

Market Denial and International Fisheries Regulation

The Targeted and Effective Use of Trade
Measures Against the Flag of Convenience
Fishing Industry

By
Darren S. Calley

MARTINUS
NIJHOFF
PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON
2012

Contents

Acknowledgements	ix
Acronyms and Abbreviations	xi
Chapter One Introduction	1
1.1 The Present Study: the Problem, the Solution and the Methodology	1
1.2 The Structure of the Study	3
1.3 Necessary Omissions	6
Chapter Two The Flag of Convenience Industry: Its Historical and Economic Pedigree, Contemporary Context and Relationship to High Seas Fishing	9
2.1 Introduction	9
2.2 A Brief History of Flags of Convenience	11
2.3 The Economic Drivers of Flags of Convenience	17
2.4 The Economic Incentives for States to Act as Flags of Convenience	21
2.5 Flags of Convenience and their Relationship with IUU Fishing	22
2.6 A Rogue State Come Good? How Belize is Cleaning Up its Act, but Vessel Owners Are Not	30
2.7 The On-going Links in the FOC Chain: Bolivia, Cambodia and Georgia	38
2.8 Conclusion	46
Chapter Three The Consequences of Flags of Convenience on the Marine Environment and Fisheries Sector	47
3.1 Introduction	47
3.2 How Great is the Problem of Flag of Convenience Fishing?	48
3.3 What Type of Environmental Damage is Caused by Flags of Convenience Vessels?	51
3.3.1 Longlines and Seabird Mortality	54
3.3.2 Purse Seine Fisheries and Dolphin Mortality	58
3.3.3 High Seas Bottom Trawling	63

3.4	The Impact on Individuals Employed in the Flag of Convenience Sector	71
3.5	Conclusion	74
Chapter Four The Laws of the Sea: The Legal Vacuum that has Created the Flag of Convenience Industry		
4.1	Introduction	75
4.2	Exclusive Flag State Jurisdiction over Vessels: Its Pedigree and Consequences	76
4.3	Vessel Registration: Can a Vessel Choose Which Flag to Fly?	83
4.4	The Origins of the Genuine Link Between Vessel and State	84
4.5	What is a Genuine Link?	86
4.6	A Dearth or the Death of the Genuine Link?	92
4.7	The Resurgence of the Genuine Link?	99
4.8	Conclusion	101
Chapter Five The Growing Use of Market Denial Strategies by Regional Fisheries Management Organisations		
5.1	Introduction	103
5.2	The Basis for Regional Co-operation	105
5.2.1	The UN Convention on the Law of the Sea	105
5.2.2	The UNFAO Compliance Agreement	107
5.2.3	The UN Fish Stocks Agreement	110
5.3	Regional Attempts to Tackle IUU Activities	114
5.4	The 'General Principles' of Ocean Governance: The Code of Conduct for Responsible Fishing	123
5.5	Regional Implementation of the Code and the International Plans of Action	125
5.5.1	RFMO Mandates: Which Regional Bodies Have Taken on the Competence to Regulate the Wider Marine Environment?	126
5.5.2	Linking Environmental Measures with Market Denial	134
5.5.3	How Certain Regional Measures can be Undermined by Ports of Convenience	141
5.6	Market Related Deterrents to IUU/FOC Activities	147
5.7	Case Study: CCAMLR's Catch Documentation Scheme	150
5.7.1	Practical Considerations of the CDS	153
5.7.2	The CDS and Environmental Harms	155
5.8	Conclusion	159

Chapter Six	Multilateral Trade Measures: How CITES Could be Used in the Fight Against IUU Fishing	161
6.1	Introduction	161
6.2	The Workings of CITES	162
6.2.1	CITES as a Convention	164
6.2.2	CITES as an Institution	169
6.3	CITES and Fish Stocks	173
6.3.1	Case Study on Patagonian Toothfish	175
6.3.2	Case Study on Atlantic Bluefin Tuna	181
6.4	A Residual Role for CITES in Relation to Other Important Fish Stocks	182
6.4.1	The Technical Burden To Listing Commercially Exploited Aquatic Species	183
6.4.2	Implementation and Legal Issues Surrounding CITES and Fish Stocks	185
	• The “Look Alike” Clause	185
	• Split-Listing	186
6.4.3	Administrative, Economic and Social Implications	190
6.5	On-going Legal Aspects – “Introduction From the Sea”	191
6.6	The Inherent and Practical Limits to CITES	199
6.7	Conclusion	203
Chapter Seven	International Trade Law: The WTO, GATT and Regional Free Trade	207
7.1	Introduction	207
7.2	The World Trade Organisation	208
7.3	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade	210
7.3.1	Article I: Most-favoured-nations	210
7.3.2	Article III: National Treatment	211
7.3.3	“Like” Products and the Product/Process Distinction	212
7.3.4	Article XI: Quantitative Restrictions	213
7.3.5	Article XX: General Exceptions	214
7.4	<i>Shrimp Turtle</i> : Clarity in the Face of Defeat	216
7.5	The Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade	220
7.6	The Applicability of WTO Rules to Multilateral Environmental Agreements	222
7.7	EC Council Regulation 1005/2008	223
7.7.1	Regulation 1005/2008 and Environmental Harms	227
7.8	Conclusion	228

Chapter Eight	Conclusions	229
Appendix One	Vessels Registration Movements to and from Belize between 2001–2005	233
Primary Source Referencing Materials		245
Global Treaties		245
International Organisations and their Proprietary Legislation		251
Regional Conventions and Legislation		256
Domestic Legislation		265
Table of Cases		266
Bibliography		269
Index		279