Foreign Investment, International Law and Common Concerns

Edited by Tullio Treves, Francesco Seatzu and Seline Trevisanu
Contents

Foreword by the Editors xvi
Notes on Contributors xvii
Table of Cases xix
Table of Statutes xxiii

1 Introduction: Foreign Investment, International Law and Common Concerns 1
TULLIO TREVES

PART I
General International Law Issues 7

2 The Jurisprudence of Investment Treaty Tribunals: Between Public Good and Common Concern 9
STEPHAN W. SCHILL

2.1 The Quest for Multilateral Order: From Custom to Arbitral Jurisprudence 9
2.2 Multilateralizing Investment Law through Jurisprudence 10
  2.2.1 Analogizing with Earlier Decisions 12
  2.2.2 Precedent as a Means of Clarification of Investment Treaty Provisions 12
  2.2.3 Abbreviation of Reasoning 13
  2.2.4 Precedent and Standardization of Interpretation: Towards a Jurisprudence Constante 14
  2.2.5 Delegation of Law-Making Functions from States to Tribunals 15
  2.2.6 Multilateralization and Conflicting Decisions 17
  2.2.7 Precedent and the Generation of Normative Expectations 19
2.3 Arbitral Jurisprudence as a Common Concern: Addressing the Legitimacy of Multilateralizing Investment Law 22
Contents

3 Regulatory Measures, Standards of Treatment and the Law Applicable to Investment Disputes
PAOLO BERTOLI, ZENO CRESPI REGHIZZI

3.1 Introduction 26
3.2 The Law Applicable for, and the Law Applicable to, Treaty Claims 27
3.3 The Legal Basis for, and the Law Applicable to, Contract Claims 30
3.4 Regulatory Measures, International Law and Domestic Law in Investment Claims 33
3.4.1 Treaty Claims 33
3.4.2 Contract Claims 35
3.5 The Assessment of the Legitimacy of Regulatory Measures in Light of the Treaty Standards of Treatment 36
3.5.1 Regulatory Measures and Expropriation 36
3.5.2 Regulatory Measures and Fair and Equitable Treatment 39
3.6 The Impact of the Presence of a Stabilization Clause on the Arbitrators’ Evaluation 42
3.6.1 Stabilization Clauses and Expropriation 46
3.6.2 Stabilization Clauses and Fair and Equitable Treatment 46
3.7 Concluding Remarks 48

4 Investor Rights and Well-Being: Remarks on the Interpretation of Investment Treaties in Light of Other Rights
LUIGI CREMA

4.1 Preliminary Clarifications of the Issue at Stake 50
4.1.1 The Treaties ... 51
4.1.2 ... and Common Concerns: That Is? 53
4.1.2.1 Other rules, common concerns, or planetary welfare? 53
4.1.2.2 Other concerns are often not codified in rules, or their concrete content is not determined 55
4.1.2.3 Concerns common to whom? The interpretation does not entail a conflict between rules, but between jurisdictions 56
4.1.2.4 To sum up, by way of introduction 56
4.2 Application of the Treaty, its Broad Clauses, and Their Exceptions 57
4.3 Integration of Treaties with Domestic Regulations 58
4.4 Integration of Investor Rights with Other International Rights 59
4.4.1 Interpretation of Investment Agreements in Light of Other International Rules 59
   4.4.1.1 Article 31.3(c) 59
   4.4.1.2 Interpretive role of customs and other treaties outside Art.31.3(c) 62
4.4.2 Application of Investor rights and Other International Rules and Regulations 63
   4.4.2.1 Investor rights and other treaties 63
   4.4.2.2 Investor rights and other customs 64
4.5 Non-Application of Investment Treaties Conflicting with Ius Cogens 65
4.6 Interpretation of Clauses and Exceptions – Revised 66
4.7 Conclusions 67

5  Necessity Exceptions, the Argentine Crisis and Legitimacy Concerns: Or the Benefits of a Public International Law Approach to Investment Arbitration 71
CHRISTINA BINDER

