Investing in Kids
Early Childhood Programs and Local Economic Development

Timothy J. Bartik

2011

W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research
Kalamazoo, Michigan
# Contents

Acknowledgments xix

1 Introduction  1
   Clarifying Previous Thinking  3
   The Advantages of Thinking and Acting Locally  7
   Why Consider Early Childhood Programs and Business Incentives Together?  7
   A Road Map for This Book  9

2 The Nature and Importance of Local Economic Development Benefits, and How They Are Affected by Labor Demand and Labor Supply  13
   What is Local Economic Development Policy?  15
   The Importance of Local Economic Development  16
   Hysteresis: An Argument for Why Local Job Growth Development Might Help Workers  21
   But Why Are Jobs Said to Offer "Benefits"? Is There "Something Special" about Jobs?  22
   But Why Are Local Jobs So Important? After All, I Could Get Those Same Job Opportunities Elsewhere  27
   Other Possible Benefits of Local Job Growth  28
   Where the Rubber Hits the Road: Empirical Evidence on the Effects of Increases in Local Labor Demand  30
   Not Everyone Agrees: The Blanchard-Katz Perspective and Its Policy Implications  33
   The Zero-Sum-Game Argument: Why Care about Local Benefits When What Count Are National Benefits?  36
   If Growth Provides Benefits, Why Worry about the Details?  38
   What Are the Labor Supply Policies That Affect the Quantity or Quality of Labor Supply in a State or Local Area?  40
   What Are the Key Issues in How Early Childhood and Other Labor Supply Programs Affect Local Economic Development Benefits?  40
   Two Perspectives on the Benefits to Out-Movers  42
   How Mobile Is the U.S. Population?  43
How Will a State or Local Area’s Employers Respond to a Local Increase in Labor Force Participation or Job Skills? 45
What about the Response at the National Level? 48
Conclusion 49

3 Estimated Economic Development Effects of Well-Designed Business Incentive Programs 53
Types of Business Incentives 56
Business Incentive Effects 63
Financing and Design of Incentives 65
Effects of Local Job Growth on Local Workers 68
Response to Possible Objections 70
Conclusion 73

4 The Economic Development Effects of High-Quality Early Childhood Programs 77
Context of These Three Early Childhood Programs 78
Summary of Economic Development Benefits 79
Why You Should Care about 1 Percent Effects on Earnings 89
Program Description 91
Modeling Economic Development Effects, Part 1: Spending 100
Modeling Economic Development Effects, Part 2: State Labor Market Effects of Increased Labor Supply of Parents or Former Child Participants 103
Does This Analysis Treat Early Childhood Programs Fairly Compared to Business Incentives? 104
Conclusion 110

5 Design Matters: What Features of Business Incentive Programs and Early Childhood Programs Affect Their Economic Development Benefits? 113
Business Incentives 113
Early Childhood Programs 129
Conclusion 148

6 Dealing with the Known Unknowns: How Policymakers Should Deal with Dueling Estimates from Researchers 159
Sources of Uncertainty 159
The Best Response to Uncertainty 166
Conclusion 171
13 Thinking and Acting Locally: What Potential Is There for Local Support for High-Quality Early Childhood Programs?

Early Childhood Programs and Local Economic Development: How Do They Fit into the Big Issues?
What Can and Should Be Done Locally?
Is Local Action Really Politically Feasible?
New Thinking about Early Childhood Programs and Local Economic Development

References
The Author
Index
About the Institute

Tables

3.1 Michigan’s Current Economic Development Budget
4.1 Comparison of Scale of Three Early Childhood Programs When Operated at Full Scale, in Number of Child Participants per Cohort, Present Value of Net Costs per Child, and Present Value of Costs per Cohort
4.2 Present Value of Earnings Effects on State Residents, Costs, and Net Effects of Three Early Childhood Programs
4.3 Long-Run Percentage Effects on State Residents’ Employment and Earnings of Three Early Childhood Programs, Compared to Business Incentives
7.1 Effects of Alternative Discount Rate Assumptions on Ratio of Present Value of State Economic Development Benefits to Program Costs, for Business Incentives and for Three Early Childhood Programs
7.2 Annual Rate of Return to Business Incentives and Three Early Childhood Programs, from a State Economic Development Perspective
7.3 Possible Capitalization Effects of Universal Pre-K Education