# Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations  .................................................. xxix
Acknowledgements ......................................................... xxxi
Introduction .................................................................. xxxiii

**Part 1**  
The General Agreement on Trade in Services: History, Structure and Basic Principles 1

**Chapter 1**  
The General Agreement on Trade in Services 3
1.1 International Trade in Services 3
1.1.1 The International Trade Arena 3
1.1.2 Barriers to Trade 4
1.1.3 International Trade in Services 5
1.2 The Legal Framework and its Historic Evolution 11
1.2.1 From GATT (1947), to WTO (1994) 11
1.2.2 GATS History: The Uruguay Round (1986–1994) 14
1.2.3 Why Services Were Not Included in GATT? 16
1.2.4 GATS Drafts 16
1.2.5 The ‘GATS 2000’ 17
1.2.6 Conclusion 17

**Chapter 2**  
The Framework of GATS 19
2.1 The Framework of GATS 19
2.1.1 A Structure Typical to International Trade Agreements 19
2.1.2 The Structure of GATS 19
# Table of Contents

2.2 The Preamble 20
2.3 Rules of Origin 20
2.4 Part I 21
  2.4.1 The Definition of ‘Services’ 21
  2.4.2 GATS Scope of Application 21
    2.4.2.1 Application to Service Suppliers 21
    2.4.2.2 Application to All Government Levels 21
2.5 Part II 22
  2.5.1 General Framework 22
  2.5.2 Unconditional Obligations 22
    2.5.2.1 Most Favoured Nation 22
    2.5.2.2 Transparency 23
    2.5.2.3 Recognition 23
    2.5.2.4 Business Practices 24
  2.5.3 Conditional Obligations 24
    2.5.3.1 Domestic Regulation 24
    2.5.3.2 Monopolies and Exclusive Service Suppliers 24
    2.5.3.3 Payments and Transfers 25
    2.5.3.4 Increased Participation of Developing Countries 25
2.6 Exceptions to the Agreement’s Obligations 25
  2.6.1 Economic Integration Agreements 25
    2.6.1.1 Labour Markets’ Integration 26
  2.6.2 Restrictions to Safeguard the Balance of Payments 26
  2.6.3 General and Security Exceptions 26
2.7 Part III: Specific Commitments 27
  2.7.1 Market Access 27
  2.7.2 Quantitative Restrictions 28
  2.7.3 Qualitative Restrictions 28
    2.7.3.1 National Treatment 28
    2.7.3.2 Non-discrimination: Additional Commitments 28
2.8 Institutional Provisions 29
  2.8.1 Part V 29
  2.8.2 Part VI 29
    2.8.2.1 Denial of Benefits 29
    2.8.2.2 GATS Sector-Specific Instruments 30
2.9 Subjects Still Under Negotiation 30
2.10 Conclusion 31

# Chapter 3

## GATS Interpretation 33

3.1 Introduction 33
3.2 The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969 34
3.3 Interpretation in Good Faith 36
3.4 ‘Object and Purpose’ 37
3.5 The Text 38
Table of Contents

3.5.1 The Preamble 39
3.5.2 Annexes and Additional Instruments 41
3.5.3 Schedules of Specific Commitments 42
3.5.4 Footnotes 42
3.5.5 Interpretation of the Text by the WTO Adjudicating Bodies 43

3.6 The Context 44
3.6.1 Any Subsequent Practice 45
3.6.2 WTO Agreements 46
   3.6.2.1 Alternative Legal Basis 46
   3.6.2.2 Means of Interpretation 48
   3.6.2.3 GATS-GATT Relationship 48
3.6.3 'Any Relevant Rules of International Law' 50

3.7 Supplementary Means 50
3.7.1 Preparatory Work 51

3.8 Broader Policy Considerations 52
3.8.1 The International Arena: The Hidden Layer of Interpretative Context 52
3.8.2 Other International Organizations 53
   3.8.2.1 Inter-organizational Cooperation for the Achievement of Common Goals 53
   3.8.2.2 Other International Organizations as Alternative Frameworks 54
   3.8.2.3 Other International Organizations as Complementary Frameworks 54
3.8.3 GATS: A WTO Agreement 54
   3.8.3.1 The WTO: A Politically Motivated Organization 55

