The Determination of the Nationality of Investors under Investment Protection Treaties

The International Law Association German Branch Sub-Committee on Investment Law

by

The Working Group

Christoph Benedict Richard Happ
Robert Hunter Lutz Kniprath
Patricia Nacimiento Markus Perkams
Anke Sessler

Patrick Fiedler Stephan Hobe
Ulrich Klemm Sabine Konrad
Hartmut Paulsen Marie Louise Seelig

Institute of Economic Law
Transnational Economic Law Research Center (TELC)
School of Law
Martin Luther University Halle-Wittenberg
TABLE OF CONTENTS

A. Introduction .................................................................................................................. 11

B. The Determination of Nationality of Investors in International Investment Agreements (IIAs) – Taking Stock of the Criteria Used in Modern Investment Law .................................................. 13
   I. Introduction ............................................................................................................. 13
   II. Overview of the Criteria Most Commonly Used ................................................. 13
       1. Juridical Persons .............................................................................................. 13
          a) The seat criterion ....................................................................................... 14
          b) The place of incorporation ......................................................................... 15
          c) The control criterion .................................................................................. 15
          d) Reference to the law of the home state ...................................................... 16
       2. Natural Persons ............................................................................................... 16
   III. The Definition of Investors under German IIAs ............................................. 17
       1. The definition of German investors abroad under German IIAs ............. 17
          a) Juridical Persons ....................................................................................... 17
             (1) The definition of German investors in existing IIAs ...................... 18
                (a) The three criteria in German IIAs ............................................... 18
                (b) Further elements for the definition of German investors ......... 18
             (2) The definition of German investors in the new Model IIA .......... 19
          b) Natural Persons .......................................................................................... 20
       2. The definition of foreign investors in Germany under German IIAs ...... 20
          a) Juridical Persons ....................................................................................... 20
             (1) The three criteria with regard to foreign investors in Germany .... 20
             (2) Further criteria used in the definition of the term foreign investors...
                in Germany ............................................................................................. 21
          b) Natural persons .......................................................................................... 22
       3. The interpretation of the term investor in German IIAs by arbitral tribunals .......................................................................................................................... 23
          a) Sedelmayer v. Russian Federation (Germany-Union of the Soviet Socialist Republics IIA) .......................................................... 23
          b) Siemens v. Argentina (Germany-Argentina IIA) ......................................... 24

C. Impact of MoMiG on “Sitztheorie” / “Gründungstheorie” – Consequences for German BITs ........................................................................................................... 25
   I. Introduction ............................................................................................................. 25
   II. Brief Introduction to MoMiG and the Transition from Seat Theory (Sitztheorie) to Incorporation Theory (Gründungstheorie) ................................................................. 26
   III. Previous Legal Situation: Determination of the Nationality of the Investor Under German BITs According to the “Old” Corporation Law ......................................... 27
IV. Novel Legal Situation: Determination of the Nationality of the Investor Under German BITs According to the “New” Corporation Law
1. Two alternative answers to this question are conceivable:
   a) First Alternative: A corporation which moves its administrative seat outside of Germany no longer enjoys protection under the German BIT.
   b) Second Alternative: A corporation which moves its administrative seat outside of Germany still enjoys protection under the German BIT.
2. Discussion and Conclusion
V. Several Issues Arising in Connection with the Transition as Effectuated by MoMiG:
1. Do Already Transacted Investments Lose Protection if the Corporate Investor Moves Its Administrative Seat Abroad?
2. Do Investors Who Did Not Enjoy Protection Under German BITs Under Previous Law Gain Protection Under the New Law?
3. Structuring Prospective Foreign Investments: Increase in Flexibility and Legal Certainty?
VI. Concluding Remarks
D. The Nationality of Corporations
I. Is a corporation’s entitlement to the Protection of an Investment Treaty a question solely of form or is it also a question of substance?
1. Introduction
2. Range of possible results should BIT protection be afforded solely on the basis of formal criteria
3. Are BITs Permeable to Rules of General International Law?
4. Possible Additional Rules of General International Law
   a) ‘Effective Link’ Principle
   b) Abuse of rights
5. Conclusion
II. The Nationality of Corporations in International Investment Law
1. Introduction
2. Policy Considerations
3. Jurisprudence
4. Dogmatic Considerations
   a) No basis for applying external standards
   b) No external standards
5. Conclusion
E. Consideration of Denial of Benefit Clauses and any Other Mechanisms that Limit the Scope of BITs for Investors
I. Introduction
II. History, Development and Usage of such clauses
III. Analysis of these clauses
   1. Individual elements
   2. Function of denial of benefit clauses