

Freedom of Investment between EU and Non-EU Member States and its Impact on Corporate Income Tax Systems within the European Union

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan Tilburg University, op gezag van de rector magnificus, prof. dr. Ph. Eijlander, in het openbaar te verdedigen ten overstaan van een door het college voor promoties aangewezen commissie in de aula van de Universiteit op vrijdag 2 december 2011 om 14.15 uur door

DANIËL SEBASTIAAN SMIT

geboren op 9 januari 1976 te Rotterdam.

Contents

PREFACE	i
CONTENTS	iii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xxv
PART ONE	1
METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK AND BENCHMARK	
CHAPTER I: SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	3
1 Research question, scope of the study and acknowledgments	3
1.1 Introduction	3
1.2 The research question	9
1.3 Scope of the study and acknowledgments	16
1.4 The selected corporate income tax measures	19
1.4.1 <i>Limitation on the deduction of interest expenses paid on inter-company or third-party loans</i>	20
1.4.2 <i>Withholding taxes on dividend, interest and royalty payments</i>	22
1.4.3 <i>Measures providing for relief for double taxation of income received from foreign investments</i>	23
1.4.4 <i>CFC legislation</i>	24
1.4.5 <i>Measures denying the deduction of foreign losses from the domestic taxable base</i>	25

1.4.6	<i>Corporate income taxation of realized or deemed capital gains upon the transnational transfer of business assets</i>	26
1.5	Methodology	27
1.6	Structure	29
 CHAPTER II: THE BENCHMARK OF INTERNATIONAL TAX NEUTRALITY AND THE REQUIREMENT OF A GENUINE ECONOMIC LINK UNDER FREEDOM OF INVESTMENT: DEFINITION AND RELATIONSHIP		35
1	Introduction	35
2	Freedom of investment: the concepts of admission, establishment, capital and (financial) services under the Treaty	36
2.1	International economic integration and its relationship to liberalization of international investment	36
2.2	International economic integration and the European Union	39
2.3	Freedom of investment: concepts of admission, establishment, capital and (financial) services under the Treaty	41
2.3.1	<i>Introduction</i>	41
2.3.2	<i>The different approaches to the concept of foreign investment under economic integration investment agreements</i>	41
2.3.3	<i>Concept of admission: general considerations</i>	43
2.3.4	<i>Concept of establishment: general considerations</i>	43
2.3.5	<i>Concept of establishment under the Treaty</i>	44
2.3.5.1	<i>Actual pursuit of an economic activity</i>	46
2.3.5.2	<i>Fixed establishment</i>	50
2.3.5.3	<i>The benchmark of “definite influence”</i>	53
2.3.5.4	<i>Synthesis</i>	57
2.3.6	<i>Concept of capital: general considerations</i>	58
2.3.7	<i>Concept of capital under the Treaty</i>	63
2.3.7.1	<i>Concept of direct investment under the Treaty</i>	67
2.3.7.2	<i>Concept of portfolio investment under the Treaty</i>	71
2.3.7.3	<i>Does the free movement of capital involve the pursuit of an economic activity?</i>	73
2.3.8	<i>Concept of (financial) services: general considerations</i>	75
2.3.9	<i>Concept of (financial) services under the Treaty</i>	76
2.4	Synthesis: genuine economic link as the fundamental prerequisite under EU freedom of investment	78
3	The benchmark of international tax neutrality	80
3.1	The influence of corporate income taxation on international investment	80

3.2	Four major causes of international tax distortions	82
3.3	The benchmark of international tax neutrality	85
3.3.1	<i>Introduction</i>	85
3.3.2	<i>Capital export neutrality</i>	85
3.3.3	<i>Capital import neutrality</i>	87
3.3.4	<i>Capital ownership neutrality</i>	88
3.3.5	<i>International tax neutrality as a requirement of equal tax treatment</i>	89
3.3.6	<i>Inter-nations neutrality</i>	90
3.3.7	<i>Evaluation</i>	92
3.4	The relationship between the “genuine economic link” and the benchmark of international tax neutrality	98
3.5	Operation of the benchmark of international tax neutrality in the field of corporate income taxation	100
3.6	Equity considerations	102
4	Conclusions	104

PART TWO **107**

THE INTRA-UNION CONTEXT: SKETCHING THE RELEVANT DEGREE OF LEGAL INTEGRATION BETWEEN MEMBER STATES IN THE FIELD OF CORPORATE INCOME TAXATION

CHAPTER III: THE NOTION OF “THIRD COUNTRIES” UNDER FREEDOM OF INVESTMENT	109
1 Introduction	109
2 The personal and territorial scope of the freedom of establishment, the free movement of capital and the free movement of services	113
2.1 Geographical application of the Treaty	113
2.2 Personal scope of the freedom of establishment, the free movement of capital and the free movement of services	115
2.3 Territorial scope of the freedom of establishment, the free movement of capital and the free movement of services	117
2.4 Questions to be examined further	119
3 The position of the Member States’ associated and dependent territories under the freedom of establishment, the free movement of capital and the free movement of services in the field of corporate income taxation	120
3.1 Introduction	120
3.2 Classification of the Member States’ associated and dependent territories under the Treaty	121