3.9 A Dynamic Agreement in a Changing Reality 55
3.10 Conclusion 56

Part 2
GATS in Details 57

Chapter 4
GATS Scope of Application 59
4.1 GATS Provision 59
   4.1.1 The Considerations behind Drafting 59
4.2 GATS Article 1:1 Coverage: Before Any Substantive Assessment 60
4.3 Legal Analysis 60
   4.3.1 Measures 61
   4.3.2 'Whether in the Form of Law, Regulation, Rule, Procedure, Decision, Administrative Action or Any Other Form' 61
   4.3.3 The Interpretation of 'Measure' in Article 3.3 DSU 62
4.3.4 GATT Experience 63
4.3.5 Specific Groups of Measures 64
Table of Contents

4.3.5.1 Five Categories Examined by the Sub-Committee for Trade in Services 64
4.3.5.2 Electronic Commerce 65
4.3.5.3 Can a Practice Be Considered ‘A Measure’? 65
4.3.6 ‘Measures by Members’ 66
  4.3.6.1 GATS Provision 66
  4.3.6.2 Comparison to GATT Provisions 68
    4.3.6.2.1 Application to Non-governmental Bodies 68
    4.3.6.2.2 The Reasonability Standard 68
    4.3.6.2.3 The Conditions for Assuming Central Government Responsibility over Acts of Lower Government Levels 70
    4.3.6.2.4 The Same Standard of Behaviour for All Government Levels 70
  4.3.7 Measures by Members, Affecting Trade in Services 72
    4.3.7.1 Distinguishing the Source from the Effect of a Measure 72
    4.3.7.2 Examples of ‘Measures’ 73
      4.3.7.2.1 Measures in Respect of the Purchase, Payment or Use of a Service 74
      4.3.7.2.2 Measures in Respect of the Access and Use of Public Ancillary Services 74
      4.3.7.2.3 Measures in Respect of the Presence of Foreign Persons 75
      4.3.7.2.4 The List Is Indicative 75
        4.3.7.2.4.1 Only Measures Affecting Services and Service Suppliers 75
        4.3.7.2.4.2 Two Explicit Exceptions 77
    4.3.7.3 ‘By Members’ 77
    4.3.7.4 Affecting 77
      4.3.7.4.1 A Link between Measures and Trade 77
      4.3.7.4.2 The Order of Examination 78
      4.3.7.4.3 Broad Scope of Application 78
        4.3.7.4.3.1 Not Necessarily Aiming Directly at Services 79
        4.3.7.4.3.2 Modification of Competitive Conditions 80
4.3.7.4.4 GATT Interpretation 80
4.3.7.4.5 Decision Must Be Based on Facts 80
4.3.7.5 Services: ‘Except Services Supplied in the Exercise of Governmental Authority’ 81
4.3.7.5.1 ‘Supplied... on a Commercial Basis’ 82
4.3.7.5.2 ‘Competition’ 83
4.3.7.5.3 ‘Governmental Authority’ 84

4.4 Conclusion 85

Chapter 5
GATS Rules of Origin 87
5.1 Introduction 87
5.1.1 Rules of Origin and Their Role 87
5.1.2 Rules of Origin as Barriers to Trade 88
5.1.3 Rules of Origin for International Trade in Goods 88
5.1.4 GATT-WTO Rules of Origin 89
5.1.5 Rules of Origin for Trade in Services 89
5.2 GATS Rules of Origin 90
5.2.1 Service of Another Member 90
5.2.1.1 Five Options 91
5.2.1.2 Cases of a Mixed Source 92
5.2.1.3 Persons 92
5.2.2 Natural Person of Another Member 93
5.2.3 Juridical Person of Another Member 97
5.2.4 The Relationship between the Definitions of ‘Service Supplier’ and ‘Commercial Presence’ 101
5.3 The Criticism on GATS Rules of Origin 102
5.3.1 Narrow Scope of Application 102
5.3.2 Unclear, Vague Language 102
5.4 The Relationship Between GATS Rules of Origin and the Rules of Origin of Members 103
5.5 Conclusion 104

Chapter 6
The Most Favoured Nation Principle 105
6.1 Introduction 105
6.2 The Burden of Proof 106
6.3 Scope of Application 107
6.3.1 Measures 107
6.3.1.1 ‘Affecting’ 108
6.4 ‘Immediately and Unconditionally’ 108
6.4.1 ‘Immediately’ 109
6.4.2 ‘Unconditionally’ 109
6.4.3 No Offset of More Favourable with Less Favourable Treatment 111
Table of Contents