5.1 Introduction 71
5.2 The Necessity Defence in the Investment Cases Against Argentina 72
   5.2.1 Facts 72
   5.2.2 Argentina’s Reliance on the Necessity Defence 73
   5.2.3 Elements of the Necessity Defence in the Investment Tribunals’ Decisions 75
   5.2.4 Relationship Between the Treaty-Based Emergency Exceptions and the Customary Law Necessity Defence 76
   5.2.5 Consequences of Reliance on Necessity 76
   5.2.6 Résumé 77
5.3 Problems of a Reliance on the Necessity Defence in Economic Crisis Situations as Evidenced in the Argentine Cases 77
   5.3.1 Problematic Elements of Art. 25 of the ILC Articles 77
   5.3.2 Problems Relating to Treaty-Based Emergency Exceptions/BIT Standards 78
   5.3.3 Lack of Consolidation of Proceedings 79
   5.3.4 Contradictory Decisions and Ensuing Legal Insecurity 79
   5.3.5 Problems Arising from the ICSID System for the Settlement of Investment Disputes 80
   5.3.6 Do the Investment Decisions Impose ‘Excessive’ Restrictions on Argentina’s Regulatory Authority? 81
5.4 Possible Solutions: The Benefits of a Public International Law Approach to Investment Arbitration 81
5.4.1 Appraisal of Possible Solutions 82
5.4.2 The Benefits of a Public International Law Approach to Investment Arbitration 83

6 The Role of Amicus Curiae in Investment Disputes: Striking a Balance Between Confidentiality and Broader Policy Considerations 86
CHIARA RAGNI

6.1 Towards the Admission of Amicus Curiae in Investment Arbitration 86
6.2 The Practice of Arbitral Tribunals on Amicus Curiae Interventions in the Absence of Written Rules 88
6.3 The Adoption and Application of Rules on the Participation of Amici Curiae in Arbitral Investment Proceedings 91
6.4 The Impact of Amicus Curiae Participation on Investment Arbitrations Disputes 95
6.4.1 The Very Limited Influence on the Decision Reached by Arbitral Tribunals 95
6.4.2 The Potential Benefits Stemming from Amicus Participation in Investment Proceedings: The Contribution to the Transparency and to the Legitimacy of the Procedure 97
6.5 Concluding Remarks: An Assessment of the Role of Amici Curiae in Integrating Common Concerns in Investment Proceedings 98

7 Standards and Guidelines: Some Interfaces with Private Investments 100
LAURENCE BOISSON DE CHAZOURNES

7.1 Standards, Guidelines, Soft Law and Beyond 100
7.2 Standards and Guidelines as Vehicles of Socialization 103
7.3 Standards and Guidelines as Vehicles of Accountability 107
7.3.1 The Operational Guidelines of the World Bank and of the International Finance Corporation 107
7.3.2 The Fight Against Corruption and the Procedure for the Administration of Sanctions 109
PART II
Institutional Aspects

FRANCESCO SEATZU

8.1 Introduction 117
8.2 Minding the Gap: The World Bank Guidelines on the Treatment of Foreign Direct Investments 119
  8.2.1 An Overview of the Purposes, General Structure and Contents of the World Bank Guidelines 119
  8.2.2 Strengths and Weaknesses of the World Bank Guidelines 121
  8.2.3 The Underlying Continuity of the Principles for Responsible Agricultural Investment with the World Bank Guidelines 123
8.3 Filling the Gap: Reforming the World Bank’s Investment Policy and Its Related Action Plans 124
  8.3.1 Reasons for a Comprehensive Reform of the World Bank Guidelines 124
  8.3.2 Some Tentative Suggestions for a Review of the World Bank Guidelines 126
  8.3.3.1 The need to remove the obstacles to a ‘reconciliation’ between foreign investors’ interests and common concerns 129
  8.3.3.2 The structure and main tools of the World Bank’s policy for the promotion of foreign investments 131
9 Non Trade Values Protection and Investment Protection in EU Investment Policy

