CROSS-BORDER WELFARE STATE

Immigration, social security and integration

Edited by
Gijsbert Vonk

With contributions by:
Gijsbert Vonk & Sarah van Walsum
Paul Schoukens & Danny Pieters
Klaus Kapuy
Lienieke Slingenber
Eva Hilbrink
Jeanine Kla"{e}ver & Arend Odé
Karin de Vries
Will Tinne"{m}ans, Saskia Moerbeek & Dilek Karaa"{g}açli
Daan Beltman

intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
CONTENTS

Preface ........................................................................................................... v
List of abbreviations......................................................................................... xv

PART A.
OVERALL ANALYSIS OF THE RESEARCH FINDINGS

Access denied. Towards a new approach to social protection for formally excluded migrants
Gijsbert Vonk and Sarah Van Walsum ......................................................... 3

1. Introduction ............................................................................................... 3
   1.1. Background to the study ...................................................................... 3
   1.2. Object, purpose and structure ........................................................... 5
      1.2.1. Object and central question ....................................................... 5
      1.2.2. Purpose .................................................................................... 5
      1.2.3. Structure .................................................................................. 6
   1.3. Some limitations and definitions ....................................................... 7
      1.3.1. The Netherlands as a fixed point of reference ......................... 7
      1.3.2. Defining irregular immigrants .................................................... 7
      1.3.3. Defining social protection and social inclusion ....................... 8
      1.3.4. Defining civic integration .......................................................... 8

2. The exclusion of migrants from formal social security ......................... 9
   2.1. General lay out .................................................................................. 9
   2.2. The logics of inclusion and exclusion in the original position .......... 11
      2.2.1. The social security perspective ................................................. 11
      2.2.2. The perspective of immigration law ......................................... 18
      2.2.3. The perspective of civic integration ......................................... 19
   2.3. The dynamics of inclusion and exclusion of migrants in social security
      2.3.1. Sphere convergence: general remarks ....................................... 19
      2.3.2. Immigration policy and social security: the legal residence test 21
      2.3.3. Immigration policies and civic integration: the consequence of failure to meet civic integration obligations 23
2.3.4. Civic integration policies and social security: retrenchment to the national border .......................... 25
2.4. The impact of human rights on the exclusion of irregular immigrants from basic social rights ............................................. 27
2.5. Final observations ......................................................... 31
3. The position of migrants in informal social security .................. 33
3.1. Preliminary remarks ...................................................... 33
3.1.1. ‘Formal’ and ‘informal’ social security ............................ 33
3.1.2. Insights from the informal perspective ............................ 33
3.1.3. Composition of paragraph 3 ........................................ 35
3.1.4. Irregular immigrants and regular immigrants .................... 36
3.2. Informal social security arrangements: three examples ............ 36
3.2.1. Transnational effects of including migrants into national health care benefits .................................................. 37
3.2.2. Transnational arrangements for housing and (paid) care .... 38
3.2.3. Financial provisions for retirement in the country of origin 40
3.3. The outcome of the case studies: general discussion .............. 42
3.3.1. Interaction between formal and informal social security arrangements .................................................. 42
3.3.2. Modern communication technology ............................... 42
3.3.3. Varying structures of informal support ............................ 43
3.3.4. Varying dynamics of dependency ................................. 45
3.4. Final observations ......................................................... 47
4. Towards a new approach to social protection for formally excluded migrants .................................................. 48
4.1. The need for an alternative approach? ............................... 48
4.2. Building blocks for an alternative approach ......................... 50
4.2.1. Respecting basic human rights ...................................... 50
4.2.2. Extra-territorial responsibility for emigrants ................. 50
4.2.3. International co-operation in the event of return ............. 51
4.3. Respecting basic human rights ........................................ 51
4.3.1. Providing support in individual cases of exceptional vulnerability and need .................................................. 51
4.3.2. Respecting and protecting informal and private social security arrangements .................................................. 52
4.4. Extra-territorial responsibility for emigrants ....................... 54
4.5. International co-operation in the event of return .................. 56
5. Summary and final conclusions ......................................... 58
5.1. Summary ................................................................. 58
5.2. Access denied: the road ahead ........................................ 59
PART B.
ESSAYS ON MIGRATION AND SOCIAL SECURITY

Irregular labour migrants and access to social protection
Paul SCHOUKENS and Danny PIETERS

1. Introduction and conceptual framework ........................................... 63
2. The irregular labour migrant and international law ......................... 66
   2.1. Instruments of principle and human rights instruments ............... 67
       2.1.1. UN and ILO ........................................... 67
       2.1.2. Council of Europe .................................... 67
   2.2. Instruments relating to the minimum standards of social
       protection ................................................................ 70
       2.2.1. UN and ILO ........................................... 70
       2.2.2. Council of Europe .................................... 71
   2.3. Non-discrimination provisions ................................................. 72
       2.3.1. UN and ILO ........................................... 72
       2.3.2. Council of Europe .................................... 73
   2.4. Instruments relating to the social protection of migrant workers .. 73
       2.4.1. UN and ILO ........................................... 73
       2.4.2. Council of Europe .................................... 76
3. Some national approaches ............................................................... 76
   3.1. Right to health care ............................................................... 77
   3.2. Access to social assistance ....................................................... 78
   3.3. Right to social insurance benefits ............................................. 79
4. Which social protection to grant to irregular labour migrants? .......... 79
   4.1. The sovereignty of states to regulate access to the country .......... 81
   4.2. The sovereignty of states to regulate work in the country .......... 82
   4.3. The equilibrium between rights and duties of the people under
       social protection ................................................................ 82
   4.4. The respect for human rights and the respect for the special
       needs of migrants ................................................................ 84
   4.5. Coming to a balanced approach of access to social protection ....... 84

