The Impact of Investment Treaties on Contracts between Host States and Foreign Investors

By
Jan Ole Voss

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN • BOSTON
2011
## CONTENTS

Foreword.......................................................................................................................... xv
Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................ xvii
List of Abbreviations ........................................................................................................ xix
Table of Cases .................................................................................................................. xxvii

### Introduction

From the Protection of Foreign Property to Global Economic Governance .................. 1
The Contracts between Host States and Foreign Investors as Instruments of Investment Protection .......................................................... 7
The Modern Interrelationship between Treaties and Contracts in Investment Treaty Arbitration ......................................................... 9
The Research Methodology and the Structure of the Work............................................... 13

### 1. Contracts Between Host States and Foreign Investors in the Absence of International Investment Treaties

A. The Existence and Characteristics of State Contracts ................................................. 15
   1. The Notion of State Contract and Its Legal Nature ................................................. 15
   II. Traditional and Modern Forms of State Contracts.................................................. 17
       1. Traditional Forms .............................................................................................. 17
       2. Modern Forms .................................................................................................. 19
          a. Modern Concession Agreements .................................................................. 20
          b. Production Sharing Agreements .................................................................. 21
          c. Management Agreements/Technical Assistance Agreement/Service Contracts .... 21
          d. Turnkey Contracts ....................................................................................... 22
          e. Joint Venture Agreements ........................................................................... 22
          f. Licensing and Transfer of Technology Agreements ...................................... 23
CONTENTS

1. Introduction
   II. Direct Internationalisation
      1. State Contracts as International Law/Per Se Application
      2. Genuine Legal Orders
      3. Customary International Law and Incorporation of International Law
   III. Indirect Internationalisation
      1. The Origin of the Principle of Party Autonomy
      2. The Restrictions to the Principle of Party Autonomy
         a. The Content and General Limitations of the Principle of Party Autonomy
         b. The Participation of the State as a Sovereign
      3. Express Choice of Law by the Parties to the Dispute
         a. The Choice of a Genuine or Non-National Legal Order
         b. The Choice of Public International Law
         c. The Choice of the Host State's Internal Law
      4. Implied Choice
   IV. Conclusion

2. The Regime Established by Investment Treaties
   A. Stocktaking: The Worldwide Network of Bilateral and Multilateral Investment Treaties
      I. The Evolution of the Investment Treaty Network
      II. The Reasons for the Emergence of Investment Treaties
      III. The Present Existence of a Worldwide Network of Investment Treaties
      IV. The Creation of Customary International Law through Investment Treaties
CONTENTS

B. The Consent to Investment Arbitration in Investment Treaties ................................................................. 57
  I. Three Methods of Establishing Consent in International Investment Arbitration .................. 57
  II. Range of Choices ......................................................................................................................... 62
    1. International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID) ......................... 62
    2. ICSID Additional Facility .................................................................................................... 63
    3. International Chamber of Commerce (ICC) .......... 64
    4. UNCITRAL/AAA/LCIA/SCC Institute .............................................................................. 65
  III. The Treaty's Dispute Resolution Clause .................................................................................. 65
    1. The Scope of the Host State's Consent ................................................................................. 65
       a. Unqualified Access to International Arbitration ................................................................. 66
       b. Qualified Access to International Arbitration ................................................................. 66
    2. The Scope of a Broadly Phrased Dispute Resolution Clause ........................................... 68
       a. Arbitral Practice ............................................................................................................. 68
       b. Discussion of the Contradicting Approaches .................................................................. 73
       c. Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 81

C. The Legal Effects of the International Investment Treaty Regime .................................... 81
  I. Conferral of Rights upon the Private Individual ................................................................. 81
    1. The "Derivative" Model .................................................................................................... 82
    2. The "Direct" Theory ........................................................................................................... 85
    3. Examination of the Contradicting Approaches ............................................................... 87
       a. Wording of the Substantive Provisions ........................................................................ 87
       b. Direct Access to International Dispute Settlement ...................................................... 88
       c. Comparison with the Systemic Features of Diplomatic Protection ................................ 89
       d. Waiver of Diplomatic Protection ................................................................................. 93
    e. Difference between State—State Proceedings and Diplomatic Protection .................... 94
    f. Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 95
  II. Consequences of a Treaty Breach: State Responsibility and the Investment Treaty Regime .............. 95
## CONTENTS

1. The General System of State Responsibility and Sub-Systems of State Responsibility ................................... 96  
   a. Consequences of Breach under the General System of State Responsibility ........................................... 96  
   b. Sub-Systems of State Responsibility ........................................... 97

