COMPETITION AND INNOVATION IN THE EU REGULATION OF PHARMACEUTICALS

The Case of Parallel Trade

Claudia Desogus
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments .......................................................... v
List of Abbreviations ...................................................... xiii
Table of Equivalence ....................................................... xv
List of Tables and Graphs ................................................ xvii

Introduction ........................................................................ 1

1. Background ................................................................. 1
2. Parallel trade: past solutions and new challenges .................. 2
3. General scope ................................................................... 4
4. Product and geographic scope ........................................... 5
5. Methodology .................................................................... 5
6. Theoretical baseline ....................................................... 6
7. Structure of the book ...................................................... 6

Chapter I.
The European Pharmaceutical Market ..................................... 11

Introduction ........................................................................ 11
1. The economics of the pharmaceuticals ............................... 12
   1.1. Features of the supply-side of the market .................... 15
   1.2. Features of the demand-side of the market .................. 20
      1.2.1. Who chooses drugs: the role of physicians .......... 20
      1.2.2. Who pays for drugs: the role of governments ....... 21
      1.2.3. The cost-containment measures applied by national
governments ................................................................. 23
      1.2.4. Administering drugs: the role of pharmacists ....... 27
2. The European pharmaceutical market .................................. 27
3. A single market for pharmaceuticals ................................... 32
   3.1. The harmonisation of marketing authorisation for drugs ... 32
   3.2. The harmonisation of price control measures .............. 36
4. Price controls and free movement of goods ........................ 40
5. What is parallel trade? .................................................... 45
   5.1. The regulatory environment ...................................... 51
Competition and Innovation in the EU Regulation of Pharmaceuticals

6. Defining the relevant market in the pharmaceutical sector .... 53
   6.1. The relevant market ........................................... 54
       6.1.1. The product market .................................... 56
       6.1.2. The geographic market ................................. 58
   6.2. The product market definition for pharmaceuticals .... 60
       6.2.1. The limits of the SSNIP test .......................... 60
       6.2.2. The ATC classification .................................. 62
       6.2.3. The limits of the ATC for Article 102 TFEU cases 64
       6.2.4. When pharmaceutical product markets are narrow 66
       6.2.5. The product market definition in parallel trade cases 72
   6.4. The geographic market definition for pharmaceuticals ..... 77

7. Conclusions ......................................................... 78

Chapter II.
The Intersection between Intellectual Property Rights and Competition Policy Goals in the Pharmaceutical Sector .......... 79

Introduction .......................................................... 79
1. The structure and the function of intellectual property rights . 81
   1.1. The trade off in the pharmaceutical sector ............... 84
   1.2. Striking the balance: the Italian case .................... 86
   1.3. 'Law in book' v. 'law in action' ............................ 88
2. The relationship between intellectual property rights and competition law under the EU Treaty .................. 90
   2.1. In search of a compromise (I): existence v. exercise of an IPR 91
   2.2. In search of a compromise (II): the 'specific subject matter' 95
3. The principle of 'regional exhaustion' ......................... 98
   3.1. The exhaustion of trademarks ............................... 100
   3.2. The exhaustion of patents .................................... 104
   3.3. The exhaustion of Intellectual Property rights covering products coming from third countries 109
4. The balance between intellectual property rights and EU competition law rules .................................. 113
   4.1. The exercise of IPRs under Article 101 TFEU ............. 114
   4.2. The exercise of IPRs under Article 102 TFEU .......... 116
       4.2.1. The refusal to licence IPRs ........................... 119
5. The early case law on parallel trade ............................ 125
   5.1. Export bans and other agreements that restrict parallel trade 125
       5.1.1. The Commission practice ............................... 127
       5.1.2. The case law .............................................. 129
   5.2. Unilateral conducts that restrict parallel trade .......... 131
       5.2.1. Refusal to supply cases ................................. 131
       5.2.2. Price discrimination cases ............................ 134
6. New cases on parallel trade of pharmaceuticals: a revirement? ............ 137
6.1. New cases under Article 102 TFEU: the Syfai saga ....................... 137
6.2. New cases under Article 101 TFEU: the Glaxo case ....................... 140

7. Conclusions ......................................................... 141

Chapter III.
Competition and Regulation in the Pharmaceutical Market: The Case
of Parallel Trade ....................................................... 143

