INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS IN WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT

How Much Institutional Sensitivity?

MARINA FOLTEA
CONTENTS

List of abbreviations page xii
Table of WTO reports xiv
Table of GATT 1947 reports xxi

Introduction 1

I. The phenomenon of fragmentation of international organizations 1

II. International organizations in the WTO 9

A. The International Trade Organization 9
B. The GATT 1947 11
C. The WTO 12

III. International organizations in WTO dispute settlement 14

IV. This study: task, method and structure 16

PART I Fondations 21

1 The institutional sensitivity of the WTO adjudicator 23

I. Introduction 23

II. Institutional sensitivity as a legitimacy ingredient 23

A. The legitimacy of international adjudication 26
B. The legitimacy of the WTO judiciary 27

III. The dimensions of institutional sensitivity 28

A. The vertical dimension 28
B. The horizontal dimension 31

1. Sensitivity in broad terms 31
   a. Discretion to refer to non-WTO law 33
   b. The use of general international law in the WTO 35

2. Sensitivity in narrow terms 39
   a. Acts emerging from international organizations 40
   b. Information and expert advice 44

3. What can be drawn from the comity doctrine? 45
IV. Other scholarly debate relating to institutional sensitivity 46
   A. The SCM and the fisheries subsidies negotiations 47
   B. The trade and environment debate 49
V. Conclusions 50

2 The WTO linking techniques 52
   I. Introduction 52
   II. Deference 53
      A. References to the International Monetary Fund in the WTO law 54
      B. GATT Article XV 54
         1. The balance of payments assessments 56
         2. Exchange measures 57
            a. Exchange or trade measures 57
            b. The use of IMF-consistent measures 58
   III. Incorporation 60
      A. The TRIPS Agreement 60
      B. The SPS and TBT agreements 63
         1. The 'relevant international organizations' under the SPS Agreement 65
         2. International organizations under the TBT Agreement 66
      C. The SCM Agreement 69
   IV. Co-operation and observership 71
      A. The WTO co-operation agreements and memoranda of understanding 72
         1. The need for further elaboration 74
         2. Their status in WTO dispute settlement 75
      B. The observer status 76
         1. Granting observer status 77
         2. The rights of observers 78
   V. The right to seek information 79
      A. The nature of the information 81
         1. Information and expert advice 81
         2. Factual and legal information 82
         3. Issues of law and issues of fact 84
      B. The source of information 86
   VI. Conclusions 86

3 The VCLT rules of interpretation 88
   I. Introduction 88
II. The rules of interpretation of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties as applied by the WTO adjudicator 89
   A. Intrinsic and extrinsic interpretation techniques 93
   B. The legal value of interpretative material under the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 94
   C. The limited reference in WTO dispute settlement 95

III. The classification of acts of international organizations in WTO dispute settlement 96
   A. Ordinary meaning 96
      1. US - Shrimp 97
         a. ‘Exhaustible natural resources’ 98
         b. The GATT Article XX chapeau 99
      2. EC - Biotech 101
   B. Context 101
      1. The Harmonized System 103
      2. The WTO Explanatory Notes and Scheduling Guidelines 104
   C. Subsequent agreement 105
      1. The ITU instruments 106
      2. The Berne Convention Report 107
      3. The OECD Arrangement 108
   D. Subsequent practice 109
      1. The status of institutional practice in the WTO 110
      2. EC - Computer Equipment 111
      3. Limitations on use of institutional practice 112
   E. Other rules of international law 114
   F. Special meanings 115
   G. Supplementary means 116
      1. The preparatory work 117
      2. Other supplementary means 118
      3. Elucidation versus confirmation 119

IV. Conclusions 121

PART II The constraints on institutional sensitivity 125

4 Internal and external constraints 127
   I. Introduction 127
   II. Internal constraints 127
      A. The WTO legal framework 127
         1. DSU Article 2(1) 127
         2. DSU Articles 3(2) and 19(2) 130
         3. DSU Article 13 132
         4. The SPS Agreement 133
5. The TBT Agreement 135
B. WTO political choices 135
C. WTO judicial decision making 138
1. Inconsistent interpretation as a legitimacy issue 139
2. Inconsistent interpretation as a problem for institutional sensitivity 140

III. External constraints 142
A. Authoritative interpretation in international organizations 143
1. The role of the International Court of Justice 143
2. The International Monetary Fund as a sui generis system 145
3. Other workable systems 147
   a. The UN specialized agencies 147
   b. The International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea 148
B. Examples of weak dispute settlement mechanisms in international organizations 150
1. The World Intellectual Property Organization 150
   a. Dispute settlement with reference to the International Court of Justice 151
   b. Independent dispute settlement systems 151
2. The World Health Organization 154
3. The World Customs Organization 155
4. The Codex Alimentarius Commission, the OIE and the International Plant Protection Convention 157
C. The issue of reciprocity 158