ANNA DE LUCA

9.1 Introduction 137
9.2 The Position of the Commission 139
9.3 The Position of the Council 141
9.4 The Position of the EP 142
9.5 Balancing Investment Protection and Non-Trade Values in the Investment Chapters in the EU FTAs with Canada, Singapore and India 144
9.6 The Protection of Non-Trade Values and Their Integration in the Investment Policy of the EU and Its Member States: What Options for the EU as a Rule Maker? 147
9.7 Conclusions 151

10 Going Green at the European Investment Bank: An Environmental Policy for Non EU Lending

SARA DE MARIA

10.1 Introduction 154
10.2 The Legal Framework of EIB Investments Outside the EU and Its Environmental Policy: The Connection with the EU Principles and Legal Framework 155
10.3 The Development of the EIB’s Own Legal Framework 156
10.4 Where Does the Development of an EIB Environmental Policy Come From and Why Has It Become So Strong in the Last Decade? 158
10.5 Structure of EIB Action Outside Europe: Guarantees and EU Mandates 160
10.6 The EIB’s Peculiar Structure and Characteristics as a Public Bank: The Importance of the Project and the Eligibility Criteria 163
10.7 The Internal Organization and the Procedure Before and During the Financing: Central Role of the Environmental Assessment and Cooperation with the EU Commission 164
10.8 Conclusions 167
11 Promoting Investments in Sustainable Development Through Multilateral Environmental Agreements
FRANCESCA ROMANIN JACUR

11.1 Introduction 170
11.2 The Participation of the Private Sector in MEAs’ Implementation 171
   11.2.1 The Creation of Investment Opportunities 172
      11.2.1.1 Lessons learned from the Clean Development Mechanism 173
      11.2.1.2 Investments in forestry programmes 176
   11.2.2 MEAs’ Financial Mechanisms Opening ‘Windows’ to the Private Sector 179
      11.2.2.1 The strategies of the GEF to enhance the engagement with private actors 180
      11.2.2.2 The GCF under the climate regime and private actors 182
11.3 MEAs’ Contribution to Create Favourable Conditions for Sustainable Investments 184
   11.3.1 Strengthening Procedural and Substantive Sustainable Development Principles 185
   11.3.2 Building Capacities at the National Level 187
11.4 Conclusions: Reconciling Interests and Meeting Common Objectives 188

PART III
Common Concerns: Selected Issues

12 Mapping Environmental Concerns in International Investment Agreements: How Far Have We Gone?
MICHELE POTESTÀ

12.2 Environmental Provisions in Investment Treaties – What Are the Patterns? 195
   12.2.1 Preambles 195
   12.2.2 Reference to and Coordination with Environmental Treaties 199
13 Environmental Expropriation in International Investment Law

PAOLO VARGIU

13.1 Introduction 213
13.2 Direct Expropriation in International Investment Law 214
13.3 Other Forms of Expropriation 218
13.4 Environmental Concerns as a Basis for Expropriation 221
13.5 Environmental Protection in the New Generation of BITs: A Shift in Focus? 224
13.6 Concluding Remarks 228

14 Applying Corporate Social Responsibility to Foreign Investments: Failures and Prospects

ANGELICA BONFANTI

14.1 Introduction 230
14.2 Defining CSR 233
14.3 The Failed Attempts to Integrate CSR into Investment Regulation 234
14.4 CSR Standards of Conduct and Their Scope of Application 236
14.5 Integrating CSR in Investment Regulation: The Soft Law Approach 239
14.6 The Hard Law Approach: BITs and FTAs 242
14.7 Prospects on CSR: From an Inspirational Benchmark to a Good Faith Requirement? 245


SELINE TREVISANUT

15.1 Introduction 247
15.2 Regulating the Offshore Energy Industry 250
15.2.1 Law of the Sea and International Environmental Law 250
15.2.2 International Investment and Energy Law 254
15.3 The Challenges Posed by the Offshore Energy Industry 257
15.3.1 Offshore Energy Investments Located in Disputed Maritime Areas or Concerning Disputed Resources 257
15.3.2 New Challenges Posed by the Marine Renewable Energy Sector 261
15.4 Concluding Remarks: Towards ‘An Integrated, Interdisciplinary and Intersectoral Approach’ 263