6.4.4 List of Exemptions 111
   6.4.4.1 Aspects of Examination in a Dispute Involving a Claim Concerning an MFN Exemption Listed in the Exemptions List 114
6.4.5 Exchanges of Services in Frontier Zones 114
6.4.6 Additional Exceptions to the MFN Principle 114
6.5 Services and Service Suppliers Entitled to MFN Treatment 115
6.6 The 'No Less Favourable Treatment' Standard 116
   6.6.1 Interpretation of 'No Less Favourable Treatment’ by WTO Adjudicating Bodies 116
      6.6.1.1 Broad Scope of Application 116
      6.6.1.2 A Similar Standard: Preventing Discrimination De Facto and De Jure 117
      6.6.1.3 The Competitive Opportunities Test 118
         6.6.1.3.1 Vertical Integration, Exclusive Distribution Arrangements and Mutuality Agreements 120
         6.6.1.3.2 The Aim-and-Effect Test 121
      6.6.1.4 Minimum Standard 121
6.6.2 ‘Like’ Services and Service Suppliers 122
6.7 Conclusion 124

Chapter 7
Schedules of Specific Commitments 125
7.1 Introduction 125
7.2 The Relevant GATS Provisions 127
   7.2.1 ‘Specify’ (Article XX:1) 128
   7.2.2 ‘Terms’, ‘Limitations’, ‘Conditions’, ‘Qualifications’ 128
   7.2.3 Broad Interpretation of Article XX:2 128
7.3 The Binding Version 129
7.4 Guidelines by the WTO Secretariat 129
   7.4.1 The 1993 and 1997 Guidelines 129
   7.4.2 The 2001 Guidelines 129
   7.4.3 The Legal Status of the Guidelines: Context or Supplementary Means? 130
7.5 The Structure of Schedules 131
7.6 Three Categories of Commitments 132
7.7 The Time-Frame for a Commitment and ‘Pre-Commitment’ 135
7.8 Measures Inconsistent with Both Articles XVI and XVII 136
7.9 The Coverage of Commitments by Sector and Mode of Supply 136
   7.9.1 Service Transactions Requiring the Use of More than One Mode of Supply 137
7.10 Levels of Commitment 137
7.11 What Should not be Scheduled 138
7.12 Interpretation of the Specific Commitments: The Difficulties 138
7.12.1 The Rules of Interpretation 138
  7.12.1.1 Introductory Heading 139
7.12.2 Classification of Services 140
7.12.3 New Services 140
7.12.4 Specific Difficulties of Interpretation:
  Mode 4 Commitments 143
7.12.5 Scheduling Mistakes 143
7.13 Conclusion 144

Chapter 8
National Treatment 147
8.1 Introduction 147
8.2 The Purpose of Article XVII 148
8.3 Burden of Proof 149
8.4 Scope of Application of the National Treatment Obligation 149
  8.4.1 Application to Modes of Supply 149
  8.4.2 Application to Services and Service Suppliers 150
    8.4.2.1 Potential Service Suppliers 150
  8.4.3 Application to Measures 151
    8.4.3.1 ‘Affecting’ 152
      8.4.3.1.1 ‘Affecting’: Actual and Potential Effect 154
    8.4.3.2 ‘Supply of Services’ 155
    8.4.3.3 Three Possibilities to the Potential Domain of National Treatment 156
    8.4.3.4 Inherent Competitive Disadvantages of Foreign Service Suppliers 157
8.5 The Standard of Treatment: ‘No Less Favourable’ 158
  8.5.1 A General Effect 159
  8.5.2 ‘Formally Identical’ or ‘Formally Different’ Treatment 160
  8.5.3 Modification of Competitive Conditions 162
    8.5.3.1 Definition of Potential Competitors 163
    8.5.3.2 Market Definition 163
    8.5.3.3 Scope of the Test 165
  8.5.4 The Scope of Adverse Effect and the ‘De Minimis’ Standard 165
8.6 ‘Likeness’ 166
  8.6.1 The Concept of ‘Likeness’ 167
    8.6.1.1 Hypothetical Likeness? 169
  8.6.2 ‘Like Service Suppliers’ 170
    8.6.2.1 Technological Neutrality? 170
  8.6.3 Are ‘Like Services’ and ‘Like Service Suppliers’ Necessarily Linked? 171
  8.6.4 Relevance of Regulatory Purpose for ‘Likeness’ Determination 174
Table of Contents

