

Behind the Multilateral Trading System

*Legal Indigenization and the WTO
in Comparative Perspective*

Xing Lijuan,



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Summary of Contents

Chapter 1 · Review of Literature	13
I. Survey of the Key Sources	13
II. Analysis of the Key Sources	21
Chapter 2 · The Concept of Legal Indigenization	49
I. Responses to a “Problematic” World	49
II. The Concept of Indigenization in the Context of International Law	66
Chapter 3 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in China	73
I. International Trade Rule-Making	73
II. International Trade Disputes	83
III. Domestic Legislation on Trade	98
IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues	103
Chapter 4 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the United States	131
I. International Trade Rule-Making	131
II. International Trade Disputes	146
III. Domestic Legislation on Trade	155
IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues	162
Chapter 5 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the European Union	173
I. International Trade Rule-Making	173
II. International Trade Disputes	181
III. “Domestic” Legislation on Trade	189
IV. “Domestic” Adjudication of Trade Issues	195
Chapter 6 · Legal Indigenization and the WTO	219
I. Indigenized WTO Agreements and Practices	219
II. Legal Indigenization in the Context of Further Negotiations	232
III. General Implications for the WTO	246

Contents

Abbreviations	xv
Acknowledgments	xvii
Abstract and Overview	xix
Introduction · The Aim, Structure, Conceptual Terminology, and Limitations of This Book	3
Goals	3
Structure and Approach	5
Conceptual Terminology	7
Limitations	11
Chapter 1 · Review of Literature	13
I. Survey of the Key Sources	13
A. WTO Mechanisms	13
1. Overall assessment	14
2. On certain mechanisms	14
3. The WTO and domestic law	15
4. The WTO and international law	15
5. Legal principles and the interpretation of the WTO agreements	16
6. The design of the WTO agreements	16
7. The position of developing countries in the WTO	17
8. Domestic context	17
B. International Negotiation and Rule-Making	17
1. The current round of multilateral trade negotiations	18
2. Power of rule-making	18
3. Strategies or priorities in trade negotiations	18
C. Domestic Legislation and Policy-Making	19
1. Legislation	19
2. Free Trade Agreements	20
3. Domestic (and regional) influences on the international regime	20
D. Participation of Members in Multilateral Disputes Settlement	20
II. Analysis of the Key Sources	21
A. WTO Mechanisms	22
1. Overall assessment	22
2. On certain mechanisms	23
3. The WTO and domestic law	24

4. The WTO and international law	25
5. Legal principles and the interpretation of the WTO agreements	26
6. The design of the WTO agreements	26
7. The position of developing countries in the WTO	28
8. Domestic context	28
B. International Negotiation and Rule-Making	29
1. Current multilateral negotiations	29
2. Power of rule-making	29
3. Strategies or priorities in trade negotiations	30
C. Domestic Legislation and Policy-Making	30
1. Legislation	30
2. Free Trade Agreements	32
3. Domestic (and regional) influences on the international regime	32
D. Participation of Members in Multilateral Disputes Settlement	32
Summary	33
Appendix 1.1 Extended Survey of the Key Sources	35
Chapter 2 · The Concept of Legal Indigenization	49
I. Responses to a “Problematic” World	49
A. Legal Fragmentation in Trade before World War II	49
B. Legal Globalization as a Response to Fragmentation	51
C. Legal Globalization — Inherent Problems	53
D. Legal Globalization — Acquired Problems	57
1. Surge of sovereign countries	57
2. Self-evolution of the global trading system	58
3. Development of international law	59
E. Legal Indigenization as a Response to Problematic Globalization	64
II. The Concept of Indigenization in the Context of International Law	66
A. Meaning	66
B. Comparisons with Other Relevant Terms	68
Summary	72
Chapter 3 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in China	73
I. International Trade Rule-Making	73
A. Review of China’s Proposals	74
1. Special and Differential Treatment in China’s proposals	74
2. Substantive provisions in China’s proposals	75
3. Procedural matters in China’s proposals	75
B. Characteristics of China’s Trade Negotiations	76
1. Special and Differential Treatment	76
2. An inclination for vagueness	76
3. Procedural matters	77
C. Pertinent Aspect of Chinese Legal Tradition and Culture	78
1. Sovereign equality	78
2. Attitude toward international law	81
3. Procedural issues	82
II. International Trade Disputes	83

