Behind the Multilateral Trading System

Legal Indigenization and the WTO in Comparative Perspective

Xing Lijuan

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina
Summary of Contents

Chapter 1 • Review of Literature 13
   I. Survey of the Key Sources 13
   II. Analysis of the Key Sources 21

Chapter 2 • The Concept of Legal Indigenization 49
   I. Responses to a “Problematic” World 49
   II. The Concept of Indigenization in the Context of International Law 66

Chapter 3 • Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in China 73
   I. International Trade Rule-Making 73
   II. International Trade Disputes 83
   III. Domestic Legislation on Trade 98
   IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues 103

Chapter 4 • Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the United States 131
   I. International Trade Rule-Making 131
   II. International Trade Disputes 146
   III. Domestic Legislation on Trade 155
   IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues 162

Chapter 5 • Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the European Union 173
   I. International Trade Rule-Making 173
   II. International Trade Disputes 181
   III. “Domestic” Legislation on Trade 189
   IV. “Domestic” Adjudication of Trade Issues 195

Chapter 6 • Legal Indigenization and the WTO 219
   I. Indigenized WTO Agreements and Practices 219
   II. Legal Indigenization in the Context of Further Negotiations 232
   III. General Implications for the WTO 246
# Contents

Abbreviations xv

Acknowledgments xvii

Abstract and Overview xix

Introduction • The Aim, Structure, Conceptual Terminology, and Limitations of This Book 3

Goals 3

Structure and Approach 5

Conceptual Terminology 7

Limitations 11

Chapter 1 • Review of Literature 13

I. Survey of the Key Sources 13

A. WTO Mechanisms 13

1. Overall assessment 14

2. On certain mechanisms 14

3. The WTO and domestic law 15

4. The WTO and international law 15

5. Legal principles and the interpretation of the WTO agreements 16

6. The design of the WTO agreements 16

7. The position of developing countries in the WTO 17

8. Domestic context 17

B. International Negotiation and Rule-Making 17

1. The current round of multilateral trade negotiations 18

2. Power of rule-making 18

3. Strategies or priorities in trade negotiations 18

C. Domestic Legislation and Policy-Making 19

1. Legislation 19

2. Free Trade Agreements 20

3. Domestic (and regional) influences on the international regime 20

D. Participation of Members in Multilateral Disputes Settlement 20

II. Analysis of the Key Sources 21

A. WTO Mechanisms 22

1. Overall assessment 22

2. On certain mechanisms 23

3. The WTO and domestic law 24
CONTENTS

4. The WTO and international law 25
5. Legal principles and the interpretation of the WTO agreements 26
6. The design of the WTO agreements 26
7. The position of developing countries in the WTO 28
8. Domestic context 28

B. International Negotiation and Rule-Making 29
1. Current multilateral negotiations 29
2. Power of rule-making 29
3. Strategies or priorities in trade negotiations 30

C. Domestic Legislation and Policy-Making 30
1. Legislation 30
2. Free Trade Agreements 32
3. Domestic (and regional) influences on the international regime 32

D. Participation of Members in Multilateral Disputes Settlement 32

Summary 33

Appendix 1.1 Extended Survey of the Key Sources 35

Chapter 2 • The Concept of Legal Indigenization 49

I. Responses to a “Problematic” World 49
   A. Legal Fragmentation in Trade before World War II 49
   B. Legal Globalization as a Response to Fragmentation 51
   C. Legal Globalization — Inherent Problems 53
   D. Legal Globalization — Acquired Problems 57
      1. Surge of sovereign countries 57
      2. Self-evolution of the global trading system 58
      3. Development of international law 59
   E. Legal Indigenization as a Response to Problematic Globalization 64

II. The Concept of Indigenization in the Context of International Law 66
   A. Meaning 66
   B. Comparisons with Other Relevant Terms 68

Summary 72

Chapter 3 • Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in China 73

I. International Trade Rule-Making 73
   A. Review of China’s Proposals 74
      1. Special and Differential Treatment in China’s proposals 74
      2. Substantive provisions in China’s proposals 75
      3. Procedural matters in China’s proposals 75
   B. Characteristics of China’s Trade Negotiations 76
      1. Special and Differential Treatment 76
      2. An inclination for vagueness 76
      3. Procedural matters 77
   C. Pertinent Aspect of Chinese Legal Tradition and Culture 78
      1. Sovereign equality 78
      2. Attitude toward international law 81
      3. Procedural issues 82

II. International Trade Disputes 83
Appendix 3.5 Sentences of Fixed-Term Imprisonment of Not More than Three Years or Criminal Detention Prescribed in Chapter III of the Criminal Law

Appendix 3.6 Sentences of Fixed-Term Imprisonment of Not Less than Three Years but Not More than Seven Years Prescribed in Chapter III of the Criminal Law

Appendix 3.7 A List of Departmental Rules Issued by the Ministry of Commerce on Anti-dumping Issues

Chapter 4 • Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the United States

I. International Trade Rule-Making
   A. Overview
      1. Multilateral trade negotiations
      2. Negotiations for free trade agreements
   B. Characteristics of the United States' Trade Negotiations
      1. Series of proposals
      2. Cautiousness toward Special and Differential Treatment
      3. Reforms of the WTO mechanisms
      4. The international rule of law
      5. Procedural justice
      6. U.S. practices and experiences
      7. Selective partners in free trade agreements
      8. Out-reform in trading partners
   C. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture
      1. Procedural fairness in the common law tradition
      2. Leadership in the WTO
      3. Reciprocity and Special and Differential Treatment
      4. The international rule of law
      5. Segmentation of power and trade issues

