Climate Change and International Trade

Rafael Leal-Arcas
Senior Lecturer in Law, Queen Mary University of London, UK and Marie Curie Senior Research Fellow, World Trade Institute, University of Bern, Switzerland
Contents

List of figures ix
List of tables and boxes xi
Abbreviations xii
Acknowledgements xvi

1. Prologue 1
   1.1 Linking the legal regimes of trade and climate change 2
   1.2 Comparing the trade and climate regimes 11
   1.3 Multilayered governance in climate change and trade 15
       1.3.1 Criteria for the distribution of powers 19
   1.4 Structure of the book 21
   1.5 What this book is not about 23

PART 1 SETTING THE SCENE

2. The climate change challenge in the context of international trade 27
   2.1 Introduction 27
   2.2 What causes climate change? 30
   2.3 The international community’s acknowledgement 33
   2.4 Effects of climate change 37
   2.5 Climate migration 43
       2.5.1 Introducing the issue 44
       2.5.2 Where climate migrants will go 48
       2.5.3 Linking the concepts: climate migration and international trade 54

3. Environmental protection and the international trade system 80
   3.1 Introduction 80
   3.2 Background to legal instruments 91
       3.2.1 The Montreal Protocol 92
       3.2.2 The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (CITES) 93
       3.2.3 The Basel Convention 94
       3.2.4 The Cartagena Protocol 96
3.3 The WTO and the environment 96
  3.3.1 Principal legal aspects 96
  3.3.2 Dispute resolution within the WTO 99
  3.3.3 The proportionality principle in WTO law 101
  3.3.4 Eco-labeling and the WTO 117
3.4 Unilateral trade-related climate change measures 132
  3.4.1 An overview 133
  3.4.2 The WTO and subsidies for renewable energy 136
  3.4.3 EU Emissions Trading Scheme 150
  3.4.4 Conclusion 176

PART 2 THE CURRENT STATE OF PLAY

4. Legal and policy responses to climate change 179
  4.1 Introduction 179
  4.2 Earth Summit: The UNFCCC (1992) 181
     4.2.1 Objectives 181
     4.2.2 Major guidelines 183
  4.3 COP-1: The Berlin Mandate (1995) 187
  4.5 COP-3: The Kyoto Protocol (1997) 187
     4.5.1 Stronger GHG emissions commitments 187
     4.5.2 Explaining the negotiations 189
  4.6 COP-6: The Hague (2000) 190
  4.7 COP-13: The Bali action plan (2007) 191
  4.8 COP-15: The Copenhagen Accord (2009) 193
     4.8.1 Political (rather than legal) commitments 193
     4.8.2 Main features 195
  4.9 COP-16: The Cancún Agreements (2010) 201
     4.9.1 An overview 201
     4.9.2 Climate finance 207
  4.10 COP-17: Durban (2011) 213
     4.10.1 Extension of the Kyoto Protocol to a second commitment period 214
     4.10.2 The Durban Platform 215
     4.10.3 Creation of the institutions outlined in the Cancún Agreements 216
     4.10.4 Overall assessment 217

5. Analyzing the Kyoto Protocol 219
  5.1 Introduction 219
  5.2 What is the Kyoto Protocol? 220
5.3 Main points of the Kyoto Protocol 223
5.4 Major mechanisms of the Kyoto Protocol 227
  5.4.1 The CDM 228
  5.4.2 Joint implementation 241
  5.4.3 Emissions trading 243
5.5 Problems with the Kyoto Protocol 244
  5.5.1 Implementation 245
  5.5.2 Enforcement mechanism 247
5.6 Position of the main players 249
  5.6.1 U.S. position 249
  5.6.2 Chinese position 268
  5.6.3 EU position 278
5.7 Options under the current situation 284

PART 3 MOVING FORWARD

6. Top-down and bottom-up approaches to climate change and trade 291
  6.1 Introduction to collective irresponsibility 291
  6.2 Paradigm shift: justifying a bottom-up approach 294
  6.3 Current centralized legal framework: Waiting for Godot? 300
  6.4 The incremental development of multilateral regimes 306
  6.5 Explaining the bottom-up approach 311
    6.5.1 Advocating greater flexibility 311
    6.5.2 Why a bottom-up approach? 314
    6.5.3 National and sub-national initiatives 316
    6.5.4 Looking ahead: will new climate regimes be up to par? 319
    6.5.5 An incremental bottom-up approach for climate change 321
  6.6 Plausible avenues 325
    6.6.1 Variable geometry 325
    6.6.2 A sectoral regulatory approach 339
  6.7 Incentives for cooperative compliance 342
    6.7.1 Compliance 343
    6.7.2 The Montreal Protocol as a success story of regulatory cooperation 345
    6.7.3 Incentives to reduce GHG emissions 351
    6.7.4 Enforcement 355
  6.8 Conclusion 359
7. Regional trade agreements and climate change
   7.1 Introduction 363
   7.2 Overview of RTAs 365
   7.3 Motivations for RTA conclusion 369
   7.4 The mandate of regional integration 373
       7.4.1 GATT Article XXIV 373
       7.4.2 The enabling clause 376
       7.4.3 GATS Article V 378
   7.5 Main trends in RTAs 380
       7.5.1 From MFN liberalization to RTAs 381
       7.5.2 Geographical shift 382
       7.5.3 Cross-regional RTAs 385
       7.5.4 Mega-bloc RTAs 386
   7.6 Effects of regionalism on multilateralism 390
   7.7 Advantages and disadvantages of RTAs 397
   7.8 Using RTAs to promote climate change mitigation 405
       7.8.1 Moving away from multilateralism 405
       7.8.2 A greener type of trade 407
       7.8.3 Climate-related provisions within RTAs 408
       7.8.4 Proposed FTAs for climate purposes 412
       7.8.5 Concluding remarks 416
   7.9 Conclusion 416

8. Geoengineering the climate and possible trade implications 419
   8.1 Introduction 419
   8.2 Limitations and controversies 422
   8.3 Considerations around geoengineering 425
       8.3.1 Moral and policy concerns 426
       8.3.2 Technology 427
       8.3.3 Governance 430
       8.3.4 Legal considerations relating to international trade 434
   8.4 Conclusion 454

9. Recommendations 455

Bibliography 472
Index 503