Remedies under the WTO Legal System

By

R. Rajesh Babu
CONTENTS

Acknowledgment ........................................................................................................ xiii
Abbreviations ............................................................................................................. xv

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................... 1
   1. Introduction ....................................................................................................... 1
   2. Scope and Objective .......................................................................................... 3
   3. General Introduction to the Volume ................................................................ 5
      3.1. Remedies under International Law ............................................................ 5
      3.2. Remedies under WTO Law ...................................................................... 8
      3.3. Enforcement of Remedies under WTO Law .......................................... 12
      3.4. WTO Remedies and Developing Countries .......................................... 16

2. General Features of the WTO Dispute Settlement Understanding .................... 19
   1. Introduction ....................................................................................................... 19
   2. GATT Dispute Settlement (1947–1994) ......................................................... 20
      2.1. The Havana Charter and the GATT 1947 ................................................. 20
      2.2. The General Agreement in Tariffs and Trade, 1947 ............................... 21
      2.3. Dispute Settlement in GATT 1947 (Articles XXII and XXIII) .................. 22
      2.4. Compliance and Enforcement in the GATT Era .................................... 25
      2.5. Summary of the GATT Era ...................................................................... 29
      2.6. The Uruguay Round: Rethinking on Compliance and Enforcement .......... 30
   3. The WTO Dispute Settlement Understanding .................................................. 30
      3.1. The Dispute Settlement Understanding: An Introduction ......................... 31
      3.2. The WTO Dispute Settlement Process: Pre-Implementation Stage .......... 32
      3.3. Compliance with and Enforcement of Adopted Reports: The Implementation Stage ............................................................ 34
      3.4. Surveillance of Implementation .................................................................. 35
4.1. Article 4.7 of the SCM Agreement ........................................................................37
5. Prohibition of Unilateralism ..................................................................................38
6. Jurisdiction ..............................................................................................................43
   6.1. Compulsory Jurisdiction ..................................................................................43
   6.2. Scope of Jurisdiction ......................................................................................44
   6.3. Nature of Claims ............................................................................................46
7. Other Means of Dispute Settlement in the DSU .......................................................47
   7.1. Good Offices, Conciliation or Mediation .........................................................47
   7.2. Arbitration Pursuant to Article 25 of the DSU ................................................48

3. Remedies under International Law ..........................................................................51
   1. Introduction ........................................................................................................51
   2. Remedies in International Law in Context .........................................................54
   3. The ILC’s Articles on State Responsibility for Internationally Wrongful Acts .........58
      3.1. Historical Development of the Articles .......................................................58
      3.2. General Overview of the Articles ................................................................60
      3.3. Legal Status of the Articles .......................................................................63
      3.4. Basic Concepts Underlying the Articles ....................................................64
         3.4.1. Distinction between Primary and Secondary Obligations .....................64
         3.4.2. The Concept of ‘Injured State’ and ‘Injury’ ..........................................65
         3.4.3. Residual Nature of the Articles ............................................................67
   4. Legal Consequences of the International Responsibility of a State ......................68
      4.1. Obligations Arising out of an International Wrongful Act .........................70
         4.1.1. Cessation of the Wrongful Act .............................................................70
         4.1.2. Assurance and Guarantees of Non-Repetition ......................................73
      4.2. Reparation for Injury CAUSED .....................................................................74
         4.2.1. Definition of Injury and Establishing the Causal Link .........................74
         4.2.2. Forms of Reparation ............................................................................74
   5. Conclusion ............................................................................................................74

4. Remedies under WTO Law .....................................................................................75
   1. Introduction ........................................................................................................75
   2. The Relationship between WTO Law and International Law ............................75
      2.1. WTO Law as Lex Specialis – Understanding the Connection ....................75