A. Overview	84
B. Chinese Ideologies Challenged by the DSB Disputes	84
1. Protection of subjects involving illegality	84
2. Publications and public morality	85
3. Trading rights and state control	86
4. Criminal thresholds and the protection of intellectual property rights as civil rights	86
C. Pertinent Aspects of Chinese Legal Tradition and Culture	86
1. Protection of subjects of law involving illegal elements	87
2. Publications and public morality	90
3. Trading rights and state control	91
4. The protection of civil rights through the criminal law	94
5. The protection of intellectual property rights — more fundamental issues	97
III. Domestic Legislation on Trade	98
A. Legal Regime of Trade	98
B. WTO Law in Domestic Context and Characteristics of Domestic Legislation	99
1. WTO law in domestic context	99
2. Characteristics of domestic legislation	100
C. Pertinent Aspects of Chinese Legal Tradition and Culture	101
1. Forms of law in dynastic China	101
2. Contemporary China's legal regime	102
IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues	103
A. Administrative and Judicial Regimes Relating to Trade	103
B. WTO Law in Domestic Context and Characteristics of Domestic Adjudication	104
1. WTO law in domestic context	104
2. Characteristics of domestic adjudication	105
C. Pertinent Aspects of Chinese Legal Tradition and Culture	109
1. Judicial review on administrative activities	109
2. Direct application of WTO law	111
3. Administrative litigation as a legal remedy	113
4. Competence of intermediate courts to exercise jurisdiction over trade cases	115
Summary	116
Appendix 3.1 Specific Amendments to the Dispute Settlement Understanding — Drafting Inputs from China	119
Appendix 3.2 Dynasties in Chinese History	122
Appendix 3.3 Sentences Requiring Thresholds Prescribed in Chapter III of the Criminal Law	123
Appendix 3.4 Sentences Not Requiring Thresholds Prescribed in Chapter III of the Criminal Law	124

Appendix 3.5 Sentences of Fixed-Term Imprisonment of Not More than Three Years or Criminal Detention Prescribed in Chapter III of the Criminal Law	125
Appendix 3.6 Sentences of Fixed-Term Imprisonment of Not Less than Three Years but Not More than Seven Years Prescribed in Chapter III of the Criminal Law	128
Appendix 3.7 A List of Departmental Rules Issued by the Ministry of Commerce on Anti-dumping Issues	130
Chapter 4 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the United States	131
I. International Trade Rule-Making	131
A. Overview	131
1. Multilateral trade negotiations	131
2. Negotiations for free trade agreements	134
B. Characteristics of the United States' Trade Negotiations	134
1. Series of proposals	134
2. Cautiousness toward Special and Differential Treatment	136
3. Reforms of the WTO mechanisms	136
4. The international rule of law	137
5. Procedural justice	137
6. U.S. practices and experiences	138
7. Selective partners in free trade agreements	138
8. Out-reform in trading partners	140
C. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture	141
1. Procedural fairness in the common law tradition	141
2. Leadership in the WTO	142
3. Reciprocity and Special and Differential Treatment	143
4. The international rule of law	144
5. Segmentation of power and trade issues	145
II. International Trade Disputes	146
A. Overview	147
B. U.S. Ideologies Challenged by the DSB Disputes	148
1. Sovereignty or unilateralism	148
2. The extra-territorial application of American law	150
C. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture	150
1. Origins of "unilateralism"	151
2. The extra-territorial application of American law	154
III. Domestic Legislation on Trade	155
A. WTO Law in Domestic Context and Characteristics of Domestic Legislation	155
1. WTO law in domestic context	156
2. Characteristics of domestic legislation	156
B. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture	159
1. The civil law and common law traditions	159
2. Fluctuation of trade policies	160
3. Subordination of international law to domestic law	161
IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues	162