3.3	The relevant ECJ case law on Member States' associated and dependent territories: (parts of a) Member State, third countries or "second countries"?	126
3.4	The approach followed by the Netherlands Supreme Court and opinions in the academic literature	132
3.5	Synthesis and evaluation	137
4	Conclusions and practical implications	142
 CHAPTER IV: RELEVANT POSITIVE INTEGRATION BETWEEN MEMBER STATES AND BETWEEN MEMBER STATES AND THIRD COUNTRIES		147
1	Introduction	147
2	Relevant degree of positive legal integration under EU law between Member States in the field of corporate income taxation	150
2.1	Introduction	150
2.2	The Parent-Subsidiary Directive	151
2.2.1	<i>Withholding taxes on dividend payments</i>	153
2.2.2	<i>Limitation on the deduction of interest expenses</i>	154
2.2.3	<i>Measures providing for relief for double taxation</i>	154
2.2.4	<i>CFC legislation</i>	156
2.2.5	<i>Corporate income taxation of realized or deemed capital gains upon the transnational transfer of business assets</i>	156
2.2.6	<i>The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories under the Parent-Subsidiary Directive</i>	157
2.3	The Interest & Royalty Directive	163
2.3.1	<i>Withholding taxes under the Interest & Royalty Directive</i>	164
2.3.2	<i>Limitation on the deduction of interest expenses</i>	165
2.3.3	<i>Measures providing for relief for double taxation</i>	166
2.3.4	<i>The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories under the Interest & Royalty Directive</i>	166
2.4	The Merger Directive	166
2.4.1	<i>Corporate income taxation of realized or deemed capital gains upon the transnational transfer of business assets</i>	167
2.4.2	<i>The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories under the Merger Directive</i>	168
2.5	The Mutual Assistance Directive	169
2.5.1	<i>The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories under the Mutual Assistance Directive</i>	172
2.6	The Recovery Directive	175

2.6.1	<i>The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories under the Recovery Directive</i>	176
2.7	The Arbitration Convention	177
2.7.1	<i>Measures providing for relief for double taxation and corporate income taxation of realized or deemed capital gains upon the transnational transfer of business assets</i>	177
2.7.2	<i>The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories under the Arbitration Convention</i>	179
2.8	The Code of Conduct for Business Taxation	181
2.8.1	<i>The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories under the Code of Conduct for Business Taxation</i>	184
2.9	Synthesis	184
3	Relevant degree of positive legal integration under EU law between Member States and third countries in the field of corporate income taxation	185
3.1	Introduction	185
3.2	Agreement between the Community and Switzerland providing for measures equivalent to those laid down in the Savings Directive (and the Parent-Subsidiary and Interest & Royalty Directives)	186
3.2.1	<i>Withholding taxes under the Agreement</i>	186
3.3	Mutual Assistance Directive	187
3.4	Code of Conduct for Business Taxation and the promotion of good governance in tax matters	188
4	Relevant degree of positive legal integration under international tax law in the relations between the Member States and between Member States and third countries	190
4.1	Introduction	190
4.2	Double tax treaties	190
4.2.1	<i>Limitation on the deduction of interest expenses</i>	191
4.2.2	<i>Withholding taxes under tax treaties</i>	191
4.2.3	<i>Measures providing for relief for double taxation</i>	192
4.2.4	<i>CFC legislation</i>	193
4.2.5	<i>Measures denying the deduction of foreign losses from the domestic taxable base</i>	193
4.2.6	<i>Corporate income taxation of realized or deemed capital gains upon the transnational transfer of business assets</i>	194
4.3	Combating harmful tax competition and tax havens: the OECD Report on Harmful Tax Competition and the tax standard on transparency and exchange of information	195
4.4	Convention on Mutual Administrative Assistance in Tax Matters	198

4.5	Exchange of information and mutual assistance in the recovery of tax claims on the basis of tax treaties	200
4.6	Tax Information Exchange Agreements	201
4.7	Synthesis	202
5	Conclusions	205
 CHAPTER V: RELEVANT NEGATIVE INTEGRATION BETWEEN MEMBER STATES		207
1	Introduction	207
2	Relevant degree of negative legal integration under EU law between Member States in the field of corporate income taxation	208
2.1	The impact of the prohibition of state aid in the field of corporate income taxation	208
2.2	The impact of the Treaty freedoms in the field of corporate income taxation	214
2.3	The doctrine of direct effect and the primacy of the Treaty freedoms	214
2.4	The question of access to the Treaty freedoms in the field of corporate income taxation	215
2.4.1	<i>Introduction</i>	215
2.4.2	<i>Access to the Treaty freedoms in the case of tax evasion or tax avoidance</i>	216
2.4.3	<i>The link between corporate income tax measures and the Treaty freedoms: the principle of causality</i>	218
2.5	The concept of restrictions under the Treaty freedoms in the field of corporate income taxation	227
2.5.1	<i>Introduction</i>	227
2.5.2	<i>Discrimination under the Treaty freedoms</i>	229
2.5.2.1	<i>Comparability</i>	236
2.5.3	<i>Most-favoured-nation treatment under the Treaty freedoms</i>	243
2.5.4	<i>Non-discriminatory restrictions under the Treaty freedoms</i>	246
2.6	The concept of justification grounds under the Treaty freedoms in the field of corporate income taxation	252
2.6.1	<i>Introduction</i>	252
2.6.2	<i>Impact of the written justification grounds on restrictive corporate income tax measures</i>	252
2.6.3	<i>Impact of unwritten justification grounds on restrictive corporate income tax measures</i>	256
2.6.3.1	<i>Introduction</i>	256
2.6.3.2	<i>Territoriality</i>	257
2.6.3.3	<i>Fiscal coherence</i>	260