8.6.5 Does 'Likeness' Include Directly Competitive or Substitutable Services/Service Suppliers? 175
8.7 The Non-Discrimination Standard: Conclusion 176
8.8 The ‘Aim and Effect’ Test 177
8.9 The Interpretation of Article XVII of GATS Based on Article III of GATT 179
  8.9.1 Relationships between Article III of GATT and Article XVII of GATS 179
8.10 The Necessity Test 180
8.11 Alternative Interpretation of Article XVII 181
8.12 Conclusion 182

Chapter 9
Market Access 183
9.1 Introduction 183
9.2 Article XVI 183
  9.2.1 Article XVI:1: ‘Treatment No Less Favourable’ 184
    9.2.1.1 Application to Specific Commitments 185
    9.2.1.2 Application to Measures 185
    9.2.1.3 The Competitive Opportunities Test 185
    9.2.1.4 ‘Terms, Limitations and Conditions’ 186
    9.2.1.5 ‘Agreed and Specified’ 188
    9.2.1.6 Movement of Capital 188
  9.2.2 Article XVI:2 189
    9.2.2.1 The Burden of Proof 189
    9.2.2.2 The Chapeau 190
    9.2.2.3 Six Limitations on Market Access 191
      9.2.2.3.1 Technological Neutrality 191
      9.2.2.3.2 Limitations on the Number of Service Suppliers 192
        9.2.2.3.2.1 Monopolies and Exclusive Service Suppliers 194
        9.2.2.3.2.2 Monopolies and Exclusive Service Suppliers 194
      9.2.2.3.3 Limitations on the Total Value of Service Transactions or Assets 195
      9.2.2.3.4 Limitations on the Total Number of Service Operations or on the Total Quantity of Service Output 195
        9.2.2.3.4.1 ‘Total’ 195
        9.2.2.3.4.2 ‘Services Operations’, ‘Services Output’ 196
        9.2.2.3.4.3 The Manner by which the Measures are Expressed 196
        9.2.2.3.4.4 Measures which Limit Input for the Supply of Service are Allowed 197
Table of Contents

9.2.2.3.5 Limitations on the Total Number of Natural Persons 198
9.2.2.3.5.1 Scope of Coverage: Modes of Supply 198
9.2.2.3.5.2 ‘Or’ 198
9.2.2.3.5.3 ‘Necessary for, and Directly Related to’ 198

