

Credit Rating Agencies on the Watch List

Analysis of European Regulation

RAQUEL GARCÍA ALCUBILLA AND
JAVIER RUIZ DEL POZO

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

| | |
|--|------|
| <i>List of Tables</i> | xiii |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i> | xiv |
| <i>Note to the Reader</i> | xvi |
| | |
| 1. Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1 A History of Ratings and the Role of Rating Agencies | 1 |
| 1.1.1 Financial Markets Prior to Rating Agencies | 1 |
| 1.1.2 The Predecessors of Rating Agencies | 2 |
| 1.1.3 The Rise of Rating Agencies | 4 |
| 1.1.4 Role of Rating Agencies | 5 |
| 1.2 Rating Industry | 6 |
| 1.2.1 Characteristics | 6 |
| 1.2.2 Worldwide | 7 |
| 1.2.3 Europe | 10 |
| 1.3 Use of Ratings | 11 |
| 1.3.1 Use by Market Participants | 12 |
| 1.3.2 Use in Private Contracts | 13 |
| 1.3.3 Use in Regulation | 16 |
| 1.4 Rating Process | 18 |
| 1.4.1 Rating Process for Traditional Ratings | 18 |
| 1.4.2 Rating Process for Structured Finance Instruments | 23 |
| | |
| 2. Financial Crisis: Global Regulatory Reaction | 27 |
| 2.1 Deficiencies in the Rating Industry | 27 |
| 2.1.1 Introduction | 27 |
| 2.1.2 Failures in Integrity | 28 |
| 2.1.3 Failures in Reliability | 28 |
| 2.1.4 Failures in Transparency | 30 |
| 2.1.5 Lack of Competition | 30 |
| 2.2 Global Initiatives | 32 |
| 2.2.1 Introduction | 32 |
| 2.2.2 G-20 | 33 |
| 2.2.3 Financial Stability Board | 34 |
| 2.2.4 IOSCO | 36 |
| 2.2.5 Over-reliance on Ratings | 41 |
| | |
| 3. Analysis of the EU Credit Rating Agencies Regulation | 47 |
| 3.1 Background | 47 |
| 3.1.1 European Commission's Communication | 47 |
| 3.1.2 ESMA's Reports on Rating Agencies | 48 |
| 3.1.3 European Commission's Regulation Proposal | 49 |

| | | |
|-------|---|-----|
| 3.2 | Supervisory Structure | 51 |
| 3.2.1 | Colleges of Supervisors | 51 |
| 3.2.2 | ESMA | 53 |
| 3.3 | Definitions and Concepts | 58 |
| 3.3.1 | Credit Rating and Rating Category | 58 |
| 3.3.2 | Credit Rating Activities and Ancillary Services | 64 |
| 3.3.3 | Credit Rating Agency and Group of Rating Agencies | 65 |
| 3.3.4 | Persons Involved in Rating Activities | 67 |
| 3.3.5 | Rated Entities and Rated Instruments | 68 |
| 3.3.6 | Other Definitions | 70 |
| 3.4 | Scope | 71 |
| 3.4.1 | Ratings under the Scope | 71 |
| 3.4.2 | Ratings and Credit Scores Outside the Scope | 75 |
| 3.5 | Use of Ratings for Regulatory Purposes | 83 |
| 3.5.1 | Introduction | 83 |
| 3.5.2 | Basel and Capital Requirements Directive | 85 |
| 3.5.3 | ECAs Recognition Process under the CRD | 87 |
| 3.5.4 | Eligibility as Collateral by European Central Bank | 97 |
| 3.6 | Registration Process and Requirements | 99 |
| 3.6.1 | Rating Agencies Operating in Europe in 2010 | 99 |
| 3.6.2 | Scope for Registration | 100 |
| 3.6.3 | Registration Process | 100 |
| 3.6.4 | Withdrawal of Registration | 107 |
| 3.6.5 | Notification and Publication | 108 |
| 3.6.6 | Material Changes to Initial Conditions | 109 |
| 3.7 | Supervision and Enforcement | 110 |
| 3.7.1 | Introduction | 110 |
| 3.7.2 | Supervision by ESMA | 113 |
| 3.7.3 | Infringements | 119 |
| 3.7.4 | Sanctioning Regime | 120 |
| 3.8 | Substantive Requirements | 130 |
| 3.8.1 | Organization and Governance | 130 |
| 3.8.2 | Business Activities and Resources | 143 |
| 3.8.3 | Independence and Conflicts of Interest | 165 |
| 3.8.4 | Methodologies, Models, and Key Assumptions | 183 |
| 3.8.5 | Disclosure and Presentation of Ratings | 200 |
| 3.8.6 | Transparency of Rating Agencies' Activities, Policies, and Procedures | 215 |
| 4. | Use of Non-EU Ratings in the EU | 227 |
| 4.1 | Procedures Set Out by the CRA Regulation | 228 |
| 4.1.1 | Systemic Importance | 229 |
| 4.2 | Endorsement | 229 |
| 4.2.1 | Scope | 229 |
| 4.2.2 | Conditions | 230 |
| 4.2.3 | Responsibility of the Endorsing CRA | 230 |
| 4.2.4 | Application for Endorsement | 231 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 4.2.5 Approval of Endorsement and Endorsing Activity | 233 |
| 4.2.6 Changes to Endorsing Regime | 234 |
| 4.3 Certification Based on Equivalence | 234 |
| 4.3.1 Scope | 234 |
| 4.3.2 Process | 235 |
| 4.3.3 Application for Certification | 236 |
| 4.3.4 Sanctioning Regime | 237 |
| 4.3.5 ESMA's Methodology to Assess Equivalence | 238 |
| 4.3.6 ESMA's Advice on the Equivalence Between the US and EU Frameworks | 239 |
| 4.3.7 European Commission's Equivalence Decision on Japan | 241 |
| 4.4 Relationship Between Endorsement and Certification Based on Equivalence | 241 |
| 4.5 Cooperation Arrangements | 244 |
| 5. Future Developments | 245 |
| 5.1 Rethinking Business Models | 246 |
| 5.1.1 Investor-Pays Model | 247 |
| 5.1.2 Public Utility Model | 249 |
| 5.1.3 Payment-Upon-Results Model | 251 |
| 5.1.4 Hiring Agent Model | 251 |
| 5.2 Over-Reliance | 253 |
| 5.3 Competition | 254 |
| 5.4 Civil Liability | 255 |
| 5.5 Sovereign Ratings | 257 |
| 5.6 Global Consistency in Regulation and Oversight of Rating Agencies | 258 |
| 5.6.1 Regulatory Consistency | 258 |
| 5.6.2 Oversight Coordination | 260 |
| 5.7 Overall Conclusions | 260 |
| <i>Appendices</i> | |
| Appendix 1. The European System of Financial Supervisors | 263 |
| Appendix 2. ESMA's Governance Structure and Resources | 266 |
| Appendix 3. Mapping Factors Under CRD | 268 |
| Appendix 4. US Legislation on CRAs | 272 |
| Appendix 5. Japanese Legislation on CRAs | 279 |
| <i>Glossary</i> | 283 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 286 |
| <i>Index</i> | 291 |