2.6.3.4	<i>The need to combat tax avoidance</i>	263
2.6.3.5	<i>The need for effective fiscal supervision</i>	268
2.6.3.6	<i>The need for effective collection of tax</i>	270
2.6.3.7	<i>The need to safeguard the (balanced) allocation of taxation powers</i>	272
2.6.3.8	<i>Promotion of (national) research and development and competitiveness</i>	276
2.6.3.9	<i>Lack of compensatory taxation and counteracting harmful tax competition</i>	276
2.6.3.10	<i>Lack of and presence of harmonization</i>	281
2.6.3.11	<i>Lack of reciprocity</i>	283
2.6.3.12	<i>Loss of income</i>	284
2.6.3.13	<i>Administrative difficulties</i>	284
2.7	Synthesis: practical impact of the Treaty freedoms on the central six corporate income tax themes	285
2.7.1	<i>Limitation on the deduction of interest expenses paid on inter-company or third-party loans</i>	285
2.7.2	<i>Withholding taxes on dividend, interest and royalty payments</i>	291
2.7.3	<i>Measures providing for relief for double taxation of income received from foreign investments</i>	296
2.7.4	<i>CFC legislation</i>	303
2.7.5	<i>Measures denying the deduction of foreign losses from the domestic taxable base</i>	305
2.7.6	<i>Corporate income taxation of realized or unrealized capital gains upon the transnational transfer of business assets</i>	308
3	Negative legal integration under international tax law between Member States and between Member States and third countries in the field of corporate income taxation	317
3.1	Introduction	317
3.2	Double tax treaties	319
3.2.1	<i>Introduction</i>	319
3.2.2	<i>Article 24(1) OECD MC: Discrimination based on nationality</i>	319
3.2.3	<i>Article 24(3) OECD MC: Discrimination based on the place of residence in the case of a permanent establishment</i>	320
3.2.4	<i>Article 24(4) OECD MC: Discrimination based on the place of residence of the recipient of payments</i>	322
3.2.5	<i>Article 24(5) OECD MC: Discrimination based on the place of residence of the shareholder of a domestic company</i>	322
3.3	OECD Code of Liberalisation of Capital Movements	324
3.3.1	<i>Effect on corporate income taxation</i>	326
3.4	OECD Declaration and Decisions on International Investment and Multinational Enterprises	327

3.4.1	<i>Effect on corporate income taxation</i>	328
3.5	General Agreement on Trade in Services	329
3.5.1	<i>Effect on corporate income taxation</i>	330
3.6	Bilateral investment treaties	331
3.6.1	<i>Effect on corporate income taxation</i>	333
3.7	Synthesis	334
4	Conclusions and summary	336

PART THREE **341**
THE THIRD-COUNTRY CONTEXT: THE IMPACT OF FREEDOM OF INVESTMENT BETWEEN THE MEMBER STATES AND THIRD COUNTRIES IN THE FIELD OF CORPORATE INCOME TAXATION

CHAPTER VI: FREEDOM OF INVESTMENT BETWEEN THE MEMBER STATES AND THIRD COUNTRIES: ACCESS **343**

1	Introduction	343
2	Categorization of economic integration agreements between the Union and third countries	345
2.1	Agreement on the European Economic Area	345
2.1.1	<i>Primacy and direct effect of the EEA Agreement</i>	346
2.1.2	<i>Interpretation of the EEA Agreement</i>	347
2.2	Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements	349
2.2.1	<i>Europe Agreements</i>	350
2.2.2	<i>Stabilisation and Association Agreements</i>	352
2.2.3	<i>Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	353
2.2.4	<i>Euro-Mediterranean Association Agreements</i>	355
2.2.5	<i>Partnership Agreement with the African, Caribbean and Pacific group of states (Cotonou Agreement)</i>	357
2.2.6	<i>Association Agreements with other third countries or groups of third countries</i>	359
2.2.7	<i>Cooperation Agreements with third countries or groups of countries</i>	361
2.2.8	<i>Other third countries</i>	362
2.2.9	<i>Primacy and direct effect of the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	362
2.2.10	<i>Interpretation of the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	367
2.3	Agreement between the Community and Switzerland on the free movement of persons	369
2.3.1	<i>Primacy and direct effect of the Agreement</i>	370
2.3.2	<i>Interpretation of the Agreement</i>	370
2.4	The Member States' associated and dependent territories	371