2. The Investment Treaty Regime as a Sub-System ............................................................................. 98  
   a. The Differences between the Investment Treaty System and the General System .......................... 98
   b. Relationship to General Rules of State Responsibility ...................................................................... 100

3. Special Consequences under the Investment Treaty Regime ......................................................... 102

III. The Application of International Law in International Arbitration over Contracts between Host States and Foreign Investors .............................................. 103

   1. General .................................................................................... 103
   2. Application of International Law due to Direct Choice by Treaty ............................................... 104  
      a. The Source of the Choice of Law Rule ................. 104
      b. The Direct Choice by Treaty ................................. 105
   3. Indirect Choice of International Law by Treaties ............................................................................. 107  
      a. Framework of Arbitral Rules................................. 107
      b. Investment Treaties as International Law............. 108
   4. The Role of Domestic Law .................................................................................... 110  
      a. Necessity of the Application of Domestic Law ............................................................................. 110
      b. The Relationship between Domestic Law and International Law ............................................. 111
      c. The Contractual Choice of Domestic Law .................................................................................... 114   

D. The Notion of "Investment" and Contracts Between Foreign Investor and Host State ......................... 115

   I. The Specific Regulations concerning Contracts ............................................................................. 116  
      1. Exclusion of Contractual Contents ................. 117
      2. Limited Protection of Contractual Contents ........ 118
      3. Full Protection of Contractual Contents ............ 119

   II. Contracts and Contractual Contents as "Investment" under the ICSID Convention .................. 124
| CONTENTS |
|------------------|---------|
| 1. Substantial Contributions .................................................. 125 |
| 2. Duration ................................................................. 128 |
| 3. Risk-Assumption/Return of Gains or Profit ..................................... 131 |
| 4. Significant Contribution to Economic Development .......................... 134 |
| 5. Investment Treaties as Lex Specialis .................................... 137 |
| III. Conclusion .................................................................. 138 |
| E. Investment Treaties and Sub-State Entities as Parties to Contracts .................. 138 |
| I. Sub-State Entities as Contractual Partner under General International Law .................. 139 |
| 1. General Aspects ......................................................... 139 |
| 2. Attribution of Conduct to the State ........................................ 140 |
| II. Investment Treaty Arbitration and Attribution of Conduct of Sub-State Entities ............ 148 |
| 1. Attribution of Conduct under International Law .................................... 149 |
| 2. Determination of the Parties to a Contractual Dispute ........................ 155 |
| III. Special Regimes of Attribution of Particular Investment Treaties .................... 156 |
| 1. Articles 22 and 23 of the ECT ........................................ 157 |
| 2. Article 2(2) of the 2004 US Model BIT .................................... 158 |
| IV. Conclusion .................................................................. 159 |
| 3. The Substantive Coverage of Contracts Between Host States and Foreign Investors Through Investment Treaty Standards .......................................................... 160 |
| A. The Distinction between Treaty Claims and Contract Claims ...................... 160 |
| I. Conceptual Distinction .................................................................. 160 |
| II. Relevance of the Distinctions .................................................. 162 |
| III. The Evolution of Arbitral Case Law .......................................... 163 |
| 1. The Authoritative Annulment Decision in *Vivendi*—Analytical Separation and the Principle of Coincidence ........................................ 163 |
| 2. The Prima Facie Approach for Jurisdictional Purposes .......................... 167 |
| a. Competence/Competence of International Arbitral Tribunals .................... 167 |
| b. Determination of Jurisdiction .................................................. 168 |
IV. The Fundamental Differences between Contract Claims and Treaty Claims
1. The Nature of Investment Treaties and the Consequent Distinction between International Commercial Arbitration and Investment Arbitration

B. The Substantive Protection Standards of Investment Treaties and Their Coverage of State Contracts
I. Expropriation
1. Expropriation under Customary International Law
2. Expropriation of Contracts under Customary International Law
3. Expropriation of Contracts under the Regime of Investment Treaties
   a. Coverage of State Contracts
   b. Distinction between Breach of Contract and Expropriation
   c. Findings of an Expropriation of State Contract
   d. Conclusion
II. The Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard
1. General Considerations
   a. Origins of the Standard
   b. Fair and Equitable Treatment and the International Minimum Standard
   c. Specifications of the Content
2. The Coverage of State Contracts
   a. Legitimate Expectations
   b. Failure to Provide a Stable Framework for the Investment and Other Violations of the Standard
3. Conclusion
III. Further Standards
1. Non-Discrimination
2. Full Protection and Security
IV. Concluding Remarks
1. The Dogma of the Governmental—Commercial Distinction ........................................................................... 216
2. The Difference between the Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard and the Non-Expropriation Standard ........................................................................................................... 219
3. The Broad Discretion of Arbitrators .................................................................................................................. 220

