AGRICULTURAL IMPORT SURGES IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

Analytical framework and insights from case studies

Edited by
Manitra A. Rakotoarisoa,
Ramesh P. Sharma
and
David Hallam

TRADE AND MARKETS DIVISION
FOOD AND AGRICULTURE ORGANIZATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS
Rome, 2011
Agricultural import surges in developing countries: Analytical framework and insights from case studies

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS XIII
ACRONYMS XV

PART 1:
IMPORT SURGES: THEORETICAL AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION 3
1.1 WHY THIS BOOK? 3
1.2 OBJECTIVES 4
1.3 ORGANIZATION OF THIS BOOK 4
1.4 DEFINITION OF IMPORT SURGES 4
1.5 WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION (WTO) PROVISIONS: SAFEGUARDS MECHANISMS 5
REFERENCES 8

CHAPTER 2: IDENTIFICATION OF IMPORT SURGES 11
2.1 OVERVIEW ON THE IDENTIFICATION OF IMPORT SURGES 11
2.2 QUANTITATIVE THRESHOLD TO DEFINE AN IMPORT SURGE AND ITS DURATION 11
   2.2.1 Quantitative threshold 11
   2.2.2 Duration of the surge 13
2.3 LENGTH OF TIME TO BE INVESTIGATED AND DATA USE 13
2.4 VARIOUS IDENTIFICATION ISSUES:
   2.4.1 Subproducts in a dispute involving a grouped product 14
   2.4.2 Net versus gross import 14
2.5 CONCLUDING REMARKS 14
REFERENCES 18

CHAPTER 3: POTENTIAL SOURCES OF IMPORT SURGES 21
3.1 MAIN TYPES OF CONTRIBUTING FACTORS 21
3.2 POTENTIAL DOMESTIC CAUSES 21
   3.2.1 Domestic production shortfalls 21
   3.2.2 Domestic market liberalization and reforms 21
   3.2.3 Border policy reforms (trade liberalization and trade reforms) 22
   3.2.4 Appreciation or revaluation of the currency 22
   3.2.5 Opening to foreign direct investment 22
   3.2.6 Other demand shocks 22
   3.2.7 Other domestic causes 23
3.3 POTENTIAL EXTERNAL CAUSES 23
Agricultural import surges in developing countries: Analytical framework and insights from case studies

3.3.1 Export subsidies
3.3.2 Export credits
3.3.3 Domestic supports
3.3.4 Food aid
3.3.5 Changes in policies of state trading enterprises (STE)
3.3.6 Depreciation, devaluation of the currency
3.3.7 Concentration of trade and markets
3.3.8 Other market shocks that can result in sharp declines in commodity prices

3.4 CONCLUDING REMARKS: INTERACTION OF THE VARIOUS CAUSES

APPENDIX 3.1: AGRICULTURAL SUBSIDIES, THE URUGUAY ROUND AND IMPORT SURGES

REFERENCES

CHAPTER 4: CONSEQUENCES OF IMPORT SURGES

4.1 ASSESSMENT ISSUES
4.2 IMPORT SURGE IN A SMALL OPEN ECONOMY AND MAJOR CONSEQUENCES
4.3 LEGAL WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION (WTO) CONCEPTS OF INJURY AND THREAT OF INJURY
4.3.1 Serious injury
4.3.2 Threat of serious injury
4.3.3 Material injury and threat of material injury
4.4 A STANDARD ANALYTICAL APPROACH TO AN INJURY INVESTIGATION
4.5 DETERMINING WHICH PRODUCT IS REALLY AFFECTED: PRODUCT ELIGIBILITY, LIKE AND COMPETITIVE PRODUCTS
4.5.1 Like products
4.5.2 Directly competitive products
4.5.3 Directly competitive or substitutable products in GATT Article III
4.5.4 Mapping the industry/sector
4.6 NON-ATTRIBUTION ANALYSIS
4.7 IMPACT INDICATORS
4.8 MEASURING THE IMPACTS
4.9 PRICE ANALYSIS
4.9.1 For self-sufficient markets
4.9.2 For markets supplied by imports
4.9.3 Implications
4.10 PRICE TRANSMISSION MECHANISMS
4.10.1 The nature of price transmission and import surges
4.10.2 Application methodology
4.10.3 Recommendations for applied analysis
4.11 CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSIONS
REFERENCES

CHAPTER 5: APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY FOR THE ANALYSIS IMPORT SURGES

5.1 CHALLENGES IN STUDYING IMPORT SURGES IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

iv
Agricultural import surges in developing countries: Analytical framework and insights from case studies

5.1.1 Terminology and definition ambiguity
5.1.2 Lack of information
5.1.3 Confusion over concurrent sources of import surges
5.1.4 Confusion over the identification of injuries