Printed by, the Netherlands
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1.</td>
<td>Concept of <em>Lex Specialis</em> in International Law</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2.</td>
<td>WTO Law as &quot;Lex Specialis&quot;</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.</td>
<td>Applicable Law in the WTO DSU – the Possible Wider Relationship</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.</td>
<td>Customary Rules of Interpretation under International Law and the WTO</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1.</td>
<td>Customary Rules of Interpretation under International Law</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2.</td>
<td>Customary Rules of Interpretation in the WTO</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.</td>
<td><em>Non Lique</em> in the WTO and International Law – A Possible Fall Out</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Access to the WTO Dispute Settlement System: Legal Standing</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Material Aspects of Remedies under the WTO Dispute Settlement System</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Object and Purpose of Remedies</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Nature and Content of Remedies under the DSU</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1.</td>
<td>Recommendation to 'Bring the Measures into Conformity': The Ultimate Remedy under the WTO</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2.</td>
<td>Special Rules on Remedies: Subsidies Practice – &quot;Withdrawal&quot; vs. &quot;Bring into Conformity&quot;</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3.</td>
<td>Suggest Ways to Comply – the Non-binding Option</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Legal Effect of Rulings under Article 19.1</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Value of GATT/WTO Reports as Precedent</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>The Prospective Nature of Remedies</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Prompt Compliance</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.1.</td>
<td>Concept of Compliance</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Reasonable Period of Time for Implementation</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.1.</td>
<td>The Procedure</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.2.</td>
<td>Scope of Article 21.3 (c) Arbitration</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.3.</td>
<td>Factors Determining the Reasonable Period of Time</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.2.4. Special Rules in the SCM Agreement .............................................. 170
6.2.5. Nature of the Burden of Proof ................................................. 173
6.3. “Surveillance” During the Reasonable Period ................................... 174
6.4. Disagreements Regarding Implementation:  
    The Compliance Review Procedure ............................................... 176
    6.4.1. The Compliance Review Procedure ..................................... 176
    6.4.2. Scope of the Article 21.5 Review ....................................... 179
    6.4.3. “Measures” Taken to Comply .............................................. 182
6.5. The Relationship between Articles 21.5 and 22:  
    The Problem of Sequencing ..................................................... 185
    6.5.1. Statement of the Problem ................................................. 186
    6.5.2. The EC – US Controversy: the EC- Banana Case .................... 186
    6.5.3. The Panel/Arbitration Findings ......................................... 189
    6.5.4. Bilateral Understanding: The Ad hoc Solution ....................... 191
7. Compensation: Remedy for Non-Compliance .................................... 193
    7.1. Remedies for Non-Compliance .............................................. 193
    7.2. Compensation as a Remedy .................................................. 194
    7.3. Cases where Compensation was Opted for as a Remedy .............. 196
    7.4. Problems with WTO Compensation ......................................... 198
    7.5. Proposals for Improving Compensation as a Remedy .................. 202
        7.5.1. Compulsory/ Mandatory Compensation .............................. 202
        7.5.2. Financial/Money Compensation ...................................... 203
        7.5.3. Retrospective Compensation ....................................... 205
8. Remedies for Non-violation and Situation Claims ............................. 205
    8.1. Remedies for Non-violation Claims .................................... 208
    8.2. Situation Complaints ....................................................... 210
9. Preliminary Conclusions .................................................................. 211
5. Enforcing Remedies under WTO Law ............................................... 217
    1. Introduction ............................................................................. 217
        1.1. Enforcement Record of the WTO: The Data ......................... 218
        1.2. Use of Terms ..................................................................... 222
    2. Enforcement of Remedies in International Law ............................... 225
        2.1. Is International Law ‘Law’? A Brief Look at the Old Debate .... 225
        2.2. Customary Rules on Countermeasures: The ILC Articles .......... 226
        2.3. Preclusion of Wrongfulness of Countermeasures ................. 228
        2.4. Conditions Limiting the Application of Countermeasures in International Law ............................................................. 229
CONTENTS