9.2.2.3.6 Limitations on the Manner of Incorporation 199

9.2.2.3.7 Limitations on the Participation of Foreign Capital 199

9.2.3 The Economic Needs Test 200

9.2.4 A Measure May be Included in Some of the Groups 200

9.2.5 Article XVI:2: An Exhaustive List 201

9.2.6 Interpretation Rules for the List 202

9.2.7 Relationship between Articles XVI:1 and XVI:2 204

9.2.8 Does Article XVI Apply to Consumers? 205

9.3 Quantitative Restrictions in GATT: A Comparison 206

9.4 Payments and Transfers 208

9.4.1 Article XI:1 209

9.4.2 Article XI:2 211

9.5 Relationship between Market Access (Article XVI) and National Treatment (Article XVII) 211

9.6 Relationship between Market Access (Article XVI) and Domestic Regulation (Articles XIV and VI) 214

9.7 Conclusion 216

Chapter 10

Economic Integration Agreements 217

10.1 Introduction 217

10.2 The Economic Aspect of Economic Integration Agreements 220

10.2.1 Cost of Economic Integration Agreement 222

10.3 Article V of GATS 222

10.3.1 Article V:1 224

10.3.1.1 Comparison to Article XXIV:1 of GATT 225

10.3.1.1.1 The Agreements Covered: ‘Economic Integration Agreements’ 225

10.3.1.1.2 ‘Substantial Sectoral Coverage’ 226

10.3.1.1.3 ‘Substantially all Discrimination’ 230

10.3.1.1.3.1 ‘Substantially’ 232

10.3.1.1.3.2 In the Sense of Article XVII 232
Table of Contents

10.3.1.3.3 Elimination of Existing Discriminatory Measures, and/or Prohibition of New or More Discriminatory Measures 233
10.3.1.4 Elimination of Discrimination: When? 233
10.3.1.5 The Exception to the Obligation for Eliminating Discrimination 234
10.3.2 Article V:2: Wider Process of Economic Integration 235
10.3.3 Article V:3: Developing Countries 236
  10.3.3.1 Juridical Persons 237
10.3.4 Article V:4: Additional Conditions 238
  10.3.4.1 Scope of Application 238
  10.3.4.1.1 Members and Non-Members 238
  10.3.4.2 ‘Shall Not... Raise the Overall Barriers to Trade within the Respective Sectors or Subsectors’ 238
    10.3.4.2.1 ‘Overall’ 240
    10.3.4.2.2 Barriers to Trade 241
    10.3.4.2.3 ‘Overall Level of Trade Barriers’ 241
    10.3.4.2.4 ‘Facilitate Trade between the Parties’ 242
10.3.5 Article V:5: Compensation Due to Modification of Commitments 242
10.3.6 Article V:6: Rights of Juridical Persons 243
  10.3.6.1 ‘Juridical Persons’ 243
  10.3.6.2 ‘Substantive Business Operations’ 243
  10.3.6.3 ‘In the Territory of the Parties’ 244
10.3.7 Article V:7: Notification 244
10.4 Article Vbis: Labour Markets’ Integration 245
10.5 Conclusion 248

Chapter 11
GATS and Competition Rules 251
11.1 Introduction 251
11.2 GATS and Anti-Competitive Practices 252
  11.2.1 Application of Existing Disciplines 253
    11.2.1.1 Monopolies and Exclusive Service Suppliers: Article VIII 253
    11.2.1.1.1 Monopolies and Exclusive Service Suppliers 254
    11.2.1.1.1.1 ‘Monopoly Supplier of Services’ 254
    11.2.1.1.2 Exclusive Service Suppliers 255
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.1.2 Manner of Acting</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.1.2.1 'In the Supply of the Monopoly Service'</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.1.2.2 'In its Territory'</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.1.2.3 Application of Disciplines: MFN and Specific Commitments</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.1.3 Article VIII:2</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.1.3.1 'Affiliated Company'</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.1.3.2 Scope of Monopoly Rights</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.1.3.3 'Abuse of Monopoly Position'</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.1.4 Article VIII:3</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.1.5 Article VIII:4</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.2 Business Practices – Article IX</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.2.1 ‘Certain Business Practices of Service Suppliers’</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.2.2 ‘May' [Restrain Competition]</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.2.3 ‘Anti-competitive Practices’</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.2.4 ‘Restrain Competition and Thereby Restrict Trade in Services’</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.2.5 Practical Implications of Article IX</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.2.5.1 Consultations</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.2.5.2 Sanctions</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.2.5.3 Basis for Further Negotiations</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1.3 The Disadvantages of Existing Disciplines</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.2 The Development of New Disciplines in the WTO Context</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3 Conclusion</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 12
Administrative Standards and Recognition of Professional Qualifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.1 Introduction</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2 Scope of Application: Article VI:1</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3 The Legal Obligation</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.1 The Subject of Reference: Administration, not Substance</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.1.1 Comparison to Article X:3(a) of GATT</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.2 The Burden of Proof</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.3 Uniform, Impartial, Reasonable</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.3.1 Are the three Standards Cumulative or Independent?</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4 Review of Administrative Decisions: Article VI:2</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

12.4.1 Administrative Decisions Affecting Trade in Services 278
12.4.2 The Tribunals 278
  12.4.2.1 The Tribunals’ Scope of Authority 279
  12.4.2.2 The Tribunals’ Relations with the Administrative Authority: Independence? 280
  12.4.2.2.1 The Agencies Covered 280
  12.4.2.3 Appeal on a Tribunal’s Decision 281
  12.4.2.4 The Constitutional Exception 281
12.5 Administrative Authorization: Article VI:3 281
  12.5.1 Article VI:1,3 in GATS Jurisprudence 282
  12.5.2 The Purpose of Article VI:1-3 283
12.6 Future Disciplines on Recognition of Professional Qualifications: Article VI:4,5 283
  12.6.1 Article VI:4 283
    12.6.1.1 Scope of Coverage: ‘Measures Relating’ 283
    12.6.1.3 The Criteria to Be Fulfilled by the Disciplines Developed 285
      12.6.1.3.1 Objective and Transparent Criteria 286
      12.6.1.3.2 The Necessity Test 286
    12.6.1.4 Potential Overlap with other GATS Provisions 289
      12.6.1.5 The Doha Round Developments 291
    12.6.2 Nullification or Impairment: Article VI:5 291
      12.6.2.1 Scope of Application 292
      12.6.2.2 Burden of Proof 292
12.7 Verification of Professional Competence 295
  12.7.1 Scope of Application 295
  12.7.2 Purpose 295
  12.7.3 ‘Adequate Procedures’ 296
12.8 The Relationship Between Article VI and Articles XVI (Market Access) and XVII (National Treatment) 296
12.9 Development of Future Disciplines Concerning Recognition of Professional Qualifications 296
12.10 Conclusion 301