A. Overview: The Main Agencies, Courts, and Statutory Provisions	162
B. Characteristics of Domestic Adjudication	163
1. Administrative segmentation	163
2. Judicial review	164
3. Specialized courts and judicial segmentation	165
C. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture	165
1. “Expertise” deference	166
2. Administrative deference	166
3. The extra-territorial application of American law	168
Summary	168
Appendix 4.1 Further Contribution of the United States to the Improvement of the Dispute Settlement Understanding of the WTO Related to Transparency — Revised Legal Drafting	171
Chapter 5 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the European Union	173
I. International Trade Rule-Making	173
A. Overview	174
B. Characteristics of the EU’s Trade Negotiations	174
1. An emphasis on overall goals of the WTO mechanisms	174
2. A unique perspective on constituents of the DSB	175
3. A fixed style of proposals	175
4. A focus on development, sustainability, and Special and Differential Treatment	175
5. Proposed texts accompanying discussions	176
6. An emphasis on regional issues	177
7. A heavy reliance on principles and guidelines	177
8. Status of independent experts in trade disputes settlement	177
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture	178
1. Role of judges	179
2. Principles and doctrines	179
3. Jurists in the civil law tradition	180
4. Sustainable development	180
II. International Trade Disputes	181
A. Overview	182
B. EU Ideologies Challenged by the DSB Disputes	183
1. Approaches of interpreting the WTO agreements	183
2. Multilateralism and trade preferences in FTAs	184
3. The application of legal principles in arguments	185
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture	186
1. The interpretation of international agreements	186
2. The relationship between trade preferences and multilateralism	188
3. The status of legal principles	189
III. “Domestic” Legislation on Trade	189
A. Overview	190
B. WTO Law in “Domestic” Context and Characteristics of “Domestic” Legislation	191
1. WTO law in “domestic” context	191

2. Characteristics of “domestic” legislation	191
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture	193
1. Different concepts of law	193
2. The relationship between EU law and national law	194
IV. “Domestic” Adjudication of Trade Issues	195
A. Overview	195
1. Administrative organs	195
2. Courts	196
B. Characteristics of “Domestic” Adjudication	197
1. The form of determinations on trade defense	197
2. Judicial protection of individual rights	197
3. Types of actions	198
4. The application of legal principles	199
5. Procedural rights	200
6. The style of judgments	200
7. Case law	200
8. Opinions of Advocates General	201
9. The application of the WTO agreements	201
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture	202
1. Judicial review	202
2. The style of judgments	203
3. The application of legal principles in EU jurisprudence	204
4. The centrality of the person and the protection of fundamental rights	208
5. The principle of due process	209
6. The system of Advocate General	209
Summary	210
Appendix 5.1 EU Emphasis on Principles, as Illustrated in Proposals on Special and Differential Treatment and Environmental Goods	212
Appendix 5.2 Independent Group of Experts for the Enforcement of Initiation Standards	215
Appendix 5.3 Illustrations of EU Basic Regulations on Trade	217
Chapter 6 · Legal Indigenization and the WTO	219
I. Indigenized WTO Agreements and Practices	219
A. The United States and the Multilateral Anti-dumping Mechanism	219
1. History of U.S. anti-dumping legislation	220
2. Article VI of the GATT 1947	221
3. The Kennedy Code	222
4. The Tokyo Code	224
5. Anti-dumping Agreement 1994	224
B. Rules for Applying the Notion of “Legitimate Expectations”	226
1. Case of Japan — Film	227
2. Case of EC — Computer Equipment	228
3. Case of EC — Asbestos	229
4. Rules for applying the notion of “legitimate expectations”	231

C. Admissibility of Amicus Curiae Submissions	231
II. Legal Indigenization in the Context of Further Negotiations	232
A. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Special and Differential Treatment	232
1. China	233
2. The United States	234
3. The EU	235
B. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Trade and the Environment	237
1. China	237
2. The United States	238
3. The EU	239
C. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Fisheries Subsidies	240
1. China	241
2. The United States	241
3. The EU	241
D. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Reform of the DSB	242
1. China	242
2. The United States	243
3. The EU	244
III. General Implications for the WTO	246
A. In the Short Term	246
1. Overview of the Trade Policy Review Mechanism	248
2. The Trade Policy Review Mechanism and legal indigenization	248
3. Concerns regarding the Trade Policy Review Mechanism	249
B. In the Long Term	250
Summary	250
Conclusion · The Context, Concept, and Significance of Legal Indigenization	253
Legal Indigenization and China	253
Legal Indigenization and the United States	254
Legal Indigenization and the EU	255
Legal Indigenization and the WTO	255
Bibliography	257
About the Author	271
Index	273