

# DEBATES ON U.S. IMMIGRATION

**EDITORS**

**JUDITH GANS**

*University of Arizona*

**ELAINE M. REPLOGLE | DANIEL J. TICHENOR**

*University of Oregon*

 **SAGE** reference

Los Angeles | London | New Delhi  
Singapore | Washington DC

# CONTENTS

---

<b>About the Editors</b>	ix
<b>About the Contributors</b>	x
<b>Preface</b>	xvii

## **POLITICAL DEBATES** **1**

### **Introduction** **1**

Elaine M. Replogle and Daniel J. Tichenor, *University of Oregon*

### **Admission and Membership**

#### **1. Legal Immigration Selection System** **11**

David W. Haines, *George Mason University*  
Madeleine Sumption, *Migration Policy Institute*

#### **2. Gender and Refugee Status** **27**

Priscilla Yamin, *University of Oregon*

#### **3. Naturalization Process** **39**

Karey Leung, *Rutgers University*

#### **4. Legalization (Amnesty) for Unauthorized Immigrants** **53**

Andrew D. Linenberg, *Hinkle, Fingles & Prior, P.C.*

#### **5. Birthright Citizenship** **75**

Alexandra Filindra, *University of Illinois at Chicago*  
Edward J. Erler, *California State University, San Bernardino*

#### **6. Immigrant Voting** **91**

Ron Hayduk, *Queens College, City University of New York*  
Rodolfo O. de la Garza, *Columbia University*

#### **7. Nativism** **112**

Carolyn J. Craig, *University of Oregon*

### **Control and Enforcement**

#### **8. Federal Policy Versus Decentralized Policy** **128**

Ali Noorani, *National Immigration Forum*  
Anna O. Law, *DePaul University*

#### **9. U.S. Border Control** **144**

Melysa Sperber, *George Washington University Law School*  
Catalina Amuedo-Dorantes, *San Diego State University*  
Cynthia Bansak, *St. Lawrence University*

<b>10. Immigrant Detention and Deportation Under the Obama Administration</b>	<b>162</b>
<i>Kathryn Miller, University of Oregon</i>	
<b>11. Arizona's S.B. 1070</b>	<b>175</b>
<i>Calvin L. Lewis, Texas Tech University School of Law</i>	
<i>Roberto Suro, University of Southern California</i>	
<b>12. Driver's Licenses</b>	<b>191</b>
<i>Michele Waslin, American Immigration Council, Immigration Policy Center</i>	
<i>Julie Myers Wood, ICS Consulting</i>	
<b>13. Crime</b>	<b>203</b>
<i>Trista R. Chaney, Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR)</i>	
<i>Walter A. Ewing, American Immigration Council</i>	
<b>ECONOMIC, LABOR, AND DEMOGRAPHIC DEBATES</b>	<b>221</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>221</b>
<i>Judith Gans, University of Arizona</i>	
<b><i>Economic Impact</i></b>	
<b>14. Cost to Taxpayers</b>	<b>227</b>
<i>Marshall Fitz and Philip E. Wolgin, Center for American Progress</i>	
<i>Ann Robertson, Independent Scholar</i>	
<b>15. Depression of Wages and Price Levels</b>	<b>242</b>
<i>Sarah E. Bohn and Magnus Lofstrom, Public Policy Institute of California</i>	
<b>16. Remittances</b>	<b>255</b>
<i>Kristin Johnson, University of Rhode Island</i>	
<i>Jack Martin, Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR)</i>	
<b><i>Labor Market</i></b>	
<b>17. H-1B Visas</b>	<b>267</b>
<i>Jeffrey L. Gower, University at Buffalo-SUNY</i>	
<i>Norman Matloff, University of California, Davis</i>	
<b>18. Temporary Worker Programs</b>	<b>285</b>
<i>Nik Theodore, University of Illinois at Chicago</i>	
<i>Eric A. Ruark, Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR)</i>	
<b>19. Secure ID Cards</b>	<b>299</b>
<i>James R. Edwards Jr., Center for Immigration Studies</i>	
<i>Lillie Coney, Electronic Privacy Information Center</i>	

<b>20. Worksite Enforcement</b>	<b>318</b>
<p>Jessica M. Vaughan, <i>Center for Immigration Studies</i>          Marielena Hincapié, <i>National Immigration Law Center</i>          Maura Ooi, <i>Georgetown University Law Center</i></p>	
<b>21. Worksite Raids</b>	<b>335</b>
<p>Mark Krikorian, <i>Center for Immigration Studies</i>          Clarissa Martínez-De-Castro and Laura Vazquez, <i>National Council of La Raza</i></p>	
<b>Demographics and Environment</b>	
<b>22. Population Growth</b>	<b>348</b>
<p>Susan K. Brown and Frank D. Bean, <i>University of California, Irvine</i>          Lissette M. Piedra, Shinwoo Choi, and Hye Joon Park, <i>University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign</i></p>	
<b>23. Environment and Immigration</b>	<b>365</b>
<p>Philip Cafaro, <i>Colorado State University</i>          Winthrop R. Staples III, <i>Independent Scholar</i>          Andrew Light, <i>Center for American Progress</i></p>	
<b>SOCIAL AND CULTURAL DEBATES</b>	<b>379</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>379</b>
<p>Judith Gans, <i>University of Arizona</i></p>	
<b>Family and Society</b>	
<b>24. Family-Based Immigration</b>	<b>385</b>
<p>David C. Koelsch, <i>University of Detroit Mercy School of Law</i>          Carol L. Cleaveland, <i>George Mason University</i></p>	
<b>25. Cultural Assimilation</b>	<b>399</b>
<p>Elizabeth Hull, <i>Rutgers University</i>          Morris I. Onyewuchi, <i>Attorney-at-Law</i></p>	
<b>26. Social and Political Integration</b>	<b>416</b>
<p>Francisco J. Alatorre, <i>New Mexico State University</i></p>	
<b>27. Catholic Church and Immigration</b>	<b>429</b>
<p>Donald M. Kerwin Jr., <i>Center for Migration Studies</i></p>	
<b>Language and Education</b>	
<b>28. English as Official Language</b>	<b>444</b>
<p>K.C. McAlpin, <i>ProEnglish</i>          Alida Y. Lasker, <i>Cleary Gottlieb Steen &amp; Hamilton</i></p>	

<b>29. English Instruction in the Classroom</b>	<b>459</b>
Rosalie Pedalino Porter, <i>READ Institute</i> Karen Manges Douglas, <i>Sam Houston State University</i>	
<b>30. Higher Education and Immigration Status</b>	<b>478</b>
Andrew J. Parr, <i>Nevada Department of Education</i> Matthew K. Tabor, <i>EducationNews.org</i>	
<b><i>Responses to Illegal Immigration</i></b>	
<b>31. Racial Profiling</b>	<b>491</b>
Peter H. Schuck, <i>Yale University</i> Karin D. Martin and Jack Glaser, <i>University of California, Berkeley</i>	
<b>32. State and Local Law Enforcement</b>	<b>509</b>
Jessica Saunders and Nelson Lim, <i>RAND Corporation</i> Carl Matthies, <i>Vera Institute of Justice</i>	
<b>33. Use of the Term “Illegal Alien”</b>	<b>529</b>
Eric A. Ruark, <i>Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR)</i> Shoba Sivaprasad Wadhia, <i>Penn State Law</i>	
<b>Appendix: Documents Highlighting Key Moments in U.S. Immigration History, 1924 to 2011</b>	<b>543</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>587</b>