Chapter 13
Transparency 303
13.1 Introduction 303
13.2 Publication of Relevant Measures: Article III:1 306
  13.2.1 Relevant Measures of General Application 306
    13.2.1.1 ‘Pertain to or Affect the Operation of this Agreement’ 307
    13.2.1.2 Affect the Operation of the Agreement 307
    13.2.1.3 Comparison to GATT Article X 308
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13.2.2 'Prompt' Publication</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.2.1 Time of Publication</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.2.2 Place of Publication</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.3 Article III:2</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.3.1 'Not Practicable'</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.3.2 'Publicly Available'</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.3.3 Language of Publication</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.4 Article III:3</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.4.1 Scope of Application</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.4.2 'Prompt' Notification</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5 Article III:4: Enquiry and Contact Points</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6 Reverse Notification: Article III:5</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7 Comparison to Article X of GATT</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.8 The Exception to the Transparency Rule</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.8.1 Scope of Application</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.8.2 Circumstances where Article IIIbis may be Invoked</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.9 Conclusion</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.9.1 Conclusion</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 14

GATS and the Developing Countries | 319 |
| 14.1 Introduction | 319 |
| 14.2 GATS and Developing Countries | 323 |
| 14.2.1 The Preamble | 323 |
| 14.2.2 Specific provisions | 324 |
| 14.2.2.1 Facilitating Terms | 324 |
| 14.2.2.1.1 Article IV:1: Principles Underlying Negotiations | 325 |
| 14.2.2.1.2 Article IV:2: Contact Points | 326 |
| 14.2.2.1.3 Article IV:3: Least Developed Countries | 327 |
| 14.2.2.2 Specific Commitments: Articles XIX and XXV | 328 |
| 14.2.2.2.1 Article XIX | 328 |
| 14.2.2.2.2 Article XXV | 329 |
| 14.2.2.3 Economic Integration Agreements | 329 |
| 14.2.2.4 Balance of Payment Difficulties | 330 |
| 14.2.2.5 Subsidies | 331 |
| 14.2.2.6 Telecommunications Networks | 331 |
| 14.3 The Meaning of GATS Provisions for the Developing Countries | 333 |
| 14.4 Conclusion | 334 |

Chapter 15

The Safety Valves of GATS | 337 |
| 15.1 Introduction | 337 |
| 15.2 Temporary ‘Safety Valves’ | 337 |
Table of Contents