II. International Trade Disputes
   A. Overview
   B. U.S. Ideologies Challenged by the DSB Disputes
      1. Sovereignty or unilateralism
      2. The extra-territorial application of American law
   C. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture
      1. Origins of "unilateralism"
      2. The extra-territorial application of American law

III. Domestic Legislation on Trade
   A. WTO Law in Domestic Context and Characteristics of Domestic Legislation
      1. WTO law in domestic context
      2. Characteristics of domestic legislation
   B. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture
      1. The civil law and common law traditions
      2. Fluctuation of trade policies
      3. Subordination of international law to domestic law

IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues
A. Overview: The Main Agencies, Courts, and Statutory Provisions 162
B. Characteristics of Domestic Adjudication 163
1. Administrative segmentation 163
2. Judicial review 164
3. Specialized courts and judicial segmentation 165
C. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture 165
1. "Expertise" deference 166
2. Administrative deference 166
3. The extra-territorial application of American law 168

Appendix 4.1 Further Contribution of the United States to the Improvement of the Dispute Settlement Understanding of the WTO Related to Transparency — Revised Legal Drafting 171

Chapter 5 • Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the European Union 173
I. International Trade Rule-Making 173
A. Overview 174
B. Characteristics of the EU’s Trade Negotiations 174
1. An emphasis on overall goals of the WTO mechanisms 174
2. A unique perspective on constituents of the DSB 175
3. A fixed style of proposals 175
4. A focus on development, sustainability, and Special and Differential Treatment 175
5. Proposed texts accompanying discussions 176
6. An emphasis on regional issues 177
7. A heavy reliance on principles and guidelines 177
8. Status of independent experts in trade disputes settlement 177
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture 178
1. Role of judges 179
2. Principles and doctrines 179
3. Jurists in the civil law tradition 180
4. Sustainable development 180

II. International Trade Disputes 181
A. Overview 182
B. EU Ideologies Challenged by the DSB Disputes 183
1. Approaches of interpreting the WTO agreements 183
2. Multilateralism and trade preferences in FTAs 184
3. The application of legal principles in arguments 185
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture 186
1. The interpretation of international agreements 186
2. The relationship between trade preferences and multilateralism 188
3. The status of legal principles 189

III. “Domestic” Legislation on Trade 189
A. Overview 190
B. WTO Law in “Domestic” Context and Characteristics of “Domestic” Legislation 191
1. WTO law in “domestic” context 191
2. Characteristics of “domestic” legislation 191
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture 193
  1. Different concepts of law 193
  2. The relationship between EU law and national law 194
IV. “Domestic” Adjudication of Trade Issues 195
  A. Overview 195
     1. Administrative organs 195
     2. Courts 196
  B. Characteristics of “Domestic” Adjudication 197
     1. The form of determinations on trade defense 197
     2. Judicial protection of individual rights 197
     3. Types of actions 198
     4. The application of legal principles 199
     5. Procedural rights 200
     6. The style of judgments 200
     7. Case law 200
     8. Opinions of Advocates General 201
     9. The application of the WTO agreements 201
  C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture 202
     1. Judicial review 202
     2. The style of judgments 203
     3. The application of legal principles in EU jurisprudence 204
     4. The centrality of the person and the protection of fundamental rights 208
     5. The principle of due process 209
     6. The system of Advocate General 209
  Summary 210

Appendix 5.1 EU Emphasis on Principles, as Illustrated in Proposals on Special and Differential Treatment and Environmental Goods 212

Appendix 5.2 Independent Group of Experts for the Enforcement of Initiation Standards 215

Appendix 5.3 Illustrations of EU Basic Regulations on Trade 217

Chapter 6 • Legal Indigenization and the WTO 219
  I. Indigenized WTO Agreements and Practices 219
     A. The United States and the Multilateral Anti-dumping Mechanism 219
        1. History of U.S. anti-dumping legislation 220
        2. Article VI of the GATT 1947 221
        3. The Kennedy Code 222
        4. The Tokyo Code 224
        5. Anti-dumping Agreement 1994 224
     B. Rules for Applying the Notion of “Legitimate Expectations” 226
        1. Case of Japan — Film 227
        2. Case of EC — Computer Equipment 228
        3. Case of EC — Asbestos 229
        4. Rules for applying the notion of “legitimate expectations” 231
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C. Admissibility of Amicus Curiae Submissions</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Legal Indigenization in the Context of Further Negotiations</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Special and Differential Treatment</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. China</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The United States</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The EU</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Trade and the Environment</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. China</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The United States</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The EU</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Fisheries Subsidies</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. China</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The United States</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The EU</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Reform of the DSB</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. China</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The United States</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The EU</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. General Implications for the WTO</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. In the Short Term</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Overview of the Trade Policy Review Mechanism</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Trade Policy Review Mechanism and legal indigenization</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Concerns regarding the Trade Policy Review Mechanism</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. In the Long Term</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion · The Context, Concept, and Significance of Legal Indigenization</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Indigenization and China</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Indigenization and the United States</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Indigenization and the EU</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Indigenization and the WTO</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About the Author</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>