5.2 OVERALL ANALYTICAL APPROACH

5.3 IDENTIFICATION OF THE PROBLEM AND COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS OF BASIC TRADE STATISTICS AND POLICY INFORMATION

5.4 ANALYSIS OF COMPETITION, CAUSAL RELATIONS, INJURY AND NON-ATTRIBUTION ISSUES

5.5 CONCLUDING REMARKS: ANALYSIS OF THE INSTITUTIONAL CAPABILITY FOR A TRADE SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM

APPENDIX 5.1: QUALITATIVE APPROACH: REVIEW OF VARIOUS STAKEHOLDERS TO THE SURGE

APPENDIX 5.2: IDENTIFICATION OF COMMODITY-SPECIFIC INJURY INDICATORS: THE CASE OF CHICKEN QUARTERS

APPENDIX 5.3: TOOLS TO ANALYSE COMPETITIVENESS

APPENDIX 5.4: THE CASE OF PIG AND PIG MEAT INDUSTRIES: AUSTRALIAN SAFEGUARD ACTION AGAINST IMPORTS

REFERENCES

PART 2: IMPORT SURGES IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES: EVIDENCE AND INSIGHTS FROM CASE STUDIES

CHAPTER 6: PRESENTATION OF THE CASE STUDIES

6.1 INTRODUCTION
6.2 CASE STUDIES: THE COUNTRIES AND COMMODITIES
6.2.1 Cameroon
6.2.2 Côte d'Ivoire
6.2.3 Ghana
6.2.4 Honduras
6.2.5 Jamaica
6.2.6 Kenya
6.2.7 Malawi
6.2.8 Mozambique
6.2.9 The Philippines
6.2.10 Sri Lanka
6.2.11 The United Republic of Tanzania

6.3 CONCLUDING REMARKS

REFERENCES

CHAPTER 7: IDENTIFYING IMPORT SURGES AND THEIR CAUSES IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

7.1 OVERVIEW OF THE IDENTIFICATION PROCESS
7.2 INCIDENCE OF IMPORT SURGES IN SELECTED COUNTRIES
Agricultural import surges in developing countries: Analytical framework and insights from case studies

7.2.1 Cameroon: poultry, rice, vegetable oil
7.2.2 Côte d'Ivoire: rice, poultry, sugar
7.2.3 Ghana: poultry, rice, tomato paste
7.2.4 Honduras: rice
7.2.5 Jamaica: dairy, onion, poultry
7.2.6 Kenya: dry milk powder, maize, sugar
7.2.7 Malawi: dairy (fresh and dry whole milk), maize, sugar
7.2.8 Mozambique: poultry and vegetable oil
7.2.9 Philippines: onions, tobacco
7.2.10 Sri Lanka: dairy
7.2.11 The United Republic of Tanzania: dairy, maize, rice

7.3 INTERNAL CAUSES OF IMPORT SURGES
7.3.1 Low productivity and lack of competitiveness in the domestic sector
7.3.2 High production risks with lack of management tools
7.3.3 Trade policy reforms
7.3.4 Trading arrangements
7.3.5 Domestic market reforms and policies
7.3.6 Exchange rate movement (sudden appreciation)
7.3.7 Demand shocks
7.3.8 Other internal causes

7.4 EXTERNAL CAUSES OF IMPORT SURGES
7.4.1 Mixed views on the effects of OECD production and export subsidies on import surges
7.4.2 Food aid
7.4.3 State trading
7.4.4 Currency devaluation
7.4.5 Some remarks on export credits

7.5 INTERACTIONS AND COMBINATION OF CAUSES
7.6 CONCLUSION

APPENDIX 7.1: IMPORT SURGE CASES REPORTED IN FAO COUNTRY CASE STUDIES
APPENDIX 7.2: POTENTIAL CAUSES OF POULTRY MEAT IMPORT SURGES
APPENDIX 7.3: POTENTIAL CAUSES OF DAIRY IMPORT SURGES IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES
REFERENCES

CHAPTER 8: CONSEQUENCES AND IMPLICATIONS OF IMPORT SURGES IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

8.1 INJURIES AND CONSEQUENCES
8.2 PRICE COMPETITION
8.3 DECREASES IN VOLUME OF PRODUCTION, MARKET SHARES AND PROFITS
8.4 ANY BENEFICIARIES BEYOND CONSUMERS?
8.5 NON-ATTRIBUTION ANALYSIS
8.6 CONCLUDING REMARKS: SOME UNADDRESSED MEASUREMENT ISSUES
8.6.1 Dynamics of the impacts of import surge
8.6.2 Causality and sequence problems
8.6.3 Path-dependence (persistence)
REFERENCES
CHAPTER 9: RESPONSES TO IMPORT SURGES IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES 123

