

Antitrust Law in Brazil

Fighting Cartels

Eduardo Molan Gaban

Ph.D. and Master in Law, Pontifical Catholic University of São Paulo, Brazil
Visiting Fulbright Fellow at New York University School of Law, New York, US

and

Juliana Oliveira Domingues

Ph.D. in Law from Pontifical Catholic University of São Paulo, Brazil
Master in Law from Federal University of Santa Catarina, Brazil



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

Table of Contents

Foreword	vii
Case References	xiii
List of Abbreviations	xxi
Introduction	1
Part I	
Brazilian Legal System: Postulates, Principles and Constitutional Rules	
Chapter 1	
Thoughts Underlying the Brazilian Legal System and the Notion of the Constitution	7
1.1 Constitution and System	8
Chapter 2	
Constitutional Postulates and the Enforcement of the Constitution	13
2.1 Constitutional Postulates	13
2.2 Application and Enforcement of the Constitution	19
Chapter 3	
Brazilian Constitution Principles and Rules: Some Specific Principles and Rules that Structure the Economic Order	25
3.1 Constitutional Principles	25
3.2 Constitutional Rules	26

Table of Contents

3.3	Some Principles that Structure the Economic Order in the 1988 Constitution	28
3.3.1	Principle of Free Initiative	29
3.3.2	Principle of Free Competition	32
3.3.3	Principle of Consumer Protection	33
3.3.4	Principle of the Social Role of Property	34
3.3.5	Repression of Abuse of Economic Power	35

Part II

Competition/Antitrust and Horizontal Agreements: Cartels

Chapter 4

Brief History and the Evolution of Antitrust Law

4.1	Antecedents	42
4.1.1	Formation of Competition Rules in Canada	44
4.1.2	Formation of Competition Rules in the US	45
4.1.3	Formation of Competition Rules in Europe	49
4.1.3.1	The <i>Quinine</i> Case and the Proof of a Cartel Agreement	51
4.1.3.2	The <i>Wood Pulp</i> Case and the Theory of Effects	52
4.1.3.3	The <i>Beef Industry</i> Case and the Crisis Cartel's Allegation	53
4.1.4	Formation of Competition Rules in Brazil	54
4.2	Relationship between the Disciplines of Conduct and that of Structures	59
4.3	Control of Conduct in Legal Theory and in Economic Theory	61
4.3.1	The Harvard School and the Chicago School	61
4.3.2	Brief Comments on the Freiburg School	66
4.3.3	Distinction Between <i>per se</i> Rule and Rule of Reason and Comments on Exemption Practices and Authorisations	66
4.4	Social Welfare and Antitrust Violation	71

Chapter 5

Context to Identify an Antitrust Violation Pursuant to Law

No. 8884/94	and to the New Brazilian Antitrust Law	77
5.1	Relevant Market	77
5.2	Market Power	83
5.3	Barriers to Entry and Absence of Competition Rivalry	85
5.4	Relationship between the Principles of Free Initiative and Free Competition in their Normative Enforcement Process by Law No. 8884/94 and by the NBAL	89

Chapter 6	
Horizontal Agreements: Cartels and their Conditions	97
6.1 Restrictive Practices: Cartels	98
6.1.1 Concept	100
6.1.2 Conditions for Cartel's Success (from Players' Logic Perspective)	106
6.1.3 Appreciation of Evidence (from an Antitrust Authorities' Perspective)	108
6.1.4 Market Power Assessment	109
6.1.5 Price Leadership	113
6.1.6 Parallelism of Conduct	115
6.1.7 International Cartels	120
6.1.8 International Hard Core Cartels	129
6.1.8.1 Prevalence, Formation and Identification	133
6.1.9 Collaboration among Competitors in Brazil: A Comparative Approach	139
6.1.9.1 The 2010 EC Guidelines on Collaboration Among Competitors	142
Part III	
International Antitrust Policy and the Tools Available for Fighting International Hard Core Cartels	
Chapter 7	
In the Multilateral International Plan	151
7.1 OECD	153
7.1.1 A Few Considerations about Soft Law	155
7.1.2 OECD Recommendations	157
7.2 UNCTAD	160
7.2.1 UNCTAD and Competition	162
7.3 WTO	167
7.3.1 Competition in the WTO	171
7.3.2 The Proposals of Action	173
7.4 International Competition Network (ICN)	176
7.4.1 The ICN and Cartels	181
Chapter 8	
Bilateral, Regional and National Scopes: Brazilian Experience	187
8.1 Cooperation Agreements	191
8.1.1 Positive and Negative Comity	192
8.2 Introduction to Competition in Mercosur	195
8.3 Current Scenario of the Policy against Hard Core Cartels in Brazil	201
8.3.1 The Brazilian Experience with Cooperation	201
8.3.1.1 Investigation of the Lysine Cartel	202

Chapter 6

Horizontal Agreements: Cartels and their Conditions	97
6.1 Restrictive Practices: Cartels	98
6.1.1 Concept	100
6.1.2 Conditions for Cartel’s Success (from Players’ Logic Perspective)	106
6.1.3 Appreciation of Evidence (from an Antitrust Authorities’ Perspective)	108
6.1.4 Market Power Assessment	109
6.1.5 Price Leadership	113
6.1.6 Parallelism of Conduct	115
6.1.7 International Cartels	120
6.1.8 International Hard Core Cartels	129
6.1.8.1 Prevalence, Formation and Identification	133
6.1.9 Collaboration among Competitors in Brazil: A Comparative Approach	139
6.1.9.1 The 2010 EC Guidelines on Collaboration Among Competitors	142

Part III

International Antitrust Policy and the Tools Available for Fighting International Hard Core Cartels

Chapter 7

In the Multilateral International Plan	151
7.1 OECD	153
7.1.1 A Few Considerations about Soft Law	155
7.1.2 OECD Recommendations	157
7.2 UNCTAD	160
7.2.1 UNCTAD and Competition	162
7.3 WTO	167
7.3.1 Competition in the WTO	171
7.3.2 The Proposals of Action	173
7.4 International Competition Network (ICN)	176
7.4.1 The ICN and Cartels	181

Chapter 8

Bilateral, Regional and National Scopes: Brazilian Experience	187
8.1 Cooperation Agreements	191
8.1.1 Positive and Negative Comity	192
8.2 Introduction to Competition in Mercosur	195
8.3 Current Scenario of the Policy against Hard Core Cartels in Brazil	201
8.3.1 The Brazilian Experience with Cooperation	201
8.3.1.1 Investigation of the Lysine Cartel	202

Table of Contents

8.3.1.2	Investigation of the Vitamins Cartel	203
8.3.1.3	The Investigation of the Alleged Toilet Paper Cartel: A National Case with International Cooperation	204
8.3.1.4	Initiation of an Investigation into a Suspected Compressor Cartel: First Partnership Ever	205
8.3.2	Leniency Agreements	206
8.3.2.1	Requirements in Brazil	212
8.3.2.2	Other Implications	215
8.3.2.3	The Leniency Agreement and the Cease and Desist Agreement	217
8.3.2.4	Brief Comments about Inspection in Brazil: A Comparative Approach	221
8.3.3	Cultural Problems and Modification of SBDC Action	225
8.3.4	The Brazilian Private Damages System	229
8.3.4.1	A Global Trend that Influenced Brazilian Antitrust Laws	229
8.3.4.2	The Brazilian Private Damages System Itself	233
Conclusion		237
Case Studies		239
Annex		
A Brief Comparison between Law No. 8884/94 and the NBAL		381
Bibliographic References		385
Index		409