IV. Conclusions 161

5 The competence and credibility of international organizations 163
I. Introduction 163
II. Positive presumption in favour of an international organization 164
   A. Specific mention in the WTO legal texts 164
   B. The universality of international organizations 166
III. The Codex Alimentarius Commission, the OIE and the International Plant Protection Convention 168
   A. The functioning of these international organizations 169
      1. The Codex Alimentarius Commission 169
      2. The OIE 170
      3. The International Plant Protection Convention 170
   B. Selected operational issues 171

IV. The role of WTO subsidiary bodies 172
A. The SPS Committee 173
   1. The peer-review function 173
   2. Norm elaboration 174
      a. The granting of observer status in the SPS Committee 174
      b. Monitoring the process of international harmonization 176
B. The SCM Committee 177
   1. Disciplining fisheries subsidies 177
   2. The Food and Agriculture Organization 178

V. Conclusions 179

PART III International organizations in the WTO disputes settlement procedure 183

6 The International Monetary Fund 185
   I. Introduction 185
   II. Consultation with the International Monetary Fund 185
   III. Determinations on exchange matters 189
   IV. Evaluation 191
   V. Conclusions 196

7 The World Intellectual Property Organization 199
   I. Introduction 199
   II. The request for factual information by panels 199
   III. Non-incorporated WIPO treaties: US - Section 110(5) Copyright Act 203
   IV. Interpretations by the contracting parties 204
      A. The General Report to the 1948 Berne Revision Conference 204
      B. Other conference documents 205
      C. Evaluation 206
   V. Documents prepared by WIPO 208
      A. Uruguay Round documents in US - Section 110(5) Copyright Act 208
      B. Guides and reports 209
         1. The three-step test in US - Section 110(5) Copyright Act 209
            a. 'Do not conflict with the normal exploitation' 210
b. ‘Do not unreasonably prejudice the legitimate interests of the copyright holder’ 210

2. Interpretation of Article 17 of the Berne Convention in China – IP Rights 211

C. Model Provisions in China – IP Rights 211
   1. The explanatory observation as ‘context’ 212
   2. The explanatory observation as supplementary means 213

D. Evaluation 213

VI. The opinion of the WIPO Secretariat: US – Section 211 Appropriations Act 216

VII. General evaluation 217
   A. The nature and weight of WIPO’s input 218
   B. The future 220
      1. Incorporated regimes 222
      2. Non-incorporated regimes 222

VIII. Conclusions 225

8 The World Customs Organization 227
   I. Introduction 227
   II. The request for factual information 228
   III. Consideration of the WCO instruments 229
      A. The Harmonized System 230
      B. General Rules for Interpretation of the Harmonized System 231
      C. Decisions by the WCO HS Committee 233
      D. The HS Explanatory Notes 234
      E. The WCO Secretariat’s opinions and information 235
   IV. Evaluation 236
      A. The weight of the WCO instruments 237
      B. Some issues in the consideration of HS-related instruments 240
      C. The relevance of WCO dispute settlement 241
   V. Conclusions 243

9 The World Health Organization and the Codex Alimentarius Commission 245
   I. Introduction 245
   II. The role of science in the WTO 246
CONTENTS

A. The need for scientific experts  247
B. Complexity in dealing with scientific expertise  249
C. The discretion of the panels to appoint experts  250

III. WHO in *Thailand – Cigarettes*  251
A. The WHO resolution and recommendations  253
B. WHO economic data  254
C. Evaluation  255
   1. The disregard of WHO's expertise  256
   2. Future WTO–WHO interactions on tobacco control policies  257

IV. The Codex Alimentarius Commission in SPS disputes  259
A. *EC – Hormones*  260
   1. The provision of information and expert advice by the Codex  261
   2. The selection of scientific experts  263
B. *US/Canada – Continued Suspension*  265
   1. The inclusion of JECFA's affiliated experts  266
   2. The examination of the issue on appeal  267
C. Evaluation  268
   1. Consultation with the relevant international organizations  268
      a. The identification of experts  268
      b. The provision of information and expert advice  270
   2. The Codex and the 'objective assessment of the matter'  272
      a. *EC – Hormones*  273
      b. *US/Canada – Continued Suspension*  274
   3. The use of expert review groups  275

V. Conclusions  278

**Concluding summary**  280

I. The general constraints on institutional sensitivity  280

II. The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties as a framework for analysis  282

III. The study of specific international organizations and policy recommendations  285

IV. The contribution to the coherence debate  291

*Bibliography*  293

*Index*  316