3	The impact of the freedom of establishment on Member States' corporate income tax systems in situations involving third-country investments	373
3.1	Introduction	373
3.2	The freedom of establishment under Articles 49 and 54 TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation	374
3.2.1	<i>Access and interpretation in situations involving third-country investments</i>	374
3.3	National treatment requirement under Article 55 TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation	375
3.3.1	<i>Access and interpretation in situations involving third-country investments</i>	375
3.4	Freedom of establishment under Article 31-EEA Agreement in the field of corporate income taxation	377
3.4.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	377
3.4.2	<i>Relationship with Article 124 EEA Agreement in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	378
3.5	The freedom of establishment under Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements in the field of corporate income taxation	378
3.5.1	<i>Introduction</i>	378
3.5.2	<i>Europe Agreements</i>	379
3.5.2.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	379
3.5.3	<i>Stabilisation and Association Agreements</i>	383
3.5.3.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	383
3.5.4	<i>Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	384
3.5.4.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	384
3.5.5	<i>Euro-Mediterranean Association Agreements</i>	385
3.5.5.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	385
3.5.6	<i>Cotonou Agreement</i>	387
3.5.6.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	387
3.5.7	<i>Association Agreements concluded with other third countries or groups of third countries</i>	389
3.5.7.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	389
3.5.8	<i>Cooperation Agreements concluded with other third countries or groups of third countries</i>	391
3.5.8.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	391
3.5.9	<i>Direct effect of the freedom of establishment under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	392
3.5.10	<i>Conclusions</i>	394
3.6	Agreement between the Community and Switzerland on the free movement of persons	395
3.6.1	<i>Access to the freedom of establishment and interpretation; establishment by companies not governed</i>	395

3.7	The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories	396
3.7.1	<i>Access to and interpretation of the freedom of establishment under Article 49 TFEU</i>	396
3.7.2	<i>Access to and interpretation of the freedom of establishment under Article 199 TFEU and Article 45(2)(a) of the OCT Decision 2001</i>	397
4	The impact of the free movement of capital on Member States' corporate income tax systems in situations involving third-country investments	399
4.1	Introduction	399
4.2	The free movement of capital under Article 63(1) TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation	400
4.2.1	<i>Background of the liberalization erga omnes under Article 63(1) TFEU</i>	400
4.2.2	<i>Access and interpretation in situations involving third-country investment in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	403
4.2.3	<i>Direct effect of the free movement of capital under Article 63(1) TFEU</i>	406
4.3	The free movement of capital under Article 40 EEA Agreement in the field of corporate income taxation	408
4.3.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	408
4.4	The free movement of capital under Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements in the field of corporate income taxation	410
4.4.1	<i>Introduction</i>	410
4.4.2	<i>Europe Agreements</i>	410
4.4.2.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	410
4.4.2.1.1	<i>Transactions on the capital account of balance of payments</i>	413
4.4.2.1.2	<i>Impact on corporate income taxation</i>	415
4.4.3	<i>Stabilisation and Association Agreements</i>	419
4.4.3.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	419
4.4.4	<i>Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	421
4.4.4.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	421
4.4.5	<i>Euro-Mediterranean Association Agreements</i>	422
4.4.5.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	422
4.4.6	<i>Cotonou Agreement</i>	423
4.4.6.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	423
4.4.7	<i>Association Agreements concluded with other third countries or groups of third countries</i>	424
4.4.7.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	424
4.4.8	<i>Cooperation Agreements with third countries or groups of third countries</i>	425
4.4.8.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	425
4.4.9	<i>Direct effect of the free movement of capital under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	425

4.4.10	<i>Conclusion</i>	426
4.5	Agreement between the Community and Switzerland on the free movement of persons	428
4.6	The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories	428
4.6.1	<i>Access to and interpretation of the free movement of capital under Article 63(1) TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	428
4.6.2	<i>Access and interpretation of the free movement of capital under Article 47(1) (b) of the OCT Decision 2001 in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	429
5	The impact of the free movement of services on Member States' corporate income tax systems in situations involving third-country investments	430
5.1	Introduction	430
5.2	The free movement of services under Article 56 TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation	431
5.2.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	431
5.3	The free movement of services under Article 36 EEA Agreement in the field of corporate income taxation	432
5.3.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	432
5.4	The free movement of services under Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements in the field of corporate income taxation	433
5.4.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	433
5.5	Agreement between the Community and Switzerland on the free movement of persons	438
5.5.1	<i>Access and interpretation</i>	438
5.6	The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories	441
5.6.1	<i>Access and interpretation of the free movement of services under Article 44 of the OCT Decision 2001</i>	441
6	The significance of the free movement of payments on Member States' corporate income tax systems in situations involving third-country investments	442
6.1	Introduction	442
6.2	The free movement of payments under Article 63(2) TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation	442
6.2.1	<i>Definition and purport of the free movement of payments</i>	442
6.2.2	<i>An autonomous, fifth freedom or annexed to and conditional upon the other Treaty freedoms?</i>	445
6.2.3	<i>Relationship to the free movement of capital under Article 63(1) TFEU</i>	447
6.2.4	<i>Impact of the free movement of payments in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	448
6.3	The free movement of payments under the EEA Agreement and the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements in the field of corporate income taxation	451

