Antitrust Law in Brazil

Fighting Cartels

Eduardo Molan Gaban
Ph.D. and Master in Law, Pontifical Catholic University of São Paulo, Brazil
Visiting Fulbright Fellow at New York University School of Law, New York, US

and

Juliana Oliveira Domingues
Ph.D. in Law from Pontifical Catholic University of São Paulo, Brazil
Master in Law from Federal University of Santa Catarina, Brazil
# Table of Contents

Foreword vii

Case References xiii

List of Abbreviations xxi

Introduction 1

Part I
Brazilian Legal System: Postulates, Principles and Constitutional Rules

Chapter 1
Thoughts Underlying the Brazilian Legal System and the Notion of the Constitution 7
1.1 Constitution and System 8

Chapter 2
Constitutional Postulates and the Enforcement of the Constitution 13
2.1 Constitutional Postulates 13
2.2 Application and Enforcement of the Constitution 19

Chapter 3
Brazilian Constitution Principles and Rules: Some Specific Principles and Rules that Structure the Economic Order 25
3.1 Constitutional Principles 25
3.2 Constitutional Rules 26
Table of Contents

3.3 Some Principles that Structure the Economic Order in the 1988 Constitution
   3.3.1 Principle of Free Initiative 28
   3.3.2 Principle of Free Competition 29
   3.3.3 Principle of Consumer Protection 32
   3.3.4 Principle of the Social Role of Property 33
   3.3.5 Repression of Abuse of Economic Power 35

Part II
Competition/Antitrust and Horizontal Agreements: Cartels

Chapter 4
Brief History and the Evolution of Antitrust Law 41
4.1 Antecedents 42
   4.1.1 Formation of Competition Rules in Canada 44
   4.1.2 Formation of Competition Rules in the US 45
   4.1.3 Formation of Competition Rules in Europe 49
      4.1.3.1 The Quinine Case and the Proof of a Cartel Agreement 51
      4.1.3.2 The Wood Pulp Case and the Theory of Effects 52
      4.1.3.3 The Beef Industry Case and the Crisis Cartel’s Allegation 53
   4.1.4 Formation of Competition Rules in Brazil 54
4.2 Relationship between the Disciplines of Conduct and that of Structures 59
4.3 Control of Conduct in Legal Theory and in Economic Theory 61
   4.3.1 The Harvard School and the Chicago School 61
   4.3.2 Brief Comments on the Freiburg School 66
   4.3.3 Distinction Between per se Rule and Rule of Reason and Comments on Exemption Practices and Authorisations 66
4.4 Social Welfare and Antitrust Violation 71

Chapter 5
Context to Identify an Antitrust Violation Pursuant to Law No. 8884/94 and to the New Brazilian Antitrust Law 77
5.1 Relevant Market 77
5.2 Market Power 83
5.3 Barriers to Entry and Absence of Competition Rivalry 85
5.4 Relationship between the Principles of Free Initiative and Free Competition in their Normative Enforcement Process by Law No. 8884/94 and by the NBAL 89
**Table of Contents**

**Chapter 6**  
**Horizontal Agreements: Cartels and their Conditions**  
6.1 Restrictive Practices: Cartels  
   6.1.1 Concept  
   6.1.2 Conditions for Cartel’s Success (from Players’ Logic Perspective)  
   6.1.3 Appreciation of Evidence (from an Antitrust Authorities’ Perspective)  
   6.1.4 Market Power Assessment  
   6.1.5 Price Leadership  
   6.1.6 Parallelism of Conduct  
   6.1.7 International Cartels  
   6.1.8 International Hard Core Cartels  
      6.1.8.1 Prevalence, Formation and Identification  
   6.1.9 Collaboration among Competitors in Brazil: A Comparative Approach  
      6.1.9.1 The 2010 EC Guidelines on Collaboration Among Competitors

**Part III**  
**International Antitrust Policy and the Tools Available for Fighting International Hard Core Cartels**

**Chapter 7**  
**In the Multilateral International Plan**  
7.1 OECD  
   7.1.1 A Few Considerations about Soft Law  
   7.1.2 OECD Recommendations  
7.2 UNCTAD  
   7.2.1 UNCTAD and Competition  
7.3 WTO  
   7.3.1 Competition in the WTO  
   7.3.2 The Proposals of Action  
7.4 International Competition Network (ICN)  
   7.4.1 The ICN and Cartels

**Chapter 8**  
**Bilateral, Regional and National Scopes: Brazilian Experience**  
8.1 Cooperation Agreements  
   8.1.1 Positive and Negative Comity  
8.2 Introduction to Competition in Mercosur  
8.3 Current Scenario of the Policy against Hard Core Cartels in Brazil  
   8.3.1 The Brazilian Experience with Cooperation  
      8.3.1.1 Investigation of the Lysine Cartel
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6</th>
<th>Horizontal Agreements: Cartels and their Conditions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Restrictive Practices: Cartels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.1</td>
<td>Concept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.2</td>
<td>Conditions for Cartel’s Success (from Players’ Logic Perspective)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.3</td>
<td>Appreciation of Evidence (from an Antitrust Authorities’ Perspective)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.4</td>
<td>Market Power Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.5</td>
<td>Price Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.6</td>
<td>Parallelism of Conduct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.7</td>
<td>International Cartels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.8</td>
<td>International Hard Core Cartels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.8.1</td>
<td>Prevalence, Formation and Identification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.9</td>
<td>Collaboration among Competitors in Brazil: A Comparative Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.9.1</td>
<td>The 2010 EC Guidelines on Collaboration Among Competitors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part III</th>
<th>International Antitrust Policy and the Tools Available for Fighting International Hard Core Cartels</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7</td>
<td>In the Multilateral International Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>OECD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.1</td>
<td>A Few Considerations about Soft Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2</td>
<td>OECD Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>UNCTAD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1</td>
<td>UNCTAD and Competition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>WTO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1</td>
<td>Competition in the WTO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.2</td>
<td>The Proposals of Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>International Competition Network (ICN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.1</td>
<td>The ICN and Cartels</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 8</th>
<th>Bilateral, Regional and National Scopes: Brazilian Experience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Cooperation Agreements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.1</td>
<td>Positive and Negative Comity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Introduction to Competition in Mercosur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>Current Scenario of the Policy against Hard Core Cartels in Brazil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.1</td>
<td>The Brazilian Experience with Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.1.1</td>
<td>Investigation of the Lysine Cartel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table of Contents

8.3.1.2 Investigation of the Vitamins Cartel 203
8.3.1.3 The Investigation of the Alleged Toilet Paper Cartel: A National Case with International Cooperation 204
8.3.1.4 Initiation of an Investigation into a Suspected Compressor Cartel: First Partnership Ever 205

8.3.2 Leniency Agreements 206
8.3.2.1 Requirements in Brazil 212
8.3.2.2 Other Implications 215
8.3.2.3 The Leniency Agreement and the Cease and Desist Agreement 217
8.3.2.4 Brief Comments about Inspection in Brazil: A Comparative Approach 221

8.3.3 Cultural Problems and Modification of SBDC Action 225
8.3.4 The Brazilian Private Damages System 229
8.3.4.1 A Global Trend that Influenced Brazilian Antitrust Laws 229
8.3.4.2 The Brazilian Private Damages System Itself 233

Conclusion 237

Case Studies 239

Annex
A Brief Comparison between Law No. 8884/94 and the NBAL 381

Bibliographic References 385

Index 409