RESOLVING TRANSFER PRICING DISPUTES

A Global Analysis

Edited by
EDUARDO BAISTROCCHI
and
IAN ROXAN

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
PART 1 The context of transfer pricing disputes 1

1 Introduction 3

IAN ROXAN
1.1 A transfer pricing dispute 3
1.2 Objective and scope: the range of transfer pricing disputes 4
1.3 Span of countries and disputes covered 5
1.4 Approach and outline 6
1.5 Interaction with the OECD Guidelines 7
1.6 Questionnaire answered by country experts 7

2 The transfer pricing problem 10

EDUARDO BAISTROCCHI
2.1 Introduction 10
2.2 Demand for the arm's length principle 12
2.3 The ALP, rules and standards 16
2.4 The ALP over a century: from a rule to a standard-based norm 18
2.5 OECD Guidelines: towards a procedural meaning for the ALP 19
2.6 OECD Guidelines: the minimum threshold of procedural fairness in transfer pricing disputes 20
2.7 Conclusion 22
PART II  North America and Europe  25

3 Transfer pricing disputes in the United States  27

REUVEN S. AVI-YONAH
3.1 Introduction  27
3.2 Origins (1917–1928)  32
3.3 Rise (1928–1972)  35
3.4 Decline (1972–1992)  48
3.5 Fall (1992–1994)  63
3.6 1994–2010  80
3.7 Conclusion  87
Appendix: Questionnaire (United States)  92

4 Transfer pricing disputes in Canada  95

DAVID G. DUFF AND BYRON BESWICK
4.1 Introduction  95
4.2 Economic context  96
4.3 Legislative framework for transfer pricing in Canada  99
4.4 Administrative guidelines  107
4.5 Transfer pricing cases  122
4.6 Alternative dispute resolution  154
4.7 Conclusion  160
Appendix: Questionnaire (Canada)  161

5 Transfer pricing disputes in the European Union  165

PHILIP GILLETT
5.1 Background  165
5.2 Key conclusions of the 2001 Report  167
5.3 EU Joint Transfer Pricing Forum  170
5.4 The comprehensive solution  182
5.5 Conclusions  184
5.6 Future of transfer pricing dispute resolution  186

6 Transfer pricing in Germany  188

ANDREAS OESTREICHER
6.1 Introduction  188
6.2 Economic and institutional context  189
6.3 Historical background of transfer pricing rules  194
6.4 Main aspects of Germany's transfer pricing legislation  202
6.5 Transfer pricing disputes: domestic approaches  214
6.6 Transfer pricing disputes: bilateral and multilateral approaches  228
6.7 Pricing agreements  235
6.8 Concluding remarks 240
Appendix: Questionnaire (Germany) 242

7 Transfer pricing in Spain 247

VIOLETA RUIZ ALMENDRAL
7.1 Introduction 247
7.2 Spanish economic and institutional context 252
7.3 Beginning of the use of arm's length standard 258
7.4 Current implementation of the ALS 268
7.5 Transfer pricing disputes 291
7.6 Advance pricing agreements in Spain 295
7.7 Concluding remarks: summary of the problems of the current implementation of the ALS in Spain 296
Appendix: Questionnaire (Spain) 300

8 Transfer pricing disputes in the United Kingdom 303

IAN ROXAN
8.1 Introduction 303
8.2 Development of transfer pricing rules in the United Kingdom 304
8.3 Domestic resolution of transfer pricing disputes in the United Kingdom 315
8.4 Bilateral resolution of transfer pricing disputes in the United Kingdom: mutual agreement 338
8.5 Advance pricing agreements 346
8.6 Conclusion 349
Appendix: Questionnaire (United Kingdom) 351

PART III Asia-Pacific 357

9 Transfer pricing disputes in Australia 359

RICHARD VANN
9.1 History, context and current law 360
9.2 Recent case law on substantive transfer pricing issues 369
9.3 Transfer pricing procedure and dispute resolution 388
9.4 Conclusion 410
Appendix: Questionnaire (Australia) 411

10 Transfer pricing disputes in Japan 415

TOSHIKO MIYATAKE
10.1 Introduction 415
10.2 Methods of resolving transfer pricing disputes 416
CONTENTS

10.3 Transfer pricing cases 427
10.4 APA as a method to prevent transfer pricing disputes 430
10.5 Conclusion 436
Appendix: Questionnaire (Japan) 437

11 Transfer pricing disputes in the Republic of Korea 439
HUN PARK
11.1 Introduction 439
11.2 Transfer pricing rule under LCITA 442
11.3 MAP and arbitration 454
11.4 Advance pricing agreements and advance ruling confirmation 462
11.5 Administrative appeal procedure and judicial appeal procedure 474
11.6 Conclusion 482
Appendix: Questionnaire (Republic of Korea) 483

12 Transfer pricing disputes in Singapore 489
STEPHEN L. H. PHUA
12.1 Introduction 489
12.2 Economic and institutional context 490
12.3 Legislature framework of transfer pricing 493
12.4 Administrative guidelines 507
12.5 Documentation 511
12.6 Corresponding adjustments 511
12.7 Remedies 512
12.8 Conclusion 513
Appendix: Questionnaire (Singapore) 514

PART IV BRIC Countries 517

13 Transfer pricing disputes in Brazil 519
ISABEL CALICH AND JOÃO DÁCIO ROLIM
13.1 Introduction 519
13.2 Economic context 520
13.3 Historical background of transfer pricing rules 523
13.4 Main aspects of the Brazilian transfer pricing legislation 525
13.5 Transfer pricing disputes: domestic approaches 531
13.6 Administrative procedures to minimise transfer pricing disputes 541
13.7 Bilateral and multilateral approaches to transfer pricing disputes 544
13.8 Recent developments in the transfer pricing legislation 547
CONTENTS

