power and hierarchies

## 4.4 Feedback practices through dimensions in Case Steelco

## 4.5 Control layers and formal and informal feedback practices

- 4.5.1 Feedback in Flamholtz's organizational control layers
- 4.5.2 Accountability and feedback practices in the core control system
- 4.5.3 Feedback channels and positions in organizational structure
- 4.5.4 Feedback culture(s) in organizational culture
- 4.5.5 Feedback between organizational members and stakeholders in external environment

# 5 CONCLUSIONS AND EVALUATION

- 5.1 Conclusions regarding management accounting research
- 5.2 Evaluation of the study
- 5.3 Suggestions for further studies

# REFERENCES