

Well-Being and Fair Distribution

Beyond Cost-Benefit Analysis

Matthew D. Adler

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

Introduction xiii

Chapter 1. Preliminaries: Morality, Consequentialism, Welfarism 1

I. What Is a Moral Decision Procedure? 2

A. Normative Evaluation, Moral Evaluation, and Persons 3

B. Morality, Social Norms, and Law 11

C. Moral Decision Procedures 14

II. Moral Facts and Moral Epistemology 16

A. Metaethics 16

B. Moral Epistemology 20

III. Consequentialism 22

A. Agent-Relative Constraints 24

B. Agent-Relative Options 29

IV. Welfarism 32

V. Welfarism: A Formal Characterization 38

Chapter 2. The SWF Approach and Its Competitors 57

I. The SWF Approach: An Introduction 61

A. What Is an SWF? 61

B. The Social Welfare Function in Welfare Economics and
Contemporary Policy Analysis 79

II. Cost-Benefit Analysis 88

A. Minimal Welfarist Criteria 92

B. Using CBA to Rank Outcomes: The Kaldor–Hicks Defense 98

C. CBA, Overall Well-Being, and the Ranking of Outcomes 104

D. Other Roles for CBA? 111

III. Inequality Metrics 114

A. Applying Inequality Metrics to the Distribution of Utility 119

B. Income Evaluation Functions and Equivalent Incomes 124

C. Applying the Pigou–Dalton Principle to Attributes 130

D. Egalitarian Equivalence 134

IV. Other Equity Metrics 137

A. Poverty Metrics 137

B. Social-Gradient Metrics 141

C. Tax Incidence Analysis 145

V. QALY-Based Cost-Effectiveness Analysis 148

Chapter 3. Well-Being and Interpersonal Comparisons 155*I. What Is Well-Being? Philosophical Debates* 158

A. Preferences, Mental States, and Objective Goods: Three Themes in the Philosophical Literature on Well-Being 159

B. Why the Debate? 170

C. Metaethical Disputes 181

II. Interpersonal Comparisons 185

A. The Generic Case for Interpersonal Comparisons 187

B. Harsanyi's "Extended Preference" Solution to the Puzzle of Interpersonal Comparisons 192

III. Well-Being: An Account 201

A. Own-History Preferences 202

B. Extended Preferences for Life-Histories in which the Spectator is not the Subject 204

C. Full Information and Rationality 213

D. Zeroing Out 216

E. Pooling Utility Functions 221

F. Why Is this an Attractive Account of Well-Being? 222

IV. Lingering Objections 225

A. Intertemporal and Interworld Change in Preferences 225

B. Respecting Individual Sovereignty 227

C. The Limits of EU Theory (Herein of Incompleteness) 229

D. Should We Use EU Theory to Construct a Difference Ordering? 231

Chapter 4. Estimating Utilities 237*I. Simplified Outcomes, Missing Attributes, and Extended Preferences* 241*II. Inferring Extended Preferences from Ordinary Preferences* 258

A. The Non-Essentiality Condition 260

B. What Is the Role of Life-History Surveys? 270

III. Inferring Extended Preferences: Further Notes and Caveats 275

A. Subjects' Preferences 275

B. Heterogeneity in Extended Preferences 279

C. Temporal Additivity 284

D. Happiness Data 297

E. Surveys or Revealed-Preference Data? 299

IV. Zeroing Out 302**Chapter 5. The Case for a Continuous Prioritarian SWF** 307*I. Fairness* 314

A. Fairness and the Separateness of Persons 314

B. Three Conceptions of Fairness: Veil of Ignorance, Claims within Outcomes, Claims across Outcomes 321

C. Is Morality Exhausted by Fairness? 338

II. <i>The Pigou–Dalton Principle</i>	339
A. The Utilitarian SWF	340
B. The Sufficientist SWF	345
III. <i>Separability</i>	351
IV. <i>Prioritarianism and Prioritarian SWFs, Continuous and Discontinuous</i>	356
A. What Is Prioritarianism?	360
B. The Leximin SWF	367
C. The Prioritarian SWF with a Lexical Threshold	374
D. “Numbers Win” Redux	377
V. <i>The Atkinson SWF</i>	378
A. Well-Being Ratios	379
B. The Atkinson SWF and Ratio Rescaling Invariance	383
C. Calibrating the Atkinson SWF	392
VI. <i>The Metaethics of the SWF</i>	399
Chapter 6. Lifetime Prioritarianism	405
I. <i>Personal Identity Over Time</i>	409
II. <i>Lifetime Well-Being</i>	414
A. The Structure of Lifetime Well-Being	414
B. Discounting	422
III. <i>The Basic Case for Lifetime Prioritarianism</i>	430
IV. <i>Does Parfit’s Reductionist Account of Personal Identity Undermine Lifetime Prioritarianism?</i>	442
A. Shifting from Persons to Momentary Time-Slices as the Units of Moral Concern?	443
B. Shifting from Persons to Person-Stages as the Units of Moral Concern?	450
C. Reducing the Moral Weight of Fairness?	453
V. <i>Intuitions about Equalization of Attributes or Sublifetime Well-Being</i>	454
A. Intrapersonal Equalization	455
B. Interpersonal Synchronization	463
C. Interpersonal Equalization	466
Chapter 7. Ranking Actions: Prioritarianism Under Uncertainty	477
I. <i>EU Theory</i>	481
A. EU Theory as a Generic Set of Bridge Principles	481
B. Meshing EU Theory with the Continuous Prioritarian SWF	490
II. <i>Defending EU Prioritarianism from the Targeted Objection</i>	496
A. The Targeted Objection: How EU Prioritarianism Violates the Ex Ante Pareto and Pigou–Dalton Principles	497
B. Responding to the Targeted Objection	506
C. Choosing a “Translation” Function (Herein of Ex Ante Separability)	518
D. Should We Reconsider the Continuous Prioritarian SWF?	524
III. <i>Generic Refinements to EU Theory</i>	530

- A. Incomplete Orderings (and Dynamic Choice) 531
- B. Imprecise Probabilities 542
- C. Uncertainty about the Ordering of Outcomes 545
- D. Strategic Interaction 547

Chapter 8. Next Steps 553

I. Law and Legally Optimal Structures 554

- A. Is it Optimal for Non-tax Bodies to use CBA? 560
- B. Does Everyone Benefit in the Long Run if Government uses CBA? 566
- C. The Abilities and Motivations of Government Officials
(Herein of Regulatory Review) 567

II. Relaxing the Population Assumption 571

- A. Non-identity Problems 571
- B. Variable Population Size 575
- C. Infinite Populations 576

III. Responsibility 579

Bibliography 585

Index 617