2.4.1. Object of Countermeasures ........................................... 229
2.4.2. Countermeasures must be Directed only
Against the State Responsible ............................................. 230
2.4.3. Countermeasures are Temporary Measures ....................... 230
2.4.4. Reversibility of Object of Countermeasures ..................... 231
2.4.5. Non-Termination of Substantive Obligations ..................... 231
2.4.6. Countermeasures must be Proportionate ......................... 232
2.4.7. Obligations not Affected by Countermeasures ................... 233
2.4.8. Procedural Conditions ................................................ 233
2.4.9. Termination of Countermeasures .................................... 234

2.5. Lex Specialis Enforcement Provisions in
Other International Law Regimes ......................................... 235

3. Applicability of Customary Rules of Countermeasures
in WTO Law ............................................................................ 236

4. Countermeasures in WTO Law ............................................. 238
4.1. Suspension of Obligation and Retaliation
under GATT 1947 ................................................................. 238
4.2. From GATT to WTO: Remedies for Non-Compliance ............... 241
4.3. Object and Purpose of Countermeasures in the WTO ............ 242
   4.3.1. The Compliance vs. Rebalancing Debate ....................... 248

5. General Features of Countermeasures in the WTO ................. 254
5.1. The Bilateral Nature of Countermeasures ............................ 254
5.2. Temporal Character of Countermeasures ............................ 256
5.3. Prospective Nature of Countermeasures: Date from
which ‘Injury’ is Calculated .................................................. 259
5.4. Countermeasures to be Consistent with the
Covered Agreements ............................................................. 261

6. Principles and Procedure Governing Countermeasures .......... 262
6.1. General Conditions for Countermeasures ............................ 264
   6.1.1. Choice between Suspension of “Concessions”
   and “Other Obligations” .................................................... 267
   6.1.2. Other Requirements: Methodology Paper
   and Product Coverage ....................................................... 268
6.2. Specific Rules and Procedures for Countermeasures ............ 269
   6.2.1. Retaliation and Cross-Retaliation: The Hierarchy
   of Responses ........................................................................ 269
   6.2.2. Rules and Procedure for Granting
   Cross-Retaliation .............................................................. 273
6.3. Scope and Power of Review of Article 22.6
Arbitrators ............................................................................. 280
6.4. Burden of Proof ........................................................................................................ 283

7. Level of Countermeasures: The Principle of Proportionality .............................. 286
    7.1. The Concept of Proportionality in International Law ..................................... 286
    7.2. The WTO Countermeasures and the Principle of Proportionality .................. 288
        7.2.1. Determination of ‘Equivalence’ in Countermeasures Cases .................... 292
        7.2.2. ‘Appropriate’ Countermeasures in the SCM Agreement: The Exception .... 296

7.3. Assessment of Level of Countermeasures – The Methodology ......................... 301
    7.3.1. Assessment of ‘Equivalence’ .................................................................... 302
    7.3.2. Mirror Legislation as Equivalent Countermeasure ..................................... 306

7.4. The “Carousel” Type Retaliation ........................................................................ 308

8. Surveillance of Implementation ................................................................................. 312

9. Instances of Countermeasures in the WTO: The Cases ......................................... 313
    9.1. The EC – Bananas Case ............................................................................ 314
    9.2. The EC – Hormones Case ......................................................................... 319
    9.3. The US – Tax Treatment for “Foreign Sales Corporations” Case ................. 323
    9.4. The Aircraft Subsidy Cases ....................................................................... 324
    9.5. The US – Offset Act of 2000 (Byrd Amendment) Case ................................ 326
    9.6. The US – Gambling and Betting Services Case ........................................... 328
    9.7. The Issues Raised by these Cases ............................................................... 330

10. The Effectiveness of Countermeasures in WTO Law ............................................. 333
    10.1. Effectiveness of Countermeasures: The Institutional Dilemma ...................... 336

11. Preliminary Conclusions ......................................................................................... 340