4. The Umbrella Clause ........................................................................................................................................ 221
   A. General Considerations ................................................................................................................................. 221
   B. History and Contemporary Use of the Clause ............................................................................................ 223
      I. Historical Analysis ............................................................................................................................... 223
         1. Anglo-Iranian Oil Company ........................................................................................................... 223
         2. The Abs-Shawcross Draft Convention on Investments Abroad ................................................... 225
         3. OECD Draft Convention on the Protection of Foreign Property 1967 ........................................ 227
      II. Contemporary Occurrence and Use of the Clause .................................................................................... 228
         1. Occurrence at Present ......................................................................................................................... 229
         2. Multilateral Agreements .................................................................................................................... 230
         3. Differences in the Clauses' Wordings .............................................................................................. 231
            a. Mandatory Language ..................................................................................................................... 231
            b. Scope of Obligations ....................................................................................................................... 232
            c. Structure ........................................................................................................................................ 233
            d. Requisitions of the Wording .......................................................................................................... 233
      C. The Effect of the Clause ............................................................................................................................. 235
         I. The Narrow Interpretation or Rejection of an Elevating Effect ........................................................... 235
         II. The Elevating Effect ........................................................................................................................... 238
      III. Distinction between Commercial and Non-Commercial Conduct ....................................................... 243
   D. The Central Controversial Aspects ................................................................................................................. 245
      I. The Wording of the Clause ....................................................................................................................... 245
         1. Narrow Interpretation ....................................................................................................................... 245
         2. Broad Interpretation ........................................................................................................................... 247
         3. Conclusion ......................................................................................................................................... 250
      II. The Implications of the Purpose of Investment Treaties ........................................................................ 252
         1. In Dubio Mitius ................................................................................................................................. 252
2. Effective Interpretation .............................................. 254

III. The Consequences of a Broad Interpretation .............. 256
   1. The Narrow Approach ......................................... 256
   2. The Middle Approach ...................................... 259
   3. The Broad Approach ..................................... 261

IV. The Location of the Clause ................................ 265

V. Alternative Functions of the Clause .......................... 267

E. Resolution of Central Aspects ................................. 269
   I. Threshold of Elevation ..................................... 270
   II. Manner of Elevation ..................................... 273
   III. The Contracts Covered ................................. 275

5. The Relationship of Parallel Treaty-Based International
   Arbitral Proceedings and Contract-Based Domestic
   Court Proceedings in Investment Treaty Disputes .......... 277
   A. Conflicting Jurisdictions under International
      Investment Treaties and Contracts between
      a Foreign Investor and a Host State ....................... 277
      I. Jurisdictional Conflicts in Investment
         Treaty Law .................................................. 278
         1. Generation and Risks of Parallel and Multiple
            Proceedings ............................................. 278
         2. Contract-Related Parallel Proceedings:
            “Asymmetrical” and “Symmetrical”
            Conflicts .............................................. 284
         3. Traditional Means of Jurisdictional Conflict
            Resolution and Their Effect under the
            Investment Treaty Regime .............................. 285
            a. The Exhaustion of Local Remedies Rule .......... 286
            b. The Principles of Litis Pendens and Res
               Judicata ............................................. 288
      II. Treaty Provisions on the Avoidance of Parallel
         Proceedings ................................................. 290
         1. The “Fork in the Road Clause” ......................... 290
         2. Prior Recourse to State Courts for a Fixed Period
            of Time .............................................. 293
         3. Alternative Proposals on Jurisdictional Conflict
            Mitigation ............................................... 296
            a. Article 1121 of the NAFTA ........................ 296
CONTENTS

b. Article 26 of the ICSID Convention ........................ 298
c. Transaction-Based Approaches and Dispute-Based Approaches ........................................ 300

B. The Relationship between International Treaty Proceedings and Domestic Contract Proceedings........... 301
   I. General Considerations ........................................... 301
   II. Prevalence of International Tribunals in Asymmetrical Conflicts ........................................ 303
       1. The Superior Status of International Tribunals .......................................................... 303
       2. The Primacy or “Independency” of International Investment Tribunals .................................. 305

III. The Impact of the Contractual Dispute Resolution Clause on Symmetrical Conflicts ......................... 309
    1. Traditional Forms—The Calvo Clause ......................... 310
    2. The Interpretation in Modern Investment Arbitration ..................................................... 313
    3. The Different Views and Their Resolution ...... 320
       a. Waiver of Right to Treaty Protection .......... 320
       b. The Effects of a Contractual Dispute Resolution Clause ............................................ 323

IV. Conclusion .......................................................... 331

Final Conclusion ..................................................... 332

Bibliography ......................................................... 337

Index ................................................................. 361