9.1 OVERVIEW OF THE TYPES OF RESPONSES 123
9.2 SECTOR RESPONSES 123
9.3 GOVERNMENT INTERVENTIONS 123
  9.3.1 Import restriction and tariff hike 123
  9.3.2 Reversing the domestic market reforms 126
  9.3.3 Investment and addressing market failure 126
  9.3.4 Monitoring and trade surveillance 126
  9.3.5 No direct interventions: should import surges be encouraged? 126
9.4 CONCLUDING REMARKS 127
REFERENCES 127

CHAPTER 10: CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS 129

10.1 SUMMARIZING THE APPROACH AND FINDINGS 129
10.2 IMPLICATIONS: WHAT CAN BE LEARNED FROM THE CASE STUDIES? 130
  10.2.1 No single approach for the study of import surge 130
  10.2.2 Institutions, productivity and competitiveness are key to prevent surge 130
  10.2.3 Need for a full account of import surge consequences before intervention 130
  10.2.4 Need for clear political economy and priority setting 130
  10.2.5 On the trade off between pursuing agricultural market and trade liberalization reforms (openness), and protecting import competing sector: is it really an issue? 131
10.3 HOW DO THESE FINDINGS SQUARE WITH OTHER STUDIES? 131
10.4 MOVING FORWARD: IMPORT SURGES IN THE CURRENT CONTEXT 131
  10.4.1 Trade monitoring and capacity and rigorous analytical framework 131
  10.4.2 Poverty and food insecurity 132
APPENDIX 10.1: EXAMPLES OF OTHER IMPORT SURGE STUDIES 133
REFERENCES 136

PART 3: SELECTED IMPORT SURGE PAPERS FROM THE FAO COUNTRY CASE STUDIES

ANNEX I: THE EXTENT AND IMPACT OF DAIRY PRODUCTS, SUGAR AND MAIZE IMPORT SURGES IN KENYA 139

1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND 139
  1.1 BACKGROUND AND THE RATIONALE FOR THE CASE STUDY 139
  1.2 THE STUDY PROCESS 140
    1.2.1 Qualitative surveys 140
    1.2.2 Quantitative survey: focus on the types of data collected 140
  1.3 ANALYTICAL METHODOLOGY FOR THE IDENTIFICATION OF IMPORT SURGES 141
2. FOOD IMPORTS AND IMPORT SURGES 141
2.1 INTRODUCTION
2.2 DAIRY IMPORT SURGES
  2.2.1 The nature and behaviour of the dairy imports in Kenya
  2.2.2 Identification of dry milk powders import surges
2.3 SUGAR IMPORT SURGES
  2.3.1 The nature and behaviour of the sugar imports in Kenya
  2.3.2 Identification of sugar import surges
2.4 MAIZE IMPORT SURGES
  2.4.1 The nature and behaviour of the maize imports in Kenya
  2.4.2 Identification of maize import surges
3. MAPPING THE SECTOR: THE PRODUCT AND MARKET CHARACTERISTICS
  3.1 OVERVIEW
  3.2 MAPPING THE DAIRY SECTOR
    3.2.1 Product description and the country context
    3.2.2 Dairy products and their importance to Kenya's economy
    3.2.3 The cost of imported dry milk powders and the price-quantity relationships in Kenya
3.3 MAPPING THE SUGAR SECTOR
  3.3.1 Product Description and the Country Context
  3.3.2 Sugar and its importance to Kenya’s economy
  3.3.3 The cost of imported sugar and the behaviour of the sugar consumer prices in Kenya
3.4 MAPPING THE MAIZE SECTOR
  3.4.1 Product description and the country context
  3.4.2 Maize and its importance to Kenya’s economy
  3.4.3 The cost of imported maize and the maize price - quantity relationships in Kenya
4. INJURY ANALYSIS: THE INJURY INDICATORS
  4.1 DAIRY SECTOR
  4.2 SUGAR SECTOR
  4.3 MAIZE SECTOR
5. FOOD IMPORT SURGES: ATTRIBUTION AND NON-ATTRIBUTION FACTORS
  5.1 THE MAJOR FACTORS THAT INFLUENCE FOOD IMPORTS IN KENYA
    5.1.1 General economic environment and the consumer purchasing power
    5.1.2 Kenya’s general policy framework
    5.1.3 Kenya’s trade policy
    5.1.4 Customs and other statutory requirements
    5.1.5 Other related economic and non-economic factors
  5.2 FOOD IMPORT SURGES: ATTRIBUTION AND NON-ATTRIBUTION ISSUES
6. GOVERNMENT RESPONSE TO IMPORT SURGES
7. FOOD IMPORTS SURVEILLANCE
8. CONCLUSIONS
  8.1 DAIRY IMPORT SURGES
  8.2 SUGAR IMPORT SURGES
  8.3 MAIZE IMPORT SURGES
9. BIBLIOGRAPHY AND APPENDICES
  9.1 Literature reviewed