13.9 Concluding remarks 551
Appendix: Questionnaire (Brazil) 552

14 Transfer pricing disputes in the Russian Federation 555

ANDREY SHPAK
14.1 Introduction 555
14.2 Economic and institutional context 555
14.3 Historical background 556
14.4 Current transfer pricing rules 562
14.5 Administrative procedure 569
14.6 Transfer pricing disputes: domestic approaches 572
14.7 Transfer pricing disputes: bilateral and multilateral approaches MAP/arbitration 578
14.8 Advance pricing agreements 578
14.9 Concluding remarks 579
Appendix: Questionnaire (Russia) 580

15 Transfer pricing disputes in India 584

MUKESH BUTANI
15.1 Introduction 584
15.2 Emergence of transfer pricing in India 588
15.3 Overview of the administrative set-up for dispute resolution 588
15.4 Emergence of transfer pricing disputes 588
15.5 Dispute resolution mechanism under domestic law 595
15.6 Alternate dispute resolution mechanisms under domestic law 601
15.7 Tax treaties: what is their relevance in the Indian tax regime? 605
15.8 Dispute resolution under DTAA 609
15.9 Reliance on OECD Guidelines and US transfer pricing rules 613
15.10 Transfer pricing audit in India: an overview 615
15.11 Indian transfer pricing controversies and principles 617
15.12 Transfer pricing penalties 627
15.13 Advance pricing agreement 629
15.14 Safe harbour provisions 629
15.15 Conclusion 630
Appendix: Questionnaire (India) 630

16 Transfer pricing disputes in China 634

JINYAN LI
16.1 Introduction 634
16.2 Historical and cultural context for transfer pricing disputes 634
16.3 Transfer pricing law and administration 645
16.4 Disputes prevention and administrative resolution 651
CONTENTS

16.5 Future of transfer pricing disputes resolution 658
16.6 Conclusions 663
Appendix: Questionnaire (China) 664

PART V South America, Middle East and Africa 667

17 Transfer pricing disputes in Argentina 669
EDUARDO BAISTROCCHI
17.1 Introduction 669
17.2 Economic and institutional context 672
17.3 Transfer pricing in Argentina: prior to the 1998 tax reform 676
17.4 Current implementation of the ALP: 1998 reform 707
17.5 Transfer pricing disputes: domestic approaches 713
17.6 Transfer pricing disputes: bilateral and multilateral approaches 721
17.7 Advance pricing agreements 721
17.8 Concluding remarks 722
Appendix: Questionnaire (Argentina) 723

18 Transfer pricing disputes in Chile 728
JUAN PABLO GUERRERO DAW
18.1 Introduction 728
18.2 Inception of arm's length principle 733
18.3 Current implementation of ALP 739
18.4 Transfer pricing disputes: current situation 746
18.5 Transfer pricing disputes: bilateral and multilateral approaches 748
18.6 Expected change in transfer pricing regulation 751
18.7 Concluding remarks 753
Appendix: Questionnaire (Chile) 755

19 Transfer pricing disputes in Israel 757
OFER GRANOT AND YORAM MARGALIOH
19.1 Introduction: the Israeli tax sphere 757
19.2 Economic and institutional context 758
19.3 Transfer pricing in Israel: prior to 2003 tax reform 762
19.4 Israeli transfer pricing statutory regime (2003 onwards) 767
19.5 Transfer pricing disputes: domestic approach 776
19.6 Transfer pricing disputes: bilateral and multilateral approaches 780
19.7 Advance pricing agreements 784
20 Transfer pricing disputes in Africa 790

LEE CORRICK
20.1 Introduction: the African tax sphere 790
20.2 Economic and institutional context 792
20.3 Transfer pricing regimes in Africa 797
20.4 Current implementation of the arm’s length principle 808
20.5 Transfer pricing disputes: domestic approaches 821
20.6 Transfer pricing disputes: bilateral and multilateral approaches 825
20.7 Advance pricing agreements 826
20.8 Concluding remarks 827

Appendix: Questionnaire (Africa) 828

PART VI Conclusion 833

21 Transfer pricing dispute resolution: the global evolutionary path (1799–2011) 835

EDUARDO BAISTROCCHI
21.1 Introduction 835
21.2 Transfer pricing dispute resolution: a cross-country comparison 838
21.3 The ALP: core dynamic of its global transplant 858
21.4 The ALP in context 860
21.5 Five core versions of ALP regulatory technology 864
21.6 Stage VI: the last stage of the ALP? 865
21.7 Conclusion: towards a global convergence on transfer pricing dispute resolution 867

Appendix I: Evolutionary path of transfer pricing dispute resolution in Europe and North America 870
Appendix II: Evolutionary path of transfer pricing dispute resolution in the Asia-Pacific countries 872
Appendix III: Evolutionary path of transfer pricing dispute resolution in the BRIC countries 876
Appendix IV: Evolutionary path of transfer pricing dispute resolution in the Middle East and South America 878
Appendix V: Evolutionary path of transfer pricing dispute resolution in Africa 880
Appendix VI: The global transfer pricing dispute resolution evolutionary path 883
Resolving the resolution of transfer pricing disputes: global trends and divergences  884

IAN ROXAN

22.1 Developments and divergences  884
22.2 Divergences in the nature of transfer pricing standards  884
22.3 Divergences in transfer pricing dispute resolution: the role of challenges  886
22.4 Further responses  888
22.5 Conclusion  891

Index  892