THE RELEVANT MARKET IN INTERNATIONAL ECONOMIC LAW

A Comparative Antitrust and GATT Analysis

CHRISTIAN A. MELISCHEK
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments      page xiii
List of abbreviations xv
Table of cases       xvii
Table of legal texts xxvii

Introduction        1
I   The research question and scope of the study  1
II  Practical relevance of the research question  9
III Methodology and structure  11

1 Comparison of antitrust and international trade law 13
   I Emphasizing differences or commonalities?  13
   II Antitrust law  15
       1 Introduction  15
       2 Promotion of economic efficiency  17
       3 Promotion of consumer welfare  19
   III WTO/GATT law  21
       1 Introduction  22
       2 Promotion of economic efficiency  23
       3 Promotion of total welfare  25
   IV Congruence in efficiency and welfare standards  26

2 The role of market definition  29
   I Antitrust law  29
       1 Introduction  29
       2 Market definition as a statutory requirement  30
       3 Market definition as an analytical tool in antitrust analysis  34
           A Overview  34
           B Legal definition of market power  35
           C Economic definition of market power  36

vii
CONTENTS

(i) Direct measurement of market power 37
(ii) Indirect measurement of market power 38

II Article III of the GATT 40
1 Introduction 40
2 The non-discrimination obligation of national treatment 43
3 The legal framework of GATT national treatment 44
   A The structure of Article III of the GATT 44
      (i) Fiscal measures: Article III:2(1) and (2) of the GATT 45
      (ii) Regulatory measures: Article III:4 of the GATT 49
   B The scope of the national treatment principle 52
      (i) Beneficiaries 52
      (ii) Types of discriminatory treatment 53

III Conclusion 54

3 Analytical evolution from the traditional to the economic approach 57

I The traditional formalistic approach 57
1 Antitrust law 58
   A US antitrust law 58
   B EU antitrust law 63
2 Article III of the GATT 67
   A The traditional approach: the Border Tax Report 68
      (i) The Border Tax criteria 68
      (ii) Legal and de facto status 70
      (iii) The evolution of the traditional approach 72
         (a) Prominence of physical characteristics and tariff classifications 73
            (1) Physical characteristics 73
            (2) Tariff classifications 74
            (3) GATT 1947 jurisprudence 75
            (4) GATT 1994/WTO jurisprudence 77
         (b) End-uses 82
            (c) Consumers’ tastes and habits 84
   B Other non-economic approaches 88
      (i) The aims-and-effects test 88
      (ii) Process- and production-based methods 92

II The economic approach 94
1 Antitrust law 95
   A US antitrust law 95
   B EU antitrust law 97
2 Article III of the GATT 100
   A A market-based approach 100
CONTENTS

VIII Conclusion 184

5 The implementation of an economic approach: quantitative methods 185

I Introduction 185

II The law and economics of expert economic testimony 190

1 Institutional and procedural frameworks for expert testimony 191

2 Problems with party-proffered expert testimony 195

A Introductory remarks 195

B Asymmetric information and principal-agent conflict of interests 196

C Adversarial bias (partisanship) 198

D Conflicting expert testimony 199

E Validity of these concerns 200

3 Remedial options 201

A Introductory remarks 201

B Expert panelists 202

C Institutional support of panelists 204

(i) Economic expertise in the WTO Secretariat 204

(ii) Education and guidance of panelists 205

D Panel-appointed independent economic experts 206

E Evidentiary and procedural solutions 209

(i) Admissibility rules 210

(ii) Cross-examination 212

4 Analysis of the remedial options 213

A Evidentiary and procedural solutions 214

B Expert panelists, institutional support, and Panel-appointed experts 217

5 Conclusion 221

III Analysis of price elasticities of demand 223

1 The foundations of the analysis of price elasticities of demand 224

2 The theoretical role of elasticity estimates in antitrust law and Article III of the GATT 225

3 A conceptual framework for the use of cross-price elasticities under Article III of the GATT 230

A General observations 231

(i) The threshold issue 231

(ii) The relevant cross-price elasticity 233
(iii) Wholesale or retail level cross-price elasticity? 235
(iv) Cross-price elasticity in tension with sovereignty? 237

B Potential estimation problems under GATT 239
(i) Misleading price elasticities of demand 239
   (a) Elasticities and distorted competitive conditions 239
   (b) Elasticities and distorted customer perceptions 243
(ii) New products problem 247

C What can be learned from cross-price elasticities of demand for Article III purposes? 249

4 The foundations of the econometric estimation of price elasticities of demand 253
A Introduction 253
B The basics of regression analysis 255
   (i) Simple regression 255
   (ii) Multiple regression 260
   (iii) The estimation of demand elasticities using multiple regression 263
C Appraising multiple regression analysis 266
   (i) Standard errors, confidence intervals, statistical significance, and t-statistics 266
   (ii) “Goodness of fit” 270
D Statistical and economic significance 271

5 Econometrics in market definition case law 273
A The non-econometric and econometric estimation of price elasticities of demand 273
   (i) Descriptive approximations of elasticities 273
   (ii) Econometric estimations of elasticities 280
B Critical assessment of the econometric estimation of elasticities in Article III case law 289
   (i) Variables included in the regressions 290
   (ii) Data issues 293
   (iii) Interpretation of the relevant parameters 294
   (iv) Reliability of regression results 295
   (v) Transparency and accountability 299

6 Advantages and disadvantages of quantitative evidence 303
A Advantages of quantitative evidence 303
B Disadvantages of quantitative evidence 307
   (i) Difficulties in the appraisal of quantitative evidence 307
   (ii) Data requirements and the consequences 312
CONTENTS

(iii) Weight and cost of the proceedings 314
(iv) Eroding the ability to prove while increasing the ability to disprove 315
   (a) The high technical burden for establishing econometric evidence 315
   (1) General principles of the standard of proof 316
   (2) Standard of proof in antitrust and WTO law 318
   (3) Relationship between statistical significance and standard of proof 321
   (4) A law and economics perspective on the level of statistical significance and standard of proof 322
   (b) The imperfection of econometric evidence and its implications for the standard of proof 325
   (c) Establishing a level playing field in the case of econometric evidence 327

7 Conclusion 330

Conclusion 332

Bibliography 339

Index 364