Irregular migrant workers and social security
Klaus KAPUY .................................................................................. 91

1. Background .................................................................................... 91
2. International legal framework ......................................................... 94
3. National social security law ............................................................ 96
4. Proposal ......................................................................................... 98
   4.1. Personal scope of application .................................................. 99
   4.2. Entitlement criterion: qualifying periods and waiting periods .... 102
Contents

4.3. Entitlement criterion: payment of social insurance contributions . 102
4.4. Entitlement criteria related to the national labour market ....... 103
4.5. Workers compensation and similar schemes .................... 105
4.6. Medical treatment ............................................. 105
4.7. Children and social security protection ......................... 107
4.8. Practical issues ............................................... 107
4.9. Relationship with immigration law ........................... 108
4.10. Compliance with international obligations .................. 110

5. Concluding remarks ............................................. 111

The EU Directive on reception conditions for asylum seekers in relation to international law
Lieneke SLINGENBERG ........................................... 113

1. Introduction ..................................................... 113
2. Separation and convergence .................................... 115
3. EU Directive on Reception Conditions for Asylum Seekers ........ 117
4. Equal treatment? ............................................... 119
5. Basic minimum rights? ......................................... 123
   5.1. Introduction ................................................ 123
   5.2. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 123
   5.3. European Convention on Human Rights .................... 126
   5.4. Concluding remarks .................................... 129
6. Relevance of being an asylum seeker ........................ 129
7. Assessment of EU Reception Conditions Directive in relation to international law ........................ 130
   7.1. Introduction ............................................... 130
   7.2. Material benefits ......................................... 131
   7.3. Health care ............................................... 133
   7.4. Reduction and withdrawal of reception benefits ............ 134
   7.5. State obligations not addressed by the EU Reception Conditions Directive .......................... 136
8. Concluding remarks ............................................. 136

The approach of the ECJ and the ECtHR to income requirements in immigration law. How the immigration clause affects judicial means-end scrutiny
Eva HILBRINK .................................................. 139

1. Introduction: the inevitable arbitrariness of income requirements .... 139
2. The ECtHR approach .......................................... 140
3. The ECJ on income requirements regarding European Union citizens and their family members .................... 143
2.1.3. The Act on Integration Abroad: integration as a ground for exclusion .................................................. 180
2.1.4. After 2007: a return to 'active citizenship'? .................. 181
2.1.5. Changes to the integration exam abroad .......................... 182

2.2. Objections to the Dutch conceptualisation of citizenship and integration .................................................. 184
2.2.1. 'Shared citizenship' as a cultural norm: one-sided adjustment to 'the Dutch identity'? .................. 184
2.2.2. Integration as a ground for exclusion: a fair balance of interests? .................................................. 186

3. Integration requirements in immigration law .................. 187
3.1. Integration versus admission .................................. 187
3.2. Integration versus equality .................................. 191
3.3. The content of integration requirements .................. 192

4. Compatibility of the Dutch integration exam abroad with immigration law standards .......................... 194

5. Conclusions .................................................. 197

PART D.
INFORMAL SOCIAL SECURITY FOR FORMALLY EXCLUDED MIGRANTS

Across the border. A study into undocumented migrants and transnational forms of social security
Will TINNEMANS, Saskia MOERBEEK and Dilek KARAAGẠÇLI ........ 201

1. Introduction ................................................. 201
2. Changes in the group of excluded migrants .................. 202
3. World citizens ............................................. 203
4. Different forms of solidarity and Turkish Bulgarians .......... 204
5. Social and ethnic solidarity ................................... 205
6. Transnationalisation of migration and Filipino domestic workers .......... 208
7. Migration and development and the Latitude Care Network .......... 210
8. Follow-up questions ............................................. 214
9. New forms of insurance? ............................................. 214
## Contents

### PART E.
### SOCIAL PROTECTION AND VOLUNTARY RETURN

Voluntary return facilities for foreign nationals without residence permits in comparative perspective

**Daan Beltman** ..................................................... 219

1. Introduction .................................................. 219
2. Voluntary return: definition and target group ........... 220
3. Voluntary return facilities in the Netherlands .......... 221
4. Voluntary return facilities in Belgium .................. 225
5. Voluntary return facilities in Germany .................. 226
6. Voluntary return facilities in France ................... 228
7. Voluntary return facilities in the UK .................... 230
8. Rationale behind return facilities ....................... 233
9. Concluding observations ..................................... 234

**Bibliography** ...................................................... 239

*Other sources of reference* ...................................... 249

*List of case-law* .................................................. 253

*About the authors* ................................................ 257