6. WTO Remedies and the Developing Countries ....................................................... 343
    1. Introduction ...................................................................................................... 343
        1.1. The Problem of Identifying “Developing Countries” .............................. 347
    2. Differential Treatment in International Law .................................................... 350
        2.1. The S&D Principle as a Permanent Exception to International Law: Some Preliminary Observations .......................................................... 354
    3. The GATT 1947 and the Developing Countries ................................................ 357
        3.1. Differential Treatment in the GATT 1947 ............................................... 357
        3.2. GATT Dispute Settlement and the Developing Countries ......................... 358
CONTENTS

3.3. The Developing Countries' Attempt to Improve the GATT Dispute Settlement .......................... 361
3.4. The Uruguay Round and Special and Differential Treatment .................................................. 363

4. The WTO and the Developing Countries ................................................................. 364

5. The WTO Remedies and Special and Differential Treatment for the Developing Countries .... 366
5.1. The WTO DSU and S&D Treatment Provisions ......................................................... 366
5.2. Remedies under the WTO DSU and S&D Treatment for Developing Countries .............. 370
5.3. Legal Effect of S&D Treatment Provisions in WTO Law .................................................. 372
5.4. S&D Provisions in DSU: Law and Practice ....... ................................. 376
5.4.1. The Pre-Implementation Stage .............................................................................. 377
5.4.2. Implementing the DSB's Rulings ............................................................................ 381
5.4.3. WTO Jurisprudence on Remedies and S&D Provisions ....................................... 383
5.4.4. Reviewing the DSU: Making S&D Provisions More Precise, Operational and Effective... 387
5.4.5. Special Procedures Involving LDCs ........................................................................ 392
5.5. Observations ................................................................................................................. 394

6. Interpretation by the Panel/Appellate Body: Bias against Developing Countries .................. 395

7. Countermeasures and the Developing Countries' Interests .................................................. 409
7.1. The Developing Countries' Attempted Countermeasures: The Cases .................................. 415
7.1.1. The EC – Bananas (Ecuador) Case ........................................................................... 415
7.1.2. The US – Gambling and Betting Case ................................................................. 419
7.1.3. The US – Subsidies on Upland Cotton Case ....................................................... 421
7.1.4. Observations ......................................................................................................... 423
7.2. Improving Enforcement under the WTO: Some Proposals ........................................... 425
7.2.1. Mandatory Monetary/Financial Compensation ...................................................... 426
7.2.2. Joint or Collective Retaliation .................................................................................. 429
7.2.3. The Retrospective Effect of Remedies ................................................................... 432
7.2.4. The Direct Effect of WTO Rulings ........................................................................ 433
7.2.5. Automatic Option to Cross-Retaliate for Developing Countries ................................. 434
7.2.6. The Preclusion of Threshold or De Minimis Proceedings ................................................................. 435
7.2.7. Auctioning Countermeasures .................................................. 436
7.2.8. Other Proposals ............................................................... 437
8. Preliminary Conclusion ........................................................... 438

7. Summary and Conclusions ......................................................... 443
1. The WTO Dispute Settlement as an Extraordinary System ................................................................. 444
2. Remedies under the DSU: Extraordinary or Archaic? .................................................. 447
   2.1. 'Cessation' as the 'Only' Remedy for Breach of WTO Obligations ........................................ 447
   2.2. Remedies for Non-Compliance: The Buy-Out Option? .................................................. 451
   2.3. Procedural Remedies: The Additional Problem .................................................. 454
   2.4. Developing Countries: The Casualty? .................................................. 455
3. Contribution of Remedies to the DSU's Success: The Paradox .................................................. 458
4. Improving the Remedies: Some Thoughts and Recommendations .................................................. 461
   4.1. Looking for Improving Remedies within the WTO Text .................................................. 462
   4.2. Improving Remedies through Negotiations .................................................. 466

Bibliography ................................................................................. 471
Index .......................................................................................... 493