The Proper Tax Base

Structural Fairness from an International and Comparative Perspective—Essays in Honor of Paul McDaniel

Edited by

Yariv Brauner

Martin James McMahon, Jr.

Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business
Summary of Contents

Preface xiii

Part I
Tax Expenditures 1

Chapter 1
The Staff of the Joint Committee on Taxation Revision
of Tax Expenditure Classification Methodology:
What Is To Be Made of a Change That Makes No Changes? 3
Paul R. McDaniel

Chapter 2
Taxing Tax Expenditures? 17
Martin J. McMahon, Jr.

Chapter 3
The Tax Expenditure Concept Globally 47
Miranda Stewart

Chapter 4
Tax Reform and Tax Expenditures in Australia 87
Richard J. Vann

Chapter 5
Tax Reform Paul McDaniel Style: The Repeal of the Grantor Trust Rules 107
Laura E. Cunningham & Noël B. Cunningham
Summary of Contents

Part II
The Fair Tax Base and International Tax Reform 119

Chapter 6
Horizontal Equity Revisited 121
James Repetti & Diane Ring

Chapter 7
What Is This Thing Called Source? 139
Lawrence Lokken

Chapter 8
Formula Based Transfer Pricing 149
Yariv Brauner

Part III
A Comparative Perspective 177

Chapter 9
The EU proposed CCCTB—Some Tax Treaty Issues 179
Kees van Raad

Chapter 10
Shared Legal Orders: Some Thoughts about the Influence of EU Case Law on International Tax Law Rules of the EU Member States 187
Irene J.J. Burgers

Chapter 11
Intra Group Loans—A Swedish Perspective 211
Bertil Wiman

Chapter 12
European VAT and Jurisdiction to Tax 223
Antonio Vázquez del Rey
Table of Contents

Preface xiii

Part I Tax Expenditures 1

Chapter 1 The Staff of the Joint Committee on Taxation Revision of Tax Expenditure Classification Methodology: What Is To Be Made of a Change That Makes No Changes? 3
Paul R. McDaniel

1.1 Introduction 4

1.2 Methodology Historically Used To Classify Code Provisions 4
  1.2.1 The Tax Base 5
  1.2.2 Tax Rates 5
  1.2.3 The Taxable Unit 6
  1.2.4 Accounting Rules 6
  1.2.5 International Tax System 6
  1.2.6 Tax Administration 7

1.3 Methodology Adopted by JCT Staff 7
  1.3.1 Tax Subsidies 7
  1.3.2 Tax-Induced Structural Distortions 8
  1.3.3 The 2008 Tax Expenditure Estimates 9

1.4 Critique of the Reasons for the JCT Staff’s Changes 10

1.5 Conclusions 15
Chapter 2
Taxing Tax Expenditures?  17
Martin J. McMahon, Jr.

2.1 Introduction  17
2.2 “Tax Reform” Versus “Spending Reform”  19
2.3 The Failure of Criticism of Tax Expenditure Analysis  22
2.4 Taxing Tax Expenditures  25
   2.4.1 Determining Which Tax Expenditure Subsidies Should Be Taxed  25
   2.4.2 Determining How to Tax Taxable Expenditure Subsidies  29
   2.4.3 Taxing Tax Expenditures is Unadministrable  34
2.5 Revenue Enhancement, Spending Reform, and Tax Reform—Curbing Tax Expenditures  36
   2.5.1 Tax Expenditures Are Both Inefficient and Inequitable  36
   2.5.2 Tax Expenditures Are of Questionable Efficacy  37
   2.5.3 The Case for Curbing Tax Expenditures  38
2.6 Conclusion  44

Chapter 3
The Tax Expenditure Concept Globally  47
Miranda Stewart

3.1 Introduction  48
3.2 Global Trends in Tax Expenditure Reporting  49
3.3 Country Case Studies  58
   3.3.1 India  58
   3.3.2 Chile  65
   3.3.3 South Africa  68
3.4 Purpose and Challenges of Tax Expenditure Reporting  73
   3.4.1 Purpose  74
   3.4.2 Tax Expenditure Management as an Effective Element of the Budget Process  76
   3.4.3 Two Challenges  78
3.5 Conclusion  84

Chapter 4
Tax Reform and Tax Expenditures in Australia  87
Richard J. Vann

4.1 Introduction  87
4.2 The Approach to Tax Reform  89
4.3 Taxation of Labor Income  93
### Table of Contents

4.4 Saving and Taxation of Investment Income 94  
4.5 Pension Plans and the Family Home 99  
4.6 Conclusion 104

**Chapter 5**  
**Tax Reform Paul McDaniel Style: The Repeal of the Grantor Trust Rules**  
*Laura E. Cunningham & Noël B. Cunningham*  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Introduction</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 The Grantor Trust Rules</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 The Intentionally Defective Grantor Trust</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1 Basic IDGT Transaction</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2 IDGT Installment Sale Transaction</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 The Argument for Repeal</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part II**  
**The Fair Tax Base and International Tax Reform**  

