A Contemporary Concept of Monetary Sovereignty

CLAUS D. ZIMMERMANN

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

Tables of Cases and Materials xix
List of Abbreviations xxvii

General Introduction 1

1. A Revision of the Concept of Monetary Sovereignty 7
   Introduction 7
   I. Money and Monetary Sovereignty in International Law: Conceptual Foundations and Underlying Legal Theories 8
      A. Ex post facto ius oritur: classical monetary sovereignty in context 9
      B. The legal theories of money and their respective relevance today 11
   II. The Conceptual Evolution of Monetary Sovereignty Under the Impact of Contemporary Constraints on its Exercise 16
      A. Factual erosion of monetary sovereignty or conceptual evolution in light of the dual nature of sovereignty? 16
      B. Contemporary monetary sovereignty as an essentially contested concept 19
   III. Conceptual Implications for the Evaluation of the Exercise of Sovereign Powers in the Realm of Money 24
      A. The normative components of contemporary monetary sovereignty as regulatory guidance and a legitimacy benchmark 24
      B. Regulating an increasingly interdependent global economy: contemporary monetary sovereignty as cooperative sovereignty 31
   Conclusion 35

2. The Increasing Hybridization of International Monetary Law 37
   Introduction 37
   I. The Diversification of the Legal Regime for International Current and Capital Transactions Across the Three Pillars of International Economic Law 38
      A. The intersection of international trade, investments, and the related flows of capital and payments 38
      B. The emergence of an overarching framework promoting the liberalization and protection of international transfers of funds 45
         1. The OECD codes on capital liberalization and the economic pressure arising from the eurocurrency markets 45
         2. Transfer-of-funds provisions in bilateral investment treaties as an increasingly important material source of international monetary law 48
            a. The varying scopes of transfer-of-funds provisions in bilateral investment treaties 49
### Contents

- **b. Different standards of investor protection with respect to the type of currency and the applicable exchange rate**
- **3. The WTO framework for trade in services as an essential part of contemporary international monetary law**
- **C. Balance-of-payments derogations: towards a coherent regime across international economic law?**
  - 1. Institutional and procedural aspects of IMF–WTO interaction: the scope of the consultation requirement in GATT Article XV:2
  - 2. The legal value and role of the findings issued by the IMF upon consultation by the WTO under GATT Article XV:2
  - 3. Balance-of-payments derogations across international economic law and the IMF’s imperfect lead role

**II. The Evolving Normative Effects of IMF and World Bank Conditionality and the Impact of IMF Surveillance and Technical Assistance**

- **A. The reshuffle of the conditionality of IMF and World Bank lending: past and current paradigm changes**
  - 1. Procedural aspects of IMF and World Bank lending and the legal nature of their respective conditionals
  - 2. Implementation techniques as the key vectors of conditionality
  - 3. Contemporary monetary sovereignty and the rise and fall of structural conditionality
- **B. The shaping of domestic policies through IMF surveillance and technical assistance put into perspective**

**III. The Rise in Importance of Transnational Monetary Law and its Implications**

- **A. Eurocurrencies as private and transnational money**
- **B. The irresistible emergence of a truly transnational monetary and financial system**
- **C. Towards a monetary and financial lex mercatoria?**

**Conclusion**

**3. Exchange Rate Misalignment and International Law**

### I. The Code of Conduct in IMF Article IV:1—An Effective Framework for Securing Systemic Stability?

- **A. IMF Article IV:1 and the struggle for domestic regulatory autonomy**
- **B. The IMF’s 2007 and 2012 reforms of bilateral surveillance and the new combined focus on balance of payments stability and domestic stability**
- **C. The main scenarios of exchange rate misalignment and their economic impact in the light of international law**

