Beyond Mechanical Markets

ASSET PRICE SWINGS, RISK, AND THE ROLE OF THE STATE

Roman Frydman
and Michael D. Goldberg
Contents

Acknowledgments xiii

What Went Wrong and What We Can Do about It 1
  The Fatal Flaw 1
  Assuming Away What Matters Most 2
  The Imperfect Knowledge Alternative 6
  Fishermen and Financial Markets 7
  The Survival of the Rational Market Myth 8
  Opening Economics and Finance to Nonroutine Change and Imperfect Knowledge 11
  Imperfect Knowledge Economics and Its Implications 12
  A New Understanding of Asset-Price Swings, Risk, and the Role of the State 14

PART I
THE CRITIQUE

1.
The Invention of Mechanical Markets 21
  Economists’ Rationality or Markets? 22
  Was Milton Friedman Really Unconcerned about Assumptions? 24
  The Post-Crisis Life of Interacting Robots 28
## CONTENTS

*Missing the Point in the Economists' Debate* 35  
*The Distorted Language of Economic Discourse* 38  

### 2. The Folly of Fully Predetermined History  
*The Fatal Conceit Revisited* 43  
*The Pretense of Exact Knowledge* 46  
*The Economist as Engineer* 47  
*Staying the Course in the Face of Reason* 50  

### 3. The Orwellian World of “Rational Expectations”  
*Muth’s Warning Ignored* 59  
*The Rational Expectations Revolution: Model Consistency as a Standard of Rationality* 61  
*The Spurious Narrative of Rational Expectations* 62  
*A World of Stasis and Thought Uniformity* 63  
*Economists’ Rationality and Socialist Planning* 66  

### 4. The Figment of the “Rational Market”  
*Pseudo-Diversity in the “Rational Market”* 73  
*The Irrelevance of the “Rational Market”* 76  
*Beware of Rational Expectations Models* 77  
*The Fatal Conceit of the Rational Expectations Hypothesis* 79  

### 5. Castles in the Air: The Efficient Market Hypothesis  
*The Market Metaphor* 82  
*Imagining Markets in a Fully Predetermined World* 84
CONTENTS

Samuelson's Doubts 89
The Illusory Stability of the "Rational Market" 92
Efficient Market Hypothesis and Asset-Price Swings 96

6.
The Fable of Price Swings as Bubbles 103
Reinventing Irrationality 104
Bubbles in a World of Rational Expectations:
Mechanizing Crowd Psychology 105
A Seductive Narrative of Behavioral Bubbles 109
Limits to Arbitrage: An Artifact of Mechanistic Theory 111
The Trouble with Behavioral Bubbles 112
Forgotten Fundamentals 114

PART II
AN ALTERNATIVE

7.
Keynes and Fundamentals 117
Was Keynes a Behavioral Economist? 120
Imperfect Knowledge and Fundamentals 122
Are Fundamentals Really Irrelevant in the Beauty Contest? 124
Fundamentals and Equity-Price Movements: Evidence
from Bloomberg's Market Stories 128

8.
Speculation and the Allocative Performance
of Financial Markets 149
Short-Term and Value Speculators 154
How Short-Term Speculation Facilitates Value Speculation 156
Speculation and Economic Dynamism 160
CONTENTS

9. Fundamentals and Psychology in Price Swings
   Bulls, Bears, and Individual Forecasting  166
   Persistent Trends in Fundamentals  168
   Guardedly Moderate Revisions  169
   Price Swings in Individual Stocks and the Market  172
   Price Swings, Genuine Diversity, and Rationality  173
   Sustained Reversals  173

10. Bounded Instability: Linking Risk and Asset-Price Swings  175
    The Indispensable Role of Asset-Price Swings in Allocating Capital  177
    Historical Benchmarks as Gauges of Longer-Term Prospects  179
    The Unfolding of Excessive Price Swings  182
    Linking Risk to Distance from Benchmark Levels  187
    How Markets Ultimately Self-Correct  189
    The Return of Fundamentals  192

11. Contingency and Markets  195
    Contingent Market Hypothesis  198
    Contingency and Instability of Economic Structures  199
    The Fleeting Profitability of Mechanical Trading Rules  205
    Temporary Profit Opportunities  212
    An Intermediate View of Markets and a New Framework for Prudential Policy  214
## CONTENTS

12. Restoring the Market-State Balance 217

The Importance of Policy Reform for Financial Markets 218

Rationale for Active State Intervention in Financial Markets 227

Excess-Dampening Measures and Guidance Ranges 229

Active Excess-Dampening Measures 237

Excessive Price Swings and the Banking System 243

Imperfect Knowledge and Credit Ratings 246

Epilogue 249

What Can Economists Know? 249

The Search for Omniscience 250

Sharp versus Contingent Predictions 252

Recognizing Our Own Imperfect Knowledge 253

Imperfect Knowledge Economics as the Boundary of Macroeconomic Theory 255

References 257

Index 273