Introduction ............................................................ 143
1. Regulation on prices: is the pharmaceutical sector 'specific'? .............. 148
   1.1. An overview of national pharmaceutical policies .......................... 150
       1.1.1. The pharmaceutical regulations in the importing countries ...... 150
       1.1.2. The pharmaceutical regulations in the exporting countries ...... 154
       1.1.3. National policies on parallel trade .................................. 156
       1.1.4. The negotiation of prices for pharmaceuticals ..................... 157
   1.2. The role of parallel trade in price negotiations ........................... 160
2. Savings from parallel trade of pharmaceuticals: do they exist? ............ 162
   2.1. Optimal strategies in a world without parallel trade: price
discrimination ......................................................... 162
   2.2. Optimal strategies in a world with parallel trade .......................... 164
   2.3. The impact of parallel trade of pharmaceuticals on price levels in
importing countries .................................................... 166
   2.4. The impact of parallel trade of pharmaceuticals on price levels in
exporting countries .................................................... 170
3. ... And how large are they? Competition and regulation in the
pharmaceutical sector .................................................. 176
   3.1. Measuring the magnitude of savings from parallel trade of
pharmaceuticals ........................................................ 176
       3.1.1. Competition and regulation in pharmaceuticals ...................... 180
4. The price harmonising function of parallel trade of pharmaceuticals ...... 182
   4.1. The 'constitutional' issue ............................................. 186
   4.2. 'Negative harmonisation' v. 'positive harmonisation' in the
pharmaceutical market .................................................. 189
5. Anticompetitiveness 'by object' or 'by effect'? .................................. 194
   5.1. The modernised approach to Article 101 TFEU and the Glaxo case .... 195
       5.1.1. An effect-based approach? .......................................... 196
       5.1.2. ... Or an ad hoc exception for the pharmaceutical sector? ......... 199
6. Conclusions ........................................................... 202
Competition and Innovation in the EU Regulation of Pharmaceuticals

Chapter IV.
Parallel Trade and Pharmaceutical Innovation: The Emergence of the 'Efficiency Defence' in European Competition Law

Introduction ................................................................................. 205
1. The 'efficiency defence' in European competition law .................. 210
   1.1. The four-partite test under Article 101(3) TFEU ...................... 210
       1.1.1. The two positive requirements ..................................... 211
       1.1.2. The two negative requirements ..................................... 213
   1.2. The objective justification to abusive conducts by dominant
        companies ........................................................................ 215
2. Innovation in the pharmaceutical market .................................... 219
   2.1. The economics of innovation .............................................. 219
   2.2. Market structure as a determinant of innovation ................... 221
       2.2.1. Market power as a driver of innovation ....................... 222
       2.2.2. Competition as a driver of innovation ....................... 224
       2.2.3. Interim conclusions ................................................. 227
   2.3. Market structure and pharmaceutical innovation .................. 228
   2.4. R&D patterns in the pharmaceutical sector .......................... 232
3. Patents, profits and incentive to innovate in the pharmaceutical sector .. 236
   3.1. The impact of parallel trade on profits ................................. 237
       3.1.1. When parallel trade increases manufacturers' profits ...... 239
   3.2. Does more money always bring more innovation? ............... 242
   3.3. Interim conclusions ....................................................... 245
4. A test for efficiencies under Article 102 TFEU ............................ 246
   4.1. The 'legitimate business conduct à la Syfait I' ....................... 247
   4.2. The 'legitimate business conduct à la Syfait II' .................... 249
   4.3. The 'strict approach' ..................................................... 250
   4.4. The 'efficiency defence' .................................................. 252
5. Conclusions ............................................................................. 255

Chapter V.
The Welfare Effect of Parallel Trade: A Workable Rule of Reason .......... 259

Introduction ................................................................................. 259
1. The rule of reason ................................................................. 263
   1.1. Is there a 'European rule of reason'? ................................. 265
       1.1.1. The rule of reason under Article 101 TFEU: the old doctrinal
             debate ........................................................................ 267
       1.1.2. The rule of reason under Article 101 TFEU: the case law ...... 270
       1.1.3. Recent contributions to the academic debate .................. 274
       1.1.4. The rule of reason under Article 102 TFEU .................... 276

Intersentia
2. The impact of parallel trade on consumer welfare ........................................ 279
   2.1. Balancing the anti- and pro-competitive effects of an abusive conduct .............. 280
   2.2. The workability of the rule of reason ............................................. 282
3. Sharing the burden to lighten it: the law of evidence and the rule of reason ........................................ 285
   3.1. The legal burden of proof and the evidential burden of proof ...................... 285
   3.2. The proof of restriction of competition ............................................ 288
       3.2.1. The burden of proof under Article 101(1) TFEU in parallel trade cases ........ 288
   3.3. The proof of efficiencies .................................................................. 292
       3.3.1. Who has to prove efficiencies under Article 102 TFEU? .................... 292
       3.3.2. The standard of proof for efficiencies in parallel trade cases ............ 298
4. Conclusions ......................................................................................... 303

Conclusions and Future Research ......................................................... 307
List of References .............................................................................. 311