6.4	The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories	451
7	The autonomous impact of the general principle of non-discrimination on Member States' corporate income tax systems in situations involving third-country investments	452
7.1	Introduction	452
7.2	The general non-discrimination clause under Article 18 TFEU	453
	7.2.1 <i>Access and interpretation</i>	453
7.3	The general non-discrimination clause under Article 4 EEA Agreement	455
	7.3.1 <i>Access and interpretation</i>	455
7.4	The general non-discrimination clause under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements	456
	7.4.1 <i>Access and interpretation</i>	456
7.5	The non-discrimination clause under the Agreement between the Community and Switzerland on the free movement of persons	457
	7.5.1 <i>Access and interpretation</i>	457
7.6	The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories	458
	7.6.1 <i>Access and interpretation of the general non-discrimination clause under the OCT Decision 2001</i>	458
	7.6.2 <i>The non-discrimination clause under Article 4 of Protocol No 3 vis-à-vis the Channel Islands and the Isle of Man</i>	460
8	Concurrence of the fundamental freedoms under EU law in the field of corporate income taxation in situations involving third-country investments	461
8.1	Introduction	461
8.2	Concurrence of free movement of capital and freedom of establishment under the Treaty in the field of corporate income taxation	463
	8.2.1 <i>Is the substantive scope of the freedom of establishment restricted by the free movement of capital or vice versa?</i>	463
	8.2.2 <i>Is the substantive scope of the freedom of establishment or the free movement of capital restricted by means of the collision rules under Article 49 and Article 65(2) TFEU?</i>	464
	8.2.3 <i>Is the territorial or personal scope of the free movement of capital restricted by the provisions on the freedom of establishment?</i>	469
	8.2.4 <i>Provisional conclusion and synthesis: a question of causality</i>	470
	8.2.5 <i>Approach followed by the ECJ; The benchmark of "definite influence"</i>	474
	8.2.5.1 <i>Introduction</i>	474
	8.2.5.2 <i>Exclusivity of the freedom of establishment where the contested corporate income tax measure is targeted only at investments involving definite influence</i>	476
	8.2.5.3 <i>Exclusivity of the free movement of capital where the contested tax measure is targeted only at capital transactions</i>	479

8.2.5.4	<i>Exclusivity of the free movement of capital where the contested corporate income tax measure is of a generic nature and affects, as a factual matter, investments which do not involve definite influence?</i>	481
8.2.5.5	<i>Exclusivity of the freedom of establishment where the contested corporate income tax measure is of a generic nature and affects, as a factual matter, investments involving definite influence</i>	482
8.2.5.6	<i>Exclusivity of the freedom of establishment where the contested corporate income tax measure affects both investments involving definite influence and capital transactions?</i>	491
8.2.6	<i>Synthesis and evaluation</i>	493
8.3	Concurrence between the freedom of establishment and the free movement of capital under the EEA Agreement, the APC Agreements and the OCT Decision 2001 in the field of corporate income taxation	498
8.4	Concurrence between the free movement of capital and free movement of services under the Treaty in the field of corporate income taxation	500
8.4.1	<i>Is the substantive scope of the free movement of capital per se restricted by the free movement of services or vice versa?</i>	500
8.4.2	<i>Is the substantive scope of the free movement of capital or free movement of services restricted by means of a specific collision rule?</i>	504
8.4.3	<i>Is the territorial or personal scope of the free movement of capital restricted by the provisions on the freedom of services or vice versa?</i>	506
8.4.4	<i>Provisional conclusion and synthesis: a question of causality</i>	507
8.4.5	<i>Approach followed by the ECJ: causality</i>	509
8.4.6	<i>Synthesis and evaluation</i>	513
8.4.7	<i>Concurrence between the free movement of capital and the free movement of services under the EEA Agreement, the APC Agreements, the Agreement between the Community and Switzerland on the free movement of persons and the OCT Decision 2001 in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	514
8.5	Relation between the freedom of establishment and the free movement of services under the Treaty in the field of corporate income taxation	514
8.5.1	<i>Is the substantive scope of the free movement of services per se restricted by the freedom of establishment or vice versa?</i>	514
8.5.2	<i>Is the substantive scope of the free movement of services or the freedom of establishment restricted by means of a specific collision rule?</i>	515
8.5.3	<i>Provisional conclusion and synthesis: a question of causality</i>	515
8.5.4	<i>Approach followed by the ECJ</i>	517
8.5.4.1	<i>Exclusivity of the freedom of establishment where the contested corporate income tax measure is targeted only at investments involving definite influence</i>	517
8.5.4.2	<i>Exclusivity of the freedom of establishment where the contested corporate income tax measure affects both investments involving definite influence and the provision of services?</i>	517

