TRADE AND PUBLIC HEALTH

THE WTO, TOBACCO, ALCOHOL, AND DIET

BENN MCGRADY
O’Neill Institute for National and Global Health Law,
Georgetown University

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
# Contents

 Preface

 Abbreviations

 1. Intersections between Trade and Noncommunicable Disease
     1. Introduction
        1.1. The Importance of Examining the Issues in Greater Detail
            A. Tobacco
            B. Alcohol
            C. Diet
            D. Justifications for Government Intervention in Each Area
     2. The Approach of This Study
        2.1. Determinacy
        2.2. Balancing Trade and Health
            A. Prohibitions and Obligations
            B. The Interaction of Different International Instruments and Regimes
     3. Outline
        4. Limitations

 2. Normative Integration: Using Health Instruments in Interpretation of the WTO-Covered Agreements
     1. Overview of Relevant Health Instruments
     2. Using Health Norms in Interpretation of the WTO-Covered Agreements

 page xiii
 xv

1

1

14

14

15

17

18

21

22

23

27

28

29

30

34

35

38
2.1. The Use of Extraneous Rules and Resolutions as Evidence of Facts 38
2.2. The Use of Extraneous Instruments without Recourse to an Enabling Rule 39
2.3. The Use of Standards under the SPS and TBT Agreements 42
2.4. Treaty Rules and Article 31(3)(c) of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 45
   A. The Article 31(3)(c) Debate 47
   B. Wording and Context 50
   C. The Merits of the Restrictive View 55
   D. The Merits of the Divergent View 59
   E. The Merits of the Broad View 71
   F. Which View Should Be Preferred? 73
   G. Can Either the Divergent or Broad Interpretation Apply in the Context of the WTO? 74
   H. Do Temporal Requirements Prevent the Use of Treaties Such as the FCTC in Interpretation of the WTO Agreement? 76
   I. Conclusion on Article 31(3)(c) 77
2.5. Conclusion on Normative Integration 78

3. Freedom to Use Taxes, Subsidies, and Restrictions on Marketing 80
   1. Price Measures 84
      1.1. How the Covered Agreements Apply to Tax Measures 87
         A. The First Sentence of Article III:2 91
         B. The Second Sentence of Article III:2 94
         C. Article III:4 and Price Floors 100
         D. The Use of Tariffs to Encourage Healthy Consumption Habits 101
      1.2. Subsidies to Encourage Production and Consumption of Healthful Goods 103
         A. Differential Taxes and the SCM Agreement 104
         B. Agricultural Subsidies 109
   2. Restrictions on Marketing 112
      2.1. The GATT and the Impact of Advertising Bans on Tobacco Products 115
A. Advertising Bans and National Treatment under Article III:4 116
B. Advertising Bans as Quantitative Restrictions under Article XI:1 118

2.2. The GATS
A. The Prohibitive Content of the GATS 120
B. Specific Commitments 122
C. Conclusion on Application of the GATS 126

3. Conclusion 127

4. Necessity and Regulatory Autonomy under the GATT 130
1. Overlaps between the Covered Agreements 133
   1.1. Differential Taxation: Overlaps between the GATT, the Agreement on Agriculture, and the SCM Agreement 133
   1.2. Advertising: The GATT and the GATS 136
2. Application of the GATT Necessity Test 136
   2.1. Measures Necessary to Protect Health 137
       A. Characterizing a Regulatory Goal and the Level of Protection Sought 139
       B. Applying the Necessity Test by Reference to the Various Factors 143
       C. Reasonably Available Alternatives 155
       D. Conclusions on the Necessity Test, Tobacco, Alcohol, and Diet 164
   2.2. The Requirements of the Chapeau 165
3. Conclusion 168

5. Product Regulation and Labeling Measures under the SPS and TBT Agreements 170
1. Which Types of Measures Is the SPS Agreement Applicable to? 175
   1.1. Tobacco-Control Measures 176
   1.2. Alcohol 178
   1.3. Diet 178
2. Applying the Requirements of the SPS Agreement to Food Regulation 180
2.1. A Positive Requirement of Necessity 181

2.2. Risk Assessment, Scientific Principles, and Necessity 184
   A. Basing a Measure on a Risk Assessment 185
   B. Provisional Measures under Article 5.7 187
   C. Inconsistent Approaches to Risk Where Risk Turns Largely on Consumer Behavior 189
   D. Least Trade-Restrictive Means 191

2.3. Concluding Observations on Product Regulation under the SPS Agreement 194

3. Food-Labeling Measures under the SPS Agreement 194
   3.1. Application of the SPS Agreement to Labeling Measures 195

4. Application of the TBT Agreement to Labeling Measures, Bans on Flavored Cigarettes, and Alcopops 200
   4.1. When Is a Technical Regulation Trade Restrictive? 203
   4.2. Legitimate Objectives 205
   4.3. Measures That Are More Trade Restrictive Than Necessary 206

5. Conclusion 213

6. Reallocating Authority at the International Level: Delegation, Legalization, and Harmonization 215
   1. Delegation 218
      1.1. Who Should Make the Decisions? 218
      1.2. Can the Relevant Rules Be Theorized in a More Complete Manner? 221
         A. Case Study: The “Exclusion” of Tobacco from Trade Agreements 222
         B. Case Study: The Grant of a Waiver 225
         C. Conclusion on “Completely Theorizing” the Relationship 227
   2. International Legalization 228
      2.1. Binding and Nonbinding Instruments 229
      2.2. Conflicts between Treaties 234
         A. The Express Language of the FCTC and WTO Agreement 235
         B. Overlapping Subject Matter 236
         C. Overlapping Parties 242