15.2.1 Waiver: WTO Agreement 337
15.2.2 The Opt-out Clause: WTO Agreement 338
15.2.3 General Exceptions: GATS 338
  15.2.3.1 Article XIV: General Structure and Order of Analysis 340
  15.2.3.2 Application of GATS Article XIV to other WTO Agreements 341
  15.2.3.3 Extraterritorial Effect 342
  15.2.3.4 The List of Exceptions Allowed by Article XIV of GATS 343
    15.2.3.4.1 ‘Measures Necessary...’ 343
    15.2.3.4.2 Measures Necessary to Protect Public Morals or to Maintain Public Order (Article XIV(a)) 356
      15.2.3.4.2.1 ‘Public Morals’ and ‘Public Order’ 356
      15.2.3.4.2.1.1 Scope 356
      15.2.3.4.2.1.2 Content – Who Defines It? 358
      15.2.3.4.2.1.3 The Procedure 358
    15.2.3.4.3 Measures Necessary to Protect Human, Animal or Plant Life or Health (Article XIV(b)) 359
      15.2.3.4.3.1 Scope 359
      15.2.3.4.3.2 The Procedure 359
      15.2.3.4.3.3 Territorial Scope of Application 359
      15.2.3.4.3.4 Content 360
      15.2.3.4.3.5 Health and Health Concerns 361
      15.2.3.4.3.6 Assessment of Risk (to Human, Animal or Plant Life or Health) 361
    15.2.3.4.4 Measures Necessary to Secure Compliance with Laws or Regulations which are not Inconsistent with the Provisions of This Agreement (Article XIV(c)) 363
      15.2.3.4.4.1 Scope and Content 363
      15.2.3.4.4.2 The Procedure 365
      15.2.3.4.4.3 ‘Laws and Regulations’ 366
      15.2.3.4.4.4 ‘Secure Compliance’ 366
    15.2.3.4.5 Measures Inconsistent with Article XVII (National Treatment) (Article XIV(d)) 367
      15.2.3.4.5.1 Purpose 367
15.2.3.4.5.2 The Procedure 368
15.2.3.4.5.3 ‘Direct Taxes’ 368
15.2.3.4.5.4 ‘Measures Aimed at Ensuring the Equitable or Effective Imposition or Collection of Direct Taxes’ 368
15.2.3.4.5.5 Definition of Tax Terms or Concepts – Under Domestic Law 370
15.2.3.4.5.6 Interpretation Rules for Article XIV(d) 370
15.2.3.4.6 Measures Inconsistent with Article II (MFN) due to Double Taxation Treaties (Article XIV(e)) 371
15.2.3.4.6.1 Purpose 371
15.2.3.4.7 Scope of Application: Subparagraphs XIV(d), (e) 371
15.2.3.5 The Chapeau (Introductory Clause) of Article XIV 372
15.2.3.5.1 The Burden of Proof: The Chapeau 373
15.2.3.5.2 ‘A Means of Arbitrary or Unjustifiable Discrimination between Countries where Like Conditions Prevail’ 373
15.2.3.5.3 A Disguised Restriction on Trade in Services 378
15.2.3.5.3.1 The Restrictive Effect Is Relevant in More than One Context 379
15.2.4 The Security Exception: GATS Article XIVbis 379
15.2.4.1 Burden of Proof – Article XIVbis 381
15.2.4.2 Disclosure of Information Contrary to Essential Security Interests 381
15.2.4.2.1 ‘Essential Security Interest’ 382
15.2.4.3 Action Necessary for the Protection of Essential Security Interests 383
15.2.4.3.1 Who Defines ‘Necessity’ 383
15.2.4.3.2 Three Categories of Action 383
15.2.4.3.2.1 Provisioning a Military Establishment 384
15.2.4.3.2.2 Fissionable and Fusionable Materials 384
15.2.4.3.2.3 War or Other Emergency in International Relations 384
15.2.4.3.3 The Relationship between the Chapeau and Subparagraphs 385
15.2.4.4 Maintenance of obligations according to the UN Charter
15.2.4.5 Notification Obligations
  15.2.4.5.1 Standard of Notification: ‘To the Fullest Extent Possible’
  15.2.4.6 Potential Threat and Extra Territorial Threat
15.2.5 Balance-of-Payments Difficulties
  15.2.5.1 Article XII:1
    15.2.5.1.1 ‘Serious Balance-of-Payments and External Financial Difficulties or Threat Thereof’
    15.2.5.1.2 The Measures Allowed
    15.2.5.1.3 Member in the Process of Economic Development or Economic Transition
  15.2.5.2 Article XII:2
  15.2.5.3 Article XII:3
  15.2.5.4 Article XII:4
  15.2.5.5 Article XII:5
  15.2.5.6 Article XII:6
15.2.6 Emergency Safeguard Measures and Subsidies
15.2.7 General Interpretative Approach for GATS Exceptions
15.3 Permanent ‘Safety Valves’: Modification of Schedules
  15.3.1 The Terms of Modification
  15.3.2 The Rules for Modification of Schedules
    15.3.2.1 Prior Notification
    15.3.2.2 Negotiations
    15.3.2.3 The Standard of Compensation
    15.3.2.4 The Compensation: Scope of Application
    15.3.2.5 Arbitration
    15.3.2.6 Compliance with the Decision of the Arbitration
    15.3.2.7 Procedures by the Council for Trade in Services
15.4 Conclusion