8.5.5	<i>Synthesis and evaluation</i>	518
8.5.6	<i>Concurrence between the free movement of capital and the free movement of services under the EEA Agreement, the APC Agreements, the Agreement between the Community and Switzerland on the free movement of persons and the OCT Decision 2001 in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	519
8.6	Concurrence between different or comparable free movement provisions included in the Treaty on the one hand and another Agreement or international arrangement on the other	519
9	Conclusions	521
CHAPTER VII: FREEDOM OF INVESTMENT BETWEEN THE MEMBER STATES AND THIRD COUNTRIES: DISCRIMINATION AND JUSTIFICATION GROUNDS		525
1	Introduction	525
2	Restriction of the free movement of capital under Article 63(1) TFEU in situations involving third-country investments	527
2.1	Interpretation of the concept of discrimination under Article 63(1) TFEU in situations involving third-country investments	527
2.1.1	<i>Comparability in situations involving third-country investments</i>	530
2.1.2	<i>Most-favoured-nation treatment in situations involving third-country investments</i>	535
2.2	Non-discriminatory restrictions under Article 63(1) TFEU in situations involving third-country investments	538
2.3	Conclusion	539
3	Restriction of the free movement provisions under the EEA Agreement in situations involving third-country investments	540
4	Restriction of the free movement provisions under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements in situations involving third-country investments	541
4.1	Introduction	541
4.2	Discrimination under the freedom of establishment under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements in the field of corporate income taxation	541
4.2.1	<i>Europe Agreements</i>	541
4.2.1.1	<i>National treatment in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	542
4.2.1.1.1	<i>Differential treatment of a resident corporate taxpayer based on the place of residence of its shareholder(s)</i>	544
4.2.1.1.2	<i>Differential treatment based on the place of residence of the corporate taxpayer</i>	547

4.2.1.1.3	<i>Differential treatment based on the place where the corporate taxpayer's capital is invested</i>	548
4.2.1.2	<i>Comparability</i>	553
4.2.1.3	<i>Most-favoured-nation treatment under the freedom of establishment in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	553
4.2.2	<i>Stabilisation and Association Agreements</i>	556
4.2.3	<i>Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	556
4.2.4	<i>Euro-Mediterranean Association Agreements</i>	558
4.2.5	<i>Cotonou Agreement</i>	560
4.2.6	<i>Association Agreements concluded with other third countries or groups of third countries</i>	562
4.2.7	<i>Conclusion</i>	564
4.3	Discrimination under the free movement of capital under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements in the field of corporate income taxation	566
4.4	Discrimination under the free movement of services under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements in the field of corporate income taxation	569
4.5	The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories	572
4.5.1	<i>Discrimination under the freedom of establishment under Article 49 TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	572
4.5.2	<i>The freedom of establishment under the OCT Decision 2001</i>	572
4.5.3	<i>Discrimination under the free movement of capital under Article 63 TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	573
4.5.4	<i>The free movement of capital under the Overseas Countries and Territories under the OCT Decision 2001</i>	574
4.5.5	<i>Interpretation of the concept of discrimination under the free movement of services under Article 56 TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	575
4.5.6	<i>The non-discrimination clause under Article 4 of Protocol No 3 vis-à-vis the Channel Islands and the Isle of Man</i>	576
5	Justifications under freedom of investment in the field of corporate income taxation	577
5.1	Introduction	577
5.2	Concept of justifications under the free movement of capital under Article 63(1) TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation	578
5.2.1	<i>The tax carve-out under Article 65(1)(a) and Article 65(3) TFEU and the significance of Declaration No. 7</i>	578
5.2.2	<i>The impact of the "rule of reason" under Article 63(1) TFEU in situations involving third countries in the field of corporate income taxation</i>	581
5.2.2.1	<i>Territoriality</i>	581
5.2.2.2	<i>Fiscal coherence</i>	584

5.2.2.3	<i>The need to combat tax avoidance</i>	586
5.2.2.4	<i>The need for effective fiscal supervision</i>	587
5.2.2.5	<i>The need for effective collection of tax</i>	597
5.2.2.6	<i>The need to safeguard the (balanced) allocation of taxation powers</i>	598
5.2.2.7	<i>Promotion of research and development</i>	602
5.2.2.8	<i>Lack of compensatory taxation</i>	603
5.2.2.9	<i>The need to counteract harmful tax competition</i>	606
5.2.2.10	<i>Lack of and existence of harmonization</i>	609
5.2.2.11	<i>Lack of reciprocity</i>	614
5.2.2.12	<i>Loss of income</i>	617
5.2.2.13	<i>Administrative difficulties</i>	620
5.3	Justifications under the free movement provisions included in the EEA Agreement in the field of corporate income taxation	621
5.4	Justifications under the free movement provisions included in the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements in the field of corporate income taxation	622
5.5	The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories	626
5.6	Practical impact of freedom of investment under EU law on the central six corporate income tax themes in situations involving third-country investments	627
5.6.1	<i>Introduction</i>	627
5.6.2	<i>Limitation on the deduction of interest expenses paid on inter-company or third party loans</i>	629
5.6.3	<i>Withholding taxes on dividend, interest and royalty payments</i>	633
5.6.4	<i>Measures providing for relief for double taxation of income received from foreign investments</i>	637
5.6.5	<i>CFC legislation</i>	642
5.6.6	<i>Measures denying the deduction of foreign losses from the domestic taxable base</i>	646
5.6.7	<i>Corporate income taxation of realized or deemed capital gains upon the transnational transfer of business assets</i>	650
5.7	Consequences of the incompatibility of a restrictive corporate income tax measure with EU law in situations involving third-country investments	654
5.8	Limitations on the temporal effects of the ECJ's case law in situations involving third-country investments	658
6	Conclusions	662