16 Right to Property, Investments and Environmental Protection: The Perspectives of the European and Inter-American Courts of Human Rights

CESARE PITÉA

16.1 Introductory Remarks 265
16.2 Two Perspectives on the Relationship Between the Right to Property, Investments, and Environmental Protection 266
16.3 Hierarchy of Underlying Values 268
16.4 Flexibility in Considering the Role of Compensation for Interferences with Property Rights 271
16.5 Assessing the Conduct of the Owner/Investor: The Relevance of Good Faith 277
16.6 Concluding Remarks 279

17 The Protection of Cultural Rights and Cultural Heritage in International Investment Law and Arbitration

GIULIA BIGI

17.1 Introductory Remarks 280
17.2 The Protection of Cultural Rights and Cultural Heritage in International Law 281
17.3 The Protection of Cultural Rights and Cultural Heritage in International Investment Law 284
17.4 Harmonization of Foreign Investment Protection with Cultural Rights and Cultural Heritage in Investor-State Arbitration 286
17.4.1 The Direct Application of the 1972 World Heritage Convention 286
17.4.2 The Interpretative Function of the International Law Instruments on the Protection of Cultural Rights and Cultural Heritage 288
17.5 The Exclusion of the Interpretative Function of Other International Law Instruments in the Harmonization of Investment Protection with Non-Investment-Related Concerns 294
17.6 Concluding Remarks 296

18 International Investment Law and the International Protection of Workers’ Rights
STEFANO BRUGNATELLI

18.1 Introductory Remarks 298
18.2 Internationally Protected Workers’ Rights 298
18.3 Potential Conflict Between Foreign Investments and Workers’ Rights’ Protection 302
18.4 Coordination and Harmonization of Investment Protection with Workers’ Rights 305
18.4.1 General Considerations 305
18.4.2 Workers’ Rights Issues 308
18.4.2.1 Preambular clauses 308
18.4.2.2 ‘Non Lowering Standards’ clauses 310
18.4.2.3 ‘Minimum Standard’ clauses 312
18.4.2.4 ‘Right to Regulate’ clauses 313
18.4.2.5 Corporate social responsibility 314
18.4.2.6 IISD Model BIT 314
18.5 Concluding Remarks 316

19 Public Interest Concerns in International Investment Arbitration in the Water Services Sector: Problems and Prospects for an Integrated Approach
ATTILA TANZI

19.1 Introductory Remarks 318
19.2 On the Relevance of the Difficult Formation of a Basic Human Right to Access to Water and Sanitation 320
19.3 The Impact of the Due Diligence Nature of the International Obligations Concerning the Right to Water 323
19.4 On the Relationship of Separation and Compatibility Between International Investment and Human Rights Obligations 325
19.4.1 On the Suez and Sauer Awards 325
19.4.2 Preliminary Conclusions 328
19.5 Prospects for an Integrated Interpretation of 
Investment Treaties Beyond Compatibility Between 
Investment and Human Rights Obligations 328 
19.5.1 On Art. 31.3(c) VCLT 329 
19.5.2 An Integrated Treaty Interpretation Enhanced 
by Proportionality and Reciprocity 330 
19.6 On the Guidance to the Assessment of the Contents 
of Due Diligence in a Reciprocity Perspective on 
a Case-by-Case Basis 332

20 Sovereign Debt Restructuring 
and Investment Protection 336 
ANNAMARIA VITERBO

20.1 Introduction 336 
20.2 Whether Sovereign Bonds Qualify as ‘Investment’ 337 
20.3 Investment Agreements Excluding ‘Public Debt 
Operations’ from the Scope of Their Application 342 
20.4 The Greek Debt Restructuring 344 
20.5 The Safeguard of Common Concerns and 
States’ Policy Space 346

Index 349