Chapter 16
GATS Sector-Specific Instruments
  16.1 Introduction
  16.2 Movement of Natural Persons Supplying Services Under GATS
  16.3 Telecommunications
    16.3.1 The Annex on Telecommunications
    16.3.2 The Annex on Negotiations on Basic Telecommunications
    16.3.3 The Fourth Protocol: The Agreement on Basic Telecommunications
    16.3.4 The Reference Paper
    16.3.5 Supplementary Documents for the Interpretation of Telecoms Commitments
Table of Contents

16.4 Financial Services 414
   16.4.1 The Annex on Financial Services 415
      16.4.1.1 Prudential Carve-out 416
      16.4.1.2 Confidentiality 418
      16.4.1.3 Recognition 418
      16.4.1.4 Dispute Settlement 418
   16.4.2 The Understanding on Financial Services 418
      16.4.2.1 Standstill 419
      16.4.2.2 Market Access 419
         16.4.2.2.1 Monopoly Rights 420
         16.4.2.2.2 Financial Services Purchased by
            Public Entities 420
      16.4.2.3 Cross-Border Trade 420
      16.4.2.4 Commercial Presence 421
      16.4.2.5 New Financial Services 421
      16.4.2.6 Transfer and Processing of Information 421
      16.4.2.7 Temporary Entry of Personnel 422
      16.4.2.8 Non-discriminatory Measures 422
      16.4.2.9 National Treatment 423
   16.4.3 The Fifth Protocol: The Financial Services Agreement
      (1997) 423

16.5 Air Transport 424
   16.5.1 The Annex on Air Transport 424
   16.5.2 The Agreement on Trade in Civil Aircraft 425

16.6 Maritime Transport 426

16.7 E-Commerce 427

16.8 Conclusion 428

Chapter 17 429
The Legal Instruments for GATS Enforcement

17.1 Introduction 429

17.2 Consultations 430
   17.2.1 Bilateral Consultations 430
   17.2.2 Multilateral Consultations 431
   17.2.3 The Exception: Double Taxation Measures 432
   17.2.4 Dispute Settlement 432
      17.2.4.1 Dispute Settlement Causes 433
         17.2.4.1.1 The Violation Cause 434
            17.2.4.1.1.1 Violation: The Burden
               of Proof 434
            17.2.4.1.1.2 Obligations and
               Commitments 435
            17.2.4.1.1.3 The Failure to Comply 435
            17.2.4.1.1.4 Comparison to GATT
               Article XXIII 435

xxv
Table of Contents

17.2.4.1.1.4.1 ‘Directly or Indirectly’ 435
17.2.4.1.1.4.2 The Results’ Presumption 435
17.2.4.1.1.4.3 ‘Prima Facie’ Case and the Role of the Dispute Settlement Tribunals 436

17.2.4.1.1.5 The Remedies 437
17.2.4.1.1.5.1 ‘Circumstances Serious Enough’ 437
17.2.4.1.1.5.2 ‘Any Member or Members’ 438
17.2.4.1.1.5.3 No Authority for Complete Abolishment of a Measure 439
17.2.4.1.1.5.4 Cross-Retaliation 439

17.2.4.1.1.6 Violation Complaints under GATS 439
17.2.4.1.2 Non-violation 443
17.2.4.1.2.1 The Burden of Proof for the Non-violation Cause 444
17.2.4.1.2.2 Benefit and Concession 444
17.2.4.1.2.2.1 The Source of Benefit or Concession 445

17.2.4.1.2.3 The Cause of Adverse Effect: ‘Application of any Measure’ 445
17.2.4.1.2.4 Nullification or Impairment 446
17.2.4.1.2.4.1 The Causal Link 446
17.2.4.1.2.4.2 The Comparison between ‘Like’ Foreign and Domestic Suppliers 448
17.2.4.1.2.4.3 The Proof of Adverse Effect 448
Table of Contents

17.2.4.1.2.4.4 This Result Was Not Reasonably Anticipated at the Time When the Relevant Specific Commitment Was Negotiated 448

17.2.4.1.2.4.5 Intentions and Expectations 449

17.2.4.1.3 The Remedies 450

17.2.4.1.4 Non-violation Complaints under GATS 451

17.3 The Relations Between the Violation and Non-Violation Causes 452

17.3.1 Comparison 452

17.3.2 Non-violation for Cases where no Disciplines Were yet Developed 453

17.3.3 Violation for Active Behaviour, Non-violation for Passive Behaviour 453

17.3.4 The Procedural Relationship between Violation and Non-violation 454

17.4 Conclusion 454

Concluding Remarks 457

Bibliography 461