CHAPTER VIII: FREEDOM OF INVESTMENT BETWEEN THE MEMBER STATES AND THIRD COUNTRIES: THE TEMPORAL SCOPE	665
1 Introduction	665
2 Standstill clauses and the free movement of capital	667
2.1 The impact of the standstill clause under Article 64(1) TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation	667
2.1.1 <i>Background and purpose of the standstill provision under Article 64(1) TFEU</i>	668
2.1.2 <i>The concept of “restriction” under Article 64(1) TFEU</i>	672
2.1.3 <i>Categories of capital movement governed by the standstill clause under Article 64(1) TFEU</i>	675
2.1.4 <i>Causality between the restrictive company tax measure and the capital movements covered</i>	675
2.1.5 <i>To which extent does Article 64(1) TFEU cover both inward and outward investments?</i>	679
2.1.6 <i>Posterior amendments in national company tax legislation</i>	682
2.1.7 <i>The adoption of secondary EU law after 31 December 1993</i>	689
2.1.8 <i>Article 64(1) TFEU is not concerned with restrictions on the personal scope of the free movement of capital</i>	691
2.1.9 <i>Relationship with the free movement of payments</i>	691
2.1.10 <i>Relationship with the repealed grandfather clause under Article 73e EC (old)</i>	693
2.1.11 <i>Consequences of incompatibility with the standstill clause under Article 64(1) TFEU</i>	693
2.1.12 <i>Synthesis and conclusions</i>	694
2.2 No general standstill clause relating to the free movement of capital under the EEA Agreement	696
2.3 Standstill clauses and the free movement of capital under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements and their impact in the field of corporate income taxation	697
2.3.1 <i>Introduction</i>	697
2.3.2 <i>Europe Agreements</i>	697
2.3.3 <i>Stabilisation and Association Agreements</i>	701
2.3.4 <i>Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	701
2.3.5 <i>Euro-Mediterranean Association Agreements</i>	702
2.3.6 <i>Cotonou Agreement, Association Agreements concluded with other third countries or groups of third countries and Cooperation Agreements with third countries or groups of third countries</i>	703
2.3.7 <i>Conclusion</i>	704
2.4 The position of the Member States’ associated and dependent territories	704

3	Standstill clauses and the freedom of establishment	705
3.1	No general standstill clause relating to the freedom of establishment under the Treaty	705
3.2	No general standstill clause relating to the freedom of establishment under the EEA Agreement	705
3.3	Standstill clauses and the freedom of establishment under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements	706
3.3.1	<i>Introduction</i>	706
3.3.2	<i>Europe Agreements</i>	706
3.3.3	<i>Stabilisation and Association Agreements</i>	706
3.3.4	<i>Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	709
3.3.5	<i>Euro-Mediterranean Association Agreements</i>	709
3.3.6	<i>Cotonou Agreement, Association Agreements concluded with other third countries or regions and Cooperation Agreements with third countries or groups of third countries</i>	710
3.3.7	<i>Conclusion</i>	712
3.4	The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories	713
4	Standstill clauses and the free movement of services	714
4.1	No general standstill clause relating to the free movement of services under the Treaty	714
4.2	No general standstill clause relating to the free movement of services under the EEA Agreement	714
4.3	Standstill clauses and the freedom of establishment under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements	714
4.3.1	<i>Europe Agreements</i>	714
4.3.2	<i>Stabilisation and Association Agreements</i>	717
4.3.3	<i>Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	717
4.3.4	<i>Euro-Mediterranean Association Agreements</i>	718
4.3.5	<i>Cotonou Agreement, Association Agreements concluded with other third countries or regions and Cooperation Agreements with third countries or groups of third countries</i>	718
4.3.6	<i>Conclusion</i>	719
4.4	The position of the Member States' associated and dependent territories	719
5	Collision between a liberalization requirement and a standstill clause included in different Treaties: which one prevails?	720
6	The significance of the new procedure of approval under Article 65(4) TFEU in the field of corporate income taxation: a (slight?) shift of competence from the ECJ back to the Member States	721
7	Temporal transition issues relating to the accession of the twelve new EU Member States	726
7.1	Introduction	726

7.2	Scope <i>ratione temporis</i> of the Treaty freedoms upon accession	727
7.3	Scope <i>ratione temporis</i> of the Treaty state aid rules upon accession	732
7.4	Scope <i>ratione temporis</i> of secondary EU law in the field of corporate income taxation upon accession	733
7.4.1	<i>Parent-Subsidiary Directive</i>	733
7.4.2	<i>Interest & Royalty Directive</i>	737
7.4.3	<i>Merger Directive</i>	740
7.4.4	<i>Mutual Assistance Directive and Recovery Directive</i>	741
7.4.5	<i>Arbitration Convention</i>	742
7.4.6	<i>Code of Conduct for Business Taxation</i>	744
7.5	Conclusions	744
8	Conclusions	746

PART FOUR **749**

THE "MIXED" CONTEXT: THE IMPACT OF FREEDOM OF INVESTMENT ON INDIRECTLY HELD THIRD-COUNTRY INVESTMENTS IN THE FIELD OF CORPORATE INCOME TAXATION

CHAPTER IX: THE IMPACT OF FREEDOM OF INVESTMENT ON INDIRECTLY HELD THIRD-COUNTRY INVESTMENTS IN THE FIELD OF CORPORATE INCOME TAXATION **751**