### II. Trade Law as an Alternative for Tackling the Maintenance of an Undervalued Real Exchange Rate?

- **A. The maintenance of an undervalued real exchange rate as an export subsidy under WTO rules?**
  - 1. Preliminary remarks on the governmental measures at issue
2. Subsidies and subsidized trade under WTO law 108
3. Assessment under the WTO criteria of an export subsidy 111
   a. Financial contribution or any other form of income or price support 111
   b. Conferral of a benefit 113
   c. Specificity 114
B. The main legislative proposals in the US for unilateral trade remedies against exchange rate manipulation 117
C. The enigmas of GATT Article XV and their impact on the viability of a WTO challenge of an undervalued real exchange rate 122
   1. The consultation requirement under GATT Article XV:2 122
   2. The exception under GATT Article XV:9(a) 122
   3. Role and legal value of GATT Article XV:4—an independent basis for a WTO claim? 128

III. Overarching Conceptual Issues and the Underlying Challenge to Systemic Stability 131
   A. The conceptual differences between the IMF and WTO legal frameworks and their implications 131
   B. The G-20’s ongoing efforts to reduce global current account imbalances put into perspective 135

Conclusion 142

4. The Increasing Regionalization of Monetary Sovereignty 143

Introduction 143

I. The Increasing Regionalization of Monetary Sovereignty: Economic Rationale and Legal Characteristics 144
   A. The sovereign decision to enter a monetary union in light of the constraints of the ‘Inconsistent Quartet’ 145
   B. An overview of the internal and external monetary competences of eurozone and non-eurozone EU member states 148
   C. Key features of existing monetary unions and of plans for such unions in Africa, the Caribbean, South America, and the Gulf region 152
      1. Existing monetary unions in Africa 152
      2. Plans for additional monetary unions in Africa 154
      3. Monetary union in the Eastern Caribbean 154
      4. Plans for a monetary union in the Gulf region 155
      5. Plans for a monetary union within the Bolivarian Alliance for the Americas 156

II. Adapting the EU Legal Framework to the Impact of Domestic Economic and Fiscal Policies on Regional Economic Stability 157
   A. Until 2011: loose coordination and surveillance of domestic policies under a constantly weakened Stability and Growth Pact 157
   B. The various reforms of the EU legal framework undertaken since 2010 in order to strengthen fiscal governance 161
      1. The strengthened SGP resulting from the 2011 Six-Pack 162
      2. The Treaty on Stability, Coordination and Governance 166
      3. Further strengthened fiscal governance: the Two-Pack 167
C. The EU's new legal framework for strengthened macroeconomic governance 168

III. Overarching Legal and Conceptual Challenges Exposed by the Potential Sovereign Default of Monetary Union Members 171
A. The legal techniques and mechanisms developed to avoid or at least delay the sovereign default of members of the eurozone 171
1. The arrangements devised by the Troika in 2010 to assist Greece with its sovereign debt crisis 171
2. The creation of institutionalized crisis resolution mechanisms in 2010–2011 and their use to support Ireland, Portugal, and again Greece 174
3. The European Stability Mechanism as a permanent crisis resolution mechanism for the eurozone 178
B. Fighting imbalances instead of taking decisive steps towards fiscal union: the EU’s technique to avoid a new logical inconsistency 182
C. The increasing regionalization of monetary sovereignty: surrender or effective exercise of monetary sovereignty? 185

Conclusion 189

Introduction 191
A. Origins, mandate, and legitimacy of the G-20 193
B. The G-20’s main initiatives aimed at strengthening global financial stability 196

A. The shift from the FSF to the FSB: greater inclusiveness, a broadened mandate, and evolving challenges 202
B. The FSB and its relationship with the IMF put into perspective 207
1. The underlying division of labour 207
2. The joint FSB-IMF Early Warning Exercise 208
3. The FSB’s Key Standards for Sound Financial Systems 209

III. The Evolving Role of an Evolving IMF in the International Financial Architecture 211
A. The Fund’s work on global financial stability: key features and recent reforms put into perspective 211
1. Ensuring the continued relevance of the IMF’s and the World Bank’s work on standards and codes 211
2. The Financial Sector Assessment Program and its 2009 reform in reaction to the Global Financial Crisis 214
3. The 2010 reform of the Financial Sector Assessment Program as a vital part of the Fund’s revision of its surveillance mandate 216
B. The 2008 and 2010 overhauls of IMF governance: increasing the Fund’s legitimacy and effectiveness in fulfilling its evolving role 221
Contents

Conclusion  
Concluding Remarks

Bibliography
Index

xvii

226
229
235
253