**Chapter 6**  
**Horizontal Equity Revisited**  
*James Repetti & Diane Ring*  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Introduction</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Why HE and VE Lack Normative Content?</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Efforts to Sustain a Design Role for HE</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Critique of the Assertion that HE Lacks Normative Content</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1 HE as a Process Requirement</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2 HE as Even-Handed Enforcement</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 7**  
**What Is This Thing Called Source?**  
*Lawrence Lokken*  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Introduction</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 The Model</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Applications of the Model</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1 Generally</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.2 Interest Income</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.3 Interest by Analogy</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Conclusion</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 8
**Formula Based Transfer Pricing**
*Yariv Brauner*

8.1 Introduction 149
8.2 The Current Debate Over the Desirability of a Formula Based International Tax Reform 152
  8.2.1 Formulaic Reform Proposals 154
  8.2.2 The Main Arguments in the Debate 155
    8.2.2.1 Economic Based *versus* Arbitrary Taxation 155
    8.2.2.2 The Three Factor Formula 157
    8.2.2.3 Unilateral *versus* Multilateral Solutions 159
    8.2.2.4 Costliness—Simplicity, Compliance and Enforcement 160
  8.2.3 Distinguishing the Debate over Formulaic International Tax Reform from Transfer Pricing Reform 162
8.3 The Logic of Our Transfer Pricing Regime and the Domination of Arm’s Length 164
  8.3.1 Arm’s Length in the United States 165
  8.3.2 The Universality of Arm’s Length 166
  8.3.3 Defense of Arm’s Length 167
  8.3.4 Critique of Arm’s Length 168
8.4 The Design of a Formula-Based Transfer Pricing Regime 170
  8.4.1 Unilateral Adoption of Formulaic Transfer Pricing 171
  8.4.2 A Bilateral Approach 174
  8.4.3 A Multilateral Solution 175
8.5 Conclusion 176

## Part III
**A Comparative Perspective** 177

## Chapter 9
**The EU proposed CCCTB—Some Tax Treaty Issues**
*Kees van Raad*

9.1 Introduction 179
9.2 A Very Brief Outline of the Proposed CCCTB rules 181
9.3 Some Issues Under Tax Treaties 182
  9.3.1 Introduction 182
  9.3.2 A CCCTB Company Receives Interest Income from Outside the EU 182
    9.3.2.1 Double Taxation 182
    9.3.2.2 Treaty Application by the Third-Country State O 183
    9.3.2.3 Treaty Application by CCCTB States MS C1 and MS C2 183
9.3.3 Third-Country Company Corporation O derives Income from CCCTB States MS-C1 and MS-C2 184
9.3.3.1 No Issue in Case of Income from Single Business Activity 184
9.3.3.2 Multiple Active Income Items 184
9.3.3.3 Passive income 185

9.4 Conclusion 186

Chapter 10
Shared Legal Orders: Some Thoughts about the Influence of EU Case Law on International Tax Law Rules of the EU Member States 187
Irene J.J. Burgers

10.1 Introduction 187
10.2 Standards Developed by the ECJ Concerning the Powers of the Member States 190
10.3 The Exemption with Progression Method and EU Law: The German Experience 191
10.3.1 Introduction 191
10.3.2 Case law of the ECJ 191
10.3.2.1 Lidl Belgium 192
10.3.2.2 Krankenheim 194
10.3.3 Case Law of the German Federal Finance Court (BFH) 195
10.3.3.1 BFH, February 3, 2010, I R 23/09 195
10.3.3.2 BFH, June 9, 2010, I R 23/09 196
10.3.4 Case law of the ECJ regarding third countries: Stahlwerk Ergste Westig GmbH 198
10.3.5 Evaluation 198
10.3.6 Change in Dutch Exemption Method as from January 1, 2012 199
10.4 Transfer Pricing Rules and EU Law: The Belgian Experience 201
10.4.1 Introduction 201
10.4.2 SGI 201
10.4.3 Evaluation 204
10.5 Wrap up of ECJ Standards, Principles and Tests 205
10.6 Some Thoughts on Transplanting the ECJ Standards, Principles and Tests in the OECD Commentary 205
10.6.1 Introduction 205
10.6.2 The "Always-Somewhere Principle" 206
10.6.3 The Commercial Justification Test and the Burden of Proof 207
10.7 Conclusion 209
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 11
**Intra Group Loans—A Swedish Perspective**
*Bertil Wiman*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.1 Introduction</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2 RA 2010 ref. 67</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3 Pricing of Cross-Border Loans</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4 Conclusions</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 12
**European VAT and Jurisdiction to Tax**
*Antonio Vázquez del Rey*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.1 Place of Supply: Relevance and Underlying Principles</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2 The Place of Supply of Goods</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2.1 Overview</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2.2 General Rules</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2.3 Special Rules</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2.3.1 Generically Applicable to International Trade</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2.3.2 Specifically Applicable to Intra-Community Trade</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2.3.3 Chain Transactions</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3 The Place of Intra-Community Acquisitions of Goods</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.1 Overview</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.2 Chain Transactions</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4 The Place of Supply of Services</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4.1 Overview</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4.2 General Rules</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4.2.1 Supply of Services to Taxable Persons</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4.2.2 Supply of Services to Nontaxable Persons</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4.3 Special Rules</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4.3.1 General Exceptions</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4.3.2 Particular Exceptions</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4.4 Forthcoming Modifications</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4.5 Use and Enjoyment Rule</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.5 The Place of Importation of Goods</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>