1	Introduction	751
2	Indirect third-country investments under the Treaty freedoms	754
2.1	Indirectly held inward third-country investments	754
2.1.1	<i>Access and discrimination</i>	754
2.1.1.1	<i>The position of the intermediate company EUCo1 in Member State B as the state of source</i>	755
2.1.1.2	<i>The position of company EUCo2 in Member State B as the state of source</i>	759
2.1.1.3	<i>The position of the intermediate company EUCo1 in Member State A</i>	762
2.1.2	<i>Justification grounds</i>	762
2.2	Indirectly held outward third-country investments	764
2.2.1	<i>Access and discrimination</i>	764
2.2.2	<i>Justification grounds</i>	767
2.3	Outward dual resident companies	768
2.3.1	<i>Access and discrimination</i>	768
2.3.2	<i>Justification grounds</i>	772
2.4	Inward dual resident companies	772

2.5	Commonly held inward third-country investments	774
2.6	Conclusions	776
3	Indirect third-country investments under the Parent-Subsidiary Directive	777
3.1	Indirectly held inward third-country investments	777
3.2	Indirectly held outward third-country investments	784
3.3	Dual resident companies involving third countries	787
3.3.1	<i>Outward dual resident companies</i>	787
3.3.2	<i>Inward dual resident companies</i>	789
3.4	Conclusion	790
4	Indirect third-country investments under the Interest & Royalty Directive	791
4.1	Indirectly held inward third-country investments	791
4.2	Dual resident companies involving third countries	797
4.2.1	<i>Outward dual resident companies</i>	797
4.2.2	<i>Inward dual resident companies</i>	798
4.3	Commonly held inward third-country investments	798
4.4	Conclusion	799
5	Indirect third-country investments under the Merger Directive	801
5.1	Indirectly held third-country investments	801
5.2	Dual resident companies involving third countries	802
6	Indirect third-country investments under the Arbitration Convention	803
6.1	Indirectly held inward third-country investments	803
6.2	Dual resident companies involving third countries	804
6.2.1	<i>Outward dual resident companies</i>	804
6.2.2	<i>Inward dual resident companies</i>	805
7	Code of Conduct for Business Taxation	805
8	Conclusions	806

PART FIVE **809**
**RECOMMENDATIONS FOR LEGISLATIVE ACTION, SUMMARY
AND CONCLUSIONS**

CHAPTER X: RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CONCERTED **811**
LEGISLATIVE ACTION TOWARDS THIRD COUNTRIES IN THE
FIELD OF CORPORATE INCOME TAXATION

1	Introduction	811
2	Is the Union competent to adopt unification measures involving corporate taxation of income derived from third-country investments?	812
2.1	The principle of conferral and the principles of subsidiarity and proportionality	812

2.1.1	<i>The principle of conferral</i>	812
2.1.2	<i>The principles of subsidiarity and proportionality</i>	815
2.2	External competence in the field of corporate income taxation in situations involving third-country investments	816
2.2.1	<i>Introduction</i>	816
2.2.2	<i>Specific conferred powers</i>	816
2.2.3	<i>General conferred powers</i>	820
2.2.4	<i>Evaluation</i>	823
2.2.4.1	<i>Is the Union competent to adopt unification measures in the field of corporate income taxation vis-à-vis third countries?</i>	823
2.2.4.2	<i>Is the Union competence also exclusive?</i>	825
2.2.4.3	<i>The role of the principles of subsidiarity and proportionality</i>	827
3	Recommendations for concerted legislative action at the Union level vis-à-vis third countries in the field of corporate income taxation	828
3.1	Introduction	828
3.2	Withholding taxes on dividend payments, measures providing for relief for double taxation of income received from foreign investments and CFC legislation	830
3.3	Withholding taxes on interest and royalty payments and limitation on the deduction of interest expenses paid on intercompany or third-party loans	836
3.4	Measures denying the deduction of foreign losses from the domestic taxable base	839
3.5	Corporate income taxation of realized or deemed capital gains upon the transnational transfer of business assets	840
	CHAPTER XI: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	843
1	Summary and conclusions	843
1.1	The research question	843
1.2	The benchmark of international tax neutrality and its relationship with the requirement of a “genuine economic link” under freedom of investment	845
1.3	The dividing line between Member States and third countries	848
1.4	Sketching the relevant degree of positive and negative integration between Member States in the field of corporate income taxation: a substantial degree of legal integration	850
1.5	Freedom of investment between Member States and non-Member States in the field of corporate income taxation: on balance a less substantial degree of legal integration	854
1.5.1	<i>Access to freedom of investment: the benchmarks of “definite influence” and “genuine economic link” as the existing and desirable gateways</i>	854

1.5.2	<i>Discrimination and justification grounds under freedom of investment: more leeway for Member States to distinguish between intra-Union and third country investments</i>	856
1.5.3	<i>Practical impact on the six central corporate income tax measures</i>	858
1.5.4	<i>The temporal scope of freedom of investment: additional limitations under the Treaty, additional protection under the Association, Partnership and Cooperation Agreements</i>	859
1.6	Indirectly held third-country investments: substantial intra-Union protection?	862
1.7	Recommendations: a call for uniformity vis-à-vis third countries in the field of corporate income taxation	863
1.8	Final conclusions	864
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	869
	TABLE OF CASE LAWS AND OPINIONS	901
	CENTER DISSERTATION SERIES	917